

ANN ARBOR HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Staff Report

ADDRESS: 1530 Hill Street, Application Number HDC16-219

DISTRICT: Washtenaw / Hill Historic District

REPORT DATE: October 20, 2016

REPORT PREPARED BY: Jill Thacher, Historic Preservation Coordinator

REVIEW COMMITTEE DATE: Monday, October 17, 2016

OWNER

APPLICANT

Name:	Chad & Katherine Brummett	Same
Address:	1530 Hill Street Ann Arbor, MI 48104	
Phone:	(734) 834-1003	

BACKGROUND: The Baldwin/Hall House was most likely built in 1847 when Deacon J.D. Baldwin moved to Ann Arbor from New York. (Baldwin's maternal grandfather participated in the Boston Tea Party. While dressed as an Indian, he threw tea overboard from the ship in Boston Harbor.) The house originally sat on 154 acres of farmland on which Baldwin grew treefruit and berries. In 1876 he sold the house and 80 acres to Israel and Olivia Hall, who later subdivided it. The house was originally pink brick, which was stuccoed by the time the Halls purchased it. Mrs. Hall added the fireplaces and sloped roof porches, and remodeled the front entry. The daughter of one of the Hall children, Elizabeth (Mrs. J.R.) Hayden, lived in the house until her death in the 1980s.

Many changes were made to the house over time, including the addition of the two-car garage prior to 1916 (per Sanborn). In 1986, a new owner extensively remodeled the house, removing most of the interior plaster, fireplaces, and wood trim.

Windows were added and removed, several doors were replaced with French doors, and the chimneys and a rear side porch were removed. The walled courtyard and second-floor balcony on the west side were added between 1986 and 1999. The essential form of the house, however, with two two-story sections and a one-story side wing, remains unchanged from the 1916 Sanborn.

The previous owner received a Rehabilitation Award from the Historic District Commission in 2008. Some of the work included repairing the scored stucco exterior and rehabilitating original windows.

The current owner received a Certificate of Appropriateness to put an addition on the back of the house over the garage in 2014.



LOCATION: The site is located at the southwest corner of Washtenaw Avenue and Hill Street.

APPLICATION: The applicant seeks HDC approval to install a new double french door in place of a single door on the south-facing elevation on the west side of the house.

APPLICABLE REGULATIONS:

From the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:

- (1) A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.
- (2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
- (9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
- (10) New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

From the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (other SOI Guidelines may also apply):

Entrances and Porches

Recommended: Designing and installing additional entrances or porches on secondary elevations when required for the new use in a manner that preserves the historic character of the buildings, i.e., limiting such alteration to non-character-defining elevations.

Not Recommended: Cutting new entrances on a primary elevation. Altering utilitarian or service entrances so they appear to be formal entrances by adding paneled doors, fanlights, and sidelights.

Introducing a new entrance or porch that is incompatible in size, scale, material, and color.

From the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines (other Guidelines may apply):

Doors

Not Appropriate: Installing a new door opening.

STAFF FINDINGS:

1. The proposed french door is 5'2" wide and 6'8" tall. It leads onto an existing non-original rear-facing porch that is within a walled courtyard.
2. The door's location is out of sight from the street and sidewalk, facing the backyard.

Staff's opinion is that this widened door opening will not affect the historic building, given that the door is located on a secondary elevation that has already been altered by the addition of this non-original door opening, porch, and two windows.

3. Staff believes the work is compatible with the existing structure, neighboring buildings, and the surrounding historic district, and meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines and the *Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines*.

POSSIBLE MOTIONS: (Note that the motions are only a suggestion. The Review Committee, consisting of staff and at least two Commissioners, will meet with the applicant on site and then make a recommendation at the meeting.)

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 1530 Hill Street, a contributing property in the Washtenaw / Hill Historic District, to install a new double door in place of a single door on the south-facing elevation on the west side of the house. The proposed work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings*, in particular standards 1, 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for entrances and porches, as well as the *Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines*, particularly as they pertain to doors.

MOTION WORKSHEET:

I move that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the work at 1530 Hill Street in the Washtenaw / Hill Historic District

_____ Provided the following condition(S) is (ARE) met: 1) STATE CONDITION(s)

The work is generally compatible with the size, scale, massing, and materials and meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, standard(S) number(S) (*circle all that apply*): 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10

ATTACHMENTS: application, drawings, photos.

1530 Hill (2008)

