



City of Ann Arbor

Formal Minutes

Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
[http://a2gov.legistar.com/
Calendar.aspx](http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx)

Thursday, May 12, 2016

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second
floor, City Council Chambers

A. CALL TO ORDER

Chair Bushkuhl called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

B. ROLL CALL

Jill Thacher called the roll.

Staff Present: Jill Thacher

Present: 7 - Robert White, Ellen Ramsburgh, Thomas Stulberg,
Benjamin L. Bushkuhl, John Beeson, Jennifer Ross, and
Evan Hall

C. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

**The Agenda was unanimously Approved as presented. On a voice
vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.**

D. AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION - (3 Minutes per Speaker)

E. HEARINGS

E-1 [16-0708](#) HDC16-054; 241 E Liberty - New Awning Signs -- MSHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Ross and White visited the site as part of their review.

*Ross reported that the application was quite straight forward and she
agreed with the staff report, assessment and recommendation. She said
since there is already signage there she would like the lettering on the
awning to be as small as possible. She said she didn't feel that the work*

would detract from the storefront and she supports the application.

White agreed with staff's recommendation and with Commissioner Ross.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Janeen Baird, Liberty Associates, 210 S. Fifth Avenue, the owner was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Ramsburgh, seconded by White that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 241 East Liberty Street, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District, to recover an existing awning frame and add signage to existing awning covers, on the condition that the new awning cover is the same color as the ones to be removed. The proposed work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2 and 9 and the guidelines for storefronts, and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 7-0

Certificate of Appropriateness Granted

Yeas: 7 - White, Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, Secretary Ross, and Hall

Nays: 0

E-2 **[16-0709](#)** HDC16-062; 117 E Liberty - New Business Sign - MSHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Ross and White visited the site as part of their review.

Ross reported that the storefront is not of historic age, and she felt that the sign was very exciting and compatible with the eclectic block and she felt it meets our Standards and she supports staff's assessment of the proposal.

White agreed.

PUBLIC HEARING:

John Roos, 503 Cherry Street, Ann Arbor, the petitioner was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission. He explained the proposed signage and showed the sign to the Commission.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Bushkuhl, seconded by White, that the Historic District Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 117 E. Liberty Street, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District, to install a new business sign under the conditions that the sign may not be refaced by another business and that the sign may not extend above the wood below the store band at the top of the storefront. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, in particular the guidelines for signs, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 9, and 10, and the guidelines for storefronts.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 7-0

Certificate of Appropriateness Granted

Yeas: 7 - White, Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, Secretary Ross, and Hall

Nays: 0

E-3 [16-0710](#) HDC16-063; 403 W Mosley - Rear Dormer Addition - OWSHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Ross and White visited the site as part of their review.

Ross reported that during the site visit they saw that the main house is a very sweet bungalow style house that is very unique and has cool landscaping. She agreed with the staff report noting that the dormer is a meaningful and thoughtful way of adding square footage instead of adding an addition to the house. She agreed with staff that the brackets seem a bit much but they will not be seen from the right-of-way. She said the board and batten will make it hard to distinguish it from the original house, and she generally supports the application.

White agreed with staff's recommendation and with Commissioner Ross, and he supports the application.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Jason Bell, 1547 Granger Avenue, Ann Arbor, owner was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Ramsburgh, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 403 W. Mosley Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to install a new dormer with a double hung window on the rear elevation of the roof, on the condition that the lower brackets may be installed only if determined to be necessary, with a staff approval, and without the upper brackets. The work as conditioned is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 9 and 10 and the guidelines for roofs and windows.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 7-0

Certificate of Appropriateness Granted

Yeas: 7 - White, Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, Secretary Ross, and Hall

Nays: 0

E-4 [16-0711](#) HDC16-073; 512 Fourth - Two Story Rear Addition - OWSHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Ross and White visited the site as part of their review.

Ross agreed with the staff report in that the addition will be clearly visible from the right-of-way due to the empty lot next door. She felt that addition was quite large and will add a substantial mass to the house. She felt that the existing rear addition could be original to the house, but was not sure. She reported that there is a very similar addition on a house that is located kitty-corner to this house, and that addition looked compatible and seemed fine.

