



City of Ann Arbor
Formal Minutes
Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Thursday, April 14, 2016

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council Chambers

A **CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Benjamin Bushkuhl called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

B **ROLL CALL**

Jill Thacher called the roll.

Staff Present: Jill Thacher

Present: 6 - Robert White, Ellen Ramsburgh, Thomas Stulberg,
Benjamin L. Bushkuhl, John Beeson, and Evan Hall

Absent: 1 - Jennifer Ross

C **APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

The agenda was unanimously approved as presented.

D **AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION - (3 Minutes per Speaker)**

None

E **HEARINGS**

E-1 **16-0527** HDC16-032; 112 W Liberty - Projecting Sign - MSHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Beeson and Bushkuhl visited the site as part of their review.

Beeson reported that the cornice was definitely damaged from the truck that had hit it, but the brick was fairly intact and looked good. He said he

felt the installation of this sign would be in trying to keep it within the mortar joints since they seem fairly tight. He said the proposed size, scale and massing matched with existing signage down the street.

Bushkuhl agreed, adding that in looking at the row of storefronts there is a rhythm and they are in a similar configuration as this proposed signage which helps with the pedestrian feel when walking down the street.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Mark Chalou, Chalou Designs, 3458 E. Pineview Drive, Dexter, the petitioner was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission. He explained the proposed sign.

Beeson asked about the baffle that would be added.

Chalou explained it would be added to the bottom of the sign to help protect it from people being able to reach up and touch the sign.

Bushkuhl asked how bright the neon yellow would be.

Chalou said it was a really old yellow gold that is very subtle and on a scale of 1-10 this sign would be a 5.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Beeson, seconded by White, that the Historic District Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 112 W. Liberty Street, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District, to install a projecting sign with neon illumination as proposed, on the condition that the sign is mounted into masonry joints, not through masonry units. The work as conditioned is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, in particular the guidelines for signs, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 9, and 10, and the guidelines for storefronts.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented

application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness Granted

Yeas: 6 - White, Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, and Hall

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Secretary Ross

E-2 [16-0528](#) HDC16-040; 248 Crest - Two-Story Addition - OWSHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Beeson and Bushkuhl visited the site as part of their review.

Bushkuhl reported that during their site visit they considered sight lines and the proposed location is the most appropriate location for an addition and the size and massing from the rear are in keeping with our guidelines.

Beeson noted that the garage was an interesting unit in itself having a separate chimney. He agreed with the scale being appropriate for the neighborhood.

He noted that there was no indication that the porch off the back was original.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Bonnie Greenspoon, Lewis Greenspoon Architects, 440 S. Main Street, Suite 2, Ann Arbor, the petitioner was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Ramsburgh, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 248 Crest Avenue, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic

District, to construct a two-story addition to the rear of the existing home, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the house and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 5, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for additions and building site; and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for additions.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness Granted

Yeas: 6 - White, Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, and Hall

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Secretary Ross

E-3 [16-0529](#) HDC16-041; 715 W Jefferson - Second Floor Addition - OWSHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Beeson and Bushkuhl visited the site as part of their review.

Beeson reported that the roof cut-off at the back of the house is hard to tell from the front but when you walk around the building one can notice that it slopes off rather quickly, and in looking at the dormer there are many features that could indicate that it was in the period of significance but given that it is on the back of the house it isn't something that they considered worth further investigation since one would not see it. Beeson commented that just filling it in would just balance out the house and help fill out the house.

Bushkuhl agreed regarding whether it is original or from the period of

significance; and he would guess not since that it is not something you typically see and seems like something that could have been done in a different time. He said discussion about the difference between the addition and the main house he felt carrying the ridge back to one uniform height makes sense and if you would drop it down a bit it would make a strange little lip area where leaves or other things could get caught, so in this case it makes sense to carry it through in that same plain.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Marc Rueter, Rueter Architects and Associates, together with the owner, Mary Beth Lewis, 715 W. Jefferson, Ann Arbor, were present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Beeson asked if the front windows would be new wood windows.

Rueter said they would be wood windows matching the size, character, and profiles of the existing historic double-hung windows.

Beeson asked if they would be single or double-pane.

Rueter said they would be double-pane.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Hall, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 715 W. Jefferson Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to add a 218 square foot addition above the rear wing of the house and to replace two first floor windows on the east and north building elevations, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for additions and building site; and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for additions and windows.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness Granted

Yeas: 6 - White, Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, and Hall

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Secretary Ross

E-4 [16-0530](#) HDC16-043; 314 E Liberty - Deck, Ramp, & Signs - ELHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Beeson and Bushkuhl visited the site as part of their review.

