



# City of Ann Arbor

301 E. Huron St.  
Ann Arbor, MI 48104  
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

## Meeting Minutes City Planning Commission

---

Tuesday, July 17, 2012

7:00 PM

City Hall, 301 E. Huron Street, 2nd Flr.

---

Commission public meetings are held the first and third Tuesday of each month. Both of these meetings provide opportunities for the public to address the Commission. Persons with disabilities are encouraged to participate. Accommodations, including sign language interpreters, may be arranged by contacting the City Clerk's Office at 734-794-6140 (V/TDD) at least 24 hours in advance. Planning Commission meeting agendas and packets are available from the Legislative Information Center on the City Clerk's page of the City's website (<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>) or on the 1st floor of City Hall on the Friday before the meeting. Agendas and packets are also sent to subscribers of the City's email notification service, GovDelivery. You can subscribe to this free service by accessing the City's website and clicking on the red envelope at the top of the home page.

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Channel 16 live at 7:00 p.m. on the first and third Tuesdays of the month and replayed the following Wednesdays at 10:00 AM and Sundays at 2:00 PM. Recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website ([www.a2gov.org](http://www.a2gov.org)).

### 1 CALL TO ORDER

*Chair Mahler called the meeting to order at 7:00 pm.*

### 2 ROLL CALL

**Present** 6 - Bona, Mahler, Westphal, Giannola, Adenekan, and Clein

**Absent** 3 - Pratt, Woods, and Derezinski

### 3 APPROVAL OF AGENDA

**A motion was made by Adenekan, seconded by Secretary Giannola, that the Agenda be approved to hear item 11b before 11a. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.**

### 4 **12-0942** ORGANIZATION OF COMMISSION

#### **Election of Officers (Article V of Bylaws)**

4-a (1) Chair

**Moved by Bona, seconded by Giannola, that Kirk Westphal be nominated for the office of Chair. On a voice vote, Chair Mahler declared the motion carried.**

4-b (2) Vice Chair

**Moved by Westphal, seconded by Bona, that Wendy Woods be nominated for**

the office of Vice-Chair. On a voice vote, Chair Mahler declared the motion carried.

4-c (3) Secretary

Moved by Westphal, seconded by Giannola, that Bonnie Bona be nominated for the office of Secretary. On a voice vote, Chair Mahler declared the motion carried.

*At this point, Mahler stepped down and Westphal assumed the position of Chair.*

#### 4-d Review of Bylaws (Article XIV of the Bylaws)

*Rampson explained that the By-laws had been updated within the last two years, and unless Commission had specific amendments, staff is recommending that the by-laws remain unchanged.*

#### 4-e Public Notice and Input Overview

*Westphal called attention to the handout provided at the podium outlining the Planning Commission's notice requirements and public input opportunities.*

*Mahler noted this information is also available at the Planning Services website at [www.a2gov.org/planning](http://www.a2gov.org/planning).*

### 5 INTRODUCTIONS

*Westphal welcomed Ken Clein as the newest Planning Commissioner and asked him to introduce himself.*

*Clein said he is an architect with Quinn Evans. He said he is a resident of the First Ward and has lived in Michigan for 14 years.*

### 6 MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING

6-a 12-0945 City Planning Commission Meeting Minutes of May 15, 2012

**A motion was made by Adenekan, seconded by Secretary Giannola, that the Minutes be Approved by the Commission and forwarded to the City Council and should be returned by 8/20/2012. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.**

6-b 12-0957 City Planning Commission Meeting Minutes of June 5, 2012

**A motion was made by Adenekan, seconded by Secretary Giannola, that the Minutes be Approved by the Commission and forwarded to the City Council and should be returned by 8/20/2012. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.**

**7 REPORTS FROM CITY ADMINISTRATION, CITY COUNCIL, PLANNING MANAGER, PLANNING COMMISSION OFFICERS AND COMMITTEES, WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS AND PETITIONS**

**a City Council**

**b Planning Manager**

*Rampson noted that given the length of the agenda she would update the Commission later.*

