

ANN ARBOR HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Staff Report

ADDRESS: 241 East Liberty Street, Application Number HDC16-054

DISTRICT: Main Street Historic District

REPORT DATE: May 4, 2016

REPORT PREPARED BY: Jill Thacher, Historic Preservation Coordinator

REVIEW COMMITTEE DATE: Monday, May 9, 2016

	OWNER	APPLICANT
Name:	Liberty Plaza Associates	Folk Sign Studio LLC
Address:	210 Fifth Ann Arbor, MI	5215 Moechei Road Stockbridge, MI 49285
Phone:		(734) 883-8259

BACKGROUND: This storefront occupies the western end of the Zwerdling Block, built in 1915 by tailor Osias Zwerdling. Zwerdling was a leader in the local Jewish community. In the late 1970s, it and its neighbor to the east, the 1917 Darling Block, were renovated into the East Liberty Plaza. The six original storefronts were removed and new contemporary ones inset several feet to allow light into new commercial spaces in the basement level. All of the original wood double-hung windows were replaced with metal double-hung windows in the same size but with unequal sash.

In 2010, new signage and awnings were approved by the Historic District Commission.

LOCATION: The site is located on the northwest corner of East Liberty and Fifth Streets.

APPLICATION: The applicant seeks HDC approval to recover existing individual small awnings and add signage to them on one storefront bay, and replace the small awnings with a new full width awning with signage across another bay. The proposed new awning is rectangular and 17'x3'. All of the awnings are red with white lettering.

APPLICABLE REGULATIONS:

From the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:

- (2) The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
- (9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

From the Secretary of the Interior’s Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (other SOI Guidelines may also apply):

Storefronts

Not Recommended: Introducing a new design that is incompatible in size, scale, material, and color; using inappropriately scaled signs and logos or other types of signs that obscure, damage, or destroy remaining character-defining features of the historic building; using new illuminated signs.

From the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines (other Guidelines may apply):

Awnings

Appropriate: Mounting a standard storefront awning so that the bottom of the fixed frame is at least 7 feet above the sidewalk, although 8 feet is preferred. Consideration should be given to the height of neighboring awnings.

Projecting the awning from the face of the building no more than 4 feet.

Attaching the awning just below the storefront cornice and fitting it within the storefront opening.

Using canvas, vinyl-coated canvas, or acrylic fabrics for awnings and banners.

Signs

Appropriate: Installing signage that is subordinate to the overall building composition.

Mounting signs to fit within existing architectural features using the shape of the sign to help reinforce the horizontal lines of moldings and transoms seen along the street.

Installing signage in the historic sign band area of the building, typically the area above the transoms or just above the storefront.

Not Appropriate: Installing several signs to advertise a single business.

STAFF FINDINGS:

1. The proposed new awning measures 17 long by 3 feet high. It would replace five small individual awnings that were installed by a previous tenant, but would be mounted on the existing frame. The awning will be red with white letters that say “Nagomi Sushi Downtown”. The awning will also contain a logo at one end. On the other storefront bay, lettering would be applied to each of the existing small square awnings. The awnings would read, “Lunch Specials”, “Sake”, “Japanese Cuisine”, “Liquor”, and “Special Events”.
2. The proposed new awning and its signage is compatible with the building and adjacent awnings, as long as the color and fabric match the five existing awnings that will remain. The signage on the small awnings is minimal in height and does not detract from the

historic character of the building. Staff believes that the overall size, color, texture, and material are appropriate and meet *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*, in particular standards 2 and 9, and the guidelines for storefronts, and the *Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines*.

POSSIBLE MOTIONS: (Note that the motion is only a suggestion. The Review Committee, consisting of staff and at least two Commissioners, will meet with the applicant on site and then make a recommendation at the meeting.)

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 241 East Liberty Street, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District, to recover an existing awning frame and add signage to existing awning covers, on the condition that the new awning cover is the same color as the ones to be removed. The proposed work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings*, in particular standards 2 and 9 and the guidelines for storefronts, and the *Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines*.

MOTION WORKSHEET:

I move that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the work at 241 East Liberty Street in the Main Street Historic District

___ Provided the following condition(S) is (ARE) met: 1) STATE CONDITION(s)

The work is generally compatible with the size, scale, massing, and materials and meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, standard(S) number(S) (*circle all that apply*): 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10

ATTACHMENTS: application, drawings, photos.