White agreed with Commissioner Ross, and said they could see throughout the neighborhood there have been several additions added in order to make their houses more liveable, and he felt this was a similar situation. He agreed with the staff report.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Amy Frontier, 512 Fourth Street, Ann Arbor, the owner was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Beeson, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a

certificate of appropriateness for the application at 512 Fourth Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to add a two-story addition, bumpout, skylight, and patios as proposed. The proposed work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the house and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2,5,9, and 10 and the guidelines for new additions and building site.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5-2

Certificate of Appropriateness Granted

Yeas: 5 - White, Ramsburgh, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, and Hall

Nays: 2 - Stulberg, and Secretary Ross

F. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

G. NEW BUSINESS

G-1 16-0712 2127 Wallingford Marker Application

This month staff received one application for a historic building plaque for the house at 2127 Wallingford Road (at the northwest corner of Woodside). The Manley and Anna C. Osgood House was constructed in 1927 and first appears in Polk City Directories in 1929. Mr. Osgood was the president and general manager of the Ann Arbor Construction Company and the Ann Arbor Asphalt Construction company. It is brick Tudor style, with a slate roof and original casement windows. The house features wall dormers, two boxed-bay windows, a prominent chimney with decorative brickwork and stone trim, and an original attached garage and screen room. It is not in a historic district.

The Historic District Commission will consider all of the following when reviewing an application for a historic property plaque.

- a) *The building must be at least one hundred years old, as documented by a combination of records (title search, tax records, wills, etc.).*
- b) *The building must have been maintained, over time, in its original condition, or must have undergone historically appropriate restoration or rehabilitation.*
- c) *The building may not have historically inappropriate features, enclosures or repairs.*
- d) *The principal facades of the building visible from the street or any public right of way must maintain integrity of form, materials, and architectural features consistent with the dominant period of the building.*

The house is 89 years old. The application does not meet the requirement that the house be 100 years old, which staff would like the Historic District Commission to discuss. The criteria widely used for establishing that a resource is historic is 50 years of age, and that standard is also applied by the HDC when granting awards.

The house has maintained its historic integrity and has had no significant exterior changes. The current owners have done extensive exterior and especially interior restoration work that showcases the original architectural features of the house. The lack of alteration to the house by the current or four previous homeowners is critical to understanding the architectural significance of the home. It is a lovely record of a moment in Ann Arbor's history.

Staff feels that a historic plaque is appropriate for the Osgood Manley House, located at 2127 Wallingford Road, based on the age of the house, the house's history, and the relatively unaltered appearance of its character-defining architectural features.

Moved by White, seconded by Stulberg, to change the criteria to 50 years. On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 7-0

Yeas: 7 - White, Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, Secretary Ross, and Hall

Nays: 0

Moved by White, seconded by Bushkuhl, that the 1927 Osgood Manley House at 2127 Wallingford Road meets the criteria for a City

of Ann Arbor Historic Building marker based on its age, historic and architectural significance, and contribution to the history of Ann Arbor. On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 7-0

Yeas: 7 - White, Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, Secretary Ross, and Hall

Nays: 0

H. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

H-1 [16-0713](#) Minutes of the April 14, 2016 HDC Meeting

The minutes were unanimously Approved by the Commission and forwarded to the City Council. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

I. REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS

The Commission continued their discussion on mini-splits as they relate to historic structures.

J. ASSIGNMENTS

J-1 Review Committee: Monday, June 6, 2016, at 5pm for the June 9, 2016 Regular Meeting

Commissioners Ross and Hall volunteered for the June Review Committee.

K. REPORTS FROM STAFF

K-1 [16-0714](#) April 2016 HDC Staff Activities

Received and Filed

L. CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS

Bushkuhl reported that given his current time restraints he would appreciate passing on the torch to another Commissioner who would be interested in serving as the HDC representative to the Cobblestone

Farms Association. He noted they meet once a month on the first Monday of the month.

Ramsburgh graciously offered to serve.

M. COMMUNICATIONS

M-1 [16-0715](#) Various Communications to the HDC

N. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 9:30 p.m.

Community Television Network Channel 16 live televised public meetings are also available to watch live online from CTN's website, www.a2gov.org/ctn, on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>).

Live Web streaming is one more way, in addition to these listed below, to stay in touch with Ann Arbor City Council and board and commission actions and deliberations.

- *Video on Demand: Replay public meetings at your convenience online at www.a2gov.org/government/city_administration/communicationsoffice/ctn/Pages/VideoOnDemand.aspx*
- *Cable: Watch CTN Channel 16 public meeting programming via Comcast Cable channel 16.*

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at www.a2gov.org/ctn, on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>), or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.