



# City of Ann Arbor

## Formal Minutes

### Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street  
Ann Arbor, MI 48104  
[http://a2gov.legistar.com/  
Calendar.aspx](http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx)

---

Thursday, November 17, 2016

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second  
floor, City Council Chambers

---

**A**      **CALL TO ORDER**

*Chair Bushkuhl called the meeting to order at 7:05 p.m.*

**B**      **ROLL CALL**

*Jill Thacher called the roll.*

*Staff Present: Historic Preservation Coordinator, Jill Thacher*

**Present:** 7 - Robert White, Ellen Ramsburgh, Benjamin L. Bushkuhl,  
John Beeson, Jennifer Ross, Evan Hall, and Max Cope

**C**      **APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

*The agenda was unanimously approved as presented.*

**D**      **AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION - (3 Minutes per Speaker)**

*No speakers.*

**E**      **UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

**F**      **HEARINGS**

**F-1**      **16-1617**      HDC16-259; 115 Crest Avenue - New Rear Window - OWSHD

*Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.*

**REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:**

*Commissioners Cope and Hall visited the site as part of their review.*

*Hall reported that he agrees with the staff report that we would not be  
losing any historic materials. He commented that he would recommend*

*adjusting the trim to differentiate the new from the existing.*

*Cope agreed with staff findings and Hall.*

**PUBLIC HEARING:**

*No applicant present.*

*Noting no public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.*

**Moved by Ramsburgh, Seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 115 Crest Avenue, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to remove one window opening on the rear elevation and install a new window opening with a pair of double-hung windows, on the following condition: that the window trim width is varied from the original by one inch. As conditioned, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, and 9, and the guidelines for windows, and the Ann Arbor Historic Guidelines for windows.**

**COMMISSION DISCUSSION:**

*The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.*

**On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 7-0**

**Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.**

**F-2**      **16-1618**      HDC16-245; 150 S Fifth Ave - Business Sign - MSHD

*Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.*

**REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:**

*Commissioners Cope and Hall visited the site as part of their review.*

*Cope reported that in looking at the building he agrees with staff findings and doesn’t believe it detracts from the character of the Main Street*

*Historic District.*

*Hall agrees with the staff findings.*

**PUBLIC HEARING:**

*Tony Wright, Pro Design Graphics, Inc., 31137 7 Mile Road, Livonia, the applicant was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.*

*Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.*

**Moved by Cope, Seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 150 South Fifth Avenue, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District, to install a new business sign on the condition that the sign is mounted through mortar joints, not through masonry units. The work as conditioned is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and meets The Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, in particular the guidelines for signs, and The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9, and 10, and the guidelines for storefronts.**

**COMMISSION DISCUSSION:**

*The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.*

**On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 7-0**

**Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.**

**Yeas:** 7 - White, Ramsburgh, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, Secretary Ross, Hall, and Cope

**Nays:** 0

**F-3**      **16-1619**      HDC16-257; 224 S Main - Business Sign - MSHD

*Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.*

**REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:**

*Commissioners Cope and Hall visited the site as part of their review.*

*Hall agrees with the staff findings in regards to the lighting levels.*

*Cope agreed.*

**PUBLIC HEARING:**

*Kevin Short, Huron Sign Company, 663 S. Mansfield Street, Ypsilanti, the applicant was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.*

*Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.*

**Moved by Ross, Seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 224 South Main Street, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District, to install a new business sign as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and meets The Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, in particular the guidelines for signs, and The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9, and 10, and the guidelines for storefronts.**

**COMMISSION DISCUSSION:**

*The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.*

**On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 7-0**

**Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.**

**Yeas:** 7 - White, Ramsburgh, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, Secretary Ross, Hall, and Cope

**Nays:** 0

**F-4**      [16-1620](#)      HDC16-258; 526 S Ashley - Rear Addition - OWSHD

*Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.*

**REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:**

*Commissioners Cope and Hall visited the site as part of their review.*

*Hall reported that Thacher had covered the application very well in the staff report and he felt it would be a good discussion for the Commission. He said he felt the applicant had taken a lot of effort to meet the guidelines in a unique way and is commendable in that way.*

*Cope agrees with staff and Hall. He said at first he couldn't see the differentiation between the old and the new, but after looking at it through their unique application, he believes the work would be appropriateness.*

**PUBLIC HEARING:**

*Connie Crump and Jay Simrod, 526 S. Ashley Street, Ann Arbor, the applicant was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.*

*Simrod explained that the handmade door on the plans would remain and not be removed as stated in the staff report.*

*John Pianelli, 525 South First Street, Ann Arbor, sent an email in support of the application that was read by Bushkuhl.*

*Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.*

**Moved by Hall, Seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 526 South Ashley Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to construct a 512 square foot addition and porch as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for additions and building site; and The Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for additions.**

