

City of Ann Arbor

301 E. Huron St.

Ann Arbor, MI 48104

<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>



Meeting Minutes - Final

Tuesday, October 1, 2019

7:00 PM

**Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council
Chambers**

City Planning Commission

Commission public meetings are held the first and third Tuesday of each month. Both of these meetings provide opportunities for the public to address the Commission. All persons are encouraged to participate in public meetings. Citizens requiring translation or sign language services or other reasonable accommodations may contact the City Clerk's office at 734.794.6140; via e-mail to: cityclerk@a2gov.org; or by written request addressed and mailed or delivered to: City Clerk's Office, 301 E. Huron St., Ann Arbor, MI 48104. Requests need to be received at least two (2) business days in advance of the meeting. Planning Commission meeting agendas and packets are available from the Legislative Information Center on the City Clerk's page of the City's website (<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>) or on the 1st floor of City Hall on the Friday before the meeting. Agendas and packets are also sent to subscribers of the City's email notification service, GovDelivery. You can subscribe to this free service by accessing the City's website and clicking on the 'Subscribe to Updates' envelope on the home page.

1 CALL TO ORDER

2 ROLL CALL

City of Ann Arbor Planning Manager Brett Lenart called the roll.

Present 6 - Milshteyn, Gibb-Randall, Ackerman, Sauve, Abrons, and Hammerschmidt

Absent 3 - Woods, Briggs, and Mills

3 INTRODUCTIONS

None.

4 APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Moved by Ackerman, seconded by Sauve, and approved unanimously as presented.

5 MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING

5-a **[19-1871](#)** City Planning Commission Meeting Minutes of September 4, 2019

Moved by Abrons, seconded by Gibb-Randall, approved unanimously as presented and forwarded to the City Council.

6 REPORTS FROM CITY ADMINISTRATION, CITY COUNCIL, PLANNING MANAGER, PLANNING COMMISSION OFFICERS AND COMMITTEES, WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS AND PETITIONS

6-a City Council

No report.

6-b Planning Manager

Lenart encouraged participants to complete a Sign-in card if they speak in a Public Hearing or wish to be contacted regarding a specific project. He also discussed the upcoming Short Term Rental community input meetings.

6-c Planning Commission Officers and Committees

No report.

6-d Written Communications and Petitions

[19-1872](#) Various Correspondence to the City Planning Commission

Received and Filed

7 AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION (Persons may speak for three minutes about an item that is NOT listed as a public hearing on this agenda. Please state your name and address for the record.)

AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION

Tom Stullberg, 1202 Traver Street, Ann Arbor discussed evaluating the R1E and C1A/R zoning districts.

Nathan Shevick, 500 E. Michigan Avenue, East Lansing, MI on behalf of Ken Bryant, discussed marijuana adult use permits as they relate to medical marijuana permits.

8 PUBLIC HEARINGS SCHEDULED FOR NEXT BUSINESS MEETING

[19-1873](#) Public Hearings Scheduled for the October 15, 2019 Planning Commission Meeting

Lenart explained that a public hearing on the following items will be held by the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission at Larcom City Hall, 301 E. Huron Street, Second Floor, Ann Arbor, Michigan on Tuesday, October

15, 2019 at 7:00 p.m.

3953 Research Park Drive (Mercedes-Benz) Research and Development Site Improvements for City Council Approval – A proposal to install a 3,900-square foot modular office building at 3953 Research Park Drive and to connect this site with a drive connection to the adjacent southern site (3959 Research Park Drive) for shared parking. This 3.12-acre site is zoned RE (Research).

3959 Research Park Drive (Mercedes-Benz) Research and Development for City Planning Commission Approval – A proposal to install a new access drive between the 3959 Research Park Drive and the adjacent 3953 Research Park Drive property for vehicle and Fire Department access. A Landscape Modification is being requested to leave the existing landscaping as it is, requiring approval from the City Planning Commission. This 3.37-acre site is zoned RE (Research).

