

ANN ARBOR HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Staff Report

ADDRESS: 514 West Madison Street, Application Number HDC22-1200

DISTRICT: Old West Side Historic District

REPORT DATE: October 13, 2022

REPORT PREPARED BY: Jill Thacher, Historic Preservation Coordinator

REVIEW COMMITTEE DATE: Tuesday, October 11, 2022

	OWNER	APPLICANT
Name:	Zachary Moen	Monika Frost/Dexter Builders, Inc
Address:	Not provided	13600 Luick Drive Chelsea, MI 48118
Phone:		Not provided

BACKGROUND: This brick, two-story, mansard-roofed home appears in the 1894 and 1897 Polk City Directories with no named occupant, and in 1898 as the home of Emily and John Bonien, a laborer. Their last name is listed later as Bonnin (1910) and eventually, in 1920, as Bonin (at which point John is listed as the “assistant in charge of surveying instrument room, U of M”). It features a full-width front porch with a shallow mansard roof that is adorned with arrow and round wood shingles (arranged to form two rows of full circles). The base of the porch is rusticated block and the decking and stairs are poured concrete. The one-over-one double-hung windows are topped with shallow brick arches. The front and side elevations of the mansard roof feature small dormer windows with stylized pediments.

On May 11, 2012 a fire caused extensive burn damage to the second floor and attic, and smoke and water damage throughout the house. Repair and restoration occurred in 2012 and 2013. In November, 2013 the HDC approved an application to install a third-floor dormer and change a window opening on a rear addition.

LOCATION: The site is located on the north side of West Madison Street, west of Third Street and east of Fourth Street.

APPLICATION: The applicant seeks HDC approval to replace the masonry elements of the front porch with similar materials.

APPLICABLE REGULATIONS

From the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation:

- (2) The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.

- (9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

From the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (other SOI Guidelines may also apply):

Building Site

Recommended: Identifying, retaining, and preserving buildings and their features as well as features of the site that are important in defining its overall historic character.

Not Recommended: Introducing new construction onto the building site which is visually incompatible in terms of size, scale, design, materials, color and texture or which destroys historic relationships on the site.

Removing or radically changing buildings and their features or site features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the building site so that, as a result, the character is diminished.

Masonry

Recommended: Repairing masonry features by patching, piecing-in, or consolidating the masonry using recognized preservation methods. Repair may also include the limited replacement in kind – or with compatible substitute material – of those extensively deteriorated or missing parts of masonry features when there are surviving prototypes such as terra-cotta brackets or stone balusters.

Not Recommended: Replacing an entire masonry feature such as a cornice or balustrade when repair of the masonry and limited replacement of deteriorated or missing parts is appropriate.

Using a substitute material for the replacement part that does not convey the visual appearance of the surviving parts of the masonry feature or that is physically or chemically incompatible.

From the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines (other Ann Arbor guidelines may also apply):

Masonry Walls, Trims and Foundation

Appropriate: Protecting, maintaining and preserving masonry features and surfaces that contribute to the overall historic character of a building or site.

Repairing historic masonry using recognized preservation methods.

STAFF FINDINGS

1. This porch is unique in the Old West Side because of its sculpted-block elements, mansard roof, and hand-cut (by a former resident's children!) wood scallop shingles. The blocks would have been cast on site as the porch was being built. The application says deterioration and the porch pulling away from the house because of settling requires replacement of its masonry elements.
2. The existing porch has a sculpted block foundation, wing walls, and six 18" x 18" block piers. The decking and the caps on each pier and wing wall are 4" concrete. The proposal is to replace the masonry with new that resembles the existing as closely as possible and matches dimensions. This is included as a condition in the resolution.
3. Photos of the porch's deterioration and the areas of concern are included in the attachments. If the HDC finds that the porch deterioration is sufficient to require replacement, the proposed sculpted block adequately matches the existing.

POSSIBLE MOTIONS: (Note that the motion supports staff findings and is only a suggestion. The Review Committee, consisting of staff and at least two Commissioners, will meet with the applicant on site and then make a recommendation at the meeting.)

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 514 West Madison Street, a contributing building in the Old West Side Historic District, to replace the masonry portions of the front porch with the proposed materials, on the condition that the dimensions of the blocks, masonry joints, and concrete elements match the original. As conditioned, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and meets the *Ann Arbor Historic District Guidelines* for masonry walls, trims and foundation, and *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*, in particular standards 2 and 9, and the guidelines for building site and masonry.

MOTION WORKSHEET:

I move that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the work at 514 W Madison Street in the Old West Side Historic District

_____ Provided the following condition(S) is (ARE) met: 1) STATE CONDITION(s)

The work is generally compatible with the size, scale, massing, and materials and meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, standard(S) number(S) (*circle all that apply*): 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10

ATTACHMENTS: Application, photos, drawings, block detail

514 W Madison (April 2008 photo)