Bushkuhl reported that in visiting the site they considered how the proposed work would fit in with the surrounding properties. He noted that when he thinks of this building he almost still sees the old deck there and was used to it, and believes most people assume it is something that should be there. He said the existing condition reads more like a building which seems more appropriate, but given that the proposed deck will be lower will be more appropriate and an improvement over the previous one. He said the pergola will be drawing a little more attention to the deck than it was previously. He said since the building is non-contributing it is more about how it relates to the neighboring properties.

Beeson agreed with the staff report and the spatial relations. He said with the previous deck gone, you get a sense where the contributing structure is and its placement with the rest of the street. He said with the new deck being out, his only concern with it would be the height and how much lower it will be. He said the north elevation shows how much lower it would be noting that it would be more in relationship to the streetscape and the scale as well as the sidewalk. He said the proposed pergola would be similar to them having umbrellas and they both act in a way to close in the space.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Ali Ramlawi, Jerusalem Garden, 314 E. Liberty Street, Ann Arbor, the

petitioner was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Ramsburgh, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 314 E. Liberty, a contributing property in the East Liberty Historic District, to construct a deck with a barrier-free accessible ramp in front of the building; a pergola; and add a menu sign and two vertical signs on an existing column in front of the building, on the condition that the porch is not roofed over or enclosed in any manner in the future. As conditioned, the proposed work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Guidelines for new construction and signs, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9, and 10 and the Guidelines for Setting.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness Granted

Yeas: 6 - White, Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, and Hall

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Secretary Ross

E-5 [16-0531](#) HDC16-044; 1547 Washtenaw -- Parking -- WHHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Beeson and Bushkuhl visited the site as part of their review.

Bushkuhl reported that in visiting the site, the area that is being discussed is far behind the house and won't be visible, which is a good thing. He said filling in a gully to create some parking spots makes good use of this space and the efforts of cleaning up to make things better than they are now will improve the site and meets our guidelines. He agreed with the staff report.

Beeson agreed, adding that it would be hard to notice where the property line goes. He said he had some questions and concerns with the size of the retaining wall.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Robb Burroughs, Design Studio, representing the petitioner was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Burroughs explained that the proposed retaining wall is intended to be a dry-lid which is vertical, and the existing one is made of 4x4s that are wooden and rather decayed. He said the new one would be complimentary to the stone in the house. He explained that the church owners have worked hard to restore the house as well as the landscaping of the sites.

Bushkuhl asked about the access noting that there would be need for easements.

Burroughs agreed, noting that is part of the proposed work.

Stulberg asked about the grading necessary for the parking spaces.

Burroughs said the grade would be matching and would be permeable pavers.

Ramsburgh asked about the retaining wall and if there would be a fence on top.

Burroughs said yes, a decorative aluminum or iron type fence. He said there would also be a fence all along the back property line that is currently not there.

Bushkuhl asked what the height of the fence would be.

Burroughs said 42 inches, and while it is intended to be decorative it will

be more of a pedestrian guardrail just because they have a drop off.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Stulberg, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 1547 Washtenaw Avenue, a contributing property in the Washtenaw / Hill Historic District, to add eight parking spaces, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, and 10 and the guidelines for additions and building site; and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for all new construction.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness Granted

Yeas: 6 - White, Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, and Hall

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Secretary Ross

E-6 [16-0532](#) HDC16-047; 415 W Jefferson - Chimney Removal & Window Replacement

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Beeson and Bushkuhl visited the site as part of their review.

Beeson reported that the attic windows are in very good condition, and the sashes are in great shape. He noted that one of the windows had some warping so it might need a new frame or a new sash which would allow

them to be more weather tight. He said they would need to install stoppers on how far the window could open since it was close to the floor. Beeson also noted that the storm windows had not been well installed and the screws had all damaged the frame. Beeson said the chimney was very utilitarian and he was hopeful that the bricks could be saved for other projects since they were beautiful. He said the basement windows were difficult to see what they were made up of, but he believed they were 1 sheet of glass with fake dividers, with metal frames that were adhered to the basement walls, so he believed they had been in-filled windows.

