



Approved Minutes

April 21, 2016

Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority Board of Directors

Ann Arbor District Library, 343 South Fifth Avenue, Ann Arbor, Michigan, 6:30 p.m.

Board: Mike Allemang, Jack Bernard, Eli Cooper, Gillian Ream Gainsley, Charles Griffith, Prashanth Gururaja, Larry Krieg, Eric Mahler (Chair), Stephen Wade

Absent with Notice: Sue Gott

Staff: Matt Carpenter, Ron Copeland, Bill De Groot, Dawn Gabay, Mary Stasiak, Phil Webb, Chris White

Local Advisory Council: Rebecca Burke

Recording Secretary: Karen Wheeler

Chairman Eric Mahler declared that a quorum was present and called the meeting to order at 6:36 p.m.

1.0 Public Hearing

There was no public hearing.

2.0 Communications and Announcements

Mr. Mahler recognized Charles Griffith during Mr. Griffith's final meeting as a board member. Mr. Mahler shared highlights of the organization's accomplishments under Mr. Griffith's leadership, and presented Mr. Griffith with a plaque of appreciation and a bus mailbox.

Mr. Griffith shared his thoughts on serving on the board, working with board members past and present, and working with staff and community members. Mr. Griffith thanked board members and staff for their support and dedication during his tenure. Mr. Griffith expressed special appreciation to the millage team for their hard work.

3.0 Public Time – Comment on Agenda Items

Carolyn Grawi appeared before the Board. Ms. Grawi commented on her 30 plus years of using public transportation services, the May 1 service expansion, and the A-Ride Will Call Policy. Ms. Grawi shared details of ARide trips, and suggested that the Will Call

Policy is ~~prohibitive~~ needs improvements. Ms. Grawi indicated that people with disabilities should not be excluded from having the same choices as everyone in the community.

Jim Mogensen appeared before the Board. Mr. Mogensen commented on the PDC meeting summary which did not specify that it was Mr. Mogensen's mother who was conveying information about drivers needing to be told to lower bus ramps. Mr. Mogensen raised a concern about where to place walkers on buses. Mr. Mogensen suggested offsetting route lines on maps in the RideGuide that have routes where there are overlaps to help people understand when the lines end, and when they don't.

Michelle Barney appeared before the Board. Ms. Barney commented on the ARide Will Call Policy indicating that the policy is restrictive and complicated. Ms. Barney expressed appreciation for the service changes, particularly in Ypsilanti, and the expanded A-Ride service.

No one further appearing, Mr. Mahler declared Public Time closed.

4.0 Review and Approval of Minutes of March 17, 2016

Mike Allemang moved approval of the minutes as written with support from Eli Cooper. The motion passed unanimously.

5.0 Board and Staff Reports

5.1 Chief Executive Officer

Mr. Carpenter introduced Mary Stasiak to report on the May 1 Service Improvements.

5.1.1 May 1 Service Expansion

Ms. Stasiak reported on largest expansion of bus service since 1979. Ms. Stasiak shared details of some of the preparations including the addition of 160 new bus stops, new service in Scio Township, and extensive outreach.

Mr. Carpenter commended staff and board members who shepherded the process noting that all indicators were pointing toward a successful roll out. Mr. Carpenter noted that despite the saturation of information sharing, it was expected that there will be people who are not aware of the changes, and some who may not be in favor of the changes. Mr. Carpenter pledged to listen to all concerns.

Mr. Griffith was complimentary of the Service Ambassador who was on his bus to explain the service changes. Staff responded to an inquiry from Mr. Griffith about the number of new buses and drivers added for the new service. There are 12 new buses, and more than 50 new drivers have been trained.

5.1.2 AirRide Service

Mr. Carpenter reported on AirRide service. The Wayne County Airport Authority (WCAA) instituted new regulations which added a stop to AirRide service to serve people who have disabilities. The additional stop is causing some Michigan Flyer runs to be late. Michigan Flyer is proposing to suspend service to the Kensington Court Hotel to make up time. Due to a miscommunication, Michigan Flyer issued information to customers indicating that service to the Kensington would end in mid-May. AAATA has a policy for taking public comment 30 days in advance of service changes. Mr. Carpenter pledged to continue to provide the highest level of AirRide service possible.

