



It is the mission of the Ann Arbor Transportation Authority to provide useful, reliable, safe, environmentally responsible, and cost-effective public transportation options for the benefit of the Greater Ann Arbor Community.

Approved Minutes  
December 15, 2011  
Ann Arbor Transportation Authority  
Board of Directors Meeting  
Ann Arbor District Library, 343 South Fifth Avenue, Ann Arbor, Michigan, 6:30 p.m.

Board Members Present: Jesse Bernstein (Chair), Anya Dale, Charles Griffith, Sue McCormick, David Nacht, Rich Robben

Absent: Roger Kerson

Staff Present: Michael Benham, Terry Black, Ron Copeland, Dawn Gabay, Michael Ford, Jan Hallberg, Ed Robertson, Mary Stasiak, Phil Webb, Chris White

Recording Secretary: Karen Wheeler

Chairman Jesse Bernstein declared that a quorum was present and called the meeting to order at 6:37 p.m.

1.0 Public Hearing

There was no public hearing.

2.0 Communications and Announcements

There were no communications or announcements.

3.0 Public Time – Comment on Agenda Items

Henry Herskovitz appeared before the Board. Mr. Herskovitz read from a prepared statement expressing concern about three alleged conflicts of interest relating to a lawsuit brought by the ACLU. Mr. Herskovitz referred to a lawsuit which contests the rejection of a political ad critical of the State of Israel on AATA buses. Mr. Herskovitz commented on affiliations of AATA Board Chair Jesse Bernstein, AATA Board Trustee David Nacht, and AATA Legal Counsel Jerry Lax claiming that the three gentlemen support the state of Israel. Mr. Herskovitz suggested that conflict arises when they are polled for their vote or their opinion on a proposed ad that criticizes the state they support.

Thomas Partridge appeared before the Board. Mr. Partridge spoke in favor of expanding AATA into a countywide system that would include all townships, villages and cities in Washtenaw County and would provide links to public resources. Mr. Partridge commented on the "opt out" provision in the proposed countywide system.

No one further appearing, Mr. Bernstein declared Public Time closed.

#### 4.0 Review and Approval of Minutes

##### 4.1 *Review and Approval of Minutes of November 17, 2011*

Anya Dale moved approval of the November 17, 2011 meeting minutes as written with support from Rich Robben. Charles Griffith abstained. The motion carried.

##### 4.2 *Review and Approval of Minutes of December 5, 2011*

Sue McCormick moved approval of the December 5, 2011 meeting minutes as written with support from Charles Griffith. The motion carried.

#### 5.0 Board and Staff Reports

##### 5.1 *Chief Executive Officer*

Michael Ford provided an overview of his full report to the Board. Mr. Ford reported on progress on Airport Shuttle Service noting that negotiations with Michigan Flyer were ongoing. Mr. Ford indicated that there had been some conflicting information regarding the collection of fees and Mr. Ford stated that the information would be clarified.

Mr. Ford provided follow-up information on a concern raised at the November Board meeting regarding the two package limit on paratransit service and compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act for providing the service.

Mr. Ford reported that because the service is a shared ride, the package limit attempts to make certain that room will be available for all passengers.

Mr. Ford addressed another concern raised in November as to the condition of vehicles used to provide paratransit service. Mr. Ford indicated that he would oversee an investigation of the condition of higher mileage vehicles and would personally ride in some of the vehicles and report back on his findings.

Mr. Ford reported on a recommendation made to the Planning and Development Committee to award a contract for an Organizational Strategic Plan. Mr. Ford noted that there was an action item before the Board and requested support for moving the project forward.

Mr. Ford reported that the Performance Monitoring and External Relations Committee did not meet in December due to a presentation on the Marketing Plan being postponed to January. Mr. Ford reported on the December 5th u196 board meeting and ongoing efforts to finalize the 4-Party Agreement, planning for the second round of District Advisory Council meetings, and work on the board's Bylaws. Mr. Ford noted recent presentations made to Ann Arbor City Council and the Washtenaw County Board of Commissioners on the 4-Party Agreement.

Mr. Ford provided an update on the Blake Transit Center project. The latest plans were recently presented to the City of Ann Arbor. Mr. Ford noted that the current design is estimated to exceed the project funds. PDC directed staff to make adjustments to bring the project back within budget.

Mr. Ford reported that over the past month on-time performance had been impacted due to the Stadium Bridges and State Street closures. Vehicles were added to routes in some cases to try and keep some of the service on-time. Mr. Ford indicated that he would share data at the January PMER meeting.

Mr. Ford reported that outreach meetings with business and community partners were ongoing and referred to his written report for full details.

Jesse Bernstein provided an update on the Transit Master Plan's Financial Task Force. The group had originally hoped to complete its work in January. They changed course when it was discovered that additional work was necessary to study the service plan and find a balance between what services to provide and projected costs. This resulted in the task force taking more time to do their work. Mr. Bernstein expressed appreciation for all of the work being completed and for the investment of a great deal of time.