**c Planning Commission Officers and Committees**

*Bona reported that North Main Huron River Task Force had its first meeting last week, which was mainly to get organized. She noted the Task Force will have its own webpage, which will contain the proceedings and background documents. She said the next meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, August 8 from 5-7 pm. She said the Task Force will be conducting two tours of the area; one on July 25 and the other on August 1. She said both tours will be open to the public.*

*Mahler reported that the Ordinance Revisions Committee met to discuss R4C/R2A committee recommendations. He said they are in the process of gathering more information and will bring back their responses to the Commission. He said that the ZORO Technical Committee has met several times, and a public meeting is scheduled on August 2. He noted that ZORO is on schedule to move forward to Council in November.*

**d Written Communications and Petitions**

**12-0944** Various Correspondence to the Planning Commission

Received and Filed

**8 AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION (Persons may speak for three minutes about an item that is NOT listed as a public hearing on this agenda. Please state your name and address for the record.)**

*None.*

**9 PUBLIC HEARINGS SCHEDULED FOR NEXT BUSINESS MEETING**

**10 UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

**10-a 12-0950** Speedway Gas Station Site Plan for City Council Approval - A proposal to demolish the existing vacant gas station building and construct a new 3,968 sq ft gas station/convenience store building, fire pump island with canopy, and 16 parking spaces on this 1.39 acres site at 1300 North Maple Road. Staff Recommendation: Approval

*Kowalski presented the staff report.*

*PUBLIC HEARING:*

*Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.*

**Moved by Bona, seconded by Giannola, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the Speedway (1300 North Maple Road) Rezoning from PL (Public Land District) to C3 (Fringe Commercial District). On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried.**

**Yeas:** 6 - Bonnie Bona, Eric A. Mahler, Kirk Westphal, Diane Giannola, Eleanore Adenekan, and Kenneth Clein

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 3 - Evan Pratt, Wendy Woods, and Tony Derezinski

*COMMISSION DISCUSSION:*

*Bona asked the staff position on keeping invasive species in the conflicting land use buffer.*

*Kowalski said this was reviewed by the landscape reviewer, who noted that planting the required trees and removing all of the existing vegetation would reduce the screening.*

*Bona said she supports the landscape modification request.*

*Clein said that he agrees that we would want a denser buffer. He commented that the material on the side of the building is not noted on the plan and asked for clarification.*

*Kowalski referred the question to the petitioner.*

*Kevin Foley, representative from Speedway, said they will have a hipped roof with commercial asphalt shingles. He said the building is a masonry block/structural block that gives the appearance of brick.*

**Moved by Mahler, seconded by Bona, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby approves the proposed landscape modifications in order to use existing vegetation to count toward the requirements for the Conflicting Land Use buffer, according to Chapter 62 (Landscape and Screening Ordinance), Section 5:608(2)(c)(v). On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried**

**Yeas:** 6 - Bonnie Bona, Eric A. Mahler, Kirk Westphal, Diane Giannola, Eleanore Adenekan, and Kenneth Clein

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 3 - Evan Pratt, Wendy Woods, and Tony Derezinski

**Moved by Mahler, seconded by Bona, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the Speedway Site Plan, subject to approval of the plan by the Washtenaw County Water Resources Commissioner. On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried.**

**Yeas:** 6 - Bonnie Bona, Eric A. Mahler, Kirk Westphal, Diane Giannola, Eleanore Adenekan, and Kenneth Clein

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Evan Pratt, Wendy Woods, and Tony Derezinski

**11**      **REGULAR BUSINESS - Staff Report, Public Hearing and Commission Discussion of Each Item**

(If an agenda item is tabled, it will most likely be rescheduled to a future date. If you would like to be notified when a tabled agenda item will appear on a future agenda, please provide your email address on the form provided on the front table at the meeting. You may also call Planning and Development Services at 734-794-6265 during office hours to obtain additional information about the review schedule or visit the Planning page on the City's website (www.a2gov.org).)

(Public Hearings: Individuals may speak for three minutes. The first person who is the official representative of an organized group or who is representing the petitioner may speak for five minutes; additional representatives may speak for three minutes. Please state your name and address for the record.)

