

ANN ARBOR HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Staff Report

ADDRESS: 903 W Liberty, Application Number HDC20-144

DISTRICT: Old West Side Historic District

REPORT DATE: October 8, 2020

REPORT PREPARED BY: Jill Thacher, Historic Preservation Coordinator

REVIEW COMMITTEE DATE: October 5, 2020

	OWNER	APPLICANT
Name:	Steve & Allison LeDuc	Same
Address:	903 W. Liberty St. Ann Arbor, MI 48103	
Phone:	(734) 330-7045	

BACKGROUND: This is the 2 ½ story 1914 Weithammer home. It features pedimented gables facing north, east, and west, and triple windows in the front gable facing West Liberty. On the northeast corner is a red brick chimney, and the half-width front porch is partially inset with round columns supporting a pedimented gable roof. One-over-one windows are regularly spaced, and the foundation is rusticated block. There is also a contributing single-car garage with 3/1 windows and double leaf doors. The house is currently a duplex.

The house next door at 907, originally a small Greek revival but now with several additions, was moved from the corner to allow the current house at 903 to be constructed.

LOCATION: The site is located on West Liberty Street at the southwest corner of South Seventh.

APPLICATION: The applicant seeks after-the-fact HDC approval to pave the gravel driveway and parking area with asphalt.

APPLICABLE REGULATIONS

Ann Arbor City Code Chapter 103 § 8:421(3)

When work has been done upon a resource without a permit, and the commission finds that the work does not qualify for a certificate of appropriateness, the commission may require an owner to restore the resource to the condition the resource was in before the inappropriate work or to modify the work so that it qualifies for a certificate of appropriateness. If the owner does not comply with the restoration or modification requirement within a reasonable time, the commission may request for the city to seek an order from the circuit court to require the owner to restore the resource to its former condition or to modify the work so that it qualifies for a certificate of appropriateness. If the

owner does not comply or cannot comply with the order of the court, the commission may request for the city to enter the property and conduct work necessary to restore the resource to its former condition or modify the work so that it qualifies for a certificate of appropriateness in accordance with the court's order. The costs of the work shall be charged to the owner and may be levied by the city as a special assessment against the property. When acting pursuant to an order of the circuit court, the city may enter a property for purposes of this section.

From the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:

- (1) A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.
- (2) The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
- (10) New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property will be unimpaired.

From the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (other SOI Guidelines may also apply):

District or Neighborhood Setting

Recommended: Identifying, retaining, and preserving buildings, and streetscape, and landscape features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the district or neighborhood. Such features can include streets, alleys, paving, walkways, street lights, signs, benches, parks and gardens, and trees.

Not Recommended: Destroying streetscape and landscape features by widening existing streets, changing paving material, or introducing inappropriately located new streets or parking lots.

Building Site

Recommended: Retaining the historic relationship between buildings, landscape features, and open space.

Identifying, retaining, and preserving buildings and their features as well as features of the site that are important in defining its overall historic character.

Not Recommended: Introducing new construction onto the building site which is visually incompatible in terms of size, scale, design, materials, color and texture or which destroys historic relationships on the site.

From the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines (other Ann Arbor guidelines may also apply):

Landscape Features

Not Appropriate: Introducing any new building, streetscape, or landscape feature that is out of scale or otherwise inappropriate to the district's historic character.

Paved Areas

Appropriate: Installing new parking areas, which are compatible with the scale, proportion of yard area, and characteristics of the historic district, behind buildings. These shall be reviewed on a case-by-case basis.

Retaining and maintaining historic sidewalks, walkways, driveways, and patios/terraces.

Not Appropriate: Installing or enlarging parking areas in front of buildings.

Installing driveways or parking areas that are too wide or large for the building site and are out of character for the district.

Landscape Features

Appropriate: Retaining historic relationships between buildings, landscape features, and open spaces.

Not Appropriate: Introducing a new landscape feature or plant material that is visually incompatible with the site or destroys site patterns or vistas.

STAFF FINDINGS

1. This is a corner lot with the house facing West Liberty and the driveway off South Seventh. The lot is deep and stretches nearly to the driveway of the house to the south. The driveway and parking area were paved in asphalt on Saturday, August 22, 2020. The contractor was not aware that an approved HDC application was required. The homeowners, who have previously received HDC staff approvals for other work, called the city building department to inquire about permits on the Thursday prior and left a message, but they did not receive a return call on Friday. The work was reported to city staff by an Old West Side resident.
2. The extent of the paving appears to match the former extent of the gravel driveway and parking area. There are two parking spaces east of the garage that were established decades ago (they appear on aerial photos from 1993, but not 1960, the next most recent available). A plot plan showing the extent of the pavement was requested by staff and the application will be updated if it is provided.
3. The application states that the driveway, which slopes down to the street, had a problem with loose gravel washing out onto the sidewalk and street, causing a mess and a hazard for pedestrians and bikers. Photos illustrating the problem are provided in the application.

4. Staff recommends approval of the application. Concrete is a preferred material to asphalt, but it is not treated differently in the guidelines used by the HDC and is considered on a case-by-case basis. As such, the proposed work is generally compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the site's buildings and the surrounding neighborhood and meets the *Ann Arbor Historic District Guidelines* for paved areas and landscape features, and *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*, in particular standards 1, 2 and 10, and the guidelines for building site.

POSSIBLE MOTIONS: (Note that the motion supports staff findings and is only a suggestion. The Review Committee, consisting of staff and at least two Commissioners, will meet with the applicant on site and then make a recommendation at the meeting.)

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 903 W Liberty Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, for after-the-fact pavement of the driveway and parking spaces, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and meets the *Ann Arbor Historic District Guidelines* for paved areas and landscape features, and *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*, in particular standards 1, 2, and 10, and the guidelines for building site.

