



City of Ann Arbor

Formal Minutes - Draft

Design Review Board

301 E. Huron St.
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
[http://a2gov.legistar.com/
Calendar.aspx](http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx)

Wednesday, December 13, 2023

3:00 PM

Electronic Meeting

This meeting will be broadcast on CTN Cable Channel 16, ATT Channel 99, and at a2gov.org/watchCTN

Public comment can be made by calling: 877 853 5247 or 888 788 0099 Enter Meeting ID:
Webinar ID: 974 6174 9412

A. **CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Geoff Perkins called the meeting to order at 3:00 pm.

B. **ROLL CALL**

Deputy Planning Manager Hank Kelley called the roll and noted Board Member Gary Cooper has submitted his resignation to the Design Review Board.

Others present:

Hank Kelley, Deputy Planning Manager

Alexis DiLeo, City Planner

Matt Kowalski, City Planner

Present: 7 - Richard (Dick) Mitchell, Tamara Burns, William Kinley, Geoffrey M. Perkins, Lori Singleton, John Kotarski, and Wendy Rampson

C. **APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

Moved by Bill Kinley seconded by Lori Singleton to approve the agenda. The agenda was unanimously approved as presented.

D. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

[23-1984](#) April 12, 2023 Design Review Board Meeting Minutes

Attachments: April 12, 2023 DRB Meeting Minutes.pdf

Moved by Lori Singleton seconded by Dick Mitchell to approve the April 12, 2023 Design Review Board meeting minutes.

E. PUBLIC COMMENT (3 minutes per speaker)

-Kayvon Hemati, resident, spoke in opposition to the project at 1208 South University and demolishing Pinball Pete's

-Lucas Renno, resident, spoke in opposition to the project at 1208 South University and demolishing Pinball Pete's.

-Hannah Myers, resident, spoke in opposition to 228 Packard Street noting the project was out of scale.

-Samuel Hayes, Washtenaw County resident, spoke in opposition to 1208 South University, need clearer definition of affordable. New units will be very expensive. Not attainable for lower income college students.

-Ted Arnold - Owner of Pinball Pete's spoke in opposition 1208 South University, future of business is in balance. Ask City to consider if this is the proper building for the area.

-Dennis and Connie Burke, 528 South Fourth Avenue, spoke in opposition to the 228 Packard Street project. Expressed concern with tear-down of homes and huge parking structure noting there is already public parking in the area.

-Jeffrey Ratliff, resident - comment - high rises push out small businesses more and more in favor of corporate businesses who can afford higher rents. Concerning trend in Ann Arbor.

-Howie Yang, resident, spoke in opposition to 228 Packard Street, I am pro-development, however, concerned with 12-13 story mega buildings and high density next to existing homes in area.

-Anne Eisen, resident, spoke in opposition to the 228 Packard Street project, noting we need housing for people who live and work in Ann Arbor. this location is perfect for people of any income level who choose not to own cars. Project would build 400 parking spaces and unaffordable units. Replaces existing affordable housing. Attracts new traffic and anticipate problems for existing transit.

-Piotr Michalowski, resident across street from 228 Packard Street, spoke in opposition to the proposed project. Expressing concern that project is out of scale with environment.

F. REGULAR BUSINESS

23-1985 DR23-0004: 228 Packard Street

The proposed apartment building, featuring ground-floor commercial space and a parking structure, occupies a block bordered by Packard Street, South Fifth Avenue, East Madison Street, and South Fourth Avenue. Its design transitions from six stories on Packard to 12 on Madison, reflecting the block's slope. The minimalist, naturally-colored building has a one-story base on the north and a three-story base on the south, with distinct overhangs and material changes. Upper floors, aligned with the base, incorporate full-height recesses for façade diversity. The 119,903 square-foot site, currently zoned R4C and M1, is slated for rezoning to D1 with First Street Character and Secondary frontage.

Attachments: Staff Report DRB 2023-12-13 (228 Packard).pdf, Project Narrative (228 Packard).pdf, Design Plan (228 Packard).pdf, Supporting Materials (228 Packard).pdf

Representing the proposed project:

*Brad Moore, J Bradley Moore
Matthew Axtmann, ESG Architecture & Design
Ryan Bumb, Subtext
Scott Betzoldt, Midwestern Consulting*

The Design Review Board discussed the design plan for the proposed 228 Packard Street development project on December 13, 2023. Please consider the following comments and recommendations of the Design Review Board when preparing a site plan application:

Comments on project:

- The more appropriate dimensional standards for the project are those of the D2 district.*
- The context as identified by the design team feels inappropriate.*

Comments on overall design:

- The mass of the building is too tall, too large, and out of scale for the site context. Consider better matching the scale of the proposed University of Michigan quad buildings to the south.*

- *The design lacks character and distinction. More specifically, Ann Arbor traditionally uses more brick and more color, and a more earthy color palette.*
- *Some material choices are inappropriate, specifically the use of EFIS as a primary material.*
- *Consider the pedestrian experience from the sidewalk, for example by increasing visual relief and the porosity of the ground floor.*
- *Ensure there is sufficient sunlight for the proposed plantings on the north side of walls.*
- *Consider opportunities for public art and especially beyond wall murals, including high pressure laminate, mosaics, and sculpture gardens and courtyards.*
- *Provide the rationale for the proposed number of parking spaces.*

23-1986 DR23-0005; 1208 South University

A proposal for a 17-story mixed-use building with residential and retail spaces. It features a three-story brick and metal panel base, housing a lobby, leasing office, and retail on the ground floor. The design transitions from a banded 4th-floor level to a contemporary tower with punched windows and balconies. Notable are the pilaster details on the top level and a curtain wall on the northwest corner extending to the south façade's rooftop.

Attachments: Staff Report DRB 2023-12-13 (1208 S University), Project Narrative (1208 S University), Submittal Package (1208 S University Plans)

Representing the proposed project:

John Myefski, Myefski Architects

The Design Review Board discussed the design plan for the proposed 228 Packard Street development project on December 13, 2023. Please consider the following comments and recommendations of the Design Review Board when preparing a site plan application:

Comments on overall design

- *Concerns with balconies at this height, consider safety/structural concerns.*
- *Concerns with fake brick mixed with real brick. Can have a bad effect and draw attention to the different material choices. Ensure material choices blend well.*
- *Strengthen the effect of the balconies and facades.*
- *How will public art be incorporated into the project? Consider more than*

just a standard mural.

- *More information needed on the use of the proposed building panel system to ensure compliance with code.*
- *Overall support for the design, materials, and consideration of the site context.*

G. **UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

G-1. **23-2029** 2024 Design Review Board Calendar for Approval

Attachments: 2024 DRB Meeting Calendar.pdf

Moved by Singleton seconded by Wendy Rampson to approve the 2024 Design Review Board meeting calendar. The calendar was unanimously approved as presented.

Chair Perkins noted he would like the Design Review Board to go back to holding meetings in person at City Hall.

Wendy Rampson noted she was in agreement about holding meetings at City Hall.

Lori Singleton noted she would be open to in person or Zoom meetings, and asked if meetings could be hybrid that would allow broader participation from the public.

Deputy Planning Manager Kelley noted non hybrid meetings could be challenging for staffing at City Hall. Stated non voting committees of the Planning Commission holds meetings online.

H. **COMMUNICATIONS**

23-1987 Various Communication to the Design Review Board

Attachments: Allan email of opposition DR23-0004; 228 Packard Street.pdf, Burke letter of opposition DR23-0004; 228 Packard Street.pdf

Received and filed.

I. **PUBLIC COMMENT**

-Anne Eisen, resident, spoke in opposition to the 228 Packard Street project. Expressed concerns with traffic and cars for 228 Packard Street. Want to see benches and trees in the design. Suggest preservation.

-Ted Arnold, Pinball Pete's president, spoke in opposition to 1208 South University stating the only time I have heard from John Myefski was at the library meeting. I am just hearing about deals extended to Pinball Pete's right now in this meeting. No-one, landlords, etc., have reached out to us. What was presented at DRB by Mr. Myefski is false.

-Samuel Hayes, Washtenaw County resident, spoke in opposition to the 1208 South University project expressing concerns with affordability. Would like to see average prices listed "per unit" instead of "per bed". We want students to live where they study, and for families to afford.

-Kayvon Hemati, resident, spoke in opposition to the 1208 South University project saying don't think parking is so necessary in 1208 South University area. Ann Arbor wants to be centered around walkability instead of vehicle use.

-Claudius Vincenzo resident, spoke in opposition to 228 Packard Street project stating they think this is prematurely on DRB docket. Project is out of scale, and too big. Concerned with energy consumption and EV accommodation.

J. ADJOURNMENT

Chair Perkins adjourned the meeting at 5:54 pm.

Geoff Perkins, Chairperson

/courtney manor

All persons are encouraged to participate in public meetings. Citizens requiring translation or sign language services or other reasonable accommodations may contact the City Clerk's office at 734.794.6140; via e-mail to: cityclerk@a2gov.org; or by written request addressed and mailed or delivered to:

City Clerk's Office
301 E. Huron St.
Ann Arbor, MI 48104

Requests made with less than two business days' notice may not be able to be accommodated.