

# **MEMORANDUM**

TO: Ordinance Revisions Committee

THROUGH: Hank Kelley, Deputy Planning Manager

FROM: Alexis DiLeo, City Planner

DATE: April 23, 2024

SUBJECT: Petition for Text Amendments related to TC1 Standards

## Introduction

A petition has been submitted requesting five amendments to the Unified Development Code related to the TC1 district as attached. In summary, the amendments are:

- 1. Increase the number of curb cuts allowed in the TC1 district for sites on more than one street
- 2. Increase the building dimensions allowed in the TC1 district for larger sites
- 3. Allow some exceptions to minimum building frontage requirements in the TC1 district for certain open spaces
- 4. Allow some exceptions in the use specific standards for parking structures for design and uses at the street level based on site size or street frontage designation
- 5. Add a definition for block

## **Background**

In addition to the normal development standards provided in the Unified Development Code, buildings in the TC1 district must comply with additional standards provided in Table 5.17-8 of Section 5.17.7.

Certain uses also have use specific standards, as noted in the permitted use tables in Section 5.15 and provided in Section 5.16. Parking structures are among the uses with specific standards.

## **Preliminary Analysis**

Foremost, staff acknowledge that the petitioner – part of a development team working to prepare the first site plan application for any project in the TC1 district at 2845 South State Street – raises reasonable and valid concerns from a practical standpoint after attempting to apply the codified standards. It should be no surprise that some challenges have been brought to light about this untested district with its first proposed design.

### Curb cut limits - Table 5.17-8

Currently, smaller sites in the TC1 district (those less than 250 feet in lot width) may
have one curb cut and larger sites (those with more than 250 feet in lot width) may have
two curb cuts.

TABLE 5.17-8: TRANSIT CORRIDOR ADDITIONAL STANDARDS									
SITES									
Curb Cut Limits	Lots 250 ft. in Width: No more than one curb cut for a two-way driveway or two curb cuts for a pair of one-way driveways.  Lots 250 ft. or more in Width: No more than two curb cuts.								
Parking T									

 Outside of the TC1 district, Section 5.21.2 allows one opening with up to 100 feet of street frontage, two openings with between 101 and 200 feet of street frontage, and one additional opening is permitted for every 600 feet of street frontage beyond 200 feet.

TABLE 5.21-1: MAXIMUM NUMBER OF OPENINGS										
	TOTAL STREET FRONTAGE									
	UP TO 100 FT.	101 FT. TO 200 FT.	201 FT. OR MORE							
Number of Openings	1	2	2 for the first 200 ft. plus 1 for each additional 600 ft. of total <i>street frontage</i> afte the first 200 ft.							

- The additional standards for the TC1 district provided in Table 5.17-8 were put in place
  to help achieve the intent and goals of the district. The additional standards encourage
  downtown-like streetscapes by placing limitations on the number of curb cuts as well as
  regulating minimum building frontage relative to lot width and building dimensions.
- The petitioner requests an amendment so that the limitations on curb cuts apply per street frontage rather than per site. In this scheme, (assuming a site has more than 250 feet of frontage on each side) corner lots would be permitted four curb cuts and doublecorner lots would be permitted six curb cuts.
- Upon reflection, the most important aspect curb cut limits is not restricting the total number per site but ensuring that spacing of curb cuts and blocks across a site's street frontage mimics the grid pattern of downtown streets and blocks. The curb cut limitations provided in Table 5.17-8 could be changed as the petitioner has suggested, or to some version of "one for every 250 feet of lot width" with no impact to the intent or outcome of the additional standards while providing needed flexibility to unusually large sites.
- Staff support the request to amend the curb cut limits in Table 5.17-8 as long as the intent and outcomes to mimic downtown-like development patterns remain intact.
- Staff also suggest considering moving the curb cut limits in Table 5.17-8 to Table 5.21-1 for improved consistency overall.

