



City of Ann Arbor
Formal Minutes
Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Thursday, May 11, 2017

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council Chambers

A **CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Bushkuhl called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

B **ROLL CALL**

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher called the roll.

Present: 7 - Robert White, Ellen Ramsburgh, Benjamin L. Bushkuhl, John Beeson, Evan Hall, Max Cope, and David Rochlen

C **APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

The Agenda was unanimously approved as presented. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

Yeas: 7 - White, Ramsburgh, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, Cope, and Rochlen

Nays: 0

D **AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION - PUBLIC COMMENTARY - (3 Minutes per Speaker)**

None

E **UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

None

F **HEARINGS**

F-1 **17-0719** HDC17-064; 1117 West Washington Street - Patio - OWSHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Ramsburgh and Bushkuhl visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Cope, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 1117 W Washington Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to remove several concrete walks, replace some of them with brick pavers, install a new brick paver walk, install a wood or paving landing, install a 15'x25' patio in the side yard, within 4' to 10' of the garage, and install a radon abatement system.. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2 and 10 and the guidelines for building site; and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for patios.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 7-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 7 - White, Ramsburgh, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, Cope, and Rochlen

Nays: 0

F-2 [17-0720](#) HDC17-068; 116 South Main Street - New Storefront - MSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Ramsburgh and Bushkuhl visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Ed Shaffran, 116 South Main Street, applicants, was present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Beeson, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 116 South Main Street, a contributing structure in the Main Street Historic District, to replace a non-original storefront and second floor with a new storefront and second floor in a new design, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the building and the surrounding historic district and meets The City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for storefronts and signs, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 3, 5, 6 and 9, and the guidelines for storefronts, design of missing features, and district setting.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 7-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 7 - White, Ramsburgh, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, Cope, and Rochlen

Nays: 0

F-3 **[17-0721](#)** HDC17-057; 628 South First Street - Rear Addition - OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Ramsburgh and Bushkuhl visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Blake Woodsroofe, Contract Services, 419 Pearl Street, Ypsilanti, applicant, was present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Ramsburgh, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 628 S First Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to remove an existing rear shed-roofed lean-to and replace it with a mudroom and bathroom, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for All Additions, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for New Additions and District or Neighborhood Setting.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 7-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 7 - White, Ramsburgh, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, Cope, and Rochlen

Nays: 0

F-4 [17-0722](#) HDC17-063; 223 Third Street - Second Floor Addition -- OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Ramsburgh and Bushkuhl visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

David Mieras, 223 Third Street, Ann Arbor, owner, was present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Cope, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 223 Third Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to construct a second floor rear addition on top of an existing one-story addition; add a gable wall dormer on the south elevation with shake siding; remove a brick chimney; install an air conditioning unit; and install a skylight, on the condition that the rear facing and dormer corner returns are simplified, and the wide trim board at the current eve would be retained on all three elevations. As conditioned the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for All Additions, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for New Additions, District or Neighborhood Setting, and Windows.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 7-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 7 - White, Ramsburgh, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, Cope, and Rochlen

Nays: 0

F-5 [17-0723](#) HDC17-067; 208 East Huron Avenue - Storefront Alterations - MSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Ramsburgh and Bushkuhl visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Andrew Hauptman, 302 South State Street, Suite B, Ann Arbor, Architect and applicant, was present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Rochlen, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 208 East Huron Street, a non-contributing structure in the Main Street Historic District, to install three new windows in new openings on the front elevation. The work as proposed is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the building and the surrounding area and meets The City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for storefronts and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standard 9, and the guidelines for storefronts and neighborhood setting.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 7-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 7 - White, Ramsburgh, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, Cope, and Rochlen
Nays: 0

G **NEW BUSINESS**

G-1 **17-0724** 2017-2018 Historic District Commission Meeting Schedule

Moved by Rochlen, seconded by Bushkuhl, that the FY2017-2018 Historic District Commission Meeting Schedule was unanimously approved.

Yeas: 7 - White, Ramsburgh, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, Cope, and Rochlen
Nays: 0

H **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

H-1 **17-0329** Minutes of the January 12, 2017, HDC Meeting

The January 12, 2017 HDC meeting minutes were unanimously Approved by the Commission and forwarded to City Council. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

H-2 **17-0725** Minutes of the February 9, 2017, HDC Meeting

The February 9, 2017 HDC meeting minutes were unanimously Approved by the Commission and forwarded to City Council. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

H-3 **17-0726** Minutes of the March 9, 2017, HDC Meeting

The March 9, 2017 HDC meeting minutes were unanimously Approved by the Commission and forwarded to City Council. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

I **REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS**

Ramsburgh provided a report from the Cobblestone Historic Museum and the upcoming 'Spring Fling' family event to be held at Cobblestone on May 14th from 9 am - 4 pm.

J ASSIGNMENTS**J-1 Review Committee: Monday, June 5, 2017, at 5pm for the June 8, 2017 Regular Meeting**

Commissioners Bob White and Max Cope volunteered for the June HDC Review Committee.

K REPORTS FROM STAFF**K-1 17-0727 April 2017 HDC Staff Activities**

Thacher noted that Ellen Ramsburgh's term, on the HDC, ends on May 31, 2017. She explained that unless the Mayor appoints a replacement for her, she may continue to serve for another 60 days or 90 days if Council extends her term. Thacher expressed sadness with the thought of having to say Good-bye to Ramsburgh.

Ramsburgh too expressed sadness with the departure, adding that she has really enjoyed serving on the Commission and getting to know everyone. She suggested the Commission will need to look for an older person to replace her with a history background.

Received and Filed

L CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS

Ramsburgh expressed concern with new infill highrise buildings on the historic districts mainly on the core area of Ann Arbor, the Library Lot. She read a Resolution regarding safeguarding historic districts as they relate to zoning evaluations and core spaces in Ann Arbor. [See communications attached in packet]

Moved by White, seconded by Beeson, to approve the Resolution as read by Ellen Ramsburgh, and forward to the City Planning Commission and City Council. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried unanimously.

Yeas: 7 - White, Ramsburgh, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, Cope, and Rochlen

Nays: 0

CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS

Evan Hall expressed concern with be able to protect new or newer homes in historic districts as well.

Thacher said this concern is brought forth regularly and ultimately falls on City Council to charge the Historic District Commission to review or study various properties through a Study Committee.

Hall explained that Detroit Edison had come to his historic house last week to move gas meters from inside the house to outdoors and in his case, to the front of the house.

Thacher reported that she had received similar complaints from several home owners in historic districts and is working with the DTE company on appropriate placement and permitting issues.

Beeson reiterated concern with being able to protect the Kiwanis Building, 200 S. First Street (Blind Pig block).

Commission discussion pursued related to study committees.

M **COMMUNICATIONS**

M-1 [17-0728](#) Various Communications to the HDC

Received and Filed

N **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 9:57 p.m.

Community Television Network Channel 16 live televised public meetings are also available to watch live online from CTN's website, www.a2gov.org/ctn, on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>).

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at www.a2gov.org/ctn, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.

Ben Bushkuhl, Chairperson
Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner
mg/

