



# City of Ann Arbor

301 E. Huron St.  
Ann Arbor, MI 48104  
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

## Meeting Minutes Energy Commission

---

Tuesday, April 14, 2015

6:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St,  
Second floor, City Council chambers

---

### CALL TO ORDER

### ROLL CALL

**Present:** 8 - Charles Hookham, Kim Wolske, Mike Shriberg, Mark Clevey, Shoshannah Lenski, Stephen Raiman, Christopher Taylor, and Wayne Appleyard

**Absent:** 3 - Brigit Macomber, Erik Eibert, and Kenneth J. Wadland

### APPROVAL OF AGENDA

ENP presentation about downtown zoning premiums added to agenda.

Approved unanimously on a voice vote

### APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Approved unanimously on a voice vote.

### 15-0429

**Attachments:** Energy Commission Minutes 2-10-15.pdf

### PUBLIC INPUT

None.

### ENERGY REPORT - NEWS FROM THE ENERGY OFFICE AND COMMISSIONERS

**Geisler:** An electric vehicle and charging stations workshop will be held 4/16 at 9 AM in the DDA offices in Ann Arbor, along with 3 others in the state this month. The Drive Electric Ann Arbor Partnership will be launching a workplace charging challenge at the event and Clean Energy Coalition will discuss their grants for small businesses, local government, and non-profits to match installing EV charging stations.

Earth Day for Ann Arbor is Sunday 4/19 at the Leslie Science and Nature Center from Noon to 4 PM.

May 5 will be the Energy Conference and Exhibition put on by DTE and the Engineering Society of Detroit, with a theme of Energy Efficiency. Location: Suburban Collection Showplace in Novi, from 8 AM to 3 PM. Details and registration at [www.esd.org](http://www.esd.org)

A community solar in Michigan update will be held on April 27 at 7 PM at the Michigan Energy Options, 405 Grove St in East Lansing (John Sarver presenting).

The wind energy grant from the US Dept. of Energy has been modified to a focus on educational components. At City Council's first meeting in May they will be presented with a contract with the Hands On Museum to develop exhibits and programming for wind and renewables.

Appleyard: Tomorrow in Adrian at Siena Heights University, Mark Jacobson presenting on 100% renewable paths for states and the country.

### Traffic System Presentation - Les Sipowski

Mr. Sipowski discussed Ann Arbor's history with a progressive traffic control system. Various systems were combined over the years and optimized wherever possible, with redundancies added. One of most advanced systems now in Michigan. Includes time of day and adaptive technologies (most sophisticated portions on arterial roads), and the presentation went over various maps of the system throughout the city.

Energy and environmental impacts are built into modeling and optimization of the system. Fuel use emissions can be reported out and show that we are making a difference reducing gas use.

Mr. Sipowski discussed a study of 61 vehicle trips over multiple months that characterized stopping and flow patterns that will help future refinement of the system.

Raiman: When you optimize model, are you only trying to minimize trip time or carbon emissions (are they the same thing)?

Sipowski: Almost the same thing. When idling is reduced emissions are reduced, so each follows the other.

Lenski: Are there other systems other cities use that in a perfect world we would go to next? Cities at the forefront?

Sipowski: Not many but more or coming online. More adaptive systems are expensive. We have looked at Toronto, which has used similar system at a larger scale. Minneapolis pulled the plug on a similar system. Seattle is moving to traffic responsive systems.

Clevey: Are buses included in the data?

Sipowski: Yes. Working on ways to lower delays with the The Ride - though software they use is not all compatible with ours.

The full content of Mr. Sipowski's presentation is available at the following web link (8:46 - 39:29)

<http://a2govtv.pegcentral.com/player.php?video=505ae297271deb6bed7a9b8c78acbfd0>

### Downtown Zoning Premiums - Libby Levy (ENP & Associates)

Levy: Premiums mean the receipt of a larger "floor area ratio" (FAR) for a

building if meeting certain requirements by the developer for things like energy efficiency and other desired outcomes. In 2009 downtown premiums were added in Ann Arbor. Height and floor area ratio limits were then instituted. A recent study shows a population growth in downtown, largely resulting from some of these changes. In the new D1 district you can get an additional 700 FAR or 400 FAR in D2 district. If affordable housing is provided, there is an additional premium to go up to 900 FAR in D1, but no one has used this yet. For every affordable housing unit you can get 3,000 extra square feet.

Continuing the process of reaching out to the public and commissions for what is desired for premiums to match community goals. We have qualifiers that get developers in the door, big premiums/"carrots" too. You cannot be in the floodplain. You must also meet 2 points on LEED. LEED components in the premiums now seen as possibly out dated. LEED Silver, Gold, and Platinum currently possible among the bigger premiums but there may be interest in revisiting whether LEED is the right metric. Housing affordability is the main element of trying to achieve "housing diversity."

Interest in the Energy Commission's opinion on: a higher bar for energy efficiency, moving to LEED 4, zero waste construction, energy tracking (10 years), link to the Climate Action Plan.

Raiman: Do developers build as much FAR without meeting the premiums? Has there been an analysis on carbon impact of incentivizing downtown development in this way?

Levy: Residential FAR enough incentive to get to their max, but hearing that meeting the basic LEED requirements is very simple. Only one project has gone to LEED Silver. No formal analysis on carbon and environmental impacts of these premiums yet. We have met with groups of people with varied views on density and issue of benefits.