July 2008



September 2014 Google Streetview





4-13-16

HDC 16-054

4/13/16

City of Ann Arbor
PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT SERVICES — PLANNING SERVICES

100 North Fifth Avenue P.O. Box 8647 Ann Arbor, Michigan 48107-8647
p 734.794.6265 f 734.994.8312 planning@a2gov.org

ANN ARBOR HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION APPLICATION

Section 1: Property Being Reviewed and Ownership Information

Address of Property: 241 EAST LIBERTY ST

Historic District: LIBERTY PLAZA ASSOCIATES

Name of Property Owner (If different than the applicant):



Address of Property Owner: 210 FIFTH ST ANN ARBOR, MI

Daytime Phone and E-mail of Property Owner: _____

Signature of Property Owner: _____ Date: _____

Section 2: Applicant Information

Name of Applicant: FOLK SIGN STUDIO LLC

Address of Applicant: 5215 MOECHEL RD STOCKBRIDGE, MI 49285

Daytime Phone: (734) 883 8259 Fax: ()

E-mail: FOLK SIGN STUDIO @ HOTMAIL.COM

Applicant's Relationship to Property: owner architect contractor other

Signature of applicant: Scott Beckelhamer Date: 4-13-16

Section 3: Building Use (check all that apply)

Residential Single Family Multiple Family Rental

Commercial Institutional

Section 4: Stille-DeRossett-Hale Single State Construction Code Act

(This item **MUST BE INITIALED** for your application to be **PROCESSED**)

Public Act 169, Michigan's Local Historic Districts Act, was amended April 2004 to include the following language: "...the applicant has certified in the application that the property where the work will be undertaken has, or will have before the proposed completion date, a fire alarm or smoke alarm complying with the requirements of the Stille-DeRossett-Hale Single State Construction Code Act, 1972 PA 230, MCL 125.1501 to 125.1531."

Please initial here: SB

4121.4

Section 5: Description of Proposed Changes (attach additional sheets as necessary)

1. Provide a brief summary of proposed changes. CHANGE COVER ON
EXISTING AWNING FRAME.

APPLY LETTERING TO AWNING COVERS

2. Provide a description of existing conditions. EXISTING AWNINGS
WITHOUT GRAPHICS.

3. What are the reasons for the proposed changes? NEW LEASE ON
BUILDING

4. Attach any additional information that will further explain or clarify the proposal, and indicate these attachments here.

5. Attach photographs of the existing property, including at least one general photo and detailed photos of proposed work area.

STAFF USE ONLY

Date Submitted: _____ Application to _____ Staff or _____ HDC

Project No.: HDC Fee Paid: _____

Pre-filing Staff Reviewer & Date: _____ Date of Public Hearing: _____

Application Filing Date: _____ Action: _____ HDC COA _____ HDC Denial

Staff signature: _____ _____ HDC NTP _____ Staff COA

Comments:





Sign Fabrication & Service
Architectural & Descriptive
Window Films
Wayfinding Systems
ADA Signage
Dimensional Lettering
Folkstudio@hotmail.com
5215 Moechel Rd Stockbridge, MI 49285
734-883-8259

Project: Nagomi Sushi Downtown 241 East Liberty Street
8.8 square feet of signage applied to these covers.
 Apply lettering to existing awning covers.
 Cut stencils and ink on copy.

17 feet



Nagomi Sushi

D O W N T O W N

3 feet

Sign Fabrication & Service
Architecture & Decorative
Window Films
Wayfinding Systems
ADA Signage
Dimensional Lettering
Folkstudio@hotmail.com
5215 Meichel Rd Stockbridge MI 49285
734-863-8259



Project: Nagomi Sushi Downtown 241 East Liberty Street
51 square feet of new signage on this cover.
Apply lettering to new awning fabric cover.
Attach to existing frame work on building.
Cut stencils and ink on copy.



Nagomi Sushi
D O W N T O W N

LUNCH
SPECIALS

SAKE

JAPANESE
CUISINE

LIQUOR

SPECIALS
EVENTS





Existing Signage 15 SQ FT