Received and Filed

9 UNFINISHED BUSINESS

- 9-a** [19-1867](#) Hideaway Lane Planned Project Site Plan for City Council Approval - A planned project site plan for Council to revise the 17 unbuilt homes from single family to two-family dwellings at 2000 Traver Road. This 4.6-acre site currently contains a 9-unit apartment building and one single family house, as well as one partially built single family house and foundations for two single family houses; the proposal increases the total number of dwellings on the site plan from 29 to 45. No change to the site layout or an increase in number of buildings is proposed. Each of the new homes will have attached garages. Storm water will be detained on site. Access will be from Traver Road. Zoned R4A (Multiple-Family Dwelling). Staff Recommendation: Approval

PRESENTATION BY PETITIONER

Michael Powell, Design Engineer for the project, explained the proposed project highlighting the following items:

- current proposal has 17 duplexes and 1 single family home*
- no proposed zoning changes*
- existing conditions of the site*
- parking*
- stormwater*

City Planner Jeff Kahan presented the staff report.

PUBLIC HEARING

Ethell Potts, 1014 Elder Boulevard, Ann Arbor, discussed the creek and erosion concerns relating to the proposed project.

Mike Gustatson, 1709 Hideaway Lane Drive, Ann Arbor, expressed opposition for and encouraged the Commission to deny the proposed project.

Joseph Pratt 3092 Wolverine Drive, Ann Arbor, expressed opposition for and encouraged the Commission to deny the proposed project.

Seeing no further speakers, Chair Milshteyn closed the Public Hearing.

MAIN MOTION

Moved by Sauve, seconded by Gibb-Randall that he Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the Hideaway Lane Planned Project Site Plan and Development Agreement.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION ON MAIN MOTION

Commissioner Gibb Randall inquired about stormwater at the site, and expressed concern for erosion. She also discussed about water at the site generally

Powell explained the proposed stormwater system at the site.

Tony Randazzo, applicant, explained the usage of sump pumps.

Councilmember Ackerman inquired about finding groundwater and trees at the site, as well as emergency access.

Kahan explained that the applicant would have to work with the building department to find a permitted solution and that proposing an amendment to the site plan is also a possibility.

Randazzo answered that the trees planted are healthy and that he does not expect any tree health issues.

Powell explained the proposed areas for emergency response access space.

Commissioner Erica Briggs inquired about trees on the site.

Kahan explained that trees approved on a site plan are required to be there, and if a tree is not there the Planning Department can respond to complaints.

Commissioner Lisa Sauve discussed signage at the site for emergency response and wetland mitigation at the site.

James Gray, Landscape Architect, explained that the prior wetland mitigation failed and will be reimplemented.

Commissioner Sara Hammerschmidt inquired about the condition of the land for building and railroad track proximity.

Lenart further explained that development would have to meet building code requirements.

Powell explained that there is one building on the proposed plan is 20 feet from the property line, and the property line is 50 feet from the railroad tracks.

Commissioner Ellie Abrons inquired about the traffic analysis.

Powell explained that all proposed plans have been reviewed by the City's traffic engineers.

Chair Milshteyn inquired about the Condominium Association will be structured.

Randazzo explained that there will likely be a separate association for the proposed development.

Briggs inquired about bicycle parking at the site.

Randazzo explained that he is open to adding additional bike parking.

Ackerman discussed amending the motion to address Planning Commission concerns.

AMENDMENT I TO MAIN MOTION:

Moved by Ackerman, seconded by Gibb-Randall, that the main motion include the following:

Petitioner and City staff explore alternative or additional locations for bike parking.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION ON AMENDMENT I TO MAIN MOTION

None.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the amendment approved.

