

Approved Minutes December 17, 2015

Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority Board of Directors Ann Arbor District Library, 343 South Fifth Avenue, Ann Arbor, Michigan, 6:30 p.m.

Board:Mike Allemang, Jack Bernard, Gillian Ream Gainsley, Sue Gott (arrived
6:40 p.m.), Charles Griffith, Larry Krieg, Eric Mahler (Chair), Stephen
Wade

Absent with Notice: Eli Cooper

Staff: Terry Black, Matt Carpenter, Ron Copeland, Bill De Groot, Dawn Gabay, Mary Stasiak, Phil Webb, Chris White, Michelle Whitlow

Recording Secretary: Karen Wheeler

Chairman Eric Mahler declared that a quorum was present, and called the meeting to order at 6:31 p.m.

1.0 Public Hearing

There was no public hearing.

2.0 <u>Communications and Announcements</u>

There were no communications or announcements.

3.0 Board Election for Office of Secretary

Mr. Mahler announced that due to Susan Baskett's resignation from the Board, there was a need to elect a Secretary to complete the term through September 2016. Jack Bernard nominated Stephen Wade for the office of Secretary. Larry Krieg supported the motion which carried.

4.0 Appoint Performance Monitoring and External Relations Committee Chair

Mr. Mahler appointed Mike Allemang Chair of the Performance Monitoring and External Relations Committee for the duration of the fiscal year.

5.0 Public Time – Comment on Agenda Items

No one appearing, Mr. Mahler declared Public Time closed.

6.0 Review and Approval of Minutes of November 19, 2015

Charles Griffith moved approval of the minutes as written with support from Gillian Ream Gainsley. The motion carried.

7.0 Board and Staff Reports

7.1 Chief Executive Officer

Matt Carpenter thanked the Board and Staff for their support. Mr. Carpenter reviewed successes of the prior six months, highlights of which included: a public transit millage in Scio Township, Sunday service on Ypsilanti local routes, later service system-wide on Saturday and Sunday, results from an independent survey of resident satisfaction regarding public transit had a 61% positive rating, and an increase in state funding for transportation and public transit.

Mr. Carpenter reported on a meeting with RTA staff. The RTA plan is being firmed up and is scheduled to be introduced in the near term, with a vote on the plan from the RTA board expected in May.

7.2 <u>Planning and Development Committee</u>

Gillian Ream Gainsley reported that the Planning and Development Committee (PDC) addressed two items regarding the Capital and Categorical Grant Program: a newly designed tool illustrating capital projects for the next five years, and a resolution to approve the Revised FY2016 Capital and Categorical Grant Program. The Committee endorsed the resolution approving the program. Ms. Gainsley noted that the resolution includes language recognizing the option for a mid-year budget amendment, if emergent priority projects, such as the Connector and Ypsilanti Transit Center, become ready to be addressed. The committee discussed an impending M-14 road construction project and bus stops and shelters. Staff will make presentations on both topics at the January PDC meeting. Ms. Gainsley encouraged board members to submit requests for information on specific bus stops or shelters they would like addressed.

7.3 Performance Monitoring and External Relations Committee

Mike Allemang reported that the Performance Monitoring and External Relations Committee endorsed four action items to be addressed by the full Board: a modification to the contract for the Blake Transit Center, and the routing of three routine contract approvals. The Committee received a report on the need for an adjustment to the current A-Ride contract as expenses are expected to exceed the \$2Million budget previously approved by the Board. An action item to approve additional expenditures will be brought to the Board in January. Mr. Allemang reported that the annual audit was underway and going well. The auditors will report to PMER and the Board in February. The committee received reports on financial and performance data. Mr. Allemang noted that Unrestricted Net Assets are nearing the 2.5 month minimum set by the Board, and could go below the minimum. PMER will discuss the Unrestricted Net Assets policy in January. The performance reports included increases in AirRide and A-Ride ridership while fixed-route ridership was down just slightly. Mr. Allemang noted that the downward trend is consistent with other transit agencies of similar size, and ridership has been impacted by low fuel prices. UM ridership is down significantly, and go!pass ridership is down. Without those two categories, fixed route ridership is up just slightly. Staff will analyze information from UM and provide the results over the next couple of months.

