



# City of Ann Arbor

301 E. Huron St.  
Ann Arbor, MI 48104  
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

## Meeting Minutes Planning Commission, City

---

Tuesday, March 4, 2014

7:00 PM

City Hall, 301 E. Huron Street, 2nd Flr.

---

Commission public meetings are held the first and third Tuesday of each month. Both of these meetings provide opportunities for the public to address the Commission. Persons with disabilities are encouraged to participate. All persons are encouraged to participate in public meetings. Citizens requiring translation or sign language services or other reasonable accommodations may contact the City Clerk's office at 734.794.6140; via e-mail to: [cityclerk@a2gov.org](mailto:cityclerk@a2gov.org); or by written request addressed and mailed or delivered to: City Clerk's Office, 301 E. Huron St., Ann Arbor, MI 48104. Requests need to be received at least two (2) business in advance of the meeting. Planning Commission meeting agendas and packets are available from the Legislative Information Center on the City Clerk's page of the City's website (<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>) or on the 1st floor of City Hall on the Friday before the meeting. Agendas and packets are also sent to subscribers of the City's email notification service, GovDelivery. You can subscribe to this free service by accessing the City's website and clicking on the red envelope on the home page.

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Channel 16 live at 7:00 p.m. on the first and third Tuesdays of the month and replayed the following Wednesdays at 10:00 AM and Sundays at 2:00 PM. Recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website ([www.a2gov.org](http://www.a2gov.org)).

### 1 CALL TO ORDER

*Chair Westphal called the meeting to order at 7:15 p.m.*

### 2 ROLL CALL

*Jeff Kahan called the roll.*

**Present** 6 - Bona, Westphal, Giannola, Clein, Briere, and Parekh

**Absent** 3 - Woods, Adenekan, and Peters

### 3 INTRODUCTIONS

### 4 APPROVAL OF AGENDA

**Moved by Bona, seconded by Clein, that the agenda be approved as amended; to switch the order of Items 10-a and 10-b. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.**

### 5 MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING

5-a [14-0355](#) City Planning Commission Meeting Minutes of December 17, 2013

**Moved by Bona, seconded by Parekh, that the minutes be approved by the Commission and forwarded to the City Council. On a voice vote, the Chair**

declared the motion carried.

**6      REPORTS FROM CITY ADMINISTRATION, CITY COUNCIL, PLANNING MANAGER,  
PLANNING COMMISSION OFFICERS AND COMMITTEES, WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS  
AND PETITIONS**

**6-a      City Council**

*Commissioner Briere reported that at their meeting last night, the City Council had not taken any actions that affected the Planning Commission.*

**6-b      Planning Manager**

*Kahan gave a brief update on the revised March meeting calendar.*

**6-c      Planning Commission Officers and Committees**

*Commissioner Bona gave a report on the Ordinance Revisions Committee [ORC], noting that they had met prior to the Planning Commission meeting. She said they continue to work on the Downtown Rezoning project which should come before the Planning Commission soon, adding that they have been focusing their efforts on the 425 South Main Street parcel. Additionally, they have also been working on a drive-thru ordinance which was drafted in 2007.*

*Clein reported on the partnerships of the Downtown Development Authority [DDA] mentioning their kick-off of the Street Framework planning which will look at the downtown needs of both private and public sector uses.*

*Westphal reported that there was a meeting of the Chairs of the Parks Advisory Commission, Environmental Commission, Energy Commission and the Planning Commission where they were able to catch up on various ongoing initiatives and review how the Sustainability Plan interacts with these.*

**6-d      Written Communications and Petitions**

[14-0356](#)

Various Correspondences to the City Planning Commission

Received and Filed

**7      AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION (Persons may speak for three minutes about an item that is NOT listed as a public hearing on this agenda. Please state your name and address for the record.)**

*Tina Lee, Jeremiah Clark, and Rochleen, students from Skyline High School's Communications-Media Class, gave a presentation on the City's 'Walk, Wait, Drive Program'.*

**8      PUBLIC HEARINGS SCHEDULED FOR NEXT BUSINESS MEETING**

**8-a      [14-0354](#)**

Public Hearings Scheduled for the March 18, 2014 City Planning Commission Meeting

*Chair Westphal read the public hearing notice as published.*

9 **UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

10 **REGULAR BUSINESS - Staff Report, Public Hearing and Commission Discussion of Each Item**

(If an agenda item is tabled, it will most likely be rescheduled to a future date. If you would like to be notified when a tabled agenda item will appear on a future agenda, please provide your email address on the form provided on the front table at the meeting. You may also call Planning and Development Services at 734-794-6265 during office hours to obtain additional information about the review schedule or visit the Planning page on the City's website (www.a2gov.org).)

