

3

4 5

6 7

11

13

15

17

20

22

24 25

DRAFT MINUTES OF THE REGULAR SESSION OF THE HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF ANN ARBOR Thursday, December 13, 2007

Commissioners Present: Susan Wineberg. Sarah Shotwell, Michael Bruner, Diane Giannola and Robert White **(5)** Commissioners Absent: Jim Henrichs and Kristina Glusac **(2)**

8 **Staff Present:** Jill Thacher, HDC Coordinator/Planner II, Kristine Kidorf, Kidorf Preservation 9 Consulting and Brenda Acquaviva, Administrative Support Specialist V, Planning and 10 Development Services (3)

12 **CALL TO ORDER:** Commissioner White called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

14 **<u>ROLL CALL:</u>** Quorum satisfied.

16 **APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA:**

18 Moved by Commissioner Wineberg, Seconded by Commissioner Shotwell, "**to approve the** 19 **agenda as presented.**"

21 On a Voice Vote – MOTION TO APPROVE - PASSED - UNANIMOUS

- 23 A HEARINGS
 - A-1 <u>256 CREST STREET OWSHD</u>

BACKGROUND: This Bungalow-style, shingled house features a side-gabled roof overhanging
a full front porch with a front-gabled dormer above, typical of the style. Simple brackets
emphasize the overhang of the roof in the gables. The house first appears in the 1923 City
Directory as the home of Frank Ulrich, a fireman at Washtenaw Gas Co., and his wife Mary.

LOCATION: The property is located on the west side of Crest Avenue, south of West
 Washington Street and north of Buena Vista Avenue.

APPLICATION: This is in response to a violation notice. The applicant is requesting to replace a second floor bathroom window on the north side of the house. The window has already been removed and disposed of, but was a three-over-one, double-hung wood sash, similar to other original windows in the house. The Applicant proposes to install an Andersen wood three-overone, double-hung windows that is clad with "Fibrex" on the exterior.

40 41 STAFF FINDINGS:

42 43

44

45 46

47

- The building department responded to a complaint about work being done on this house without a permit. A violation letter was sent to the address, and the homeowner and contractor contacted staff about getting a certificate of appropriateness for work partially completed.
- 48
 48
 49
 49
 50
 2. One presumably original three-over-one wood sash on the second floor of the north elevation was removed by the homeowner and permanently discarded during a bathroom remodeling project.

HDC – December 13, 2007 - 2 -51 The homeowner stated that she and her contractor were unaware of the historic district 52 regulations, and also that the window was severely deteriorated due to decades of inadequate ventilation in the room. There is currently only a storm window in the opening. 53 54 55 3. The contractor completed a window worksheet for the proposed replacement sash, a 400-Series Anderson Woodwright, fibrex (fiberglass composite) clad, full divided light 56 57 sash. The measurements for the sash that was removed were taken from similar original 58 windows on the same elevation. The proposed replacement sash meets the criteria of the Guidelines for Window Evaluation, Repair and Replacement. The original casing and sill 59 are still intact and will be re-used. 60 61 62 4. This is an unfortunate situation and staff's approval recommendation is a reluctant one. The window sash is gone, however, and the contractor has made the effort to find a 63 64 window that meets the window *Guidelines*. The remaining guestion is whether the proposed fibrex cladding is appropriate. Staff has visited the site, but requires a closer 65 look and the assistance of the review committee to determine whether a clad sash is 66 67 compatible with the other windows on this elevation. 68 69 Owner/Applicant/Address: Maria & Derek White, 256 Crest Avenue, Ann Arbor, MI 48106 70 71 **Review Committee:** Commissioners Bruner and Shotwell visited the site. 72 73 Commissioner Shotwell – As the photo's show, there is not much to see, we didn't go inside. It is December and the window is gone, so something has to be put in. As to fibrex or wood, I 74 75 don't have a strong opinion either way. 76 Commissioner Bruner – Concurs with Commissioner Shotwell. 77 78 79 Applicant Presentation: Derek White was present to speak on behalf of the application. He 80 stated that the staff report was an accurate account of the situation and that they were not aware that the historic district had rules regarding the property toward the back of the home. 81 The window was completely rotted. They had other windows that they repaired, but this one 82 was not salvageable. They purchased the same type of window with matching lights, but prefer 83 84 the fibrex. 85 86 Questions of the Applicant by the Commission: 87 88 Commissioner Bruner - Asked about the fibrex windows. (Coordinator - The contractor 89 described it as a wood window clad with fibrex). (Petitioner - Yes - it's much more durable). 90 91 Audience Participation: None. 92

