



City of Ann Arbor
Formal Minutes
Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Thursday, June 14, 2018

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council Chambers

Rescheduled from June 7th

A **CALL TO ORDER**

Chair John Beeson called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

B **ROLL CALL**

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher called the roll.

Present: 6 - John Beeson, Evan Hall, Max Cope, David Rochlen, Anna Epperson, and Jessica Quijano

Absent: 1 - Robert White

C **APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

Thacher explained that the applicant of Agenda item Hearings F-8 had withdrawn their application.

The agenda was unanimously approved as amended, with F-8 removed.

D **AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION - (3 Minutes per Speaker)**

None

E **UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

F **HEARINGS**

F-1 **18-1028** HDC18-116; 114 N. Division - Expanding Parking Lot -- OFWHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Beeson and Cope visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Steve Bellock, 825 Cherrystone, owner, was present to explain the application and respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Jeff Crockett, 506 E. Kingsley, Ann Arbor, spoke against the request.

Chris Crockett, 506 E. Kingsley, Ann Arbor, President of the Old Fourth Ward Association, spoke against the request.

Ray Detter, 120 N. Division Street, Ann Arbor, spoke against the request.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Cope, seconded by Quijano, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 114 N. Division Street, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, for after-the-fact approval of a 33' by 33' gravel parking area with eight new bollards, on the following conditions: Site plan approval and all necessary variances must be obtained within one year of the date of approval of this application. The work as conditioned is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for district or neighborhood setting and building site, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, particularly as they pertain to paved areas and landscape features.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

Beeson pointed out that the work done without approval or permits, does not meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, specifically standard 2 as well as several of the others standards. He

stated that the additional parking spots go against the standards.

Quijano stated that the gravel alters the relationship of the historic front porch, while the parking gain is only one space, which is not worth the loss of the historic side yard.

Rochlen agreed, adding that he appreciated the public comments and could hear the property owner's frustration with the building and the process. Rochlen explained that the Historic District Commission looks at what was done relative to the standards, as outlined below. He said, with his vote, he was leaning towards not introducing inappropriate located parking lots.

From the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:

(1) A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.

(2) The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.

(9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

(10) New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property will be unimpaired.

From the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (other SOI Guidelines may also apply):

District or Neighborhood Setting

Recommended: Identifying, retaining, and preserving buildings, and streetscape, and landscape features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the district or neighborhood. Such features can include streets, alleys, paving, walkways, street lights, signs, benches, parks and gardens, and trees.

Not Recommended: Destroying streetscape and landscape features by widening existing streets, changing paving material, or introducing inappropriately located new streets or parking lots.

Building Site

Recommended: Retaining the historic relationship between buildings, landscape features, and open space.

Identifying, retaining, and preserving buildings and their features as well as features of the site that are important in defining its overall historic character.

Not Recommended: Introducing new construction onto the building site which is visually incompatible in terms of size, scale, design, materials, color and texture or which destroys historic relationships on the site.

From the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines (other Ann Arbor guidelines may also apply):

Paved Areas

Appropriate: Installing new parking areas, which are compatible with the scale, proportion of yard area, and characteristics of the historic district, behind buildings. These shall be reviewed on a case-by-case basis.

Retaining and maintaining historic sidewalks, walkways, driveways, and patios/terraces.

Not Appropriate: Installing or enlarging parking areas in front of buildings.

Installing driveways or parking areas that are too wide or large for the building site and are out of character for the district.

Landscape Features

Appropriate: Retaining historic relationships between buildings, landscape features, and open spaces.

Not Appropriate: Introducing a new landscape feature or plant material that is visually incompatible with the site or destroys site patterns or vistas.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion defeated. Vote: 0-6

Request was denied.