### 5.1.2 *Website Redevelopment*

Mary Stasiak provided an update on the Website Redevelopment project. Work continues on the graphic design and the final design product is expected to be completed soon. Ms. Stasiak reported on the details of outreach for design feedback raised at the November Board meeting. Surveys were conducted at the Blake Transit Center and Ypsilanti Transit Center. Riders and nonriders were interviewed at a Busch's grocery store as well as at the LA2M marketing group. AATA employees were interviewed. Online outreach was conducted through the Ann Arbor Center for Independent email list, and via Face Book, Twitter, MyRide, and through the AATA website.

Ms. Stasiak reported that the final contract with Artemis had been executed and includes a timeline of multiple levels to accomplish by the end of January so that content integration can begin.

### 5.2 *Planning and Development Committee*

Rich Robben reported on the Planning and Development Committee's December 6th meeting. The committee received the second presentation in a three part series on the Capital and Categorical Grant Program. The program includes three recently approved grants, continuation of existing service and additional service based on the Transit Master Plan (TMP), the figures of which align with the proposed TMP. The committee discussed a contract award for Airport Service.

Mr. Robben indicated that the committee had a fairly lively discussion around a recommendation to award a contract for an organizational strategic plan; specifically the cost of the project. Mr. Robben added that the proposal had been scrutinized and staff completed due diligence to ensure that the project is appropriate for the agency to pursue. Mr. Robben noted a resolution included in new business for the Board to consider award of a contract.

Mr. Robben reported that the committee received an update on the Information Technology Strategic Plan; Jan Hallberg is awaiting receipt of the final report. Mr. Robben noted that staff provided several updates; the details of which were delineated in the meeting summary included in the Board packet.

## 6.0 Question Time

Jesse Bernstein complimented Terry Black for his presentation on reconstruction of the Blake Transit Center made at a monthly meeting of a group designated to develop five downtown sites. Mr. Bernstein asked whether the website feedback outlined by Mary Stasiak was around usability. Ms. Stasiak responded that the first round of feedback

was regarding design. Ms. Stasiak added that usability testing will take place once site is up and can be tested.

Charles Griffith questioned whether the two bag limit on paratransit service is reasonable. Michael Ford responded that it depends on the type of vehicle available at a given time. Board members, with input from staff, discussed the policy. Suggestions included revisiting the policy given vehicle trunk capacity, and accommodating people who are on a fixed income; and accommodating passengers so they are not deprived and not made to feel like second class citizens. It was noted that in addition to storing packages, the paratransit vehicle trunks are often used to carry mobility aids, and the two package limit also applies to fixed-route bus service. A suggestion was made to look into whether the policy is consistent with those of other agencies. Dawn Gabay noted that the policy has been reviewed by the Local Advisory Council, the body that advises the Board and staff on matters related to providing service for seniors and people with disabilities. Michael Ford agreed to review peer agency policies and report back to the Board.

## 7.0 Old Business

David Nacht made motion in connection with compensation of the CEO and delineated the details of compensation:

For the fiscal year beginning October 1, 2011, in accordance with the provisions of Article VI, Paragraph 6.1 of the Agreement between the CEO and the Board of Directors dated May 19, 2011:

- An annual salary of \$164,800 for service, payable in bi-weekly installments subject to customary and mandatory withholdings;
- One-time lump sum payment in the amount of \$10,000 into the \$457 deferred compensation plan account;
- Effective October 1, 2011 immediate vesting in the AATA Employees' Pension Plan.

Sue McCormick supported the motion.

Jesse Bernstein thanked Mr. Ford for the good he has done for AATA and in the community and complimented Mr. Ford for essentially running two boards. Mr. Bernstein indicated that he hoped Mr. Ford's contract is an indication of the Board's appreciation for his work.

The motion passed unanimously.

## 8.0 New Business

Rich Robben moved the following resolution with support from Anya Dale.

### 8.1 *Award of Contract for Organizational Strategic Plan*

#### Resolution 7/2012

#### Contracting with a Consultant to develop an Organizational Strategic Plan

WHEREAS, on November 18, 2009, the Ann Arbor Transportation Authority Board of Directors (AATA Board) adopted Resolution 4/2010 to provide AATA with a Vision Statement that reads:

“The Ann Arbor Transportation Authority shall be the public transportation provider for Washtenaw County. Our customers shall see AATA’s expanded services as the preferred option for traveling to destinations within the county, as well as to and from the county. AATA will offer appropriate modes of transportation with the most efficient use of resources. These services shall enhance the quality of life for Washtenaw County stakeholders while promoting the economy, safeguarding the environment, and strengthening communities.”

and

WHEREAS, on November 18, 2009, the AATA Board also adopted Resolution 5/2010 to direct AATA Staff to identify county-wide transportation needs, issues, concerns, and funding requirements, and