93 Discussion by the Commission:

94 95 **Commissioner Wineberg** – Stated that the HDC should be prepared for cases like this until the 96 word gets out about the changes in the Ordinance have happened. (Petitioner stated he did an 97 informal 'poll' of the neighbors as he was not aware that the Ordinance had changed and he 98 works for an architectural firm. He stated one out of nine knew it had changed. He stated there 99 were some newspaper articles but received nothing in the mail from the city regarding this).

102 <u>MOTION</u> 103

104 Moved by Commissioner Wineberg, Seconded by Commissioner Shotwell, "that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the application at 256 Crest 105 Avenue in the Old West Side to remove a wood window sash from the second floor 106 107 of the north elevation and replace it with a 400-Series Anderson Woodwright, fibrex-clad, full divided light replacement sash (3/1). The work is generally 108 compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to 109 the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the 110 Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation standards 2 and 9." 111

On a Voice Vote – MOTION PASSED – UNANIMOUS (Application Approved)

- 112 113
- 114
- 115 116

117

A-2 514 NORTH STATE STREET - OFWHD

BACKGROUND: This two-story Queen Anne is the Michael Seery house, built in 1891. It has a gable front, gabled front and side wings, shallow rectangular bay windows, and a wraparound porch on the northwest corner.

In 1985 the HDC approved an addition and deck on the rear, and in 1986 the Zoning Board of
 Appeals granted Permission to Alter a Nonconforming Structure for that approval. The lot is
 nonconforming due to inadequate lot size. The addition was completed in 1986.

125

132

136

138 139

140

141 142

A second addition was approved on November 12, 1992 by the HDC to add a new window to the front elevation of the house, a stair tower on the northeast (rear) corner, and another rear addition and deck. This addition also received Permission to Alter a Nonconforming Structure.

LOCATION: The property is located on the east side of North State Street, north of East
 Kingsley Street and south of Depot Street.

APPLICATION: The applicant is requesting to add two parking spaces south of the garage, off the alley, along the rear lot line. The spaces would require the installation of a 3' retaining wall at the end of the proposed parking area to bring it up to the alley grade.

137 **STAFF FINDINGS**:

- 1. The backyard currently has a concrete patio and walkway, with landscaping and a privacy fence surrounding the patio.
- A privacy fence similar to the one along the alley would surround the proposed parking spaces, with a gate near the garage to allow access to the back door of the house.
- 143 144 145

- 3. The house is a duplex zoned R4C, and at capacity (per a recent City housing inspection) with eight occupants. The house currently meets the zoning requirement of 1 ½ parking spaces per unit (two garage spaces and one approved space to the north of the garage).
- spaces per unit (two garage spaces and one approved space to the north of the garage)
 take
 This house has had two large additions and a two-car garage added in the backyard.
 There is very little of the historic rear yard left, and the proposed parking spaces would
 take up much of that. Staff feels it is important to preserve this rear corner of the lot in
 order to define and preserve what little is left of the relationship between the alley, yard,
 and house, and help mitigate the bulk caused by the large additions.