7.4 Local Advisory Council

Jack Bernard reported on the Local Advisory Council (LAC) meeting. LAC meetings open with a public comment period which provides the opportunity for people to share information on various challenges. Mr. Bernard indicated that the feedback is appreciated, and AAATA staff provide thoughtful responses to the concerns raised. This month there was discussion around times when A-Ride trips are needed, and there was no service available. Staff shared information about the challenges of managing the system, and how gathering specific kinds of data might help with tailoring the system to decrease the number of times when trips are not available. LAC received reports on the new website, A-Ride trip arrival notifications, an A-Ride user survey, and the A-Ride service delivery model slated for consideration by the Board in January.

7.5 Washtenaw Area Transportation Study

Larry Krieg reported that the Washtenaw Area Transportation Study Policy Committee did not meet in December. Dr. Krieg reported on a matter discussed at an Ypsilanti Township Planning Commission meeting; redevelopment of a site near the intersection of Washtenaw and Hewitt. There is a desire to place a pad and bus shelter near the site. Both AAATA and Reimagine Washtenaw are commenting on redevelopment plans in an effort to make the area as transit friendly as possible.

8.0 Question Time

Stephen Wade commented on work on RTA plans expected to be intensifying in the coming months. Mr. Wade suggested formalizing the relationship between the AAATA board and Washtenaw County RTA board members by inviting RTA board members to attend AAATA committee or board meetings each month.

Matt Carpenter agreed that it is important for the board to understand details of the RTA's plans and that a strong, ongoing relationship with Washtenaw County's RTA board members will be extremely important as the plan rolls out. Mr. Carpenter noted that RTA's representatives have expressed a desire to strengthen the relationship, and it will merely be a question of how, and to what degree.

Larry Krieg reported on his service on the RTA's Citizen Advisory Committee indicating that he is term limited. Dr. Krieg encouraged AAATA board members to apply to serve on the CAC. Dr. Krieg also encouraged board members to attend RTA Provider Advisory Committee and Planning and Service Coordination Committee meetings as the two committees are the place "where the rubber meets the road".

Mike Allemang requested confirmation that Alma Wheeler Smith is still representing Washtenaw County on the RTA board.

Matt Carpenter reported on a recent meeting with Washtenaw County RTA board member Liz Gerber, AAATA board trustees Gainsley and Mahler, Mayor Taylor of Ann Arbor and Washtenaw County Commissioner Conan Smith. Attendees discussed the status of the RTA's work and how the board can be involved.

Charles Griffith reported on serving on the RTA's Financial Task Force. Mr. Griffith supported the idea of coordinating the AAATA board and Washtenaw County RTA board members.

Stephen Wade requested additional information on ridership trends and when declining ridership becomes a real problem for the board to address. Mr. Wade asked at what point the decline could become a financial problem.

Mike Allemang requested information on work that can be done to increase ridership suggesting that a continuing decline could be an issue when it is time for renewal of the transit millage.

Jack Bernard commented on ridership data received by PMER each month noting that adjustments to the system are made when possible, and there are some things beyond the agency's control. Mr. Bernard further noted recent problems with collecting ridership data from some fareboxes which may have an impact on go!pass ridership numbers. Staff is looking into go!pass ridership and will also be analyzing data provided by UM to determine the source of losses in that ridership category.

Eric Mahler requested clarification about the conversation planned at PMER regarding the Unrestricted Net Assets Policy. Mike Allemang responded that staff will provide information on why the reserves are reducing, and discuss the policy of maintaining 2.5 months of unrestricted assets.

9.0 Old Business

9.1 <u>A-Ride Service Delivery Recommendation</u>

Matt Carpenter reported on the mixed service delivery model in the provision of paratransit service that has been in place since May. As part of the board's approval, staff was required to return to the board by December 2015 with a recommendation on a future service delivery model. Mr. Carpenter referred to documentation outlining options for future A-Ride service delivery. Board members were asked to review the information over the coming month in order to make a decision in January.