WHEREAS, AATA Staff recognized the need to develop a Organizational Strategic Plan that defines how AATA will change itself to undertake the many upcoming initiatives and respond to new political realities, and

WHEREAS, AATA Staff developed and advertised Request for Proposals (RFP) #2011-06 for the development of an Organizational Strategic Plan, and

WHEREAS, through the RFP process, AATA Staff identified a cooperative team of two firms that meet all the requirements of the Scope of Work and provided the best value,

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT IS RESOLVED, that AATA Staff may enter into a contract with Generator Group, LLC and D. Kerry Laycock, LLC for the development of an Organizational Strategic Plan, based upon their joint proposal for the project. AATA Staff will report to Governance monthly on progress, including, but not limited to hours billed and projected hours needed to finish each phase.

Sue McCormick referred to the PDC meeting summary noting that David Nacht made a specific comment that he did not want the Board to commit to more than \$100,000 for a strategic plan. Ms. McCormick also noted that staff was seeking \$250,000 for the project indicating that the resolution presented to the Board had neither a dollar value attached nor a contract amount or limit.

Jesse Bernstein reported on a discussion with David Nacht and explained that staff understood the concerns around a project of the magnitude proposed. Mr. Bernstein indicated that the stipulation for monthly review of time spent would provide an audit procedure to ensure that the work completed would not exceed any expenditure that is unnecessary. Michael Ford responded to a question regarding the contract total which he stated was \$247,000.

Board members commented on the resolution. Sue McCormick stated that the contract amount should be included in the resolution. David Nacht restated his position from PDC indicating that given the current size of organization, and until countywide funds are available, the scale and cost of the project are not warranted.

Michael Ford noted that an organizational strategic plan project was presented at the Board retreat and that \$250,000 was included in the budget approved by the Board. Mr. Ford indicated that there has been a tremendous external focus on the TMP and requested that the Board authorize the resources to shift the focus internally to the culture, improving alignment, building the institution and succession planning. Mr. Ford added that the labor union was represented on the project team and supportive of the project and asked for the Board's consideration to move the project forward.

Mr. Ford responded to questions on the scope of the project; a 12 month process with the first phase being a comprehensive assessment of the organization. Rich Robben indicated that he reviewed the proposal in detail, found it to be comprehensive and with a good list of specific deliverables. Mr. Robben outlined details of the timeframe and expenses for the first phase of the project; a two month process slated to take place in January and February 2012 at a cost of \$14,680 for 180 hours of work. Sue McCormick suggested that it appeared that a significant amount of work could be completed under the signing authority of the CEO (up to \$100,000) and an amendment to the contract could be sought from the Board, if the need for additional funds was warranted. Michael Ford indicated that there were checks and balances built into the process and his preference was for signing the contract as recommended with the understanding that the project would not proceed past the second phase without the Board's concurrence.

Jesse Bernstein summarized Board member input indicating that the preference appeared to be that Mr. Ford would exercise his discretion and spend up to \$100,000 for the first two phases of the project, report to the Board and then a determination would be made as to whether the project should move forward.

Mr. Bernstein suggested that the motion could be withdrawn with the understanding that the Board supports the first two phases of the project with every expectation that

once those are accomplished, if work on the third phase would exceed \$100,000, the Board would consider authorizing additional funds.

Rich Robben withdrew the motion and Anya Dale withdrew the second.

#### 9.0 *Public Time*

Vivienne Armentrout appeared before the Board. Ms. Armentrout thanked Michael Ford and staff for making the Transit Master Plan meetings open and accessible. Ms. Armentrout commented on the prospect of an alternate funding source that would not require a millage for countywide. Ms. Armentrout noted that the Governor's concept of a new registration fee had been discussed, but that there was not currently a Bill in process to establish such a fee. Ms. Armentrout commented on preliminary information indicating that the WALLY project was not included in the Tiger III grants and was curious as to how the TMP would be adjusted to compensate for that.

Thomas Partridge appeared before the Board. Mr. Partridge called for a halt to spending on PowerPoint presentations and full color documents given today's economy. Mr. Partridge called on the Board to redirect the \$100,000 from strategic planning to put vehicles on the road. Mr. Partridge suggested taking the approach of "if we build it, they will come" and develop a nationwide, interstate transportation system.

No one further appearing, Mr. Bernstein declared Public Time closed.

Jesse Bernstein thanked Sue McCormick for her work on the AATA Board as well as her work at the City of Ann Arbor. David Nacht and Rich Robben echoed Mr. Bernstein's sentiment of gratitude to Ms. McCormick.

Mr. Bernstein presented Ms. McCormick with a bus mailbox and invited everyone to join in a celebration in Ms. McCormick's honor.

#### 10.0 *Adjourn*

Sue McCormick moved to adjourn the meeting with support from Charles Griffith. The motion carried and the meeting adjourned at 7:31 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Charles Griffith, Secretary