

ANN ARBOR HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Staff Report

ADDRESS: 1034 West Liberty Street, Application Number HDC14-026

DISTRICT: Old West Side Historic District

REPORT DATE: March 13, 2014

REPORT PREPARED BY: Jill Thacher, Historic Preservation Coordinator

REVIEW COMMITTEE DATE: Monday, March 10, 2014

	OWNER	APPLICANT
Name:	Armen & Emily Hratchian	Same
Address:	1034 W Liberty St Ann Arbor, MI 48103	
Phone:	(517) 974-8227	

BACKGROUND: This one-and-three-quarter story bungalow features a stuccoed first floor and shingles on the second floor, a cross-gabled roof plan, and a full-width stuccoed front porch with knee-walls flanking the front stairs. It first appears in Polk City Directories in 1919 as the home of Lucy and George L. Haarer. George was a partner at Lindenschmitt, Apfel & Co. clothiers, hatters and furnishers, at 209 South Main.

In November, 2013, the owners received a certificate of appropriateness to replace a slate roof with an asphalt roof, on the condition that the asphalt roof is reviewed by the Commission.

LOCATION: The house is located on the north side of West Liberty Street, east of Eberwhite Boulevard and west of Eighth Street. It backs up to Slauson Middle School.

APPLICATION: The owners are proposing to use GAF Camelot asphalt shingles to replace the existing slate roof.

APPLICABLE REGULATIONS:

From the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:

- (6) Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color,



texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.

From the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (other SOI Guidelines may also apply):

Roofs

Recommended: Replacing in kind an entire feature of the roof that is too deteriorated to repair, using the physical evidence as a model to reproduce the feature.

If using the same kind of material is not technically or economically feasible, then a compatible substitute material may be considered.

Building Site

Recommended: Identifying, retaining, and preserving buildings and their features as well as features of the site that are important in defining its overall historic character.

Not Recommended: Removing or radically changing buildings and their features or site features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the property so that, as a result, the character is diminished.

From the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines (other Guidelines may apply):

Roofs

Appropriate: Replacing historic roofing material that is deteriorated beyond repair with matching materials. If using the original is not technically feasible, then compatible substitute materials may be considered.

Not Appropriate: Replacing historic roofing materials that are repairable.

STAFF FINDINGS:

1. In November of 2013, the HDC approved the removal of the existing slate roof, and conditioned its replacement with asphalt on Commission review of the new material. The homeowners have provided a sample to staff of GAF Camelot shingles in the color Antique Slate. The shingles are layered with a strong shadow line to give them more dimensionality than standard shingles, and the ridges are capped. Staff appreciates that the homeowners have chosen a style that emulates slate as closely as possible for asphalt, instead of a less expensive standard shingle.
2. Staff's opinion is that the proposed asphalt shingles are an appropriate size, color, and style that are a reasonable replacement for the existing roof. The work is compatible with the house and neighborhood and meets the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings*, in particular standard six and the guidelines for roofs and building site, as well as the *Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines*, particularly as they pertain to roofs.

MOTIONS

Note that all motions are worded in the affirmative, and are only suggested.

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 1034 West Liberty Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to install roof using GAF Camelot shingles, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings*, in particular Standard 6 and the guidelines for roofs and building site, as well as the *Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines*, particularly as they pertain to roofs.

MOTION WORKSHEET:

I move that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the work at 1034 West Liberty Street in the Old West Side Historic District

_____ Provided the following condition(S) is (ARE) met: 1) STATE CONDITION(s)

The work is generally compatible with the size, scale, massing, and materials and meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, standard(S) number(S) (*circle all that apply*): 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10

ATTACHMENTS: application, drawings, photos.