# **Building dimensions – Table 5.17-8**

- Buildings in the TC1 district are limited to 250 feet in width parallel to the street and 360 feet in maximum diagonal dimension.
- These dimensions were roughly based on the dimensions of the originally platted center blocks centered at Main and Huron. These 16 blocks are 264 feet on each side, being made from four lots 66 feet wide and 132 feet deep on each half-block.
- The next blocks east of the 16-block center, between Fifth Ave and Division, are twice as long as the center blocks. They are made from eight 66-foot wide and 132-foot deep lots per block having a total block length of 528 feet.



- The petitioner requests an amendment to allow exceeding the 250-foot building width dimension and 360-foot building diagonal dimension when the lot or block is more than 3 acres (130,680 square feet). Then, the maximum building width dimension would be 300 feet and the maximum building diagonal dimension would be 450 feet.
- Because there are a variety of block sizes downtown, and most are comfortable, pedestrian-friendly blocks, there should be room for a variety of block sizes in the TC1 district as long as the site is large enough to support the variety.
- Staff support the request to allow larger blocks on larger sites but somewhat differently than as the petitioner has suggested.
- Staff preliminarily recommend a concept where the 250-foot building width and 360-foot building diagonal requirements be maintained for the first four blocks of a site, then if the

- site size allows, additional blocks could be up to 500 feet wide (mimicking the downtown blocks between Fifth Ave and Division) and a corresponding maximum diagonal dimension of 720 feet. Eligible sites that could consider the proposed larger block size would have to be more than 250,000 square feet (about 5.5 acres).
- Staff would also discuss increasing the maximum building width dimension from 250 feet to 264 feet to exactly match the scale of the central blocks in the original plat of Ann Arbor if the Committee express interest.

# Building Frontage - Table 5.17-8

Buildings in the TC1 district are required to span 70% of the lot width. This standard is
intended to achieve the solid streetwalls found downtown with some allowance for
driveways since rear alleys are almost non-existent outside of downtown.

	Sidewaiks, plazas, drives, private streets or proposed public rights-oi-way separating and								
ALL BUILDINGS									
Buildin Fronta									
Buildin									

• In the D1 and D2 districts, there is no separate standard for building frontage but with both minimum and maximum required front setback standards, it is implied. Reinforcing the clear expectation and implied standard, there are provided exceptions for maximum required front setbacks on Primary Streets. Up to 20% of the building frontage may exceed the maximum required front setback at the streetwall for an entry court or plaza area.

TABLE 5.17-7: DOWNTOWN CHARACTER OVERLAY ZONING DISTRICTS BUILDING FRONT SETBACK STANDARDS										
STREET TYPE	REQUIRED FRONT									
DESIGNATION	SETBACK	ADDITIONAL REQUIREMENTS AND EXCEPTIONS								
Primary Street	Min. o ft. Max. 1 ft. at the streetwall	(1)Up to 20% of the building frontage may exceed the maximum required front setback at the streetwall for an entry court or plaza area, except in the Main Street Overlay Zoning District.  (2)The maximum required front setback at the streetwall may be exceeded to provide up to 16 ft. between the back of curb and the streetwall to allow for pedestrian circulation.  (3)Vehicle access shall be provided from a public alley, if accessible.  (4)Recesses and alcoves on the level of the adjacent street to accommodate entry ways, display windows, planters, or similar features shall not be considered as setbacks, provided the streetwall of upper stories complies with the maximum required front setback.								
Secondary Street	Min. 0 ft. Max. 10 ft. at the streetwall	Up to 20% of the building frontage may exceed the maximum required front setback at the streetwall for entry court or plaza area.								
	Min 15ft	The average of the established front heilding line within 100 ft may be used								

The TC1 district also has minimum and maximum required front setback standards.