Bushkuhl added that it was nice to see things that the Commission had approved earlier, and that the dormer worked well from the street and didn't draw attention to itself and on the inside it made sense with what they were doing as far as headroom. He said the skylights were not visible from any angle.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Acar Altinsel, 415 W. Jefferson, Ann Arbor, petitioner was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Bushkuhl asked if the contractor and the owner had held a discussion about the attic windows.

Altinsel said yes, and that while he didn't think they were in that good shape they will do their best to make them more functional.

Bushkuhl commented that the issue was that they had never been installed correctly and he believed if they were they would function as intended.

Beeson said the hot foam insulation that was proposed to be installed was very difficult to be removed once it was installed and was not something that the State was awarding tax credits for. He said since the long term viability of foam was still not known it made him concerned what it can do on historic structures. He noted that the application process was very particular with the temperature when it was applied.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Motion on Chimney:

Moved by Beeson, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 415 W. Jefferson

Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to remove the chimney, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standard 2 and the guidelines for roofs.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness Granted

Yeas: 6 - White, Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, and Hall

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Secretary Ross

Motion on Attic Windows:

Moved by Bushkuhl, seconded by White that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 415 W. Jefferson Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to replace two attic windows. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standard 2 and the guidelines for windows.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion failed. Vote: 1-5

Yeas: 1 - White

Nays: 5 - Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, and Hall

Absent: 1 - Secretary Ross

Motion on Basement Windows:

Moved by Bushkuhl, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 415 W. Jefferson Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to replace five basement windows. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines and the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standard 2 and the guidelines for windows.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness Granted

Yeas: 6 - White, Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, and Hall

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Secretary Ross

F UNFINISHED BUSINESS

G NEW BUSINESS

G-1 16-0533 HDC Award Nominations

Moved by White, seconded by Beeson to approve the 2016 HDC Award Nominations as presented. On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Yeas: 6 - White, Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, and Hall

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Secretary Ross

G-2 [16-0534](#) 2016-2017 HDC Meeting Schedule

Moved by White, seconded by Bushkuhl, to approve the 2016-2017 HDC Meeting Schedule as presented. On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Yeas: 6 - White, Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, and Hall

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Secretary Ross

H **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

H-1 [16-0535](#) Minutes of the December 10, 2015 HDC Meeting

A motion was made by Ramsburgh, seconded by White, that the Minutes be Approved by the Commission with corrections and forwarded to the City Council. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

H-2 [16-0536](#) Minutes of the February 11, 2016 HDC Meeting

Ramsburgh commented that she had made note about mini-splits and didn't want that to be dropped. She asked if they could come up with a guideline for these.

Thacher suggested Ramsburgh start by looking how mini-splits could be worked into the Mechanical equipment section of the guidelines.

A motion was made by Ramsburgh, seconded by White, that the Minutes be Approved by the Commission and forwarded to the City Council. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

H-3 [16-0537](#) Minutes of the March 16, 2016 HDC Meeting

A motion was made by Ramsburgh, seconded by White, that the

Minutes be Approved by the Commission with changes and forwarded to the City Council. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

I REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS

J ASSIGNMENTS

Review Committee: Monday, May 9, 2016, at 5pm for the May 12, 2016 Regular Meeting

Thacher noted that Commissioner Ross had volunteered.

White said he could possibly make the May Review Committee as could Bushkuhl.

K REPORTS FROM STAFF

16-0538 March 2016 HDC Staff Activities

Received and Filed

L CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS

Bushkuhl asked if there had been any follow-up on the issue at W. Liberty at Fourth.

Thacher said they have a June deadline for the work.

Bushkuhl said walking through town he had noted that a tenant advertising in a front yard had become permanent with concrete keeping it in place.

Thacher said Commissioners could provide her with addresses and she would follow-up on it with the new Zoning Administrator.

M COMMUNICATIONS

16-0539 Various Communications to the HDC

N ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 9:20 p.m.

Community Television Network Channel 16 live televised public meetings are also available to watch live online from CTN's website, www.a2gov.org/ctn, on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>).

Live Web streaming is one more way, in addition to these listed below, to stay in touch with Ann Arbor City Council and board and commission actions and deliberations.

- *Video on Demand: Replay public meetings at your convenience online at www.a2gov.org/government/city_administration/communicationsoffice/ctn/Pages/VideoOnDemand.aspx*
- *Cable: Watch CTN Channel 16 public meeting programming via Comcast Cable channel 16.*

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at www.a2gov.org/ctn, on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>), or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.