

# City of Ann Arbor Formal Minutes - Final

301 E. Huron Street Ann Arbor, MI 48104 http://a2gov.legistar.com/ Calendar.aspx

**Historic District Commission** 

Thursday, June 9, 2022

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council Chambers

This meeting will be broadcast live on CTN Cable Channel 16, ATT Channel 99, and online at a2gov.org/watchCTN

To speak at public comment call 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099 Enter Meeting ID: 965 3669 9762

Join from a PC, Mac, iPad, iPhone or Android device:

https://a2gov.zoom.us/j/96536699762?pwd=KzhoREg5eHgyUCtjV0NWY0lhUIMvQT09

Passcode: 880017

Or join by phone:

Call: 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099

Webinar ID: 965 3669 9762

# A. CALL TO ORDER

Chairperson Anna Epperson called the meeting to order at 7:02 pm, stating:

Welcome to the Thursday, June 9, 2022, in-person and electronic (hybrid) meeting of the Ann Arbor Historic District Commission. The meeting is being held in this mode to protect public health and safety due to the COVID 19 virus and to comply with orders issued by the governor, the Michigan Department of Health and Human Services and/or the Washtenaw County Health Department and the City of Ann Arbor. We intend to conduct this meeting similarly to an in-person meeting. However, please be patient if there are technical issues. Public comment will be via in-person, via Zoom or via telephone. To speak during any of the public comment opportunities please call 877-853-5247 (Toll Free) or 213-338-8477 and enter meeting ID 965 3669 9762 This information is also available on the published agenda, in the public notices section of the City website, and on the broadcast of this meeting on CTN channel 16, AT&T channel 99, and online at www.a2gov.org/watchctn.

# B. ROLL CALL

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner, Jill Thacher, was present and called the roll.

Historic District Commission members were physically present at City Hall of Ann Arbor, 301 E Huron Street, Ann Arbor, Michigan.

Administrative Assistant, Courtney Manor, was present via Zoom.

Present: 6 - David Rochlen, Jessica Quijano, Kathryn Fortener, Chair

Anna Epperson, Robert White, and Beverly K Willis

Absent: 1 - Jennifer Ross

# C. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

The Agenda was unanimously approved as presented.

#### D. PUBLIC COMMENTARY - (3 Minutes per Speaker)

Tom Stulberg, 1202 Traver Street, said he was calling from Lowertown, Ann Arbor. He complimented the Commission on their deliberation discussion of 224 South Main Street at the May HDC meeting. He complimented HDC liaison Jill Thacher as well; he expressed that the HDC body does the best job of any of the Commissions/Committees that he pays attention to. He spoke in support of the Commission's consistent rulings and use of Historic District Guidelines and Standards.

FOR ZOOM PARTICIPANTS, PHONE CALLERS CAN PRESS \*9 TO RAISE HANDS AND \*6 TO UNMUTE THEIR PHONES WHEN CALLED UPON TO SPEAK.

# E. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

**E-1. 22-1029** HDC22-1075 224 S Main; Addition; MSHD

Attachments: Staff Report 6-9-22 HDC22-1075 (224 S Main).pdf,

6-9-2022 Attachment - Revised Application

HDC22-1075.pdf

Project Manager for the project provided the modifications made to the project. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

No additional site visit occurred for this meeting.

#### **PUBLIC HEARING:**

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Benjamin Curtis introduced himself to the Commission as a family member of the owners who support this project.

Moved by Commissioner David Rochlen, Seconded by Bob White, that the Historic District Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 224 and 226 South Main Street, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District, to construct three additional floors to the building, install replica metal cladding on the first floor, and install a new storefront at the west end of the building on the south elevation. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for All Additions and for Additions to Commercial Structures and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for additions, windows, and district/neighborhood setting.

#### COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion failed. Vote: 1 - 5 Application Denied

Yeas: 1 - White

Nays: 5 - Vice Chair Rochlen, Secretary Quijano, Fortener, Chair

Epperson, and K Willis

Absent: 1 - Ross

#### F. HEARINGS

**F-1. 22-1030** HDC22-1084; 206 E Huron; New Sign; MSHD

Attachments: Staff Report w Attach 6-9-22 HDC22-1084 (206 E

Huron).pdf

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

#### REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Beverly Willis and Jessica Quijano visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

#### PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Moved by Jessica Quijano, Seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 206 East Huron Street, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District, to install a new 36" diameter blade sign, mounted in mortar joints, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for signs, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standard 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for storefronts.