	ther use and development standards also apply and may supersede or effect the requirements in this table, such as Sections 5.16 Use Specific Standards, 5.18 pecial Dimensional and Site Layout Standards, 5.19 Parking Standards and 5.20 Landscaping, Screening, and Buffering.												
DISTRICT	Max. Floor	MIN. OPEN SPACE AND MAX.  AX. FLOOR  MAX.  BUILDING  REQUIRED SETBACKS		SETBACKS HEIGHT		LOT DIMENSIONS							
DISTRICT	AREA	FAR	COVERAGE (% LOT AREA)	FRONT	MIN. SIDE AND REAR	FEET AND STORIES	MIN. AREA	MIN. WIDTH					
TC1	None	None	None	Min: 18 ft. on designated Transit Corridor (D), otherwise o ft. Max: 28 ft. on designated Transit Corridor (D), otherwise 15 ft. for Mixed Use or 20 ft. Townhouses/ Apartments (A)	50 ft. when abutting R district, otherwise 0 ft.	Min: 2 Stories (B) Max: 55 ft. within 80 ft., 75 ft. between 80-300 ft., 120 ft. between 300-1000 ft., 300 ft. more than 1000 ft. from R district.	None	None					

- The petitioner requests an amendment to provide exceptions in the TC1 district for "public open space, natural features preservation, plazas, park areas, gathering spaces, and public art installations."
- Upon reflection, the TC1 district standards could be amended to be more consistent with the D1 and D2 district thus achieving the intended and required development patterns while allowing flexibility for desired features and improving regulatory consistency and clarity.
- Staff preliminarily recommend a concept to change the building frontage standards in Table 5.17-7 from the current format to providing the permitted exceptions to maximum required front setback. The exceptions for up to 30% of the maximum required front setback could include: driveways, sidewalks, plazas, open space and parks, natural features and natural feature buffers, and required buffers.

# Parking Structure Use Specific Standards – Section 5.16.3.L

Parking structures have use specific standards, referenced in Table 5.15-1 Primary Uses
and provided in Section 5.16.3.L The standards are tailored depending on whether the
parking structure is located in the D1, D2, or TC district but all generally require another
permitted primary use such as retail sales, office, or restaurant use, to be on the ground
floor of the parking structure along the street. These standards seek to ensure there is
an active use at the street-level of parking structures so development in commercial and
mixed-use zoning districts remains vibrant, pedestrian-friendly places.

### Parking Structure

#### ■ 1. D1 District

In the D1 district, an off-street parking structure is not permitted at the level of the adjacent street unless separated from the street by a portion of the building that is occupied by a permitted use or uses, with the exception of the portion of a parking structure that provides vehicular or pedestrian access to the street. Permitted uses shall be located within the building and have a minimum depth of 25 feet from the exterior of the front wall. On corner lots, this requirement shall apply to lot frontages on primary streets, as defined in Section 5.17.6 B. If none of the street frontages are a primary street, an off-street parking structure must be separated from at least one street frontage by a portion of the building that is occupied by a permitted use, with the exception of the portion of a parking structure that provides access to the street.

#### 2. D2 District

In the D2 district, an off-street parking structure shall be located a minimum of ten feet from the front lot line at the level of the adjacent street and provide a landscape buffer or screening wall between the building and the front lot line.

#### 3. TC District

In the TC district, an off-street parking structure in any building adjacent to the street must be separated from the street on the first floor by a permitted primary use at least 25 feet in depth from the exterior front wall, with the exception of the parking structure that provides vehicular or pedestrian access to the street.

#### 4. All Districts

In all districts, any wall of an off-street *parking structure* that abuts a residential zoning district shall not contain openings, or if it contains openings shall be separated from the *lot line* by a *building* other than a *parking structure* occupied by a permitted primary use or uses

- The petitioner requests an amendment to allow exceptions in the TC1 district. Two
  options are suggested, one proposes allowing up to 30% of street level building
  frontages to be parking structure for larger sites and the other proposes only apply the
  ground floor active use requirement to transit corridor street frontages.
- Staff feel strongly that parking structures should not be part of the streetwall in pedestrian-oriented developments in general. That said, there is perhaps room to distinguish appropriate active ground floor uses between street hierarchies or between the interior and exterior of a site. An exception of sorts is already allowed in the D1 district, requiring only one side of a parking structure on a corner lot to have active ground floor uses. Of the two suggestions offered by the petitioner, staff support the concept to allow parking structures without active ground floor uses on non-transit corridor street frontages.

