



---

Approved Minutes

August 18, 2016

Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority Board of Directors

Ann Arbor District Library, 343 South Fifth Avenue, Ann Arbor, Michigan, 6:30pm

Board: Mike Allemang, Eli Cooper, Gillian Ream Gainsley, Sue Gott (arrived 6:50pm), Prashanth Gururaja, Roger Hewitt, Eric Mahler (Chair)

Absent with Notice: Jack Bernard, Larry Krieg, Stephen Wade

Staff: Michael Benham, Matt Carpenter, Mary Stasiak, Phil Webb, Chris White, Michelle Whitlow

LAC Representative: Rebecca Burke

Recording Secretary: Karen Wheeler

Chairman Eric Mahler declared that a quorum was present and called the meeting to order at 6:33 p.m.

1.0 Public Hearing

There was no public hearing.

2.0 Communications and Announcements

2.1 Appoint Acting Secretary

Mr. Mahler appointed Gillian Ream Gainsley Acting Secretary.

3.0 Public Time – Comment on Agenda Items

Carolyn Grawi appeared before the Board. Ms. Grawi spoke in favor of support among different counties for regional transit and hope for growth of services in Ann Arbor. Ms. Grawi commented on work at the LAC on disability awareness training. Ms. Grawi requested that the training is broadened to become part of a driver's everyday experience so that passengers don't have to remind drivers about the law, but rather drivers know what they need to do.

Cathy-Alice Koyanagi appeared before the Board. Ms. Koyanagi recently relocated to Ann Arbor and has found the transportation good overall. Ms. Koyanagi may address

some issues about the paratransit service with the LAC. Ms. Koyanagi appreciates the service and looks forward to getting to know the board as a customer and citizen.

Ed Vielmetti appeared before the board. Mr. Vielmetti commented on the AAATA routes he rides indicating that his travel patterns vary and he is dependent on having accurate and timely schedule information, preferably by phone. Mr. Vielmetti commented on traveling in other cities where real-time information is available through phone-based apps. Mr. Vielmetti requested that AAATA provide developers with access to its API data to allow for writing code to figure out data to help plan routes, obtain overall system status and have live data available by phone.

Gale Benson appeared before the Board. Mr. Benson extended congratulations on the service expansion. Mr. Benson submitted a letter of observations and suggestions on Route #68.

No one further appearing, Mr. Mahler declared Public Time closed.

#### 4.0 Review and Approval of Minutes

##### 4.1 Review and Approval of Minutes June 20, 2016

Mike Allemang moved approval of the minutes as drafted with support from Gillian Ream Gainsley. The motion passed unanimously.

##### 4.2 Review and Approval of Minutes June 23, 2016

Eli Cooper moved approval of the minutes as drafted with support from Prashanth Gururaja. The motion passed unanimously.

#### 5.0 Board and Staff Reports

##### 5.1 Chief Executive Officer

Mr. Carpenter announced that real-time information is being displayed on the website. A new Safety Officer has been hired and will join the team on September 12. Mr. Carpenter announced the resignation of Nancy Shore, GetDowntown Coordinator. Mr. Carpenter thanked Ms. Shore for her great service. Mr. Carpenter announced that staff are ready to help students returning to Ann Arbor navigate the service changes implemented in May. Mr. Carpenter reported that more service changes are coming in August and introduced Chris White to report on the changes.

##### 5.1.1 August Service Update

Mr. White reported on the fall 2016 service improvements that will begin on August 28. Weekday service on Route #6 between downtown Ann Arbor and the Meijer on Carpenter Road will increase to every 15

minutes. A new shuttle Route #61 will serve the business parks on State Street south of Ellsworth during peak hours only. Route #61 will connect to Route #6 on Airport Boulevard. Route #32 will be realigned to provide more direct trips between the Stadium Boulevard and Maple Road area and downtown Ann Arbor. Weekday service on #32A to Skyline High School service has been changed to coincide with bell times. Weekday afternoon service on Route #32B will serve Skyline after stopping at the Miller Road Park and Ride lot.

#### 5.1.2 AirRide

Mr. Carpenter provided an update on AirRide service. Mr. Carpenter is working on a recommended approach for retendering the contract that will expire on March 31, 2017. The current AirRide service model does not meet the definition of public transportation in new Wayne County Airport Authority (WCAA) regulations. Continuing with the current model, after March 31, 2017, will require payment of an access fee. Mr. Carpenter reported that deploying a new service model, perhaps using a dedicated fleet of vehicles, may meet the definition of public transportation and not require payment of a fee. Mr. Carpenter indicated that the same level and quality of service will be required in a new contract, and there will be an option for pricing to add a stop in Ypsilanti.