- 154
 155
 5. Most of the other houses on this block fronting North State Street have retained their lawn covered rear yard. Few have filled their rear yard with structures or parking. The large parking lots in the immediate vicinity of this house are all associated with lots on East Kingsley. (See aerial photo at the end of this staff report.)
- 6. The lot drops off several feet between the alley and the back of the house. The fill,
 paving, and retaining wall required to bring the parking spaces to the alley's grade would
 permanently and inappropriately alter the existing grading of the rear yard.
- 164 **Owner/Applicant/Address:** Craig Nutt, PO Box 3676, A2, MI 48104
- 165

166 **Review Committee:** Commissioner's Shotwell and Bruner visited the site. 167

168 Commissioner Bruner – The house is perched on a high lot and most of these additions have 169 consumed what is left of the backyards. These additions have maximized the amount of units 170 allowed on the property. The amount of parking is currently what is already required and taking 171 additional space in the backyard for more parking is not something I could support.

- 172
- 173 Commissioner Shotwell Concurs with Commissioner Bruner. Also stated most adjacent yards 174 that front on State Street adjacent to this one still have their rear yards in tact.
- 175
- Applicant Presentation: Mr. Craig Nutt, owner, was present to speak on behalf of this application. He stated they could have up to ten people in the house with the current zoning, so two spaces were not enough. The spaces in the back are currently being used for parking, and this would extend this two more spaces. With three parking spaces, it has been difficult. He asked the Commission for any suggestions regarding a scaled back proposal of his application.
- 181
- 182 **Public Comment:** None.
- 183
- 184 **Questions of the Applicant by the Commission:** None.
- 185

186 **Discussion by the Commission:**

Commissioner Wineberg – Stated she would deny this petition, as she agrees with the staff
 report. From an environmental standpoint, the impervious surface is being increased. Adding
 spaces that are not required is not something I will support.

- 192 <u>MOTION</u>
- Moved by Commissioner Bruner, Seconded by Commissioner Wineberg, "that the
 Commission deny the application at 514 North State Street in the Old Fourth Ward
 Historic District to add two paved parking spaces and a related retaining wall in the
 backyard. The work is not compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture,
 material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and
 does not meet *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*standards 2, 9, and 10".
- 201 202

On a Voice Vote – MOTION PASSED – UNANIMOUS (Application Denied)

- 204 (The Commission discussed alternatives to the proposal, but did not devise any).
- 205

HDC – December 13, 2007

A-3 519 FOURTH STREET - OWSHD

BACKGROUND: This simple 1½ story vernacular house with a one-story rear addition was
built in 1914 (per the applicant) and first appears in the 1915 Polk directory as the home of
Adolph (a carpenter) and Hazel Seitz. There were three additional sets of occupants between
then and 1921 (David and Regina Laubengayer in 1916; John F. and C. Lydia Hagen in 1917;
and Clyde and Amelia J Tessmer from 1918 to 1920), when Godfrey G. and Magdalene/Lena
Cook occupied the house. Godfrey was a janitor and later a stock keeper for Mayer-Schairer
Co., and he occupied the house until 1947 or 1948.

215

206

In July, 2007 (application 07-70) the Historic District Commission issued a certificate of appropriateness to the owners to 1) remove an existing garage, 2) add a two-story addition off the rear (east) elevation of the house, and 3) add a deck off the new rear addition. Features of the new addition include a side door on the north elevation, LP SmartSide lap siding (an engineered wood siding made of wood dust and resin), aluminum clad windows and French doors, asphalt shingles to match the existing, and a wood and glass side door similar in style to one on the south side of the house.

LOCATION: The property is located on the east side of Fourth Street, south of Jefferson and
 north of Madison.

226 227 **APPLICATION:** The applicant is requesting to modify some of the features of the previously 228 approved addition. Marvin double-hung wood windows in the same dimensions are proposed in place of the aluminum-clad; cedar siding is proposed instead of cement board; and casement 229 wood windows (with false meeting rails to imitate double-hung) are proposed to be added to the 230 231 addition's basement walls on three elevations. A bank of three proposed windows on the east basement elevation would allow egress, and single windows with wells would be located on the 232 233 north and south elevations. Wells on all three elevations would be built of custom landscape 234 timbers.