### Definition of Block - Section 5.37.2

• The petitioner requests a definition for "block" be added to the code to help alleviate any confusion over the nuanced differences of a block, lot, parcel and unit of a site condo.

- Staff agree that all regulations should be clear and easily interpreted. Staff further support to the consistent and correct use of any defined term, phrase and descriptions.
- Staff's preliminary suggestion is to first carefully review Section 5.17.7 for consistent use
  of terms such as site, lot and parcel, all of which are defined, to see if a definition of
  block is needed. It may be found that, after the other requested or staff suggested
  amendments are incorporated, any ambiguity may be resolved.
- Staff's second suggestion is then to re-review the TC1 additional standards for potential redundancy or inconsistency. For example, the development arrangement standard calling for blocks may be unnecessary with clear requirements on individual building widths and diagonals, and clear requirements for site standards on the number of curb cuts and exceptions to the minimum and maximum required front setbacks. As another example, rephrasing standards using existing defined terms such as streetwall may ensure desired character in the same way as the undefined term block.
- Finally, staff are not opposed to adding a definition for block if truly needed. However, making regulations clearer, consistent, and easily applied should be the first response.

# Appendix A – Excerpt from Unified Development Code

# **5.17.7 Transit Corridor Districts**

Buildings and building additions zoned TC1 shall comply with the following additional standards in Table 5.17-8 as applicable.

TABLE 5.17-	-8: TRANSIT CORRIDOR ADDITIONAL STANDARDS								
SITES									
Curb Cut Limits	Lots 250 ft. in Width: No more than one curb cut for a two-way driveway or two curb cuts for a pair of one-way driveways.  Lots 250 ft. or more in Width: No more than two curb cuts.								
Parking Lot Placement	No placement exception provided in Section 5.19.6.B may be applied.								
Parking Lot Design	In addition to the maximum parking standards provided in Section 5.19.3, the portion of the <i>site</i> devoted to <i>vehicular use area</i> may not exceed:  **Lots 250 ft. in Width: 100% the total building footprint area.  **Lots 250 ft. or more in Width: 125% of the total building footprint area.  If this limitation on vehicular use area cannot accommodate the maximum number of permitted spaces, the remaining amount must be provided in a parking structure or within a building.  When the site is more than 62,500 sq. ft., the site must be designed as two or more blocks, with sidewalks, plazas, drives, private streets or proposed public rights-of-way separating the blocks.								
Development Arrangement									
	ALL BUILDINGS								
Building Frontage	The minimum building frontage shall be 70% of the lot width provided this allows 30 ft. between the building and side lot line normally or 45 ft. between the building and side lot line when adjacent to residential zoning. If the site is divided into smaller blocks as required above, the minimum building frontage shall apply to each block.								
Building Dimensions	The building width parallel to the street may not exceed 250 ft. The building maximum diagonal dimension may not exceed 360 ft.								
Building Entrances	Buildings at the front required setback must have a functional entrance door facing the street. Entrances at corners are acceptable.								
<b>Building Access</b>	Buildings must have a sidewalk adjacent to all sides with main entrances.								
One Story Building Exception	Buildings more than 750 ft. from a public street may be 1 story.								
	SPECIFIC BUILDING TYPES								
Townhouses and Apartment Building	Are not permitted within 100 ft. of a signalized intersection.  Townhouses must have street-facing doors and stoops.  Garages may not face any public street.								
All Other Buildings	Buildings that are not townhouses or apartment buildings must meet the design requirements provided in Section 5.17.6.C.2.  Residential uses are not permitted on the first floor within 100 ft. of a signalized intersection.								

