

City of Ann Arbor Formal Minutes

Historic District Commission

Thursday, August 11, 2016	7:00 PM	Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second
		floor, City Council Chambers

F-5 <u>16-1160</u> HDC16-157; 315-321 S Main - New Downtown building - MSHD

Alexis DiLeo presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Bushkuhl and Stulberg visited the site as part of their review.

Bushkuhl reported that in viewing the renderings he believed they were somewhat conservative and the higher levels (floors five and six) would actually be less visible than some of the renderings submitted. He said the buildings to the south all have the ability to be added to, in the future or near future so the area could look very different in the future. He reviewed the historic district limits with the Commission. He said the design, quality, and materials seem to be of high quality, and the store front configurations and windows make sense. He said the Review Committee has asked for a stone sample, of the proposed lighter stone, to be shown to the Commission, as the Architect explained it to be more muted in color than what is shown in the high-contrast renderings.

Stulberg added that it was clear to see that the existing 66-foot one-story building on Main Street doesn't fit in with the existing streetscape, and he appreciated the 3-section breakdown. He said in looking at the north-frontal view, one can now see the multi-story parking structure behind it and the proposed building would be obstructing that view. He said on the south side there is a fairly large blank wall that is being proposed, but as pointed out, the historic district ends shortly after this parcel.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Dick Mitchell, 113 S. Fourth Street, Ann Arbor, Mitchell and Mouat Architects, IHC, the applicant was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission. Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Bushkuhl, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 315 321 South Main Street, a non contributing property in the Main Street Historic District, to demolish the existing one story building and construct a six floor mixed use building, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to adjacent and surrounding buildings and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, particularly as they pertain to New Construction in Historic Commercial Settings.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

Moved by White, seconded by Bushkuhl, to withdraw the motion on the floor and that the Commission postpone taking action to allow the applicant to take under consideration Commission comments as they relate to areas of concern and submit revised plans.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION ON THE POSTPONEMENT MOTION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the motion and discussed the matter.

A summary of the Commission's concerns on the proposed building included:

- 1. Minimizing the looming effect
- 2. Breaking up the south wall
- 3. Cornice in level three
- 4. The visibility of people up on the terrace

5. Request for views of more City blocks in the City to see how the building fits in.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0 Item Postponed