



# City of Ann Arbor

## Formal Minutes

### Planning Commission, City

301 E. Huron St.  
Ann Arbor, MI 48104  
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

---

Tuesday, November 18, 2014

7:00 PM Washtenaw County Building, 220 N. Main St., board room

---

Commission public meetings are held the first and third Tuesday of each month. Both of these meetings provide opportunities for the public to address the Commission. Persons with disabilities are encouraged to participate in public meetings. Citizens requiring translation or sign language services or other reasonable accommodations may contact the City Clerk's office at 734.794.6140; via e-mail to: [cityclerk@a2gov.org](mailto:cityclerk@a2gov.org); or by written request addressed and mailed or delivered to: City Clerk's Office, 301 E. Huron St., Ann Arbor, MI 48104. Requests need to be received at least two (2) business days in advance of the meeting. Planning Commission meeting agendas and packets are available from the Legislative Information Center on the City Clerk's page of the City's website (<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>) or on the 1st floor of City Hall on the Friday before the meeting. Agendas and packets are also sent to subscribers of the City's email notification service, GovDelivery. You can subscribe to this free service by accessing the City's website and clicking on the 'Subscribe to Updates' envelope on the home page.

#### 1 CALL TO ORDER

*Chair Woods called the meeting to order at 7:04 p.m.*

#### 2 ROLL CALL

*Wendy Rampson called the roll.*

**Present** 6 - Bona, Woods, Adenekan, Briere, Peters, and Mills

**Absent** 2 - Clein, and Franciscus

#### 3 INTRODUCTIONS

#### 4 MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING

[14-1651](#) City Planning Commission Meeting Minutes of October 21, 2014

**Moved by Peters, seconded by Adenekan, that the minutes be approved by the Commission and forwarded to the City Council. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.**

#### 5 APPROVAL OF AGENDA

*Bona stated that the Commission would discuss the proposed land*

*division under the Commission Proposed Business section of the agenda.*

**Moved by Briere, seconded by Bona, that the agenda be approved as presented. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.**

**ROLLCALL**

*Franciscus arrived at 7:10 p.m.*

**Present** 7 - Bona, Woods, Adenekan, Briere, Peters, Franciscus, and Mills

**Absent** 1 - Clein

**6 REPORTS FROM CITY ADMINISTRATION, CITY COUNCIL, PLANNING MANAGER, PLANNING COMMISSION OFFICERS AND COMMITTEES, WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS AND PETITIONS**

**6-a City Council**

*Briere reported that at the previous night’s Council meeting, the Council approved \$78,000 to cover the winter warming emergency needs for homeless people. She said the Council felt this was an important thing to do, adding that the County Board will consider covering the additional 50% of the cost at their next meeting. She explained that this will provide shelter for more than 100 individuals, some of which will be occur at non-profits, churches or the Delonis Center.*

**6-b Planning Manager**

*Rampson reported that at the previous night’s Council meeting, there was a scheduled first reading for the Main Street overlay zoning, which is associated with the property at 425 South Main Street. At the request of the property owner, Briere asked that the item be postponed until the December 1st, meeting, to allow them to present proposals set forth by the Ordinance Revisions Committee, and if those proposals would be approved at first reading, the item would be scheduled for public hearing and decision at the first meeting in January 2015.*

*Rampson further reported that the Planning Commission would be holding a Working Session on December 9th , when the Draft Affordable Housing Needs Assessment will be presented. She said at the January meeting they will also be discussing the East Huron Overlay District.*

**6-c Planning Commission Officers and Committees**

*Bona reported that the Ordinance Revisions Committee, at their next meeting, will be looking at the consultant contract for the downtown premiums as well as the R4C zoning, including whether to start with the combined lots issue separately or look at the R4C changes as a package.*

*Peters reported that the previous week he attended his first meeting of the DDA Partnership Development Committee and noted the following; they recommended approval of the partial grant for the water main at The Mark development, which will be considered at the full meeting in December; the Y parking issues surrounding the daycare were discussed; parking renovations are being completed; the DDA is lobbying in Lansing for the transit package; and WCC is beginning an intelligent transportation design program in association with other Universities.*

**6-d Written Communications and Petitions**

[14-1652](#) Various Correspondences to the City Planning Commission

**Received and Filed**

**7 AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION (Persons may speak for three minutes about an item that is NOT listed as a public hearing on this agenda. Please state your name and address for the record.)**

*Arthur Williams, 1899 Upland Drive, Ann Arbor, said he was speaking to the proposed division of the 1854 Upland Drive parcel and the character of the street. He said most of those who have purchased properties on the street did so because of its rural and pastoral feel in an area that's in the City. He said the seller, Mary Taggert, who was born and raised on the parcel, had expressed her desire that the parcel not be divided after she left. He said he has lived on this street for 18 years and purchased his property because of the ambiance of the street. He said he knows the parcel can legally be divided but questioned if it was the right thing to do, noting that there is a difference between doing what's right versus doing right.*