(Comments about a proposed project are most constructive when they relate to: (1) City Code requirements and land use regulations, (2) consistency with the City Master Plan, or (3) additional information about the area around the petitioner's property and the extent to which a proposed project may positively or negatively affect the area.)

- 11-b**      **12-0948**      922-926 Catherine Street Rezoning and Site Plan for City Council Approval - A request to combine and rezone these 0.52 acre vacant sites from PUD [Planned Unit Development] to R4C [Multi-Family Dwelling] and construct a 3-story, 5-unit multiple-family building with 9 parking spaces under the building. Staff Recommendation: Approval
- Rampson and Cheng presented the staff report.*

*PUBLIC HEARING:*

*Jayne Thorson, 998 Catherine Street, representing Catherine Commons, the residential building just to the east of the site, said she has some concerns about the proposal. She just became aware of the request for the four foot buffer along the east, which seems inadequate. She said her major concern involves the storm water drainage. She said currently, the storm drain is inadequate. She sent a letter to Mr. Fitzsimmons and spoke to staff and read this to the Commission describing storm main problems. She said that during a heavy rain, they put a mat over the drain, which obstructs the flow and allows the lower drain to enter the street. She expressed concern that if the grassy area is paved, this run-off will drain into the same storm drain and they will be flooded.*

*Edward Yee, 1000 Catherine Street, resident of Catherine Commons, said he has experienced flooding. He said this is a downhill slope, and for some reason at the entrance to the parking structure, the water crosses over to the south side of the street. He said the residents presented their concerns to City staff of the street's department, whom indicated they would put in a larger drain, but this went by without them getting a larger storm pipe from Catherine to Glen Avenue. He said they have spoken to the current street department staff and have been dismissed and told they might have to pay for it themselves. He said he concurs with Thorson that they will be losing a lot of ground that currently absorbs a lot of the rainfall.*

*Chris Crockett, 506 E. Kingsley Street, president of the Old Fourth Ward Association,*

said a number of residents met with Tom Fitzsimmons in the early stages of the design. She said the design is compatible with the historic district and will bring more residents to the neighborhood. She said she is not in a position to comment about the storm water issues and noted it is a problem that occurs on Catherine Street. She said these items need to be resolved for this development and the current condo development. Property owners immediately to the west and others who attended agreed that this would be a good development, noting that the new condos face onto Catherine. She said she hopes they can resolve any outstanding issues.

Julie Ritter, 920 Catherine, said this is a wonderful project and she hopes this is approved. She hopes the water run-off issue can be resolved. She said she knows there was a lot of roadwork done on Glen and hopes that they installed new sewers at the same time.

Tom Fitzsimmons, developer, introduced Lincoln Polley and Chet Hill from his design team. He said he met with neighbors, including Catherine Commons. He said the storm water issue has caught him by surprise, and stressed that they will be reducing the flow by providing underground detention for their development. He said he hopes the Commission takes that into consideration.

Chet Hill, Johnson Hill Land Ethics, said that he can assure that there will be less surface run-off than currently, since they will be capturing all run-off water in an underground storm water detention system which will be located under the drive. That water will then be released at a lesser flow into the storm water system. He stated that their development will not increase the water problem, as it has been explained, and believed the issue was really a street problem. He noted that the landscaping far exceeds the requirements, to make it fit into the neighborhood. He said the Land use buffer issue will go to the Zoning Board of Appeals. He added that while there is a lot of proposed hard surface, the open space exceeds City requirements for development of this size.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

**Moved by Bona, seconded by Mahler, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the 922-926 Catherine Street rezoning from PUD (Planned Unit Development District) to R4C (Multiple-Family Residential District).**

and

**The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the 922-926 Catherine Street Site Plan, subject to City Council approval of the requested rezoning to R4C (Multiple-Family Residential District); approval from the Zoning Board of Appeals for variances from the conflicting land use buffer requirement; and combining both lots before building permits are issued.**

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

Mahler asked why the applicant is requesting to rezone to R4C rather than leaving the site as a PUD.

Cheng said rezoning makes this project 'by-right'.