Mr. Carpenter shared details of current A-Ride operations with sedan services and same-day reservations contracted out, and lift equipped service and advance reservations being carried out by AAATA employees. Mr. Carpenter noted the options of fully contracting the service, fully taking the service inhouse, or continuing to deploy a hybrid model to capitalize on the best of what the public sector and private sector can offer. Mr. Carpenter reported that staff's recommendation is to make one change to the current model; contracting out the operation and maintenance of lift equipped buses for third party for operation which has more competitive pricing. Mr. Carpenter noted that it is common for transit agencies to employ a variety of methods to deploy services, particularly paratransit services.

Board members commented on the recommendation. The following suggestions were made:

- Board members should not support a specific hybrid model, but endorse the idea of using a hybrid trajectory that allows staff to make decisions without having to return to the board to make adjustments
- Find an equilibrium where strategic direction leaves off and tactical direction starts; get to a place to give staff latitude
- Be open minded about getting the model right, and fluid for how technology, the economy and products may evolve

Bill De Groot responded to questions on contractual requirements that will assure that a vendor delivers the same level of reliability as AAATA employees

currently conducting the work, indicating that there will be requirements for service and maintenance to make certain that a contractor is compliant with AAATA and federal standards.

10.0 <u>New Business</u>

Larry Krieg moved the following resolution with support from Charles Griffith.

10.1 Revised FY2016 Capital and Categorical Grant Program

Resolution 5/2016

APPROVAL OF REVISED FY 2016 CAPITAL AND CATEGORICAL GRANT PROGRAM

WHEREAS, the Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority (AAATA) adopted a revised Capital and Categorical Grant Program for 2015-2019 in March 2015, and

WHEREAS, a revised process for long-term capital planning is under discussion, and as a result, approval of a long-range capital program will occur later, and

WHEREAS, there are also discussions of ongoing efforts to integrate the use of grant funds for capital and operating needs, and

WHEREAS, the FY 2016 program is required for current year grant applications and modification is necessary to be within available funds, and

WHEREAS, staff has identified the attached elements of the FY2016 program are not ready to be submitted for grant funding, or can be funded from alternative sources,

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority Board of Directors hereby adopts the attached revised FY 2016 element of the Capital and Categorical Grant Program, and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the budget will remain flexible, and an adjustment will be considered, if some high priorities have emergent funding needs mid-year.

Attachments

ANN ARBOR TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY Capital and Categorical Grant Program

11/30/15

FY 2016	Dronosod	Poductio	ne in Ad	opted Program
F1 2010	FTOPOSEU	Reductio		
Category	Adopted	Ohamma	Proposed	Status
Ypsilanti Transit Center	Program \$1,200,000	Change -\$1,200,000	Program \$0	Not yet ready for grant application. Moved to future program year. Scoping underway for replacement facility. Estimated cost and timing not yet determined.
Vanpool Vehicles	\$585,000	-\$585,000	\$0	37 vanpool vehicles are in approved grants which is enough to provide for replacement and expansion through FY16
Park and Ride Lot and Superstop	\$500,000	-\$500,000	\$0	Not yet ready for grant application. Moved to future program year. Planned for Glencoe Crossing. Timing and owner approval uncertain at this time.
Computer Hardware and Software	\$720,000	-\$570,000	\$150,000	New management system software and business intellegence software moved to future program year. Remaining funds to remain for ongoing replacement and upgrade.
Planning	\$400,000	-\$300,000	\$100,000	Reduce amount of grant funding to carry out unfied planning work program. Fund from operating assistance instead.
TOTAL	\$3,405,000	-\$3,155,000	\$250,000	

Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority

11/18/2015

Capital Program		FY2016		Proposed	FY 2016 Grant Application FY2016-19 Implementation
Category	Project Description	Total Cost	Funding	Detail	Status
	IT - CAD/AVL replacement	\$1,500,000	Fed Formula 80% State 20%	Phase II of TransitMaster replacement - fixed route	In adopted FY16 program
State of Good Repair	Associated Capital Maintenance	\$330,000	Fed Formula 80% State 20%	Battery refresher and engine overhaul kits; 1 added service truck and pick-up for added facility maintenance staff	In adopted FY16 program
	IT - Hardware and Software	\$150,000	Fed Formula 80% State 20%	Replace and upgrade hardware and software	In adopted FY16 program
State of Good Repair Sub-total		\$1,980,000			
Value Added	Rider amenities and accessibility	\$100,000	Fed Formula 80% State 20%	Shelters, benches, ADA curb ramps, and lead walks	In adopted FY16 program
Value Added Sub- Total		\$100,000			
Expansion	7 Large buses	\$3,188,000	Local	Delivery for 2017 Service Expansion	In adopted FY16 program
Expansion Sub- total		\$3,188,000			
Capital Projects Total		\$5,268,000			

Grant Funded Operating Program				FY2016	FY 2016 Grant Application
Category	Project Description	Total Cost	Funding Sources	Detail	Status
Operating _ Assistance _	Operating Assistance	\$2,400,000	100% Federal Formula	FY16 - 17 funding for payment of a portion of general operating expenses	In adopted FY16 program
	Preventive Maintenance & Capital Cost of Contracting	\$1,250,000	Fed Formula 80% State 20%	FY17 funding for revenue vehicle maintenance and portion of subcontracts attributable to capital cost	In adopted FY16 program
	Administration - planning	\$100,000	Fed Formula 80% State 20%	FY17 unified planning work program	In adopted FY16 program
	Rideshare and Outreach	\$455,000	Fed CMAQ 100%	FY17 funding for employer outreach and marketing of ridesharing, transit and other alternative (non-SOV) transportation	Continued Congestion Mitigation/Air Quality (CMAC funding anticipated
Operating Sub- total		\$4,205,000			
Capital Sub-total	(from above)	\$5,268,000			

Total - Capital + Grant-Funded Operating \$9,473,000

Matt Carpenter reported on the resolution to approve a Revised FY2016 Capital and Categorical Grant Program. Mr. Carpenter reported that the revised program includes a

one year list of capital projects for approval. Staff will continue to transition to a new approach for conceptualizing and communicating capital budgets going forward.

Chris White responded to an inquiry on postponing the purchase of software to automate manual processes, indicating that staff does not have the bandwidth to carry out a new initiative due to the CAD/AVL project which has already been funded and is underway.

The motion passed unanimously.

Mike Allemang moved the following resolution with support from Larry Krieg.

10.2 Blake Transit Center Capital Amendment for Close Out Costs

Resolution 6/2016

APPROVAL OF ADDITIONAL FUNDS FOR THE BLAKE TRANSIT CENTER RECONSTRUCTION CLOSEOUT

WHEREAS, the Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority Board of Directors approved the authorization to execute contracts for the construction of a new Blake Transit Center (BTC) on October 18, 2012, and

WHEREAS, On May 15, 2014, the Board increased the total project amount by \$125,000, from \$8,128,988 to \$8,254,988 to cover construction change orders, and

WHEREAS, there is \$69,735 remaining in the original budget to complete the project, and

WHEREAS, additional expenses were incurred by both the architect and construction manager totaling \$241,198, and

WHEREAS, funding is available that can be used to pay for the aforementioned additional project costs without negatively affecting existing programs or services, and

WHEREAS, construction is complete and the building is open to the public,

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority Board of Directors increase the final total project amount authorized for the Blake Transit Center by \$175,000, from \$8,254,988 to \$8,429,988. Matt Carpenter reported on the request to amend the capital budget for the Blake Transit Center by adding \$175,000 for close out costs. Mr. Carpenter reported that the additional costs were related to expenses incurred by the architect and construction manager due to extended preconstruction and construction phases, as well as a harsh winter. Mr. Carpenter noted that staff negotiated with suppliers to lower the bills, and the costs are appropriate.

Board members discussed the request for additional funds. It was noted that the project was challenging, and a good opportunity for the agency to identify where procedures and practices can be strengthened to make future projects more efficient and effective.