236 **STAFF FINDINGS**:

237 238

239 240

241 242 243

244

245

235

- The addition of the three egress windows on the rear (east) elevation suggests that the previously approved deck would not be built. If this application is approved, the applicants could come back with an application for a smaller deck that does not interfere with the window well.
- The use of wood windows instead of aluminum-clad on the addition is appropriate. The windows on the existing house are vinyl, and were installed by a previous owner. Likewise, using cedar siding instead of cement board is appropriate and should not confuse the historic record.
- 246 247 248

249

250

251

255

- The locations of the proposed windows and wells should not have a negative visual impact on the historic part of the structure. The proposed windows on the north and south elevations are in the same location as the approved above-grade basement windows.
- 252 Owner/Applicant/Address: Robert Silbergleit & Catherine Zudak, 519 Fourth Street, A2, MI
- Review Committee: Commissioner's Shotwell and Bruner did not visit the site.

Applicant Presentation: The applicant had was not available, but the builder was in
 attendance.

258 Questions of the Applicant by the Commission:

259

264

260 Commissioner Bruner – Asked about the sizes of the egress windows. (The builder stated that all the windows would be the same size, but larger than needed for egress. This would allow for 261 greater light into the basement). The bar put up for the 'double-hung' appearance, is this what 262 they preferred? (We felt the HDC would approve of this). 263

265 Public Commentary: None.

266 267 Discussion by the Commission:

268

269 MOTION 270

271 Moved by Commissioner Shotwell, Seconded by Commissioner Wineberg, "that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the application at 519 272 Fourth Street in the Old West Side to install Marvin double-hung wood windows 273 274 and cedar siding on the previously-approved rear addition (application # 07-70) to the house; and casement windows with false meeting rails and wood-timbered 275 window wells on three elevations: the north (one window), south (one window), 276 and east (three windows in one well) basement elevations, per the submitted 277 drawings. The work is generally compatible in exterior design, arrangement, 278 texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding 279 280 area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation standard 9." 281

- 282
- 283 284

(Discussion by the Commission - meeting rails creating a 'false' sense of historic detail).

285 **MOTION TO AMEND** (The previous motion) 286

287 Moved by Commissioner Shotwell, Seconded by Commissioner Wineberg, "to amend the previous motion. Insert "or without" in the language which states "With (or 288 without) false meeting rails". 289

290 On a Voice Vote – MOTION TO AMEND – PASSED – UNANIMOUS 291

292 293 MOTION AS AMENDED 294

295 Moved by Commissioner Shotwell, Seconded by Commissioner Wineberg, "that the 296 Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the application at 519 Fourth Street in the Old West Side to install Marvin double-hung wood windows 297 and cedar siding on the previously-approved rear addition (application # 07-70) to 298 299 the house; and casement windows with or without false meeting rails and woodtimbered window wells on three elevations: the north (one window), south (one 300 301 window), and east (three windows in one well) basement elevations, per the 302 submitted drawings. The work is generally compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the 303 surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for 304 305 Rehabilitation standard 9."

306 307

On a Roll Call Vote - MAIN MOTION AS AMENDED - PASSED - UNANIMOUS

A-4 209-211 SOUTH STATE STREET - SSHD

312 A two-story single-family frame dwelling is shown in this location on the 1899 Sanborn map. 313 Additions were gradually built on the rear of the house and reached the rear lot line on the 1916 314 Sanborn. During this time it was used as a boarding house. On the 1925 Sanborn a large lot-315 316 width addition is shown on the front of the house, and a photo from 1930 shows the front facade 317 that exists today. Parts of the house and carriage house are incorporated into the body of the building, though only portions of their roofs are identifiable. An extensive and interesting history 318 319 has been provided as part of this application.