5.2 Planning and Development Committee

Ms. Gainsley reported on the Planning and Development Committee (PDC) meeting. Ms. Gott provided an update on the University of Michigan transit center. The committee received an expansive presentation on communications efforts to prepare for the May 1 service expansion. The committee received an update on the CAD/AVL project. The tracking system being replaced by the new CAD/AVL system has been removed due to concerns about unreliable information. The new system is expected to be operational in July. The committee received an update on two proposed board retreats; a one-day retreat on board governance, and a separate one-day retreat on strategic planning. Staff reported on an emergent opportunity to apply for grant funds for the planning phase of projects through the Michigan Department of Transportation. Staff considered and evaluated several projects, and identified the Connector Study and Ypsilanti Transit Center as projects for which to submit applications.

The committee received a report on a proposal to implement new service in Pittsfield Township in August 2016, which is currently in the 5YTIP for implementation in August 2017. The new service proposal was discussed in public meetings, and the committee felt that satisfied the public input process. The committee recommended moving forward the resolution to the full board to implement the proposed service revisions in August 2016.

5.3 Performance Monitoring and External Relations Committee

Mr. Allemang reported on the Performance Monitoring and External Relations Committee meeting. The committee received updates on AirRide, retreat planning, service expansion and CAD/AVL. Staff reported on the financials and the performance statistics which included three quarterly reports: fuel savings and technology fund accounting, cash and investment report, and the Quarterly Service Standards Report. The committee engaged in the first stage of planned discussions about declining fixed-route ridership. Mr. Allemang summarized some of the data noting that the decline is primarily due to UM riders. If UM is removed, ridership is up about 6%. Probable causes for UM ridership losses are more student housing downtown and Uber and Lift services. The committee discussed the possibility that there may be some initial ridership decline after the May 1 service expansion. The committee will continue to discuss ridership in the coming months through data analysis, issue identification and options to address how to deal with declines.

5.4 Local Advisory Council

Ms. Burke reported on the Local Advisory Council (LAC) meeting. The LAC Executive Committee brought forth two names for appointment to the Executive Committee: Stephen McNutt and Laura Padalino. Staff provided an update on the transition of ARide lift-van service to RideCorp; things are moving along as planned. Staff reported on proposed changes to the Wall Call Policy whereby riders could make unplanned return trips from a medical or shopping appointment back to the trip origin. The LAC can pursue a revision to the policy, although the sentiment on LAC is that the current guidelines meet the needs for unplanned return trips, and should remain the same. LAC received a report on the On-Time Arrival (be ready) Window which was revised from 20 minutes to 45 minutes for same-day reservations, and from 20 minutes to 30 minutes for advance reservations. Staff will monitor the expanded window and the impact on on-time performance.

5.4.1 LAC Executive Committee Appointments

Jack Bernard moved approval of appointing Stephen McNutt and Laura Padalino to the Local Advisory Council Executive Committee. Gillian Ream Gainsley supported the motion which passed unanimously.

5.5 Washtenaw Area Transportation Study

Mr. Krieg reported on the Washtenaw Area Transportation Study Policy Committee meeting. The committee received an update on the impact of the M14 closure including the number of trucks southbound on North Main Street attempting to turn onto Huron Street which is dangerous for pedestrians. The committee saw a video of the proposed US23 traffic control system, Flex Route System. Mr. Krieg reported on two changes to the overall US23 project based on public input; including roundabouts at the 8 Mile Road interchange, and the

addition of a lane south of Warren Road to mitigate overcrowding on the “west triple decker”. Following a presentation by Chris White, the committee approved AAATA’s application for planning funds under the Federal 5303 program administered by the State of Michigan.