# Appendix B – Excerpt from Unified Development Code

#### 5.16.3 Commercial Uses

•••

### L. Parking Structure

### 1. D1 District

In the D1 district, an off-street parking structure is not permitted at the level of the adjacent street unless separated from the street by a portion of the building that is occupied by a permitted use or uses, with the exception of the portion of a parking structure that provides vehicular or pedestrian access to the street. Permitted uses shall be located within the building and have a minimum depth of 25 feet from the exterior of the front wall. On corner lots, this requirement shall apply to lot frontages on primary streets, as defined in Section 5.17.6 B. If none of the street frontages are a primary street, an off-street parking structure must be separated from at least one street frontage by a portion of the building that is occupied by a permitted use, with the exception of the portion of a parking structure that provides access to the street.

### 2. D2 District

In the D2 district, an off-street *parking structure* shall be located a minimum of ten feet from the *front lot line* at the level of the adjacent street and provide a landscape buffer or screening wall between the *building* and the *front lot line*.

# 3. TC District

In the TC district, an off-street parking structure in any building adjacent to the street must be separated from the street on the first floor by a permitted primary use at least 25 feet in depth from the exterior front wall, with the exception of the parking structure that provides vehicular or pedestrian access to the street.

### 4. All Districts

In all districts, any wall of an off-street *parking structure* that abuts a residential zoning district shall not contain openings, or if it contains openings shall be separated from the *lot line* by a *building* other than a *parking structure* occupied by a permitted primary use or uses.



Land Development • Land Surveying • Municipal • Wireless Communications • Institutional • Transportation • Landfill Services

March 22, 2024

City of Ann Arbor Planning Department 301 E Huron Street Ann Arbor, Michigan 48104

Attn: Hank Kelley, Deputy Planning Manager

Re: 2845 S. State Street – Arbor South Project

Zoning Code Change Request *Midwestern File No.: 23142A* 

#### Dear Hank:

Midwestern Consulting, on behalf of our clients Crawford-Hoying, and Oxford Companies are respectfully requesting a text amendments to the TC1 zoning code as follows.

# 1 - Amendment to Table 5.17-8 Transit Corridor District Additional Standards

1. Curb Cut Limits - Bullet point 2 – Lots 250 feet or more in width: No more than 2 curb cuts *per public road frontage* 

## 2 - Amendment to Table 5.17-8 Transit Corridor District Additional Standards

6. Building Dimensions

- The Building width parallel to the street may not exceed 250 feet unless the lot or block is more than 3 acres and greater in size then the maximum building dimension parallel to the street may exceed 250 feet but less than 300 feet
- The Building maximum diagonal dimension may not exceed 360 feet unless the lot or block is more than 3 acres and greater in size then the maximum building diagonal dimension may exceed 360 feet but must be less than 450 feet

# 3 - Amendment to Table 5.17-8 Transit Corridor District Additional Standards

5. Building Frontage - The minimum building frontage shall be 70% of the Lot Width provided this allows 30 feet between the Building and Side Lot Line normally or 45 feet between the Building and Side Lot Line when adjacent to residential zoning. If the site is divided into smaller blocks as required above, the minimum building frontage shall apply to each block. *Public open space, natural features preservation, plazas, park areas, gathering spaces, and public art installations may count toward frontage requirements adding to the building frontage dimension.* 

## 4 - Article III: Use Regulations 5.16 Use Specific Standards – 5.16.3 Commercial Uses

4. In the TC1 district, an off-street Parking Structure in any Building adjacent to the street must be separated from the street on the first floor by a permitted primary use at least 25 feet in depth from the exterior front wall, with the exception of the portion of the Parking Structure that provides vehicular or pedestrian access to the street.

Lots/blocks 3 acres and greater in size and adjacent to the street could have 30% of the building frontage as parking structure.

Or consider...