Yeas: 6 - Alex Milshteyn, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Zachary Ackerman, Elizabeth Sauve, Ellie Abrons, and Sara Hammerschmidt

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Wendy Woods, Erica Briggs, and Sarah Mills

AMENDMENT II TO MAIN MOTION

Moved by Ackerman, seconded by Hammerschmidt that the following be included in the main motion:

Petitioner and City staff collaborate on potential signage and/or traffic calming approaches on and near the site.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION ON AMENDMENT II TO MAIN MOTION:

None.

VOTE ON AMENDMENT II TO MAIN MOTION

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring Amendment II approved.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION ON MAIN MOTION:

None.

VOTE ON MAIN MOTION:

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the Main Motion Approved as amended.

Yeas: 6 - Alex Milshteyn, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Zachary Ackerman, Elizabeth Sauve, Ellie Abrons, and Sara Hammerschmidt

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Wendy Woods, Erica Briggs, and Sarah Mills

10 REGULAR BUSINESS - Project Presentation, Staff Report, Public Hearing and Commission Discussion of Each Item

- 10-a** **19-1868** 212 South State Street Multi-Family Residential Development Site Plan for City Council Approval - A proposed 6-story building to house approximately 19 residential units and incorporate new restrooms for the adjacent Michigan Theatre. No parking is proposed as part of this proposal located at 212-216 South State Street. Zoned D1 (Downtown Core) State Street Character Overlay Zoning District. 0.20-acre site. Staff Recommendation: Approval

PRESENTATION BY PETITIONER:

Brad Moore, Architect for the project presented the proposed project.

PUBLIC HEARING

Ethell Potts, 1014 Elder Boulevard, Ann Arbor, discussed the State Street Character Overlay District as it relates to this project.

Jim Pyke, 912 Pomona Rd, Ann Arbor, explained that he works downtown at the theater and on campus, and expressed support for the proposed project and its companion project. He encouraged the Commission to approve the project.

Doug Kelbaugh, 243 E. Ann Street, Ann Arbor expressed support for the proposed project, explaining that more housing downtown is positive. He explained that as an architect, and as a professor of architecture, he encourages the Planning Commission to approve the proposed project.

Jeff Crockett, 506 E. Kingsley Street, Ann Arbor, expressed support for the proposed project. He explained that he is interested in the affordable housing aspect of the proposed project.

Ilene Tyler, 126 N. Division Avenue, Ann Arbor, expressed support for the proposed project and expressed that the developer has been accommodating to the needs of the area.

Scott Trudeau, 526 N Main St., Ann Arbor, expressed enthusiastic support for the proposed project.

Tom Stullberg, 1202 Traver Street, Ann Arbor expressed support for the proposed project.

Russ Collins, 2585 Hollywood, Executive Director of the Michigan Theater, explained that he has been working with the developer for many years and been sensitive to the needs of the Michigan Theater, he explained that the organization is very excited about the restroom improvements for the customers. He explained that the petitioner is also preserving the screening room, which is important to the organization. He explained that on behalf of the Michigan Theater Foundation, I support this proposed development.

MAIN MOTION:

Moved by Ackerman, seconded by Hammerschmidt, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the 212 S. State Street Site Plan and Development Agreement, subject to shared access easements for Solid Waste pick-up prior to issuance of any permits.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION OF MAIN MOTION

Commissioners identified that the use of this midblock space is creative, part of a set of projects that will incorporate. The developer responded to questions by noting HDC related changes to reduce lighting and let the project fade into the background. The Commission expressed concerned about bike parking being located in the other building. The Commission also discussed amenity sharing between buildings.

MOTION TO POSTPONE:

Moved by Gibb-Randall, seconded by Briggs to postpone vote on item 10-a until after the presentation for item 10-b.

Approved unanimously.