Mr. Carpenter reported on a recent meeting with RTA staff. RTA has a workable solution to take over AirRide service, if the RTA's millage is successful.

Mr. Carpenter reported that this is the intended approach. Mr. Carpenter will discuss the proposal in detail with the board committees in September and seek endorsement for proceeding.

#### 5.1.3 RTA

Mr. Carpenter reported that the Regional Transit Authority (RTA) board voted to submit language to the election commissions to place a referendum on the November 8 ballot. As part of the approval, there was an amendment to the RTA's bylaws that created a Funding Allocation Committee. Action by the new committee, which includes one board member from Detroit and one member from each of the four counties, requires unanimous consent from all members.

#### 5.2 Planning and Development Committee

Ms. Gainsley announced a promotion every Friday in August where people can ride on AAATA buses free with Ypsilanti or Ann Arbor library cards.

Ms. Gainsley reported that the Planning and Development Committee (PDC) received updates on the items reported by Mr. Carpenter under the CEO report. With regard to AirRide, it was noted that there is a desire for an AirRide stop in Ypsilanti. With regard to the RTA, a request was made for the AAATA board to receive information on tools that the RTA will use for monitoring projects benefiting Washtenaw County.

PDC received a presentation on the draft FY2017 budget. This is the first year that the operating and capital budget are being presented together. A number of hybrid buses purchased in 2007 are due for replacement in 2019 which has significant implications on the capital budget. PDC was reminded that it will be important to include the triple bottom line from the Sustainability Plan when developing future budgets.

### 5.3 Performance Monitoring and External Relations Committee

Mr. Allemang reporting on the Performance Monitoring and External Relations (PMER) Committee meeting. PMER previously met on the Tuesday of the same week of board meeting. The committee is piloting a new schedule for a few months and met the week prior to the board meeting. PMER received updates similar to the CEO report, and reports on the financial and performance data ten months into the fiscal year. The budget has a favorable bottom line just under \$700,000. The amount will be reduced when drawing down of federal operating is stopped by fiscal year end. Reports about performance trends continue with fixed-route ridership low for the period. Mr. Allemang reported that September ridership is hoped to give a good indication of the real effect of additional routes and services provided. Mr. Allemang reported that the committee endorsed moving forward a resolution to the full board for a new survey research service.

### 5.4 Local Advisory Council

Ms. Burke reported on the Local Advisory Council (LAC) meeting. LAC received a presentation from Mr. Carpenter on a new project to hire a consultant to review the paratransit program and services. LAC will be asked to provide assistance with developing a work plan for the consultant and determining best methods to communicate the project. LAC received a report on the Council's first retreat held in July. LAC discussed the appointment of Executive Committee members in September with terms beginning in October. Mr. De Groot made a presentation on the Dial-A-Ride Plus program anticipated to go into limited service in 2017 in southern Ypsilanti Township. Mr. De Groot reported that one or two LAC board members would be invited to participate in the provider evaluation process. LAC received a report from Mr. Clouse on development of a practical training video for disability training. Ms. Burke announced that RideCorp recently started a new service where paratransit riders can sign up to receive calls to say that their ride is on the way.

## 5.5 Washtenaw Area Transportation Study

Mr. Mahler reported, on behalf of Mr. Krieg, that the August meeting of the WATS Policy Committee was canceled.

## 5.6 Governance

Mr. Mahler reported that the Governance Committee continues their work to determine the best process for getting to draft governance policies. Susan Radwan attended the October 2 Governance Committee meeting and worked with the committee on creating draft policies. A significant amount of work remains to be done on how board committees function and the annual and monthly board planning agenda process. Mr. Mahler suggested that the “Means” work could be done in two subcommittees with the “Ends” policy drafting undertaken by the full Board. Mr. Mahler suggested that the scope of the Board’s November retreat could be reshaped to include drafting Ends policies. Mr. Mahler noted that Ends policy drafting was discussed in budget meetings. The importance of determining a strategic direction that values and is considerate of the budget planning process was noted. Mr. Mahler indicated that he would circulate information and propose a process for completing the governance work over the next several months.