Rampson said the PUD zoning for this site was approved [1979] before the City required supplemental regulations, so it would now require a separate zoning district to be developed.

*Bona said it took some time to clarify landscape requirements. She said there are actually two landscape variances: one to allow existing trees on the west side to constitute part of the landscape buffer, and that is what the Planning Commission is voting on, the second is the 4 foot conflicting land use buffer on the east side, which will go before the Zoning Board of Appeals approval.*

*Cheng agreed, noting that the west side is the landscape modification request and the east side is asking for a variance from the width and the required trees in the conflicting land use buffer. Cheng explained that the 15 foot wide conflicting land use buffer is something that is fairly new in the ordinance for the R3 and R34 Zoning Districts that are adjacent to other residentially zoned projects.*

*Bona noted that the Ordinance Revisions Committee had brought a request to change the ordinance, before the Commission and the Council, but the City Council had not accepted the proposal. She said she doesn't have a problem with using existing landscaping and the landscaping plan is generous. She asked Mr. Hill about what size storm event the project was designed for and how it relates to larger events.*

*Hill said he wished he could give concrete answer, but the engineer who did the calculations was not present, but believed it was designed for the 100 year storm event. Hill stated that he cannot speculate about past storm events, but assured the Commission that based on the storm event it was designed for, all storm water will be captured on site.*

*Bona said that the 100 year storm is the maximum required.*

*Cheng clarified that this project was only required to meet the first flush requirements, based on the impervious surface. He said that the proposed project does meet code and he had spoken with staff who conducted the reviews. He said there is nothing in the Capital Improvement Plan to redesign the underground storm pipes and there is no issue from this site or other sites causing the raised issues. Cheng noted it seems to be a design flaw in Catherine Commons, where the catch basin is higher than what the Catherine Commons was built on. He said this new project would probably not change the flooding issues that they are having at the neighboring Catherine Commons, but the new project will not contribute to it.*

*Bona asked what it would take to get the raised flooding issues into the CIP.*

*Cheng said that staff could explore the issue, but according to the City's System Engineers they believe it is a private matter.*

*Bona commended the design team and owners for getting input from citizens and using it in the design. She said we struggle with complementing existing character in the R4C Zoning District, and this project does it well.*

*Hill said this is due to architect Lincoln Poley and owner/developer Tom Fitzsimmons.*

*Clein said he is supportive of the project design, which successfully fronts the street. He said that he hopes there is a way to address the storm water system.*

*Adenekan said she is delighted that there is a project where the developer incorporated the comments of the neighboring citizens. She said she understands the storm water needs to be addressed, but it is not this developer's responsibility. She commended everyone for creating a win-win situation.*

*Westphal echoed the comments made. He asked about concern brought to the Commission, noting the homemade response of placing mats over the storm water system. He asked if this was advisable or inadvisable?*

*Cheng said he will forward this along to the Systems Planning Department, to make them aware of the issue.*

*Westphal asked if there were any other comments about the placement of mats over storm drains.*

*Rampson said it is highly unusual, and that they would investigate and report back on the issue.*

**On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried.**

**Yeas:** 6 - Bonnie Bona, Eric A. Mahler, Kirk Westphal, Diane Giannola, Eleanore Adenekan, and Kenneth Clein

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 3 - Evan Pratt, Wendy Woods, and Tony Derezinski

**Moved by Bona, seconded by Mahler, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby approves the proposed conflicting land use buffer modifications according to Chapter 62 (Landscape and Screening Ordinance), Section 5:603 (1) and (2). On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried.**

**Yeas:** 6 - Bonnie Bona, Eric A. Mahler, Kirk Westphal, Diane Giannola, Eleanore Adenekan, and Kenneth Clein

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 3 - Evan Pratt, Wendy Woods, and Tony Derezinski

**11-a 12-0949**

Chalmers Place Employee Parking Site Plan for Planning Commission Approval - This site plan replaces the previous rezoning and site plan project reviewed by the Planning Commission and proposes adding 24 parking spaces to the existing commercial center site on this 2.2 acres parcel located at 3365 Washtenaw Avenue, mainly by encroaching in the buffer and setback areas. Staff Recommendation: Approval