1034 West Liberty Street (2008 survey photo)



1999 Assessor's photo



GAF Camelot shingles





**City of Ann Arbor
PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT SERVICES — PLANNING
SERVICES**

301 E. Huron Street | P.O. Box 8647 | Ann Arbor, Michigan 48107-8647
p. 734.794.6265 | f. 734.994.8312 | planning@a2gov.org

ANN ARBOR HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION APPLICATION

Section 1: Property Being Reviewed and Ownership Information
Address of Property: <u>1034 W. Liberty, Ann Arbor, MI 48103</u>
Historic District: <u>Old West Side</u>
Name of Property Owner (If different than the applicant): <u>Armen Hrachian</u>
Address of Property Owner: _____
Daytime Phone and E-mail of Property Owner: <u>(517) 974-8227</u>
Signature of Property Owner: <u>[Signature]</u> Date: <u>2/20/14</u>
Section 2: Applicant Information
Name of Applicant: <u>Armen Hrachian</u>
Address of Applicant: <u>1034 W. Liberty</u>
Daytime Phone: <u>(517) 974-8227</u> Fax: (____)
E-mail: <u>armen.hrachian@gmail.com</u>
Applicant's Relationship to Property: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> owner <input type="checkbox"/> architect <input type="checkbox"/> contractor <input type="checkbox"/> other
Signature of applicant: <u>[Signature]</u> Date: <u>2/20/14</u>
Section 3: Building Use (check all that apply)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Residential <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Single Family <input type="checkbox"/> Multiple Family <input type="checkbox"/> Rental
<input type="checkbox"/> Commercial <input type="checkbox"/> Institutional
Section 4: Stille-DeRossett-Hale Single State Construction Code Act (This item MUST BE INITIALED for your application to be PROCESSED)
Public Act 169, Michigan's Local Historic Districts Act, was amended April 2004 to include the following language: " the applicant has certified in the application that the property where the work will be undertaken has, or will have before the proposed completion date, a fire alarm or smoke alarm complying with the requirements of the Stille-DeRossett-Hale Single State Construction Code Act, 1972 PA 230, MCL 125.1501 to 125.1531."
Please initial here: <u>AA</u>

Section 5: Description of Proposed Changes (attach additional sheets as necessary)

1. Provide a brief summary of proposed changes. On November 14, 2013, the HDC approved us to replace our slate roof with an asphalt roof. We have decided to use Neighborhood Roofing Co., Inc for the project, to be started asap. We have selected a GAF Cornelot II Antique Slate shingle. The HDC requested that we return when we had these and other project specifics.

2. Provide a description of existing conditions. See original application. (11/14)
We have experienced water damage in the interior of the house over the winter as a result of the current roof.

3. What are the reasons for the proposed changes? See original application. (11/14)


4. Attach any additional information that will further explain or clarify the proposal, and indicate these attachments here.
Attached: (1) Proposal from Neighborhood Roofing; (2) Cornelot II Brochure with pictures; (3) Shingle sample.

5. Attach photographs of the existing property, including at least one general photo and detailed photos of proposed work area.
See original application (11/14)

STAFF USE ONLY

Date Submitted _____ Application to _____ Staff or _____ HDC
Project No: HDC 14-026 Fee Paid: _____
Pre-filing Staff Reviewer & Date _____ Date of Public Hearing: 3/13-2014
Application Filing Date _____ Action: _____ HDC COA _____ HDC Denial
Staff signature _____ _____ HDC NTP _____ Staff COA

Comments:



NEIGHBORHOOD ROOFING
 2601 Brassow Road, Saline, MI 48176
 Phone: 734-994-6500 Fax: 734-994-6502

OWNER'S PHONE	517-974-8227	DATE	2/19/2014	PAGE	1 of 2		
WORK PHONE		PROPOSAL NUMBER	Hrachian Wliberty 2_19_2014				
		EMAIL	arman.hratchian@gmail.com				
NAME	Armen Hratchian		SHINGLE COLOR	Antique Slate	TOTAL ROOF	18.3	
JOB ADDRESS	1034 W. Liberty	BILLING ADDRESS	same	METAL EDGE COLOR	?	TOTAL HOUSE	included
CITY / ZIP	Ann Arbor, MI. 48103	CITY / ZIP		GUTTER COLOR	n/a	TOTAL GARAGE	n/a
				LOW SLOPE AREA	0	ROOF PITCH	8:12