5.6 Governance

Mr. Mahler opened the floor for discussion on the Carver Policy Governance Model which was introduced in April. Board members engaged in a positive discussion. The following ideas were shared about moving forward with the policy governance model:

- Use the model as a foundation, and make adjustments to accommodate the Authority’s work
- Talk honestly about tradeoffs
- Given that policies can be interpreted differently by different individuals, start broad in terms of executing policy, and then refine
- Seriously consider policies at the beginning
- Consciously have an agenda item each board meeting to talk about policy and things that are working or not working
- Retain the ability to escape from the Carver structure, if necessary, under the proper circumstances
- Begin with solid principles and reorganize based on a common set of principles and an architecture for how the board wants to build the organization
- At the Governance Retreat, do actual process work and consider how constituent concerns will be addressed
- Although the board may be focusing on a higher level, continue to consider day to day information that determines what it takes to deliver the highest level of service possible
- Build on the organization’s existing success and resources, including the board’s expertise, with all parties engaged

Mr. Carpenter commented that he anticipates that incremental change will emerge from identifying principles and deciding outcomes. Mr. Carpenter noted that the Carver model has an interchangeable, robust set of principles that can be applied in several directions.

Mr. Mahler acknowledged that there may be times when the organization’s work does not fit into the policy model, and there will be a need to adjust the model to fit the need. Mr. Mahler made a commitment to continuing to check in with stakeholders and customers when establishing policy to guide the agency.

6.0 Question Time

Mr. Krieg asked whether a suggestion to post signs on buses with old and new route numbers for the first two weeks of service, made at PDC, was considered. Mr. Carpenter responded that may not be workable on head signs that change between routes, but that operators and customer service representatives riding buses can help customers understand the new route numbering system. Ms. Gainsley clarified the request she made at PDC which was to provide a simple, printed table of old and new route numbers in large font.

Mr. Krieg suggested that the board should be included in the testing and roll out of the customer user interface of the new real-time information system.

Mr. Krieg asked about work with the UM community to reverse ridership losses among UM staff and students. Mr. White responded that Community Relations staff began a significant increase in engagement in the fall semester to reach incoming freshmen and dorm residents to get a better understanding of what else can be done. Mr. White noted that the process is still evolving.

Mr. Wade asked about a forum for discussion and timeline for decisions about how to proceed related to AirRide, and whether discussions would fall within one board committee.

Mr. Carpenter responded that the matter would be handled by PDC. Mr. Carpenter restated some of the details from the AirRide report made earlier in the meeting, and apologized for the miscommunication with Michigan Flyer which led to them discontinuing booking reservations from the Kensington Court Hotel beginning May 19. Mr. Carpenter indicated that AAATA will proceed with holding a 30-day public comment period, and he will continue to work with Michigan Flyer to mitigate the situation.

Ms. Gainsley expressed concern that action was being taken without a public opportunity for discussion noting that the Kensington Court Hotel is the best AirRide stop option for people who live anywhere other than Ann Arbor. Ms. Gainsley asked if Michigan Flyer could adjust the AirRide schedule as opposed to eliminating the stop, and if anything could be done to make things more reasonable at the airport. Ms. Gainsley suggested holding a hearing at PDC, and using the Public Hearing on the board agenda to receive input.

Mr. Allemang asked about the proportion of AirRide customers that utilize the Kensington Court Hotel stop compared to the downtown stop. Mr. Carpenter responded that over 75% of Ann Arbor AirRide customers come from the BTC stop, and 23% board at Kensington.

Mr. Krieg suggested that the emergent nature of the AirRide situation was the responsibility of the Wayne County Airport Authority (WCAA), and not AAATA's partner, due to WCAA making a rule change with a one-week period for comment. Mr. Krieg suggested adding a bus stop on the #6 route to connect with AirRide, if service returns to the Kensington Court, as the current #6 bus stop is a block and a half away.

Mr. Gururaja noted that the AirRide line item has a small surplus, and asked what might happen, if the stop at the Kensington is lost. Mr. Gururaja also asked what staff sees as the operational solution.

Mr. Carpenter responded that revenue impacts are unknown. Mr. Carpenter added that changing the schedule is complicated by buses coming from East Lansing. Mr. Carpenter reported that work will continue to discuss possible solutions, and he will bring those forward to the board.

Mr. Cooper described AirRide as safe, accessible, efficient, effective, convenient, frequent, and comfortable service. Mr. Cooper indicated that he is looking for the CEO and team to work with partners and stakeholders to maximize meeting the strategic objectives intended for the service.