*Cheng gave the staff report.*

**PUBLIC HEARING:**

*Kevin Travers, petitioner, said that the property to the north, where they had earlier proposed creating a buffer and parking lot is their land, but it wasn't well received by the neighbors, so they went back after listening to neighbors and came up with this plan. He said he is doing the direct marketing for this site, and they need this additional proposed parking badly, since they have 50% occupancy, and he has talked to 100 potential tenants who cannot move in because of lack of parking. He explained that they are trying to keep the center viable, and this added parking will help them survive. He said they feel they have gone above and beyond in listening and taking the concerns of the neighborhood.*

*Enter Derezinski.*

**Moved by Adenekan, seconded by Giannola, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby approves the proposed landscape modification according to Chapter 62 (Landscape and Screening Ordinance), Section 5:602 (2)(g).**

**and**

**The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby approves the Chalmers Place Employee Parking Lot Site Plan for Planning Commission Approval, subject to approval by the Zoning Board of Appeals to exceed the maximum number of parking spaces on site and reduction of the conflicting land use buffer width.**

*COMMISSION DISCUSSION:*

*Giannola said she was happy a solution was found, even if it was not the full amount they had originally hoped for. She said she has never been afraid of extra parking. She said parking is attached to how well a business is successful. She said she was happy with the nice compromise and that neighbors are comfortable with the proposed project.*

*Bona asked about the relationship between the potential uses and parking requirement in the retail center. She asked how they come up with parking requirement without knowing the uses ahead of construction. She used the example of the Courtyard Shop, noting that when they had retail uses they had plenty of parking and now when the uses have changed to food service uses there is no parking. She said while she is not in support of parking, she is in support of being realistic with the parking needs dependent on what uses are in the retail space.*

*Cheng said that parking counts for this center were based on retail center and office use.*

*Rampson explained that the commercial parking requirements were last evaluated approximately ten years ago, where they did actual counts throughout the City. She said it could be that trends have changed in the meantime.*

*Bona asked the petitioner what their current and proposed uses in the retail center.*

*Travers said that they have tried to avoid food uses, since they don't have capacity to meet their needs. He said finding the balance between what works is very difficult. He said Luvs Manicure and Pedicure is jammed during the summer months. He said they would love to have a mattress place, since they don't require much parking. He said even with the added parking they will still need to be careful with getting the right mix.*

*Bona said that since Washtenaw Avenue has the best bus service in the city, had the petitioner considered offering bus passes to employees in the retail center.*

*Travers said every tenant they have is a corporate tenant, and not a franchise, which have not been so welcoming to the idea of having their employees bused in. He said several employees do take the bus in, but many are coming from further distances.*

*Mahler said he was glad things were worked out. He said he is not afraid of adding parking for small businesses, since the reality is that most people will drive, and pedestrian activity is at a minimum.*

**On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried.**

**Yeas:** 7 - Bonnie Bona, Eric A. Mahler, Tony Derezinski, Kirk Westphal, Diane Giannola, Eleanore Adenekan, and Kenneth Clein

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 2 - Evan Pratt, and Wendy Woods

**11-c 12-0947**

AATA Blake Transit Center Site Plan Public Project Review - A proposal to demolish the existing transit center building and construct a new two-story transit center/office building on this 0.04 acre parcel at the southeast corner in the southeastern corner of the current site located with frontages on 331 South Fourth and 328 South Fifth Avenues. Staff Recommendation: Approval

*Kahan gave the staff report.*

**PUBLIC HEARING:**

*Michael Ford, CEO of AATA, gave some context for the building. He said AATA has outgrown the current Blake transit facility noting that ridership has grown 60% since 1986. 1.5 million people a year pass through the transit center, with approximately 40 buses an hour running through the center. He said time has taken a toll on the building with the need for new A/C and fire suppression systems as well as the need for ADA compliance. Ford explained that they had held committee meetings reaching out to riders, citizens and those with disabilities, and have incorporated many suggestions they have received over the past several months. He said this will be an up to date modern facility, with better space, and flow through as well as better use of technology. He said being on Fifth Avenue as well strengthens their street frontage. He said they are also incorporating elements of sustainability and are looking to be qualified for LEED Gold certification as well. He stressed that they have implemented a lot of public engagement of which they are proud of. He said they will be coordinating with the DDA and library to reduce disruption during construction. He said they want to start in the fall and be done before Art Fair next year.*