- 10-b** **19-1869** 616 East Washington Street New High-Rise Development Site Plan for City Council Approval - Five existing building are proposed to be removed to accommodate a 19-story tower that includes 240 residential units (including 19 affordable units), 127 on-site parking spaces, and 5,438 square feet of ground floor retail space. Pedestrian and vehicular access will be from East Washington Street. Zoned (Downtown Core) State Street Character Overlay Zoning District. 0.65-acre site located at 514-606 East Washington Street. Staff Recommendation: Approval

PRESENTATION BY PETITIONER:

Brad Moore, Architect for the project, presented the proposed project.

Kahan discussed stormwater management at the proposed project site.

PUBLIC HEARING

Ethel Potts, 1014 Elder Boulevard, Ann Arbor, encouraged the Planning Commission to consider character overlay districts and the intent of the zoning code.

Jeff Crocket, 506 E Kingsley, Ann Arbor, expressed support for the proposed project and explained that he believes the proposed location is appropriate for density.

Ilene Tyler, 126 N. Division St. Ann Arbor, explained that she believes that the parking study was thoughtful and expressed support for the proposed projects.

Scott Trudeau, 526 N Main St. Ann Arbor, expressed support for the project and the use of the planned project modifications. He requested more information about the public art wall.

Tom Stulberg, 1202 Traver Street, Ann Arbor, expressed that there are positive aspects to the proposed project and discussed the the validity of the planned project project type.

Jim Pike, 912 Pomona Rd, Ann Arbor expressed support for the proposed project discussing the affordability component of the project and density.

Russ Collins, 2585 Hollywood Ave, Ann Arbor, expressed support for the proposed project.

MAIN MOTION

Moved by Sauve, seconded by Gibb-Randall, that the The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve 616 East Washington Planned Project Site Plan and Development Agreement, which allows a taller building with a varied front setback while providing solar and energy conserving design, subject to providing easements for private stormwater, private reciprocal access/egress, and solid waste prior to the issuance of the first permit.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION OF MAIN MOTION

Gibb-Randall discussed solar at the site.

Sauve discussed rideshare and package delivery as they relate to the proposed project.

Moore responded that he is working with the Downtown Development Authority (DDA) over the course of construction to identify the best place for rideshare or package delivery areas.

Abrons inquired about impacts to the neighboring church.

Chris Johnson explained that the concerns regarding sunlight and south facing classrooms and offices have been addressed.

The Commission further discussed the proposed project discussing the proposed artwork, bicycle parking, lighting, loading/delivery zones, affordable housing, solar, and parking.

AMENDMENT TO MAIN MOTION

Moved by Ackerman, seconded by Sauve, to amend the 616 East Washington Street New High-Rise Development Site Plan to provide 6 units at 60% AMI and 13 units at 80% AMI.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION ON AMENDMENT TO MAIN MOTION

Briggs expressed appreciation for several aspects of the proposed project.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the Amendment I approved.

Yeas: 6 - Alex Milshteyn, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Zachary Ackerman, Elizabeth Sauve, Ellie Abrons, and Sara Hammerschmidt

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Wendy Woods, Erica Briggs, and Sarah Mills

COMMISSION DISCUSSION OF MAIN MOTION:

None.

VOTE ON MAIN MOTION

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the Main Motion approved as amended.

Yeas: 6 - Alex Milshteyn, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Zachary Ackerman, Elizabeth Sauve, Ellie Abrons, and Sara Hammerschmidt

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Wendy Woods, Erica Briggs, and Sarah Mills

Moved by Abrons, seconded by Sauve, to bring the 212 S State Street Multi Family Residential Development Site Plan back to the table for discussion.

Approved Unanimously.

19-1868 212 South State Street Multi-Family Residential Development Site Plan for City Council Approval - A proposed 6-story building to house approximately 19 residential units and incorporate new restrooms for the adjacent Michigan Theatre. No parking is proposed as part of this proposal located at 212-216 South State Street. Zoned D1 (Downtown Core) State Street Character Overlay Zoning District. 0.20-acre site. Staff Recommendation: Approval

COMMISSION DISCUSSION OF 212 S STATE STREET:

The Commission discussed solar at the site.