If the motion fails:

I move that the Commission finds that the paving does not qualify for a certificate of appropriateness, and that the property owner is ordered to restore the area to its former condition, including removing the asphalt and restoring grass or gravel to the area, within 60 days.

ATTACHMENTS: application, description of work, photos, drawings.

903 West Liberty (2018 courtesy Google Street View)







HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT SERVICES

City Hall: 301 E. Huron St. Ann Arbor, MI 48104-6120

Mailing: P.O. Box 8647, Ann Arbor, MI 48107-8647

Phone: 734.794.6265 ext. 42608

ithacher@a2gov.org

Fax: 734.994.8460

OFFICE USE ONLY	
Permit Number	HDC# 20-144
	BLDG#
DATE STAMP	

APPLICATION MUST BE FILLED OUT COMPLETELY

PROPERTY LOCATION/OWNER INFORMATION			
NAME OF PROPERTY OWNER STEVE AND ALLISON LEDUC		HISTORIC DISTRICT YES	
PROPERTY ADDRESS 903 W. LIBERTY ST		CITY ANN ARBOR	
ZIPCODE 48103	DAYTIME PHONE NUMBER (734) 330-7045	EMAIL ADDRESS STEVENLEDUC@GMAIL.COM	
PROPERTY OWNER'S ADDRESS (IF DIFFERENT FROM ABOVE)		CITY	STATE, ZIP

PROPERTY OWNER'S SIGNATURE			
SIGN HERE		PRINT NAME	DATE
		STEVE LEDUC	8/31/20

APPLICANT INFORMATION			
NAME OF APPLICANT (IF DIFFERENT FROM ABOVE)			
ADDRESS OF APPLICANT			CITY
STATE	ZIPCODE	PHONE / CELL #	FAX No
		()	()
EMAIL ADDRESS			

APPLICANT'S SIGNATURE (if different from Property Owner)			
SIGN HERE		PRINT NAME	DATE
		X	

BUILDING USE - CHECK ALL THAT APPLY				
<input type="checkbox"/> SINGLE FAMILY	<input type="checkbox"/> DUPLEX	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> RENTAL	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> MULTIPLE FAMILY	<input type="checkbox"/> COMMERCIAL
		<input type="checkbox"/> INSTITUTIONAL		

PROPOSED WORK
Describe in detail each proposed exterior alteration, improvement and/or repair (use additional paper, if necessary).
PAVE OVER EXISTING STONE DRIVEWAY. MAINTAIN SAME FOOT PRINT AND SQUARE FOOTAGE (1,430FT²). MAINTAIN EXISTING GRADES AND SLOPES. ASPHALT PAVING TO BE DONE BY ANN ARBOR ASPHALT & CONCRETE PAVING LLC.

DESCRIBE CONDITIONS THAT JUSTIFY THE PROPOSED CHANGES:
LOOSE STONE WAS NOT CONDUCTIVE TO THE NATURAL SLOPE OF THE DRIVEWAY. HEAVY RAINS LED TO EROSION OF STONE INTO SIDEWALK AND STREET. IT BECAME A HAZARD FOR BIKERS AND RUNNERS PASSING BY THE HOUSE. IT ALSO CREATED SIGNIFICANT WORK TO MAINTAIN. PICTURES ATTACHED TO EMAIL.



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION APPLICATION

FEE CHART

DESCRIPTION	
STAFF REVIEW FEES	
Application for Staff Approval	\$35.00
Work started without approvals	Additional \$50.00
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION FEES	
All other proposed work not listed below	\$100.00
Work started without approvals	Additional \$250.00
RESIDENTIAL – Single and 2-story Structure	
Addition: single story	\$300.00
Addition: taller than single story	\$550.00
New Structure - Accessory	\$100.00
New Structure – Principal	\$850.00
Replacement of single and 2-family window(s)	\$100 + \$25/window
COMMERCIAL – includes multi-family (3 or more unit) structures	
Additions	\$700.00
Replacement of multi-family and commercial window (s)	\$100 + \$50/window
Replacement of commercial storefront	\$250.00
DEMOLITION and RELOCATION	
Demolition of a contributing structure	\$1000.0
Demolition of a non-contributing structure	\$250.00
Relocation of a contributing structure	\$750.00
Relocation of a non-contributing structure	\$250.00

FOR COMMISSION REVIEWS:

- > Application withdrawals made before public notice is published will qualify for a 50% refund of the application fee.
- > Application withdrawals made after public notice is sent but before the public hearing will qualify for a 25% refund of the application fee.

\$100.00

INSTRUCTIONS FOR SUBMITTING APPLICATIONS

All HDC applications must be signed by the property owner and the applicant, if different, with the exception of staff approvals, which may be signed by only the applicant.

All completed HDC applications and their attachments may be submitted to Planning and Development Services by mail, in person (paper or digital), faxed, or via email to building@a2gov.org.

We accept CASH, CHECK, and all major credit cards. Checks should be made payable to "City of Ann Arbor"

HDC applications that are incomplete or not submitted with the required documentation or payment will not be processed or approved.

APPLICATION EXPIRATION

HDC applications expire three (3) years after the date of approval.

OFFICE USE ONLY

Date of Hearing:	October 8, 2020	
Action	<input type="checkbox"/> HDC COA	<input type="checkbox"/> HDC Denial
	<input type="checkbox"/> HDC NTP	<input type="checkbox"/> Staff COA
Staff Signature		
Comments		
Fee:	\$ _____	
Payment Type	<input type="checkbox"/> Check: # _____ <input type="checkbox"/> Cash <input type="checkbox"/> Credit Card	