#### **COMMISSION DISCUSSION:**

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6 – 0

Yeas: 6 - Vice Chair Rochlen, Secretary Quijano, Fortener, Chair

Epperson, White, and K Willis

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Ross

F-2. 22-1031 HDC22-1091; 436 Third St; Façade Changes and Window Replacement;

# **OWSHD**

Attachments: Staff Report w Attach 6-9-22 HDC22-1091 (436 Third).pdf

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

#### REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Beverly Willis and Jessica Quijano visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

#### **PUBLIC HEARING:**

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Moved by Kathy Fortener, Seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 436 Third Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to remove a rear fire-escape stair and restore the opening to exterior, wood-sided solid wall, to replace and enlarge a second-floor rear window to its original opening size and create an egress-compliant window, and remove a first floor rear window and restore the opening to exterior, wood-sided solid wall. as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for windows; and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for windows.

#### **COMMISSION DISCUSSION:**

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6 – 0

**Yeas:** 6 - Vice Chair Rochlen, Secretary Quijano, Fortener, Chair Epperson, White, and K Willis

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Ross

F-3. 22-1032 HDC22-1095; 514 S First St; Accessory Structure; OWSHD

Attachments: Staff Report w Attach 6-9-22 HDC22-1095 (514 S

First).pdf

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Beverly Willis and Jessica Quijano visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

**PUBLIC HEARING:** 

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Move by David Rochlen, Seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 514 S First Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to install a 70" wide and 75" deep, 100" tall cedar shed at the left rear of the site as proposed. The work is compatible in design, placement, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Guidelines for residential accessory structures, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, in particular standards 1, 2, and 10, and the guidelines for building site.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6 – 0

Yeas: 6 - Vice Chair Rochlen, Secretary Quijano, Fortener, Chair

Epperson, White, and K Willis

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Ross

# **F-4. 22-1033** HDC22-1096; 118 E Washington; New Sign; MSHD

Attachments: Staff Report w Attach 6-9-22 HDC22-1096 (118 E

Washington).pdf

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

# REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Beverly Willis and Jessica Quijano visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

#### PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Moved by Beverly Willis, Seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 118 East Washington Street, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District, to install a new oval pedestrian-scale blade sign measuring 3' 1" in width and 1' 9 3/8" in height, mounted in wood between two storefront windows, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for signs and pedestrian scale signs, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for storefronts.

# COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6 – 0

**Yeas:** 6 - Vice Chair Rochlen, Secretary Quijano, Fortener, Chair Epperson, White, and K Willis

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Ross

**F-5. 22-1034** HDC22-1098; 211 Crest Ave; Addition; OWSHD

Attachments: Staff Report w Attach 6-9-22 HDC22-1098 (211 Crest).pdf

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Beverly Willis and Jessica Quijano visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

**PUBLIC HEARING:** 

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Moved by Kathy Fortener, Seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 211 Crest Avenue, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to enclose the screened porch on the first floor as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for building site; and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for additions.

**COMMISSION DISCUSSION:** 

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6 – 0

**Yeas:** 6 - Vice Chair Rochlen, Secretary Quijano, Fortener, Chair Epperson, White, and K Willis

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Ross

#### G. NEW BUSINESS

# H. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

H-1. 22-1035 May 12, 2022 Historic District Commission Meeting Minutes

<u>Attachments:</u> 5-12-2022 HDC Approved Meeting Minutes-rev.pdf

The May 12, 2022 Historic District Commission meeting minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission and forwarded to City Council.

# I. REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS

# J. ASSIGNMENTS

Review Committee: Monday, July 11, 2022 at 5pm for the Thursday, July 14, 2022 Regular Meeting

Commissioners Kathy Fortener and Beverly Willis volunteered for the July 11, 2022 HDC Review Committee.

# K. REPORTS FROM STAFF

Jill Thacher noted she had been out for the past three weeks and had not had a chance to review files yet.

# L. CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS

# M. COMMUNICATIONS

M-1. <u>22-1036</u> Various Communications to the HDC

Received and Filed

# N. ADJOURNMENT

# The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 8:38 pm.

Anna Epperson, Chairperson Alexis DiLeo, City Planner Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner

Mia Gale, Administrative Assistant Courtney Manor, Administrative Assistant

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Comcast 16 / AT&T 99 live, and recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website https://a2gov.org/watchctn.

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at https://a2gov.org/watchctn, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.