Sue Gott proposed an amendment to the resolution to add the following language:

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Board directs staff to work with PMER and Governance to establish a set of best practices for improved project management procedures as well as the appropriate associated cost controls.

Ms. Gott reported that prior to the meeting she received verbal support for the amendment from the Board Treasurer who was not present.

Mr. Allemang and Dr. Krieg accepted the amendment.

Board members discussed the proposed amendment including whether the additional language should be a separate board directive to stand on its own, so that it is not just tied to one project, but required for other projects, or if entering the language in the public record would ensure that it is not forgotten. It was noted that the language directs staff to work with the PMER and Governance Committees, and that will require additional discussion.

Charles Griffith suggested expanding the title of the resolution to include "AND INTENT TO ESTABLISH COST CONTROL BEST PRACTICES" to indicate for posterity an easier recovery of past decisions.

Sue Gott clarified her reasoning for suggesting a proposed amendment to the resolution. Ms. Gott indicated that from the time the project contract was presented, there was scrutiny about the project contingency and schedule, and whether or not the contract appropriately accommodated project needs. While there was a desire to work within a tight schedule and limited contingency, that was not successful. Ms. Gott suggested that in approving additional funding, there needed to be accountability as an organization that the approval is legitimate, learn from the project and make appropriate adjustments.

Jack Bernard suggested the importance of shared responsibility among board and staff with decisions made for the project.

Matt Carpenter attempted to clarify the intent of the proposed amendment, and supported further definition of roles for managing future projects.

Eric Mahler clarified Mr. Griffith's intent to amend the title of the resolution suggesting that the title read as follows: APPROVAL OF ADDITIONAL FUNDS FOR THE BLAKE TRANSIT CENTER RECONSTRUCTION CLOSEOUT **AND DEVELOPMENT OF PROJECT MANAGEMENT BEST PRACTICES PLANNING**

Sue Gott moved the amended resolution title read by Mr. Mahler. Mr. Allemang and Dr. Krieg supported the motion.

The amended resolution passed unanimously, and reads as follows.

Resolution 6/2016 Amended

APPROVAL OF ADDITIONAL FUNDS FOR THE BLAKE TRANSIT CENTER RECONSTRUCTION CLOSEOUT AND DEVELOPMENT OF PROJECT MANAGEMENT BEST PRACTICES PLANNING

WHEREAS, the Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority Board of Directors approved the authorization to execute contracts for the construction of a new Blake Transit Center (BTC) on October 18, 2012, and

WHEREAS, On May 15, 2014, the Board increased the total project amount by \$125,000, from \$8,128,988 to \$8,254,988 to cover construction change orders, and

WHEREAS, there is \$69,735 remaining in the original budget to complete the project, and

WHEREAS, additional expenses were incurred by both the architect and construction manager totaling \$241,198, and

WHEREAS, funding is available that can be used to pay for the aforementioned additional project costs without negatively affecting existing programs or services, and

WHEREAS, construction is complete and the building is open to the public,

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority Board of Directors increase the final total project amount authorized for the Blake Transit Center by \$175,000, from \$8,254,988 to \$8,429,988, and

<u>BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Board directs staff to work with PMER and</u> <u>Governance to establish a set of best practices for improved project management</u> <u>procedures as well as the appropriate associated cost controls.</u>

10.3 Routine Contract Approvals

Gillian Ream Gainsley moved the following resolution with support from Jack Bernard.

10.3.1 Janitorial Services

Resolution 7/2016

APPROVAL OF CONTRACTS FOR JANITORIAL SERVICES

WHEREAS, the Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority (AAATA) issued Request for Proposal (RFP) #2016-03 for Janitorial Services performed at the Main Facility, Blake Transit Center and the Ypsilanti Transit Center, and

WHEREAS, thirteen (13) responses were received, and

WHEREAS, AAATA staff evaluated the bids and determined that the submittal from RNA Facilities Management was found to be the most responsive and responsible of the thirteen (13) bids received, and

WHEREAS, the cost of janitorial services is expected to exceed \$100,000 over this five year award period, and Board policy requires advance authorization to incur products or services over \$100,000,

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority Board of Directors authorizes the Chief Executive Officer to purchase janitorial services from RNA Facilities Management of Ann Arbor, MI for a threeyear period, with an option to extend such contracts for two additional one-year periods, not to exceed five years in total under the same terms and conditions provided.