THIS CONTRACT INCLUDES:

NEIGHBORHOOD ROOFING 10 (TEN) YEAR WARRANTY ON LABOR AND WORKMANSHIP
 TEAR-OFF AND DISPOSAL OF EXISTING ROOFING MATERIAL from the house (1 _ layers). INSPECTION OF ROOF DECK for any loose, damaged or rotted boards. Decking will be re-nailed as needed and any rotted or damaged roof boards/deck will be replaced at an additional cost listed under "REQUIRED WORK FOR ALL CONTRACTS". We assume responsibility for the cost of all required local **BUILDING PERMITS AND INSPECTIONS** as needed.

		GAF Camelot II	
	Included	<u>G.A.F. System Plus Warranty</u> 50 year non-pro-rated on material and replacement labor for manufacturing defects that affect the performance. This warranty extension only applies to G.A.F. shingles. 20 year transfer to new owner.	
	Included	72" of <u>G.A.F WEATHER WATCH ICE & WATER SHIELD</u> installed along all eave edges, 36" centered in valleys. Valleys will be covered with .024 Aluminum fabricated on sight to properly lay over ice & water shield. (Color to be chosen by owner to blend with shingle color as closest as is available)	
	Included	ICE & WATER SHIELD installed around all plumbing vents, skylights, vertical walls, and around chimneys	
	Included	1 1/2" FACTORY FINISHED aluminum drip edge installed on all roof edges - including drip and rake	
	Included	Install <u>G.A.F. Weather Blocker STARTER SHINGLES</u> on all eave and rake edges. 6 nail all shingles (130 MPH wind protection)	
	Included	Apply <u>GAF TIGER PAW (vapor barrier)</u> synthetic Level 4 Leak barrier over balance of roof deck.	
	Included	Install new factory finished aluminum plumbing vent covers/boots	
	Included	Brick chimney - cut raglet into brick and insert custom formed aluminum counter flashing. Anchor with steel pins, seal raglett with elastomeric sealant.	
	Included	Replace apron flashings on front and back porch roofs	

REQUIRED WORK FOR ALL CONTRACTS

Any rotted wood found in the roof system must be replaced at an additional charge. Charges are based on our wholesale cost from Fingele Lumber plus 30% plus \$30/per man hour (labor)	Included	Install <u>G.A.F. TimberTex Hip and Ridge</u> cap shingles to all hips, ridges.
	Included	Cover landscaping, protect doors and windows, clean gutters.
	Included	Building permits will be paid for and provided by Neighborhood Roofing on request by owner before the job starts.

		PER SQUARE	\$	8,472.90	GAF Camelot II	PER SQUARE
			\$3,820.00	TOTAL ADDITIONAL WORK AS LISTED BELOW		
			\$12,292.90	SUBTOTAL		
			\$ 255.00	Aluminum Valleys (.024) used for Camelot II shingles	4.0% CUSTOMER CREDIT CARD	
			\$0.00			
				\$12,547.90	TOTAL PRICE	Cash or Check
\$			\$	LESS TOTAL DEPOSITS	CONTRACTS REQUIRE A 50% DEPOSIT FOR CONTRACTS UNDER \$2000 THERE IS A BALANCE DUE UPON SUBSTANTIAL COMPLETION	
\$			\$			

NEIGHBORHOOD ROOFING REPRESENTATIVE	NAME:		DATE:
	SIGNATURE		

COSTS	ADDITIONAL WORK
\$ 400.00	Remove/dispose slate roof and all galvanized steel flashings and valleys. Remove roof deck boards.
\$ 3,420.00	Install a vapor barrier (6 mil plastic) with R19 fiberglass insulation laid into each rafter cavity. Install 7/16" O.S.B. over roof rafters. G.A.F. Tigerpaw shingle underlayment is a synthetic product and serves as an exterior vapor barrier. This roof must be treated as a "hot roof". There is no way to add "intake ventilation" to the roof (no eave edge soffit). There is no "exhaust ventilation added as it would not serve any purpose without intake air.