- 320

321 The front of the current building is of yellow and grey brick with a simple cornice, decorative 322 brickwork, five arched storefront windows/doors, and five pairs of second-floor windows above 323 the arches. The straight sides and rear of the building are built out to the lot lines. An assortment of small businesses operate within the building. 324

325

343

344

345 346

347

348

349

326 LOCATION: The property is located on the east side of South State Street, south of East Washington and north of East Liberty. 327 328

329 **APPLICATION:** The applicant is requesting to restore the front facade based on historic photographs, and to demolish the rest of the building behind the front facade. This is comprised 330 of the following items 1) replace three pairs of non-original second-floor windows with new wood 331 332 windows similar in design, operation, and sightline and profile to the existing original windows. 333 2) Replicate three iron Juliet balconies shown in a historic photo on the second floor. 3) 334 Replace all of the storefronts with new wood windows and doors, based in part on the small 335 remaining area of original storefront. In each of the five arches, install shielded lighting bars to 336 illuminate future signage. 4) Install a replica of the blade sign shown in the 1932 photograph, with updated neon text showing the name of a current tenant (instead of "the Ritz"). 5) 337 338 Demolish the existing building behind the front facade and build a new two-story building with a basement in the same footprint. 339 340

341 **STAFF FINDINGS:** 342

- 1. The restoration of the existing second floor original windows, and their replication for nonoriginal second floor windows, is appropriate.
- 2. It is difficult to see the Juliet balconies in the 1932 photo, but there is clearly some small decorative structure there. The chosen design for the balconies is simple and appropriate.
- 350 3. A small portion of the original storefront remains on the south end of the building, though 351 it has been altered. The new storefronts will be of a design based upon this remaining fragment, and consist of wood windows and doors with glazing. The proposed signage 352 353 (five signs, one in each arch, plus a blade sign) is somewhat overwhelming in quantity. 354 The placement of signage in the arches, and the blade sign itself, are appropriate, but 355 staff recommends limiting the arch signage to the three arches above doorways. Tenants would still be able to install appropriate signage on the window and/or door glazing. The 356 357 shielded light bars in the arches are acceptable if they are limited to the three arches 358 containing signage (though they appear to be drawn larger than scale). 359
- 360 4. Like the Juliet balconies, it may be challenging to replicate the blade sign based only on the 1932 photograph. 361

362 363 364 365 366	HDC – December 13, 2007 - 8 - The size and placement of the sign are in keeping with the photo. Staff requests that if the blade sign is approved by the Historic District Commission, staff be given the opportunity to review and approve the final rendering of the sign before permits are issued and before it is installed.
367 368 369 370 371 372	5. The building has grown organically over a century, and there are no character defining features on any of the other elevations behind the front façade. The protruding house and carriage barn roofs are fascinating but are fragments of buildings that are long gone. A roof alone does not comprise historic integrity. Therefore, the demolition of this structure behind the front façade, and its rebuilding in the same footprint, is appropriate.
373 374	Owner/Address: Modena Holdings, LLC, 200 E 72 nd New York, NY 10021
375 376 377	Applicant: Elizabeth Huck and Steve Jones, Quinn Evans Architects, 219 ½ North Main Street, A2, MI 48105
378 379	Review Committee: Commissioners Bruner and Shotwell visited the site.
380 381 382 383	Commissioner Bruner – It is as staff describes. The façade is really the most significant part of what remains of the property. The building is inaccessible for handicapped access due to various steps up into the previously existing house, etc.
384 385 386 387	Commissioner Shotwell – Concurs with Commissioner Bruner. This will be a big improvement as even the light fixtures are all a general conglomeration of different fixtures. As to the sign, I think that either staff and or the HDC should review the proposed final 'Blade' sign.
388 389 390	Applicant Presentation: Elizabeth Huck and Steve Jones, Quinn Evans Architects were present to speak on behalf of the application. They stated that they agree with the staff report and were available to answer any questions that the HDC might have.
391 392 202	Questions to the Applicant by the Commission:
393 394 395 396	Commissioner Bruner – Asked about awnings and restrictions of same. (Petitioner stated that the current owners will be restrictive on signage and awnings).
397 398	Public Commentary: None.
399 400	Discussion by the Commission:
400 401 402 403 404 405 406	Commissioner Wineberg – Stated she was 'torn' about this as this building has been an 'incubator' for creating small businesses in the area. The building obviously needs to be redone, but it will make the area more expensive in doing so. Regarding the proposed Blade sign, the original sign was not up for long. It was a 'dining and dancing' spot which was short lived, so that sign has not been there for the life of the building.
407 408 409 410 411 412	Commissioner Bruner – Asked if any of the members had questions regarding the windows proposed. They weren't included in the packet. (Coordinator – Stated that this was her oversight since this will be a new building, there were no 'existing' windows to compare it to, but she will provide the worksheets in the future).

