



City of Ann Arbor

Formal Minutes

Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
[http://a2gov.legistar.com/
Calendar.aspx](http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx)

Thursday, November 16, 2017

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second
floor, City Council Chambers

A **CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Beeson called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

He welcomed everyone to the meeting, introduced HDC members, and asked newest member Jessica Quijano to provide some background on herself.

Quijano said she lives in Ann Arbor since almost ten years, and has been working for the past five years with Hopkins Burns Design Studio, a historic design focused architectural firm. She said she has several years experience working on projects in other historic districts as an architect as well as National Registrar Nominations, some historic tax credit projects, and she wants to get more involved in the community in which she lives.

The Commission welcomed her warmly.

B **ROLL CALL**

Jill Thacher called the roll.

Present: 5 - John Beeson, Max Cope, David Rochlen, Anna Epperson,
and Jessica Quijano

Absent: 2 - Robert White, and Evan Hall

C **APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

The Agenda was unanimously approved with Item G-2 moved to next month's HDC meeting. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

D **AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION - PUBLIC COMMENTARY - (3 Minutes per Speaker)**

None

E UNFINISHED BUSINESS**F HEARINGS****F-1** **17-1808** HDC17-240; 216 N State Street -Replace Metal Roof -- SSHD

Commission Anna Epperson excused herself and left the room. It was noted that she had a conflict of interest on the project.

Jill Thacher explained that the Commission will need 3 affirmative votes to pass a motion, with a 2-2 affirmative vote leaving a tie vote.

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners John Beeson and David Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Katie Vohwinkle, 210 S. Fifth Avenue, representing the owner, Oxford Companies, was present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Rochlen, seconded by Cope, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 216 N. State Street, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to remove tin mansard roof cladding and replace it with asphalt dimensional shingles, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2 and 9, and the guidelines for Building Site, District/Neighborhood, and Roofs.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion defeated. Vote: 0-4

Request was denied.

Yeas: 0

Nays: 4 - Vice Chair Beeson, Cope, Rochlen, and Quijano

Absent: 2 - White, and Hall

Recused: 1 - Epperson

F-2 **17-1809** HDC17-226; 316 S Main Street - Replace Storefront -- MSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners John Beeson and David Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Richard Mitchell, Mitchell and Mouat Architects, 113 S. Fourth Avenue, Ann Arbor, was present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Cope, seconded by Rochlen, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 316 S. Main Street, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District, to replace the current storefront with a suspended canopy, stone or precast stone cladding, four main entry doors with minimal framing and a glass/aluminum easement door, three signs on the canopy and one changeable message sign beneath it, and additional signage on the glass doors, on the following conditions: that the canopy signs are neon or halo-lit, and reviewed by staff at the

building permit stage. The work as proposed is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for storefronts and signs, and The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, and 9 and the guidelines for storefronts and building site.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - Vice Chair Beeson, Cope, Rochlen, Epperson, and Quijano

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - White, and Hall

F-3 **17-1810** HDC17-218; 318 West Liberty - New Building Sign - OWSHD.

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners John Beeson and David Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Nathan Bertan, Image 360 - Brighton, 2150 Pless Drive, Brighton, sign manufacturer was present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Cope, seconded by Quijano, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 318 West Liberty Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to install a 49" by 33" address sign on the following condition: that the sign is mounted through masonry joints, not masonry units. The work as conditioned is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for signs and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standard 9.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - Vice Chair Beeson, Cope, Rochlen, Epperson, and Quijano

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - White, and Hall

F-4 [17-1812](#) HDC17-224; 316 Second Street - Demolish Garage - OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners John Beeson and David Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Mr. B. Wojahn, applicant, was present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Quijano, seconded by Cope, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 316 Second Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to demolish the garage and leave the slab in place. The work as proposed is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines and The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standard 2 and the guidelines for Building Site.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - Vice Chair Beeson, Cope, Rochlen, Epperson, and Quijano

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - White, and Hall

G NEW BUSINESS

G-1 [17-1811](#) City Sign Ordinance Informational Presentation by Consultant

City Planner Chris Cheng introduced Jill Bahm, Giffel Webster Consultant, provided a presentation on the scope of the upcoming sign ordinance review they will be working on together with the City.

Received and Filed

G-2 [17-1813](#) Elections

Elections were unanimously moved to next month, when all members are present.

H **APPROVAL OF MINUTES****I** **REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS****J** **ASSIGNMENTS**

- J-1** **17-1815** Review Committee: Monday, December 11, 2017 at Noon for the December 14, 2017 Regular Meeting
Beeson and Epperson volunteered for the December 11th HDC Review Committee.

K **REPORTS FROM STAFF**

- K-1** **17-1816** October 2017 HDC Staff Activities
Received and Filed

L **CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS****M** **COMMUNICATIONS**

- M-1** **17-1818** Various Communications to the HDC
Received and Filed

N **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 8:55 p.m.

Community Television Network Channel 16 live televised public meetings are also available to watch live online from CTN's website, www.a2gov.org/ctn, on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>).

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at www.a2gov.org/ctn, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.

/mg