Allowing parking structure frontages on non-transit corridor street frontages. In the case of the Arbor South project this would mean that there would be no structures fronting on S. State and Eisenhower (both designated transit corridors), but the project could have parking structure along the frontage of Boardwalk.

# 5 – Block definition addition to definitions section

Add block definition to definitions in code. We see many urban areas using the curb line as the block limit measuring point. This would help alleviate any confusion over the nuanced differences of a block, lot, parcel, and unit of a site condo.

These requests come from conceptual design work that has been completed while considering the application of the TC1 code to our contemplated Arbor South Project concept. The Arbor South project is the redevelopment of 23 acres of office use into a vibrant mixed use environment by introducing residential, commercial and open spaces into the office environment. This development will replace the over 10 acres of surface parking with a unique urban grid style layout including unique pedestrian spaces for social gathering and programing. Other unique site features include:

- o Frontage along 3 public road rights of way, two of which are designated transit corridors
- o Location of existing iconic office buildings in 777 and 789 Eisenhower
- Location of existing storm water features / ponds
- o Existing public utility easements and infrastructure
- o Existing private utility easements and infrastructure

We are hopeful that with this request that staff, the City Ordinance Revisions Committee, and City Planning Commission would consider these modifications to the code.

Please note that with this request we have included the application fee of \$2,000.

Sincerely, MIDWESTERN CONSULTING, LLC

Thomas J. Covert, RLA, AICP, LEED AP Principal

Recorded in Litter 7 parison 82 483.

2 (*)																				
1		1			 T 3	. (	llien			(RE)	<u>.</u>									
												•								
								-								Rose	nge		/	
		Min 24	<b>↓</b> ,	07:00					66	fel					1		<u>.</u>			
/		6 5 4		2,2 3 5	6	/ 2	34		12	3 4		78		1 2	234	45				
8	1	782		2	1	8 %	65		16/5	14/3	12 11	10 9		12. 11	1 10 9	87	6		//	
-	Paris of	Durana 4		1.000 4	1			-		6 8 =			· -					- //		
	100	6 3 3		3 5	6	/ 2	34		12	3 4	56	78		1 2	234	56	78			
8		78 7.		1 8	7 3	8 7	65		16 15	14/3	12//	10 9		16/3	14/3	12/4	10 9	•		
	ر ا	olind o	//·	Mich			CERLI	/	<u> </u>	82	1/2 x	ell.		<b>I</b>			<del></del>			
/	heer	6 5 4		veki de		3	5 6		/ 2	3 4	56	78		/ 2	2 3 4	156	78		4.1/	
8	,	782	00	02 <b>6</b> .7	<b>V</b> .	9	87	rech	16 15	14/3	12/1	10 9	2/4	16 1	5/4/	12/1	10 50		- Y	
		JI 10:00	4 12/2	Sin	11/			7	6	( y :	ch			<b>L</b>	<del></del>					12
		6 5 4	lè.	4 5	6	/ 2	3 4	7.60	/ 2	3 14	56	78		/ 2	2 3 4	36	8			121
9		78 2		2 8	7	8 7	65	Hair	11 15	14/3	/2//	10 9	Je state			10/1	JA (3)		V	
		Aigu		/ /				Sa		<del>-   -  </del>					5 14/3					•
		16 1		13) the	6	/	16		66	g y c	C-1;			·						
		2. 15		2 /	5	2	15		/	2	3	4		,	2	رق	4			
	d.	13 14 12 5	]	1/- 1	3	4	13								1	•			V /.	
	in the second se	11 6	<b>†</b>	6 11	/	5	12		8	4	6	5		<b>(</b>	7	6	5			
		10 7 9 8	1	7 10	<i>y</i>	7 8	10	1								·				
						u.	2				3									
				Prot.	7. H. C.	r H	<i>27</i>	r F	. D.	car.	j. /	16	• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •	) );;	620	12	2000 2000		<u>.</u>	
<b>j</b> ,						· ·		* _ <b>C</b>	· resc			. 0				( ( /			•	