*Steven Kromkowski, DLZ, project architect, 1425 Keystone Avenue, Lansing, said that they have gone through an extensive amount of community outreach to receive and incorporate input. He noted the tight site with lots of ongoing activity and said there was some additional property acquired to square off the south west part of the site. He said they cannot meet all of the interior landscaping requirements for the site as they would have liked to, but have operations to fit. He said there are ongoing discussions with GSA properties, immediately to the north with an opportunity for a future pedestrian connector.*

*Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.*

**Moved by Derezinski, seconded by Giannola:**

**WHEREAS, the City Administrator is directed to obtain comments and suggestions from the appropriate City departments with regard to certain public projects meeting private development regulations; and**

**WHEREAS, such projects are to be reviewed by the City Planning Commission prior to City Council approval;**

**RESOLVED, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission finds that the Blake Transit Center adheres to City private development standards with the**

following exceptions:

- **No interior landscaping is provided; 367 square feet are required per Chapter 62 (Landscape and Screening)**
- **The drive approach width is 55 feet on South Fifth Avenue and 60 feet on South Fourth Avenue; 30 feet is the maximum allowed per Chapter 47 (Streets)**

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

*Giannola asked about proposed material for the canopy.*

*Kromkowski said the canopy will be tinted glass with the supports made from steel. He said given the tight site they felt it was important to bring in light.*

*Giannola asked if on a hot day, would it intensify the heat or provide some shade.*

*Kromkowski said it would provide some shading factor, and the frit in the glass does not show dirt.*

*Giannola asked if there will be canopies on Fourth Avenue as well.*

*Terry Black, AATA, said the shelters on Fourth Avenue will be redesigned to provide more protection.*

*Derezinski said he was glad there will be collaborative efforts with DDA and the Library. He asked how the parking structure will work with the traffic flow of the buses and pedestrian flow from the library.*

*Black said they did a study of the change, and it will work well with the flow of the parking structure.*

*Derezinski asked if there was any thought to allowing air rights over the building.*

*Black said the building will be built structurally, to allow for a third and fourth story.*

*Clein said that it is commendable that they are pursuing a LEED gold certified project. He asked about the windows facing north, which won't pick up solar gain. He also asked about the green screens.*

*Kromkowski said the LEED certification is registered, and they are within the upper limit of the Gold range. He explained that the green screens have received comments, and that during the site plan review process there were requests for more trees rather than the green screens. He said that given the minimal space available they can either go with trees or green screens, but not both, and in the final site plan submission they have trees, but will request alternative bids for the green screens, since they don't want to create a fence or a wall, but noted that the screening is beneficial.*

*Rob Sherman, DLZ, said that the rendering in the Commission's packet is the current plan. He noted large columnar trees to be included to avoid conflict with future development and canopy.*

*Clein asked if there would be benches provided.*

*Sherman said there is outdoor seating near the six bus bays.*

*Clein asked about the proposed storm water perforated pipes and whether they meet code.*

*Kahan said, yes, for first flush and bankfull.*

*Bona asked about the staff report chart, noting the minimal building height indicates 2 stories. She asked what the maximum height with premiums.*

*Kahan said that he believed the maximum by-right is 180 feet, or approximately 16 stories.*

*Bona noted the existing AATA building is 26 years old, and asked the petitioner what will they do differently, in order to help make the new building last longer than 26 years.*

*Kromkowski said the materials are more durable, and the new lobby space is larger to address increased ridership. He said the design of the front glass wall will be raised approximately 18 inches off the concrete to help with deterioration. He said from a maintenance and operation standpoint, it will be easier to maintain. He said the products being specified are being selected for durability. The new building addresses the operational need which the current facility does not meet, adding that the current building cannot accommodate an additional story.*