Yeas: 0

Nays: 6 - Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, Cope, Rochlen, Epperson, and Quijano

Absent: 1 - White

Moved by Beeson, seconded by Hall, that the Commission finds that the gravel work done without permits does not qualify for a certificate of appropriateness, and that the property owner is ordered to restore the area to its former condition, including removing the gravel and restoring grass or other landscape plants to the area, within 60 days.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Yeas: 6 - Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, Cope, Rochlen, Epperson, and Quijano

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - White

F-2 [18-1029](#) HDC18-084; 523 S. Seventh -- Rear Addition - OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Beeson and Cope visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Seth Peterson, 523 S. Seventh Street, owner, was present to explain the application and respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Cope, seconded by Quijano, that the Commission issue a

certificate of appropriateness for the application at 523 S Seventh Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to reconstruct the southeast corner of the house by removing a casement window and increasing the roof slope; and adding two new skylights and two sun tunnels, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for additions, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for additions and building site.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 6 - Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, Cope, Rochlen, Epperson, and Quijano

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - White

F-3 **18-1030** HDC18-086; 822 W. Jefferson - New Deck - OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Beeson and Cope visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Bette Marvin, 822 W. Jefferson, representative, was present to explain the application and respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Cope, seconded by Rochlen, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 822 West Jefferson Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to replace a window with a door and construct a composite deck as presented in the application, on the following conditions: that the new door in a new opening is single-lite, compatible with existing doors on the building, and approved by staff before installation; and that the deck is no larger than 27' x 10'. The work as conditioned is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, material, and relationship to the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 9 and 10 and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for Decks and Patios.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 6 - Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, Cope, Rochlen, Epperson, and Quijano

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - White

F-4 **18-1031** HDC18-106; 114 Crest -- Rear Addition - OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Beeson and Cope visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Chris Allen, 706 Hiscock, Ann Arbor, applicant, was present to explain the application and respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Cope, seconded by Rochlen, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 114 Crest, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to remove a two-story rear porch and construct a 384-square-foot two-story addition as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for All Additions and Windows, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for New Additions, District or Neighborhood Setting, and Windows.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 6 - Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, Cope, Rochlen, Epperson, and Quijano

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - White

F-5 **[18-1032](#)** HDC18-105: 218 N. Division - New Windows, Patio, Pergola - OFWHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Beeson and Cope visited the site as part of their review.

They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Loch Durrant, Ventures Design, 29454 Haas Road, Wixom, applicant, was present to explain the application and respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Hall, seconded by Cope, that the Commission approve the application at 218 N. Division Street, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to expand an existing patio behind the southeast corner of the house; install a masonry and wood privacy fence along the south lot line at the back of the house; install a 12' x 9' spa pool; construct a 20' x 12' pergola over part of the patio; construct an outdoor masonry bar and grill; and remove two windows (one is known to be a non-original opening) and replace them with a four-light sliding door, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2 and 10 and the guidelines for building site, entrances and porches, and windows, and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for residential landscape features.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 6 - Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, Cope, Rochlen, Epperson, and Quijano

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - White

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Beeson and Cope visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Hall, seconded by Rochlen, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 348 Eighth, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to raise the roof height on the garage four feet. The work as proposed is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for building site, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, particularly as they pertain to residential accessory structures and additions.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 6 - Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, Cope, Rochlen, Epperson, and Quijano

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - White

F-7 **18-1034** HDC18-117; 1407 Broadway -- Rear Addition - BHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Beeson and Cope visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Kevin Kolb, 1407 Broadway, Architect, was present to explain the application and respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Quijano, seconded by Cope, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 1407 Broadway Street, a contributing property in the Broadway Historic District, to remove a shed that is attached to the rear of the house, plus a small portion of the house, and replace it with a single-story addition in the same footprint and with the same roofline. Also, to remove a door on the north elevation near the back of the house, to enlarge a window on the north elevation to meet egress requirements, and to replace a window with a door on the south side of the house, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for additions and building site; and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for additions.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 6 - Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, Cope, Rochlen, Epperson, and Quijano

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - White

F-8 [18-1035](#) HDC18-118; 321 N. Ingalls - Front Fence - OFWHD

Agenda Item F-8 Withdrawn by Applicant.

Withdrawn

F-9 [18-1036](#) HDC18-119; 615 E. Huron - Elevator Addition - OFWHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Beeson and Cope visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Steve Dykstra, Hobbs & Black Associates, Inc., Architect, designers and owner, were present to explain the application and respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Cope expressed that the pedestrian experience would feel that the elevator cuts out a significant portion of the view of Harris Hall, while the goal is to create a more pedestrian friendly street. He asked if there was discussion of having the elevator shaft in glass.