Mr. Mahler raised the question of whether board members are comfortable about signing on to support the RTA initiative through the Coalition for Transit. Board members considered the question. The following requests and suggestions were made:

- Guidance from legal counsel on the legalities of whether AAATA and the AAATA board are legally able to advocate for a millage
- Hold off until the final ballot language and approved plan the Board would be endorsing are available
- Obtain information on the implications for AAATA, if the millage passes
- Provide the Board with details on AAATA’s financial investment; specifically, how AAATA staff time and resources have been invested into RTA activities and the implications on other AAATA operations
- An updated analysis on the RTA from AAATA staff
- Direct input from Washtenaw County RTA board members
- Conduct due diligence for AAATA’s role as a local transit provider in a regional transit authority
- Do everything the Board can to support and help shape regional transit

Mr. Mahler indicated that there would be follow-up on items raised by board members and consideration of a decision at a future board meeting.

## 6.0 Question Time

Mr. Gururaja indicated that the real-time reporting information is not in the most user friendly format and asked about the plan and timeframe towards getting it there.

Ms. Stasiak responded that a live map tool launched in July. A new website home page is in development and that will provide better tools. It is expected to be ready in late August or early September. Ms. Stasiak reported that real-time information was streamed to the UM Central Campus Transit Center signs for the first time this week with data from the new bid. Plans are underway to have real-time information signs installed at the BTC and YTC in October. Ms. Stasiak reported that two other new real-time features will launch when the data is accurate. Ms. Stasiak added that staff is working on being able to provide the API for developers.

Mr. Gururaja asked about the existing policy for where ARide should operate and whether ARide coverage is mandated on the new Route #61.

Mr. White responded that there two different levels of service. If areas are within  $\frac{3}{4}$  of a mile of a bus stop, all requirements of the ADA must be met. There can't be any capacity constraints; there must be an ability to satisfy all trip demand. There is ARide service throughout Pittsfield Township but it may be in a lower level in the areas that are beyond  $\frac{3}{4}$  of a mile. When fixed-route service is expanded, the area must be expanded to a level of ADA service to satisfy all trip needs. Mr. White indicated that he believes that Pittsfield Township is paying for additional ARide service as a result of the expansion, and could clarify.

Mr. Gururaja asked about an AirRide stop in Ypsilanti and a second stop in Ann Arbor, or if it would be an either/or. Mr. Carpenter responded that the intent is to include a stop on the south side of Ann Arbor in addition to seeking cost information as an option for providing service from Ypsilanti.

Mr. Cooper referred to the budget which was introduced through PDC and the Ends policy in the governance model. Mr. Cooper asked when the board starts the Ends policy discussion as part of the budget suggesting that is now as the discussion can't be separate from budget decisions as those will prescribe what the Ends are. Mr. Cooper commented on the combined operating and capital budget. Mr. Cooper suggested that the Ends are more than a statement of good repair. Mr. Cooper noted the inclusion of a capital budget line item of \$100,000 for access to transit, but Park and Ride, a primary means for access, has been eliminated from the previous year's programming. Mr. Cooper suggested that the fleet must be maintained to provide service when there's no certainty of how people will get to the service. Mr. Cooper suggested keeping an eye on the changing mobility marketplace noting discussions about the RTA. Mr. Cooper commented on the investment of state and federal funds for high speed rail to connect Ann Arbor with Chicago and Detroit; a significant expansion of public transportation and there is not much in the budget to prepare for that eventuality, an omission Mr. Cooper hopes will be addressed through budget deliberations. Mr. Cooper commented on the

Connector which only has funding in the first year of the capital program and nothing going out several years. Mr. Cooper indicated that a high capacity transit system will span a period of years. Mr. Cooper suggested that the board provide guidance and direction so as to not miss the mark on opportunities and have projects land in the category of good repair. Mr. Cooper indicated that he embraces the concept of a policy board but feels there is opportunity to go beyond "State of Good Repair" projects. Mr. Cooper commented on the projected capital budget deficit in 2019 and asked the board to think about maximizing the availability of federal and state resources for the agency to realize both a state of good repair and a world class transit operation in Ann Arbor. Mr. Cooper indicated that he wanted to frame areas opportunity for how the board sees potential significant changes and how to position the agency to be a true regional leader within the confines of a growing metropolitan area. Mr. Cooper noted the need to focus on a state of good repair and maintaining balanced operating budget suggested starting with the Ends and an understanding that the organization will rise to the occasion of achieving those Ends.

#### 7.0 Old Business

There was no Old Business for the Board to consider.