Mr. Bernard suggested that moving the original AirRide bus stop, and more recently creating segregated bus stops, are both discriminatory practices. Mr. Bernard indicated that he has seen buses stopping at the airport location where AirRide is prohibited from stopping. Mr. Bernard indicated that it is critical that AAATA promote its objective of accessibility.

Mr. Cooper commented on the real-time bus tracking system issue. Mr. Cooper suggested that this is one area where the strategic view vs. hands-on board may conflict moving forward. Mr. Cooper expressed frustration that the new real-time system is not expected until July. Mr. Cooper asked about the minimum number of devices to have coverage to have information for riders. Mr. Carpenter responded 100%, indicating that not all new vehicles have been received, and the system has not been installed on all buses in the fleet.

Mr. Cooper indicated that he has heard repeatedly from people who are agitated and have had their lifestyles affected by the inability to obtain real-time information, because they rely on the information as the basis of go or no-go. Mr. Cooper asked how to accelerate the timeline to get real-time information in the hands of AAATA's riders prior to July.

Mr. Carpenter responded that the challenge with the real-time information system is that as the old technology is phased out and new technology phased in, there is a period of time when real-time information is not available. The original plan was for the switchover to occur earlier this year, but there were delays. As a result, the switch over is happening at the same time AAATA is rolling out new services. Mr. Carpenter acknowledged that the situation is disappointing, and apologized to customers. Mr. Carpenter has urged staff to let him know if additional resources are needed to accelerate the process. Mr. Carpenter pledged to provide additional resources, and work as quickly as possible to get the new system online.

Mr. Bernard complimented staff for the communications work to make the public aware of service changes and facilitate the adjustment to the new system.

Mr. Bernard noted comments during public time on the ARide Will Call Policy, and suggested that Brian Clouse make a presentation to the board on how the policy works, obligations and costs. Mr. Bernard noted that AAATA has done more than is required under the law, and suggested that there is value in giving the board the context to understand the assertions.

Mr. Bernard requested clarification about the bus ramp situation reported in the PDC meeting summary. Mr. Carpenter confirmed that the passenger was able to board the bus [after having to request that the driver deploy the ramp]. Mr. Bernard requested that the situation be investigated, if warranted.

Mr. Krieg complimented staff for a presentation on the service expansion at the Ypsilanti City Council meeting. Mr. Krieg noted that the Ypsilanti Mayor is eager to get an AirRide stop in Ypsilanti.

Mr. Wade thanked PMER for the ridership trends report adding that he is looking forward to learning about findings.

7.0 Old Business

There was no Old Business for the Board to consider.

8.0 New Business

Mr. Carpenter introduced the resolution to adopt the accelerated implementation of planned service improvements in Pittsfield Township.

Charles Griffith moved the following resolution with support from Gillian Ream Gainsley.

8.1 5YTIP Revisions for August, 2016

Resolution 19/2016 5YTIP Revisions for August, 2016 Implementation

WHEREAS, the Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority (AAATA) Board of Directors adopted the Five-Year Transit Improvement Program (5YTIP) in January, 2014, and

WHEREAS, AAATA promoted the 5YTIP as the basis for the transit millage election in May, 2014, and the AAATA promised to implement the 5YTIP if the election was successful, and

WHEREAS, the AAATA Board of Directors adopted a procedure to amend the 5YTIP, and

WHEREAS, a route in the plan with service for Saline and Pittsfield Township was not implemented in May, 2014 as scheduled at Saline's request and

WHEREAS, Pittsfield Township wishes the portion of the route within Pittsfield Township (route #61) to be implemented separately now, and

WHEREAS, an increase in service frequency on the #6 Ellsworth route which includes service to Airport Boulevard is included in the 5YTIP to be implemented in August, 2017, and

WHEREAS, there is a coordinated transfer between Route #61 and the expanded service on route #6 at Costco on Airport Boulevard, and

WHEREAS, Pittsfield Township has requested implementation of the Pittsfield portion (route #61) of the Saline/Pittsfield route and earlier implementation of the route #6 expansion, and