*Donna Babcock (with Herb Babcock) said she was the one who purchased Mary Taggert's house and was dismayed to learn of Mr. Lin's proposal to divide the neighboring parcel into 4 parcels. She said they had two neighbors who are in their 90's who live on this street and felt it was unfortunate that Mr. Lin couldn't attend the meeting tonight. She said she checked before purchasing their house recently and didn't hear anything about the proposed land division.*

*Jim Buck, 1887 Upland Drive, Ann Arbor, said he lives directly across from the lot proposed to be divided, noting that all the houses on the dirt street are 1 acre or ½ acre, and he was worried about the Fire Department’s capability of fighting fires after the lot is divided. He said they moved to the area because of the quiet tranquility, and a land division will mean more traffic and deterioration of the road.*

**8      PUBLIC HEARINGS SCHEDULED FOR NEXT BUSINESS MEETING**

**14-1653**      Public Hearings Scheduled for the December 2, 2014 City Planning Commission Meeting  
*Chair Woods read the public hearing notice as published.*

**9      UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

**10     REGULAR BUSINESS - Staff Report, Public Hearing and Commission Discussion of Each Item**

(If an agenda item is tabled, it will most likely be rescheduled to a future date. If you would like to be notified when a tabled agenda item will appear on a future agenda, please provide your email address on the form provided on the front table at the meeting. You may also call Planning and Development Services at 734-794-6265 during office hours to obtain additional information about the review schedule or visit the Planning page on the City’s website ([www.a2gov.org](http://www.a2gov.org)).)

(Public Hearings: Individuals may speak for three minutes. The first person who is the official representative of an organized group or who is representing the petitioner may speak for five minutes; additional representatives may speak for three minutes. Please state your name and address for the record.)

(Comments about a proposed project are most constructive when they relate to: (1) City Code requirements and land use regulations, (2) consistency with the City Master Plan, or (3) additional information about the area around the petitioner’s property and the extent to which a proposed project may positively or negatively affect the area.)

**14-1654**      Plum Market at 3601 Plymouth Road Rezoning and Site Plan - A proposal to rezone this 2.96 acre parcel from PUD (Planned Unit Development) to C3 (Fringe Commercial) to allow use of the existing educational building as a grocery store and construct a 4,639 square foot one-story addition to the north side of the building. The parking lot will be reconfigured while retaining the same number of parking spaces. (Ward 2) Staff Recommendation: Postponement  
*Chris Cheng provided the staff report.*

**PUBLIC HEARING:**

*Noting no speakers, the Chair closed the public hearing, unless the Commission postpones the item. She stated that if the item is postponed, the public hearing will be continued and individuals who have not previously addressed the Commission may speak at the continued public hearing. Individuals who have addressed the Commission previously during the public hearing may speak again during the continued public hearing if the Chair determines additional public feedback is necessary or if the petition has materially changed from that presented this evening.*

**Moved by Briere, seconded by Adenekan, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the Plum Market rezoning from PUD (Planned Unit Development District) to C3 (Fringe Commercial District) and**

**The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the Plum Market Site Plan, subject to granting of easements for existing public utilities and public access for sidewalk along Plymouth Road prior to issuance of building permits.**

**COMMISSION DISCUSSION:**

*Briere asked about the traffic study, and said she would like to understand how it was possible that the proposed counts for the grocery store would be less than those going to Cleary University. She said the counts surprised her.*

*Cheng said he had spoken with the City's traffic engineer, who reviewed the report and accepted the information.*

*Briere asked about the proposed project across the street and if there is any anticipated problem with the turning movements when exiting the site onto Plymouth Road.*

*Cheng said the City's Traffic Engineer had taken into account the proposed bank across the street and said there is enough queuing for both uses and would not worsen conditions. He explained that there is a 300 foot allowance for queuing between the entrance and development, which was acceptable.*

*Briere said she was not sure she was getting the answers that she needed.*

*Bona asked the petitioner to step forward.*

*Matthew Jonna, President and co-founder of Plum Market, said they have been serving the community for over 40 years, and are excited to be expanding their Michigan based business in Ann Arbor. He said they are also looking to move part of their headquarters to Ann Arbor. He introduced his project team to the Commission.*

*Bona said the Commission doesn't often see shared access drive sites, which makes for fewer curb-cuts and makes for fewer vehicular/pedestrian conflicts, which is a positive aspect. She asked about the pedestrian access, noting that it was a positive to have it along the street, but there did not appear to be a good connection between the hotel and their store. She asked if they could fix this issue.*

*Jonna said they had met with the owners of Big Boy, who shared that they want to re-do their parking when Plum Market does their site work, and in cooperation they continue to work with CVS and would like to re-pave the whole service drive to Green Road before they open for business. He said they will work on the connection.*