#### 8.0 New Business

Mr. Carpenter introduced the resolution for approval of a contract for Survey Research Services. Ms. Whitlow reported that AAATA's current contract for survey research services expires on August 25, 2016. To maintain the ability of services, a Request for Proposals was issued. A procurement team received and evaluated the competitive proposals. Ms. Whitlow requested that the Board authorize award of a contract with CJI Research Corporation for a one-year contract with four one year renewals.

Board members commented on the resolution. Mr. Carpenter responded to a question about what cost control mechanism exists to limit how much over \$100,000 the contract could end up incurring annually. Mr. Cooper noted that planned expenditures for FY2017 are about \$45,000. Mr. Carpenter noted that the resolution includes a statement that expenditures will not exceed the budgeted amount.

Eli Cooper moved to amend the resolution for the final "Whereas" clause to be changed to "Be It Further Resolved" and appear as the final clause. Sue Gott supported the motion.

Mr. Carpenter responded to a request for his comment on the board getting into that level of detailed monitoring. Mr. Carpenter indicated that the expenditures will be dependent on what the contractor is asked to do. Mr. Carpenter provided assurance that the expenditures will be monitored.

Board members discussed whether to place a cap on the expenditure vs. controlling expenditures through budgeting in general.

A vote was called on the motion to amend. Mr. Allemang opposed the motion to amend. The motion to amend carried.

#### 8.1 Survey Research Services

##### Board Amended Resolution 24/2016

#### APPROVAL OF CONTRACT FOR SURVEY RESEARCH SERVICES

**WHEREAS**, Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority (AAATA) contracts for professional survey research and data analysis services in an effort to learn the views and needs of our riders and those of the general public, and

**WHEREAS**, AAATA uses the data to modify existing service, develop new services, shape promotional and educational programs, and inform AAATA's communication to riders and the community, and

**WHEREAS**, AAATA's current contract for survey research services will expire on August 25, 2016, and

**WHEREAS**, AAATA staff issued Request for Proposals (RFP) #2016-21 for Survey Research Services, and received and evaluated competitive proposals, and

**WHEREAS**, the Proposal from CJI Research Corporation of Columbus, OH has been determined to be the most advantageous to AAATA, and

**WHEREAS**, the cost of survey research services is expected to exceed \$100,000 over five years, and Board policy requires advance authorization to incur products or services over \$100,000, ~~and~~

~~**WHEREAS**, the annual costs for survey services will be included in each annual budget, and expenditures will not exceed the budgeted amount,~~

**NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED**, that the AAATA Board of Directors hereby authorizes execution of a contract with CJI Research Corporation to provide survey research services for a one-year term, with up to four (4) one-year renewal options, ~~and~~

~~**WHEREAS, BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED THAT** the annual costs for survey services will be included in each annual budget, and expenditures will not exceed the budgeted amount.~~

The resolution, as amended, passed unanimously.



## 9.0 Public Time

Carolyn Grawi appeared before the Board. Ms. Grawi commented on expanded bus service into Pittsfield Township and the need to make sure there are enough RideCorp hours for additional service. Ms. Grawi suggested involving people with disabilities in the planning process for new services. Ms. Grawi shared the details of two open positions at the Ann Arbor Center for Independent Living.

Edward Vielmetti appeared before the Board. Mr. Vielmetti encouraged the release of data for development as soon as is practical. Mr. Vielmetti suggested that the current website would be difficult to use by someone who is visually impaired. He suggested opening up program access so that work could begin on that.

Michelle Barney appeared before the board. Ms. Barney commented that she has had problems as a passenger with RideCorp. Ms. Barney reported that she has experienced rudeness by drivers on fixed-route buses and provided details of two situations. Ms. Barney suggested providing more sensitivity training for new drivers. Ms. Barney expressed appreciation for additional service in Ypsilanti but concern that some connections only allow three minutes which may not be enough time in bad weather. Ms. Barney requested information on groups involved in Partners for Transit to plan ahead and be ready for the renewal election in 2018.

Gale Benson appeared before the Board. Mr. Benson commented on the timing of intersecting routes in Ypsilanti. Mr. Benson noted concerns raised about the comportment of drivers. Mr. Benson indicated that his experience with and observation of driver behavior has been very good.

No one further appearing, Mr. Mahler declared Public Time closed.

## 10.0 Adjourn

Gillian Ream Gainsley moved to adjourn the meeting with support from Roger Hewitt. The motion passed unanimously and the meeting adjourned at 8:23 pm.

Respectfully Submitted,

Gillian Ream Gainsley, Acting Secretary