	HDC – December 13, 2007	- 9 -
413	MOTION	
414		
415	Moved by Commissioner Bruner, Seconded by Commissioner Wineberg, "that the	_
416	Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the application at 209-211	South
417	State Street in the State Street Historic District to:	
418	4) Deployed three mains of many animinal account file any single way with many set of winds	
419	1) Replace three pairs of non-original second-floor windows with new wood windo	
420 421	similar in design, operation, and sightline and profile to the existing original windo	ows;
421	2) Install three iron Juliet balconies on the second floor;	
422	2) install three non Juliet balcomes on the second hoor,	
424	3) Replace all of the storefronts with new wood windows and doors, and in the thr	ee
425	arches above doorways, install shielded lighting bars to illuminate future signage	
426		,
427	4) Demolish the existing building behind the front facade and build a new two-sto	ry
428	building with a basement in the same footprint as shown in the application drawin	igs.
429	The work as conditioned is generally compatible in exterior design, arrangement,	texture,
430	material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and	
431	The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation standards 2, 5, 6, 9, an	d 10".
432		
433	On a Voice Vote – MOTION TO APPROVE – UNANIMOUS (Application Approved).	
434		
435 436	B - OLD BUSINESS –	
430 437	B-1 522 Detroit Street – (Postponed at the November 8, 2007 Meeting)	
437	B-1 <u>322 Detroit Street – (<i>i</i> ostponed at the November 0, 2007 meeting)</u>	
439	Coordinator – Refreshed the HDC on this application and that it was postponed pending	
440	additional drawings. This is a home on Detroit Street that was proposed to have window	
441	doors and egress into the basement along with stairs and railing preferring metal railing	,
442	wood).	
443		
444	Applicant Presentation: Stated that the HDC needs to know how difficult into and out	
445	house would be – anything from approaching the basement to taking things up out of the	e
446	basement, like a hot water heater (for new installation), etc.	
447		
448	Discussion by the Commission:	
449		vaad
450 451	Commissioner Wineberg – Stated she thought the metal railing would be cheaper than v and less noticeable than wood.	vood
451 452		
452 453	Commissioner Bruner – A metal railing would be less visible and more maintenance free	2
433	Commissioner Druner – A metarranning would be less visible and more maintenance nee	7.

455 **MOTION**

454

456

457 Moved by Commissioner Giannola, Seconded by Commissioner Wineberg, "that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the application at 522 458 Detroit Street in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District to install a new stairwell, 459 460 above-ground railing, stair, and three mulled casement windows and a door in the well, per the submitted drawings. The work is generally compatible in exterior 461 design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building 462 and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for 463 Rehabilitation standards 2 and 9." 464

472 473

474

467 **MOTION TO AMEND** (The previous motion)

- Moved by Commissioner Bruner, Seconded by Commissioner Wineberg, "to amend the
 previous motion to delete the <u>wood</u> railing (as was indicated in the submitted
 drawings)and insert metal above ground railing."
 - On a Voice Vote MOTION TO AMEND PASSED 3 Yes, 2 No

*Administrative Support requested to conduct a roll call vote as it was not apparent as to who
 voted yes or no.