*Bona asked what would make her believe the new building will last more than 26 years.*

*Kromkowski said that the selection of materials are important.*

*Bona said public projects need to stand up for a long time and take a lot of abuse, so durability of materials plays a key role. She asked the petitioner to speak to the City Council about the design of the building and to address long-term durability needs and why they need to replace the current building. She said the team should consider that the building will probably not be maintained as expected and asked them to look at ways to retain it, in spite of that probability.*

*Kromkowski said that they plan on using a snow melt system, which will reduce the amount of salt that they will need to use.*

*Black said that they have challenged DLZ to design a building that can take a lot of abuse with 5,000 people going through the facility each day.*

*Bona said she is disappointed that there is not enough landscaping to meet the City requirement, and would like to think that there is something AATA can do to off-set that with providing something in the street right of way that was not able to be provided on site. She said the screens are a concern to her, and she would rather not have them, but encouraged them to have as much green as possible on an otherwise heavy concreted area.*

*Derezinski said he believes this is a good project. He said in terms of the bus bays, is there new technology in buses that need to be taken into consideration. He also asked about the accessibility for handicapped patrons.*

*Kromkowski said the site will be fully accessible and meet all federal standards. In terms of technology, he explained that the bus exhaust is from the rear, outside the canopy and don't anticipate collecting under the canopy. Some of buses are longer, which compounds on a tight site.*

*Black said that three quarters of the current fleet consists of low emission hybrids. He said he didn't see any difference in sizing of the fleet in the future, adding that if they get into an articulated bus, it would not fit on this site.*

*Clein commented that they could help celebrate the entrance to the building off Fifth Avenue by locating the pedestrian entrance through a recessed door.*

*Westphal said it is a great sign for the community that his investment is being made. He noted that the Design Review Board had made a comment about the possibility of AATA acquiring the Fifth and William Street parking lot.*

*Ford said that he is aware of visioning work in the process.*

*Westphal said it is great there is some forethought on footings, but noted that the maximum allowable height is 180 feet. He said with the future of the site to the south is under consideration, and asked if there is the possibility of increasing footings.*

*Ford said that they will continue their discussions with the DDA and will explore whether opportunities are available.*

*Westphal said that functionally, as a facility for riders and employees, this is an order of magnitude higher than the current facility. He is concerned about future users. He agreed the Fifth Avenue entrance does not celebrate the building. He asked if there is something on that side that prevents the design from being more transparent.*

*Kromkowski said there are restrooms in this location, on the south side, with the core service space. He said there will be money counting going on the first floor, adding that they tried to open up the building where it was possible on the south side. He acknowledge narrow facade on Fifth Avenue, noting that the canopy will identify where the entrance is. He said they will take the Commissions comments into consideration.*

*Westphal asked if there was an opportunity for an awning at the entrance.*

*Kromkowski said there will be interior lighting that will light up the building nicely.*

*Westphal asked about street trees.*

*Kromkowski said he believed there was a tree on Fifth Avenue. He explained that they had offered a tree allowance that could be used for landscaping on that block.*

*Bona said there may be room for trees on sidewalks, and she would like to see two trees on the east and one on the west that would not block the line of sight. She said that signage is not in the Commission's purview, but the proposed signage is in a place that people won't see. She noted that pedestrian signage is not shown on the site plan, but stressed that it should be included as part of the conversation of the building having a sidewalk presence.*

**On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried.**

**Yeas:** 7 - Bonnie Bona, Eric A. Mahler, Tony Derezinski, Kirk Westphal, Diane Giannola, Eleanore Adenekan, and Kenneth Clein

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 2 - Evan Pratt, and Wendy Woods

**11-d 12-0946**

Noodles Site Plan for Planning Commission Approval - A proposal to revise the approved site plan (SP11-034) to shift the proposed 2,679 square feet restaurant building to the north property line, add eight parking spaces on the south side of the building off the shared driveway with 2151 West Stadium, and reconfigure driveway circulation behind the building on this 1.15 acres parcel at 2161 West Stadium Boulevard. Staff Recommendation: Approval