AMENDMENT I TO MAIN MOTION:

Moved by Ackerman, seconded by Gibb-Randall, to add a condition

that in the interim between the Planning Commission and City Council meetings the petitioner and City Staff explore viability of solar atop the 212 S State Street building.

DISCUSSION OF AMENDMENT I TO MAIN MOTION:

None.

AMENDMENT I TO MAIN MOTION

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the AMENDMENT I TO MAIN MOTION approved.

Yeas: 6 - Alex Milshteyn, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Zachary Ackerman, Elizabeth Sauve, Ellie Abrons, and Sara Hammerschmidt

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Wendy Woods, Erica Briggs, and Sarah Mills

COMMISSION DISCUSSION OF MAIN MOTION:

None.

VOTE ON MAIN MOTION

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair delcaring the Main Motion approved as amended.

Yeas: 6 - Alex Milshteyn, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Zachary Ackerman, Elizabeth Sauve, Ellie Abrons, and Sara Hammerschmidt

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Wendy Woods, Erica Briggs, and Sarah Mills

- 10-c** [19-1870](#) Amendments to Chapter 55 (Unified Development Code) to Add a New Zoning District, T1 Transit Support - This district is intended to require mixed uses in sufficient density to support transit systems, provide more housing choices, and further the goals of the City Master Plan. Development in this district must include residential uses, must be set close to the street, must be designed to provide accommodations for all modes of transportation with an emphasis on pedestrians and nonmotorized modes. Several sections of Chapter 55 may be amended to implement the new T1 district such as: Section 5.12 (Mixed Use Zoning Districts), Section 5.15 (Permitted Use Tables), Section 5.16 (Use Specific Standards), Section 5.17 (Area, Height and Placement Regulations),

Section 5.18 (Special Dimensional and Site Layout Standards), Section 5.19 (Parking Standards), Section 5.20 (Landscaping, Screening and Buffering) and Section 5.21 (Streets and Access). Staff Recommendation: Approval

Alexis DiLeo, City of Ann Arbor Planner, presented the staff report.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Jeff Crocket, 506 E Kingsley Street, Ann Arbor, expressed concern for the proposed ordinance, and discussed the public outreach process.

Ethel Potts, 1014 Elder Boulevard, discussed the public outreach process.

Joan Lowenstein, 502 Burson Place, Ann Arbor, representing the Board of the Washtenaw Housing Alliance, discussed affordable housing and climate change.

Tom Stulberg, 1202 Traver Street, Ann Arbor, expressed support for the proposed ordinance, and discussed parking as it relates to the ordinance.

Adam Goodman, 400 Virginia Ave, Ann Arbor, expressed support for the proposed ordinance, he discussed sustainability and density.

Scott Trudeau, 526 N Main St, Ann Arbor, explained the public input process up to this point, as well as the future process for the proposed zoning.

Jim Pike, 912 Pamona Rd, Ann Arbor, expressed support for the proposed ordinance change.

David Silkworth, discussed affordable housing and height limits as they relate to the proposed ordinance.

Kirk Westphal, 3505 Charter Place, discussed affordable housing, sustainability, and the proposed ordinance.

Julie Ritter, 920 Catherine Street, Ann Arbor, discussed the proposed ordinance as it relates to the lack of public transportation within the city and master planning process. She also discussed parking, transit, and affordable housing within the city.

Moved by Sauve, seconded by Briggs that the Ann Arbor City

Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the amendments to Chapter 55 Unified Development Code to create a new zoning district, T1 (Transit Support) District.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Ackerman discussed supply as it relates to affordable housing, developing density outside of the downtown, and effective transit corridors within the city.

Moved by Ackerman, seconded by Sauve, to continue the meeting until 11:20 p.m.