Beeson agreed on the view, stating that the existing view allows one to see the whole elevation of Harris Hall, while the proposed view blocks much of it.

Dykstra responded that they believe the buildings are so close anyway, that the proposed elevator would screen the no-man's land between the two buildings. He explained that they had looked at having the south facing elevation in glass, but it did not significantly improve the aesthetics, and the building code does not allow glass on both sides.

The designer explained that the original design was in black, and they had gone through 20 more schemes to look at different faces, pulling in

band-lines, attempting to mirror Harris Hall; instead, it expressed slim, high-finished silver with about an inch of black panel inset.

Rochlen asked if the other two elevations of elevators are silver.

The designer said the north side would mimic the south side.

Beeson asked the owner (same for both neighboring buildings) how they felt about preserving their architecturally significant historic resource, Harris Hall, in light of the proposed elevator addition that would be located only 3'8" from the west wall of Harris Hall.

The owner responded that they want to preserve their resource, as well; they have a long-term tenant they want to keep. He said, from the inside, the elevator doesn't significantly impact Harris Hall, it's from the street. He continued, they do not feel the proposed elevator addition would significantly impact Harris Hall as an asset.

Beeson reviewed the standards and guidelines, adding that he felt the addition would be making a bad situation worse, aggravating an existing condition.

Cope reiterated that he felt the addition would inappropriately alter spatial relationships, by hindering the view of the west elevation of Harris Hall.

Hall asked about the exploration of putting the elevator on the north side or other places on the building.

Dykstra, reviewing the floorplan with the Commission, responded that this proposed location is the only place where it could go up in a straight shot.

From the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:

(2) The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.

(10) New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

From the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic

Buildings (other SOI Guidelines may also apply):

New Additions

Recommended: Considering the attached exterior addition both in terms of the new use and the appearance of other buildings in the historic district or neighborhood. Design for the new work may be contemporary or may reference design motifs from the historic building.

Setting

Not Recommended: Introducing new construction into historic districts that is visually incompatible or that destroys historic relationships within the setting.

Accessibility

Recommended: Designing new or additional means of access that are comparable with the historic building and its setting.

From the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines:

Design Guidelines for Additions

Appropriate: Locating a required addition on the least character defining elevation and keeping it subordinate in volume to the historic building.

Safety Codes

Appropriate: Complying with barrier-free and safety codes in a manner that ensures the preservation of character-defining features.

Moved by Epperson, seconded by Hall, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 615 E Huron Street to add an elevator that would fall within the boundaries of the State Street Historic District, for barrier-free access to the roof, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for additions and safety codes, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2 and 10 and the guidelines for new additions, setting, and accessibility.

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion defeated. Vote: 0-6

Request was denied.

Yeas: 0

Nays: 6 - Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, Cope, Rochlen, Epperson, and Quijano

Absent: 1 - White

G NEW BUSINESS

H APPROVAL OF MINUTES

H-1 [18-1040](#) Minutes of the April 12, 2018, HDC Meeting

The Minutes were unanimously Approved by the Commission and forwarded to the City Council. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

H-2 [18-1039](#) Minutes of the May 10, 2018 HDC Meeting

The minutes were unanimously postponed to next month’s meeting.

I REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS

Commissioner Max Cope provided an update from the Cobblestone Farm Association.

J ASSIGNMENTS

J-1 Review Committee: Monday, July 9, 2018 at 5:00 pm for the July 12, 2018 Regular Meeting

Commissioners Anna Epperson and Jessica Quijano volunteered for the July HDC Review Committee.

K REPORTS FROM STAFF

K-1 [18-1037](#) May 2018 HDC Staff Activities

Received and Filed

L CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS

M COMMUNICATIONS

M-1 [18-1038](#) Various Communications to the HDC

Received and Filed

N ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned without objection at 10:35 p.m.

Community Television Network Channel 16 live televised public meetings are also available to watch live online from CTN's website, www.a2gov.org/ctn, on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>).

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at www.a2gov.org/ctn, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.

John Beeson, Chairperson
Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner
/mg