*Kowalski presented the staff report.*

**PUBLIC HEARING**

*Todd Quatro, engineer for the project, said he was available ask to questions.*

*Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.*

**Moved by Mahler, seconded by Adenekan, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby approves the Noodles and Company Site Plan, subject to approval of the associated land division and recording of a permanent off-site access easement prior to issuance of building permits.**

*Adenekan asked if there was a proposed drive thru.*

*Kowalski said no.*

*Adenekan asked staff to review the newly proposed parking plan with the Commission.*

*Kowalski reviewed the site plan with the Commission.*

*Giannola asked if it will be easy to see the parking lot in the rear.*

*Quatro said the existing driveway will be widened, so it will be easy to see the parking in the rear.*

*Derezinski asked about the 'informal access'.*

*Quatro explained that it was an easement between the two properties that could be used for access but not for parking or anything else.*

*Derezinski asked if on busy days, when the carwash had stacked cars in line, would that create a problem.*

*Quatro said they have allowed for adequate stacking, with a connecting drive right behind the building.*

*Bona asked about possibly removing the parking space closest to the street.*

*Quatro said that Noodles felt strongly about having parking there. He said he suggested adding a sidewalk on that side.*

*Bona said she is glad the building is close to street, but with the parking in the rear, the rear facade is what people will see. She asked about the possibility of adding windows on that side of the building.*

*Quatro said that area is the kitchen area and service entrance, and the building*

*design is part of the Noodles company standards.*

*Bona said it would be nice for them to decorate that side of the building by adding a nice door or through added landscaping.*

*Quatro said he considered windows on the north, but with the easement next door, he wouldn't be able to meet the code.*

*Clein said he had concerns with the railing and the door.*

*Quatro explained that because of the three foot grade change he was required to have a railing.*

**On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried**

**Yeas:** 7 - Bonnie Bona, Eric A. Mahler, Tony Derezinski, Kirk Westphal, Diane Giannola, Eleanore Adenekan, and Kenneth Clein

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 2 - Evan Pratt, and Wendy Woods

**12 AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION (Persons may speak for three minutes on any item.)**

*None*

**13 COMMISSION PROPOSED BUSINESS**

*Bona noted the email the Commission had received regarding rethinking Washtenaw Avenue. She said she wanted the author to know that the City is working on this issue, through the Climate Action Plan that will address pollution issues. She also noted the Sustainability Plan, and the Complete Streets ordinance. She asked where the City currently was on the Complete Streets policy.*

*Rampson said about a year ago the City Council had put forth a resolution that they are designing to Complete Streets, which provided guidance to the City's operating departments.*

*Derezinski said that SEMCOG did a study about how cities can use green infrastructure along the corridor, including under the US 23 overpass. He noted that he will take the email to the meeting.*

*Derezinski reported that at the previous night's meeting, City Council postponed a proposal to put park elements on the November ballot to allow for Park Advisory Committee to review.*

*Derezinski said the Maple Cove project got approved. Council discussed similar issues about the project being a 'by-right' project.*

**14 ADJOURNMENT**

**A motion was made by Clein, seconded by Mahler, that the Meeting be Adjourned. The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 9:46 p.m.**

**Kirk Westphal, Chair  
mg**

*Community Television Network Channel 16 live televised public meetings are also available to watch live online from CTN's website, [www.a2gov.org/ctn](http://www.a2gov.org/ctn), on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>).*

*Live Web streaming is one more way, in addition to these listed below, to stay in touch with Ann Arbor City Council and board and commission actions and deliberations.*

- *Video on Demand: Replay public meetings at your convenience online at [www.a2gov.org/government/city\\_administration/communicationsoffice/ctn/Pages/VideoOnDemand.aspx](http://www.a2gov.org/government/city_administration/communicationsoffice/ctn/Pages/VideoOnDemand.aspx)*
- *Cable: Watch CTN Channel 16 public meeting programming via Comcast Cable channel 16.*

*The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at [www.a2gov.org/ctn](http://www.a2gov.org/ctn), on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>), or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.*