**COMMISSION DISCUSSION:**

*The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.*

**On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 7-0**

**Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.**

**Yeas:** 7 - White, Ramsburgh, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, Secretary Ross, Hall, and Cope

**Nays:** 0

**F-5**      [16-1621](#)      HDC16-263; 547 Detroit - Alterations to Rear Addition - OFWHD

*Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.*

**REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:**

*Commissioners Cope and Hall visited the site as part of their review.*

*Cope reported that he agrees with staff recommendations in the staff report.*

*Hall agreed.*

**PUBLIC HEARING:**

*Zack Mintzias, 526 Sixth Street, Ann Arbor, co-owner and the applicant, was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.*

*Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.*

**Moved by Ross, Seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 547 Detroit Street, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to modify the following windows on the addition, approved in September 2016: add a window to the east elevation, substitute a smaller window on the north elevation; substitute horizontal sliders on the south elevation; and add a basement window to the south elevation, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the house and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 9 and 10 and the guidelines for new additions and building site and The Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for new additions.**

**COMMISSION DISCUSSION:**

*The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.*

**On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 7-0**

**Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.**

**Yeas:** 7 - White, Ramsburgh, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, Secretary Ross, Hall, and Cope

**Nays:** 0

**F-6**      **16-1622**      HDC16-246; 211 Crest - Rear Addition - OWSHD

*Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.*

**REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:**

*Commissioners Cope and Hall visited the site as part of their review.*

*Cope didn't have anything to add.*

*Hall said he agrees with the staff report, and believes the changes are in keeping with the guidelines and he felt the revised application is a big improvement to what was submitted earlier.*

**PUBLIC HEARING:**

*The applicant was not present.*

*Noting no public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.*

**Moved by Beeson, Seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at Crest avenue, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to construct a two-story gable-roofed rear addition with a ground floor mud room, screen porch, and overhang, and a second floor bedroom and bath, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for all additions, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for New Additions, District or Neighborhood**

**Settings and Windows.**

*COMMISSION DISCUSSION:*

*The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.*

**On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 7-0**

**Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.**

**Yeas:** 7 - White, Ramsburgh, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, Secretary Ross, Hall, and Cope

**Nays:** 0

**G NEW BUSINESS**

**H APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

[16-1626](#) Minutes of the September 8, 2016 HDC Meeting

**Amended**

[16-1627](#) Minutes of the October 20, 2016 HDC Meeting

**Amended**

**I REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS**

*Ramsburgh reported from Cobblestone Farm Board; they finished up the Farm Market in October and it was a really successful Tuesday afternoon Farm Market. She said in October they had a Hallow Harvest where they had lots of crafts of historic origin that were presented. The event was attended by approximately 140 visitors. She explained that they have had the house open often for weddings and historic tours. She said there is a winter holiday event held at Cobblestone Farm in December; the event will be advertised on the City's Calendar.*

*Ramsburgh further noted that the Board is looking to replace the windows in the wooden addition of the Farm House.*

**J      ASSIGNMENTS**

**Review Committee: Monday, December 5, 2016, at Noon for the December 8, 2016 Regular Meeting**

*Commissioners Ramsburgh and Beeson volunteered for the December Review Committee.*

**K      REPORTS FROM STAFF**

**K-1      [16-1623](#)      October 2016 HDC Staff Activities**

**Received and Filed**

**K-2      [16-1624](#)      Design Guidelines for Residential Signs**

*Thacher provided a report on the development of the Design Guidelines for Residential Signs in Historic Districts. The Commission reviewed photos of signage and discussed appropriate and not appropriate signage in the HDC District. Thacher said she would tweak the draft list and bring it back to the Commission in December.*

**Received and Filed**

**L      CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS**

**M      COMMUNICATIONS**

**[16-1625](#)      Various Communications to the HDC**

**Received and Filed**

**N      ADJOURNMENT**

*The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 8:50 p.m.*

Community Television Network Channel 16 live televised public meetings are also available to watch live online from CTN's website, [www.a2gov.org/ctn](http://www.a2gov.org/ctn), on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>).

Live Web streaming is one more way, in addition to these listed below, to stay in touch with Ann Arbor City Council and board and commission actions and deliberations.

- Video on Demand: Replay public meetings at your convenience online at [www.a2gov.org/government/city\\_administration/communicationsoffice/ctn/Pages/VideoOnDemand.aspx](http://www.a2gov.org/government/city_administration/communicationsoffice/ctn/Pages/VideoOnDemand.aspx)
- Cable: Watch CTN Channel 16 public meeting programming via Comcast Cable channel 16.

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at [www.a2gov.org/ctn](http://www.a2gov.org/ctn), on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>), or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.