Approved Unanimously.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION ON MAIN MOTION:

Briggs addressed engagement concerns, discussed transit, stating according to Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority (AAAT), The Ride, there were 6.9 million rides in 2018, 6.6 were on local fixed routes, and that on Washtenaw Ave there are 10 minute headways, and that the transit authority is innovative and constantly seeking to make enhancements to the system. She also explained that the heaviest corridor in terms of transit is between Ypsilanti and Ann Arbor, explaining that the T1 zoning area makes sense, and that affordability is increased by allowing people to make use of transit, and that units outside of the downtown would be cheaper. Briggs also discussed the neighborhood buffer, future plans for public engagement.

Sauve explained that the statements relating to the need to drive a car to get into the city and that affordable housing is not provided by transit are false, and provided example of her personal experience. She also explained that more opportunities for people to live closer need to be provided and that T1 zoning would provide an opportunity for that. She explained further that implementing a T1 zoning would provide opportunity engagement because it would be linked with the Master Plan

Gibb Randall discussed height limits, parking, and the impacts of both. She expressed support for the process.

Moved by Ackerman seconded by Sauve to extend the meeting until 11:25 p.m.

Approved Unanimously.*COMMISSION DISCUSSION OF MAIN MOTION:*

Hammerschmidt expressed excitement for T1 zoning, and discussed premiums, affordable housing, and neighborhood connections.

Abrons discussed further engagement for the process, and items for further research.

Lenart discussed dedicating a future Planning Commission meeting to engagement about T1 zoning.

Milshteyn discussed parking.

Moved by Ackerman, seconded by Sauve, to table decision on Amendments to Chapter 55 Unified Development Code to create a new zoning district, T1 (Transit Support) District.

Motion to Postpone Approved.

Yeas: 6 - Alex Milshteyn, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Zachary Ackerman, Elizabeth Sauve, Ellie Abrons, and Sara Hammerschmidt

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Wendy Woods, Erica Briggs, and Sarah Mills

Moved by Ackerman, seconded by Sauve, to extend the meeting until 11:40 p.m.

Approved Unanimously.**11 AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION (Persons may speak for three minutes on any item.)***AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION*

Jeff Crocket explained his experience receiving Planning Commission information.

Ken Garber 2387 Hildale, Ann Arbor, expressed appreciation for the work done by the Commission, especially to Commissioner Gibb Randall regarding her discussion of solar at the proposed downtown developments. He encouraged the commission to consider sustainability

more aggressively.

Julie Ritter, 920 Catherine Street, Ann Arbor, discussed the master plan process.

Tom Stulberg, 1202 Traver Street, Ann Arbor, discussed public engagement.

12 COMMISSION PROPOSED BUSINESS

None.

13 ADJOURNMENT

Moved by Abrons, seconded by Gibb-Randall, to adjourn the meeting at 12:37 a.m.

Approved Unanimously.

Alex Milshteyn, Chairperson
/kvl

(If an agenda item is postponed, it will most likely be rescheduled to a future date. If you would like to be notified when a postponed agenda item will appear on a future agenda, please provide your email address on the form provided on the front table at the meeting. You may also call Planning and Development Services at 734-794-6265 during office hours to obtain additional information about the review schedule or visit the Planning page on the City's website (www.a2gov.org.)

(Public Hearings: Individuals may speak for three minutes. The first person who is the official representative of an organized group or who is representing the petitioner may speak for five minutes; additional representatives may speak for three minutes. Please state your name and address for the record.)

(Comments about a proposed project are most constructive when they relate to: (1) City Code requirements and land use regulations, (2) consistency with the City Master Plan, or (3) additional information about the area around the petitioner's property and the extent to which a proposed project may positively or negatively affect the area.)

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Channel 16 live at 7:00 p.m. on the first and third Tuesdays of the month and replayed the following Thursdays at 8:00 AM and Saturdays at 8:00 PM. Recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website <https://a2ctn.viebit.com>.

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at <https://a2ctn.viebit.com>, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.