WHEREAS, Pittsfield Township considered these revisions at public meetings in October, 2015 and January, 2016, and is prepared to pay their share of the cost of this service, and

WHEREAS, a Title VI, Service and Fare Equity Analysis was conducted on the 5YTIP before adoption, and the recommended revisions do not constitute a major change from the adopted plan,

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority Board of Directors hereby adopts the revised service changes effective August 2016 briefly described as follows:

- Route 61: Implement weekday peak service connecting business parks along either side of State Street south of Ellsworth (Avis Farms)
- Route 6: Implement service every 15 minutes between the BTC and Meijer (Carpenter) including a route deviation on Airport Boulevard (Costco)

Mr. Krieg raised a concern about environmental justice indicating that increasing frequency on route #6 between Meijer and downtown Ann Arbor, and not between Meijer and Ypsilanti leaves out lifeline service. Mr. Krieg related details of an experience riding route #6. At Meijer a resource contention emerged when there was not enough space near the front of the bus to accommodate passengers with strollers in the designated stroller area, senior citizens with mobility aids, and patrons with packages. The situation led to a harsh exchange among passengers. Mr. Krieg suggested that the route between Meijer and Ypsilanti is used by people who have no other alternative than to use the bus. Mr. Krieg requested that service also be increased to serve

Ypsilanti. Mr. Krieg contemplated proposing an amendment to the resolution or tabling the item. Mr. Krieg noted that he would add the following underlined language to the final clause in the resolution:

- Route 6: Implement service every 15 minutes between the BTC and YTC and Meijer (Carpenter) including a route deviation on Airport Boulevard (Costco)

Mr. Krieg acknowledged that adding service would impact the schedule and resources, and deferred further action pending input on the practicality of his suggestion.

Mr. White responded to a request from Ms. Gainsley about whether sending the item back to PDC for review, potentially adding the change suggested by Mr. Krieg and readdressing the matter at the May board meeting would have an impact on the proposed service addition in Pittsfield.

Mr. White indicated that it was possible to defer a decision for a month. Mr. White added that the 5YTIP adopted by the board in January includes a specific process for adding new service noting that the proposed change is simply a quicker implementation of service already in the 5YTIP. Adding service would require a much more specific process for public input, and there would be some operational problems. Mr. White reported that while a number of requests for additional service have been received, at this point the 5YTIP should be implemented as adopted. Mr. White added that the May 1 service additions in Ypsilanti, which include increased access to shopping, may radically change how people use bus service in Ypsilanti.

Mr. Mahler suggested sending the item back to PDC.

Mr. Krieg moved to defer the resolution and revisit the discussion in PDC. Eli Cooper supported the motion to defer which passed unanimously.

9.0 Public Time

Mr. Mahler announced that there were time constraints and asked speakers to be brief.

Carolyn Grawi appeared before the Board. Ms. Grawi reminded the board that if public time calls for three minutes per person, that amount of time must be allotted per person, regardless of time constraints. Ms. Grawi commented on the AirRide stop indicating that it is difficult to use the stop due to its location. Ms. Grawi voiced opposition to elimination of the AirRide stop at the Kensington Court Hotel. Ms. Grawi suggested adjusting the route time or adding a segment. Ms. Grawi spoke in favor of the service improvements. Ms. Grawi suggested that people who are the most vulnerable are not being considered.

Michelle Barney appeared before the Board. Ms. Barney commented on the delay for the new real-time information system. Ms. Barney suggested preparing a simple letter to distribute to bus riders informing them that bus tracking will not be available, include

the duration of the situation, suggest that riders take earlier buses, and provide riders with documentation for employers, if buses are late.

Jim Mogensen appeared before the Board. Mr. Mogensen expressed concern about the conversation on board governance and the idea that the board could focus on strategic matters and not details. Mr. Mogensen noted his comments on civil rights matters, service in Ypsilanti, and the millage in Ypsilanti. Mr. Mogensen speculated about what will happen, if the millage isn't renewed.

No one further appearing, Mr. Mahler declared Public Time closed.

10.0 Adjourn

Eric Mahler moved to adjourn the meeting with support from Charles Griffith. The motion carried, and the meeting adjourned at 9:00 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Stephen Wade, Secretary