Staff was complimented for including an environmental impact component in background materials for assessing contracts. Michelle Whitlow responded to questions on the use of cleaning supplies with environmental aspects to them, and offered to provide additional information, if desired.

The motion passed unanimously.

Jack Bernard moved the following resolution with support from Larry Krieg.

10.3.2 General Architectural and Engineering Services

Resolution 8/2016

Approval of Contract for General Architecture & Engineering Services

WHEREAS, Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority (AAATA) Staff developed Request for Qualifications (RFQ) #2015-14 for General Architecture & Engineering Services, and

WHEREAS, eighty-four companies accessed or received notice of the RFQ from the Michigan Intergovernmental Trade Network (MITN), and

WHEREAS, four proposals were received, and

WHEREAS, staff evaluated the proposals using the criteria established within the RFQ and determined that the submittal from CHMP, Inc. of Grand Blanc, MI was found to be the most responsive and responsible, and

WHEREAS, the cost of service may exceed \$100,000, and Board policy requires advance authorization to incur products or services over \$100,000,

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority Board of Directors hereby authorizes execution of a contract with CHMP, Inc. of Grand Blanc, MI to provide General Architecture & Engineering Services for a three-year term, with renewal options for two additional one-year periods, if exercised by AAATA under the Contract Terms and Conditions. The total contract term shall not exceed five years.

Michelle Whitlow responded to an inquiry on the qualifications that made the recommended firm stand out. Ms. Whitlow noted the firm's overall experience, including experience with transit, knowledge of building ordinances, methodology, price and approach. Matt Carpenter offered to provide further details, if desired by the board.

The motion passed unanimously.

Gillian Ream Gainsley moved the following resolution with support from Mike Allemang.

10.3.3 Tires

Resolution 9/2016 Approval of Contract for New and Retread Transit Tires

WHEREAS, Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority (AAATA) Staff developed Invitation for Bid (IFB) #2015-21 for New and Retread Transit Tires, and

WHEREAS, eighteen companies accessed or received notice of the IFB from the Michigan Intergovernmental Trade Network (MITN), and

WHEREAS, five bids were received, and

WHEREAS, staff evaluated the bids using the criteria established within the IFB and determined that the submittals from Michelin North America, Inc. of Greenville, SC and Belle Tire Distributors, Inc. of Redford, MI were found to be the lowest responsive and responsible bidders, and

WHEREAS, the cost of service may exceed \$100,000, and Board policy requires advance authorization to incur products or services over \$100,000,

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority Board of Directors hereby authorizes execution of contract award to Michelin North America, Inc. of Greenville, SC (for the purchase of New Transit Tires) and Belle Tire Distributors, Inc. of Redford, MI (for the purchase of retreads, casings, rim conditioning and small vehicle tires and service) for a oneyear term, with renewal options for four additional one-year periods, if exercised by AAATA under the Contract Terms and Conditions. The total contract term for both firms shall not exceed five years.

Terry Black responded to a question on how tire bids are evaluated on price.

The motion passed unanimously.

11.0 Public Time

Michelle Barney appeared before the Board. Ms. Barney commented on an event she witnessed on an AAATA bus when another passenger was having difficulty navigating a wheelchair into the securement area. Ms. Barney indicated that the passenger did not speak English well, which made it difficult for the driver to communicate with the individual. The situation was eventually resolved, but made the bus 20 minutes late. Ms. Barney indicated that she encountered two other situations recently when there

was a delay with securing a mobility device, and asked what procedures could be put in place to resolve this type of situation more quickly.

No one further appearing, Mr. Mahler declared Public Time closed.

12.0 <u>Adjourn</u>

Gillian Ream Gainsley moved to adjourn the meeting with support from Charles Griffith. The motion passed unanimously, and the meeting adjourned at 8:23 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Stephen Wade