477

478 On a Roll Call Vote – MOTION TO AMEND – PASSED –

- 479 **3 Yes** (Commissioners Shotwell, Wineberg and Bruner)
- 480 **2 No** (Commissioners White and Giannola)
 481

482 MOTION AS AMENDED

483

492

496

497

498 499

500 501

484 Moved by Commissioner Giannola, Seconded by Commissioner Wineberg, Amended by Commissioner Bruner, "that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness 485 for the application at 522 Detroit Street in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District to 486 487 install a new stairwell, a metal above-ground railing, stair, and three mulled casement windows and a door in the well, per the submitted drawings. The work is 488 generally compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and 489 490 relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation standards 2 and 9." 491

- 493 On a Voice Vote MOTION AS AMENDED PASSED UNANIMOUS
- 494 495 **C - NEW BUSINESS –**
 - **C-1 Amendment to HDC Bylaws** Kristine Kidorf explained the amendments to the current by-laws and that they were previously handed out to the HDC for review. The Commission is making changes represented by the working session from March of 2007.

502 <u>MOTION #1</u> 503

- 504 Moved by Commissioner Wineberg, Seconded by Commissioner Shotwell, **"to amend the** 505 **current by-laws as submitted."**
- 506 507

508

510

On a Voice Vote – MOTION PASSED – UNANIMOUS

509 **MOTION #2**

511 Moved by Commissioner Shotwell, Seconded by Commissioner Wineberg, "to adopt the 512 standing rules for the HDC".

513

- 514 On a Voice Vote MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUS
- 516 AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION GENERAL (No Speakers)

517 D -**APPROVAL OF MINUTES –**

518 519 520

523

D-1 Draft Minutes of the November 8, 2007 Regular Session –

521 Corrections: Line 425 (Anson Brown bldg), Line 485 – Vacant Seat language – DELETE, Line 365 and 366 - Glusac voted for White, Shotwell voted for Bruner. 522

524 MOTION 525

Moved by Commissioner Wineberg, Seconded by Commissioner Shotwell, "that the Minutes 526 of the November 8, 2007 Regular Sessions be accepted as amended." 527

528

530

532

529 On a Voice Vote - MOTION PASSED - UNANIMOUS

E -**REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS** – None. 531

F -533 **ASSIGNMENTS -**

- 534
- 535 256 Crest Street Commissioner Bruner 536 514 North State Street -None Needed - Application was denied *Should be assigned to a previous monitor. 537 519 Fourth Street 209-211 South State Street **Commissioner White** 538 539 522 Detroit Street Commissioner Giannola 540
- Review Committee For the January 10, 2008 Regular Session Commissioner's Bruner and 541 542 _ (absent Commissioners to be asked to fill in) will meet Coordinator J. Thacher 543 on Monday, January 7, 2008, at 12:00 p.m. 544

G – STAFF ACTIVITIES REPORT 545

I-1 **Staff Activities Report for November** – There were 13 applications and 12 or 92 percent were approved – 10 were reviewed by staff and 3 were heard by the HDC.

549 Coordinator – Stated that the State Historic Preservation Office has notified us that a decision made by the HDC earlier this year is being appealed. That appeal involves a home in the 200 550 block of West Jefferson owned by a Mr. Tim Bell. This was for an incompatible egress window 551 installation that the owner did not apply for a building permit nor a certificate of appropriateness. 552 He is now appealing that to the state and we will be at that hearing on January 9th, 2008. 553

- 555 Н-**CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS –**
- 556

562

554

546

547 548

- 557 Commissioner Wineberg - Spoke about Cobblestone Farm and the new discussions that 558 Community Services is dealing with (Parks Division). Thinks they should be including the HDC in these discussions since it is an Individual Historic District. 559 560
- J -561 **COMMUNICATIONS** – None.

Moved by Commissioner White "to adjourn the meeting." The Meeting was adjourned at 563 564 9:20 p.m. without objection.

565 566 SUBMITTED BY: Brenda Acquaviva, Administrative Service Specialist V, Planning and 567 Development Services.