*Bona said she would like to see a connection to the north and asked for a note to be added to the site plan that would say "adjusted based on adjacent sites".*

*Bona said she was disappointed in the elevations that are not entries, noting the four exposed sides. She said she was hoping that the area could be robustly landscaped.*

*Jonna said it is quite wooded between their property and CVS.*

*Mark Ehgotz, the architect for the project, said that they are not adding onto the west elevation, and the area between them and CVS is so wooded it is hard to see as it is from Plymouth Road. He said on the northern elevation there are 2 new trees that are not shown on the elevation drawings.*

*Bona asked for the trees to be added to the elevation drawings when the site plan moved on to Council, as well as photographs of what is currently on the site. She asked about the pedestrian path and if there was some hindrance for cars from accessing the path.*

*Ehgotz said a concrete curb would stop the cars.*

*Bona said she felt that a business like Plum Market should do more than the minimal requirement in providing pedestrian access, given their Green reputation.*

*Matthew Bush, engineer for project, explained that they are limited by the ordinance for the required parking spaces as well as the bio-retention island requirements. He said given the geometry, they are limited and the layout of the site doesn't allow for extra pedestrian access.*

*Bona said greenspace and parking always trumps pedestrian access, which she felt shouldn't be necessary, since all were important.*

*Rampson commented that staff would work with the petitioner to see if there were any possible alternatives given the site layout.*

*Mills said she liked the idea of re-using what they can and then adding on, as well as the extra bike parking, and that the bike parking is right up front and covered. She asked for clarification where the bike racks would be located.*

*Adenekan said she agreed with Bona, adding that she was delighted that no landmark trees were going to be impacted.*

*Peters asked for clarity on the traffic study.*

*Bush clarified that they had done an analysis of all the crash reports that occurred over the past 5 years, and it showed that there were 0 crashes based on left turn incidents into that existing driveway. He said there was 1 crash based on someone shooting across all 6 lanes. He said the use code was developed and the math works out based on the uses.*

*Jonna said they have 20 stores and noted that having access on Green Road is a huge benefit to them. He said they will do a \$12 million investment on this location.*

*Briere commented that her concern was regarding turns exiting the site, since the proposed development across the street will only allow right turns and she was curious if Plum Market would have a similar restriction.*

*Cheng said if there are issues in the future, the traffic engineer will follow up with possible restricted turns.*

*Briere said she hoped that the petitioner would consider putting a bike and pedestrian path along the shared drive.*

*Woods said she had concerns regarding the turning movement parity, similar to Briere, and understands the situation as outlined.*

*Rampson noted the proposed change in zoning for this specific site.*

*Bona said she was comfortable with the zoning and felt it was the right zoning, given its proximity to Plymouth Road.*

**VOTE ON ZONING:**

**On a roll call, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion carried.**

**Yeas:** 7 - Bonnie Bona, Wendy Woods, Eleanore Adenekan, Sabra Briere, Jeremy Peters, Sofia Franciscus, and Sarah Mills

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 2 - Kirk Westphal, and Kenneth Clein

**VOTE ON SITE PLAN:**

**On a roll call, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion carried.**

**Yeas:** 7 - Bonnie Bona, Wendy Woods, Eleanore Adenekan, Sabra Briere, Jeremy Peters, Sofia Franciscus, and Sarah Mills

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 2 - Kirk Westphal, and Kenneth Clein

**11 AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION (Persons may speak for three minutes on any item.)**

*None*

**12 COMMISSION PROPOSED BUSINESS**

*Bona asked staff to review the land division process.*

*Rampson reviewed the land division process, including the state Land Division Act, with the Commission.*

*Bona noted that the zoning occurred when the parcel was annexed, and the zoning designation is not new. She asked about paving of the road.*

*Briere noted that regarding the fire safety in the area, it would need to comply with the City's fire hydrant coverage. She asked Rampson about the drives.*

*Rampson explained the code allows for up to two parcels that don't front on a public street to have a shared drive and noted that the fire*

*department has reviewed the layout and approved the proposed access.*

*Briere explained that due to the minimal size of this project, it would not require a site plan.*

*Fransiscus said she was concerned with the precedent that the land division in this subdivision might set, given the habitation and enjoyment of the property as well as for the neighbors.*

*Rampson noted that the zoning is R1, which is for single-family homes.*

*Woods stated that land divisions are a part of Ann Arbor's administrative process and she thanked the public for participating in the process.*

### **13      ADJOURNMENT**

**Moved by Mills, seconded by Peters, that the meeting be adjourned at 8:25 p.m. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.**

Wendy Woods, Chair  
mg

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Channel 16 live at 7:00 p.m. on the first and third Tuesdays of the month and replayed the following Wednesdays at 10:00 AM and Sundays at 2:00 PM. Recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website ([www.a2gov.org](http://www.a2gov.org)).

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at [www.a2gov.org/ctn](http://www.a2gov.org/ctn), or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.