Appleyard: Has anyone discussed how to do design-based premiums, as it is all in the eye of the beholder.

Levy: Some cities are mandating design review by committees or staff. We want to hear all ideas and then try to determine from them what is or is not feasible.

Shriberg: Is the LEED penalty mostly what is holding developers back?

Levy: If folks can get the premiums they want with the residential premium, then they stop there. (Shriberg stated that is the leverage point is reducing or substituting for the residential premium for the LEED or energy efficiency requirements.)

Levy: April 23rd will be a large public meeting (7 PM at Workentile). A goal is by October to gather feedback. An online survey exists at: [www.a2gov.org/premiums](http://www.a2gov.org/premiums) - encouraging public to fill this out.

## **Biodigester - Comm. Hookham**

Hookham: Anaerobic digestion being used universally. You have a feedstock that comes in. A variety of waste products come in, go into the big box of the digester. What comes out is a biogas product - largely methane, with heat content. Biofertilizer also comes out. Biogas can be fired in a generator, or stored, or used in vehicles. Mostly it is used for electricity, otherwise flared.

Solid products that come out can be used for farming. Largest system in MI is 10 MW system in Freemont.

Wastewater treatment plants often source these. Our WWTP does not have digestion and is quite removed from other organic sources; fairly isolated. City commissioned a feasibility study earlier this year. The financial model was basic in my view. Several assumption on values, but the net present value came out positive. There would need to be more assessment done to green light a project. Different feedstocks make a difference. Facilities that really do well are located near feedstocks. You could use UM and farmer material, but need continuous supply. It would be difficult to accept current plan but there are lots of benefits: always processing something a value, but once it starts you have to keep it going in order for it all to work.

Clevey: Could this be designed as a modular system that could be added to without great cost?

Hookham: It's all scalable. Will need a constant supply, and you have traffic coming in and out. Generators make some noise. So location is key.

Appleyard: Does feedstock fluctuate in the winter at the Freemont facility?

Hookham: Most of their stock is not manure/ag based. There is a nearby processing plant with fats and greases.

Shriberg asked where the City is at with any next steps.

Staff explained the response is similar to Commissioner Hookham's reaction and that presently a further evaluation/study is programmed into the upcoming CIP and that an attempt is being made to properly cost out that next evaluation.

Hookham further stated that feedstock sources is where the attention should go next and how far to go for it.

Appleyard made the point that some sources who may be using landfills may want to redirect their dumping when tipping fees go up in the near future and is that another potential source(?).

## Resolution Supporting Community Energy Resourcing

Appleyard: This did pass without changes at Environmental Commission (and is headed to Planning).

This would go to Council and they would ask the Administrator to review progress and allotment of resources for the Climate Action Plan (CAP). Are we applying enough resources to make progress?

Hookham stated an interest in understanding where the CAP fits among the Administrator's priorities and purview.

Taylor clarified that the resolution reads as a needs assessment: where are we at with the CAP, what do we need to affect it given the balance of multiple duties and interests of the Administrator.

In the Resolved clause a small correction is needed and change of "Environmental" to "Energy" Commission.

Appleyard asked for a motion for approval which was moved by Commissioner Clevey and seconded by Commissioner Shriberg (passed unanimously).

### Commission Retreat Discussion

Appleyard: We are thinking we should wait until more members can be appointed before having the retreat. We do still have times set up to talk with Jane Vogel to gather your input.

Group agreed to wait until more members join the Commission. Using the June work session was discussed as a possible date.

Clevey stated that representatives of the faith community would be welcome additions.

### COMMITTEE UPDATES

#### Climate Action Plan

Geisler: Close to landing on the branding idea for the Community Climate Partnership and how the CAP is presented in the community. Presently the idea is also to model an effort in Cleveland called "Celebration Years" where you focus summits and events around one topic from the Plan. Here we may be doing Celebration Seasons.

Shriberg said June's Green Fair is a target for a launch for the concept.

#### Community Solar/Renewable Energy Access

Appleyard: Visited a conference at Toledo's art museum. There are 25 solar installs of at least a megawatt each in the state. Their legislature and Governor are backing off their RPS and reducing their incentives.

Clevey stated the idea of Ann Arbor buying a block of any community solar offering DTE brings out. Lenski confirmed larger demand customers likely would make up the bulk of the capacity of a program.

#### Sustainable Funding

Appleyard: Reaching out to other communities to see what they are doing through the Urban Sustainability Director's Network - as of yet no responses to inquiry.

#### Nuclear

No update.

#### PUBLIC INPUT

None.

**ITEMS FOR NEXT AGENDA**

**Community Solar concept from Dave Friedrichs (Homeland Builders)**

**ADJOURNMENT**

**Motion to adjourn moved by Raiman and seconded by Shriberg at 7:40 PM.**

-----

**Visit [www.a2energy.org](http://www.a2energy.org) for community energy information in Ann Arbor,  
or  
[www.a2gov.org/energy](http://www.a2gov.org/energy) to learn more about the City's Energy Programs**

**Regular meetings shown Live and replayed on CTN Channel 16 and at [www.a2gov.org/ctn](http://www.a2gov.org/ctn)**