(Public Hearings: Individuals may speak for three minutes. The first person who is the official representative of an organized group or who is representing the petitioner may speak for five minutes; additional representatives may speak for three minutes. Please state your name and address for the record.)

(Comments about a proposed project are most constructive when they relate to: (1) City Code requirements and land use regulations, (2) consistency with the City Master Plan, or (3) additional information about the area around the petitioner's property and the extent to which a proposed project may positively or negatively affect the area.)

10-b [14-0353](#) Resolution Recommending Staff Resourcing for Community Energy Efficiency

*Jeff Kahan presented the staff report.*

**PUBLIC HEARING:**

*Wayne Appleyard, Chair of the Ann Arbor Energy Commission, spoke of the need for an added staff person in the City Energy Office in order to work towards the goals of Ann Arbor's Climate Action Plan. He explained that up until 2012 the department had two staff members, but had been operating short-staffed with one staff person after the other staff person left the City.*

**Moved by Bona, seconded by Briere that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission supports the Energy Commission and Environmental Commission's efforts to identify resourcing for the City's community energy efficiency initiatives and hereby approves the following resolution:**

**Resolution Recommending Staff Resourcing for Community Energy Efficiency**

**Whereas, The City of Ann Arbor has a longstanding commitment to energy conservation and efficiency, dating back to 1981 planning;**

**Whereas, The City of Ann Arbor recognizes the serious threat that climate change poses to the local environment, to our economy, and to our residents' long-term security, livelihoods, and quality of life;**

**Whereas, on December 17, 2012, The Ann Arbor City Council adopted the Ann Arbor Climate Action Plan (Resolution R-12-572) which identifies steps to reduce greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions to meet current short-term goals, and to set mid- and long-range targets for emissions reductions into the future;**

**Whereas, although the City of Ann Arbor has facilitated a number and type of non- motorized transportation options including bicycling and walking, more**

remains to be done to lower consumption of petroleum in our transportation sector and associated emissions;

Whereas, achieving the Climate Action Plan's adopted targets clearly requires active participation from businesses and residents;

Whereas, the estimated \$250,000,000 our community spends per year on natural gas and electricity generated from primarily out-of-state carbon sources, leaves our local economy and produces GHG emissions;

Whereas, investing in energy efficiency in buildings has a direct economic benefit in the manufacturing and research and development sectors, and on the creation of service and installation jobs; indirect benefits that come from utility savings (energy audits in the Ann Arbor area demonstrate that 10 to 30 percent savings are achievable within a ten year ROI) produce a multiplier effect that increases investment in local goods and services;

Whereas, in 2011, Ann Arbor introduced a PACE program to help our community reach targets to reduce energy used by buildings and GHG emissions while stimulating economic development, improving property values and creating jobs. The first PACE bond was a \$540,000 direct investment in the local economy, purchased by a local bank, and helped four local businesses make energy improvements that will save \$50,000 and 325 metric tons of GHG emissions per year for a period that exceeds the ten-year assessment;

Whereas, more than 50% of Ann Arbor's housing units are rental properties whose residents, on average, have lower incomes than Ann Arbor's property owners. Energy efficiency improvements on these properties not only lower GHG emissions, but they counter the broadly regressive nature of energy costs that force low-income residents to pay a much larger proportion of their income on energy, while also providing more comfortable and affordable housing;

Whereas, the City of Ann Arbor has a real opportunity to provide a service to its residents and businesses to increase energy efficiency and reap associated benefits,

including better air quality, community health, economic stimulus and improved quality of life while helping our city reach the adopted GHG emission reduction targets to which it has committed;

Whereas, City staff currently lacks the resources to properly and meaningfully expand PACE or to launch or oversee other energy efficiency and conservation programs that provide significant, wide-ranging economic and environmental benefit;

Whereas, City of Ann Arbor wishes to promote energy efficiency and conservation programs that support our local economy, reduce GHG emissions and the negative health effects associated with them, improve our property values and secure our standard of living and quality of life;

Whereas, The City Energy Office prior to February 2012 had two staff members working full-time;

**Resolved, City of Ann Arbor Planning Commission recommends that the Ann Arbor City Council direct the City Administrator to restore the second position as an FTE (full time equivalent) to create and implement additional community energy efficiency, conservation, and renewable energy programs that further the Climate Action Plan's adopted targets, reduce our community GHG emissions, provide economic benefit to our community and help to preserve our quality of life.**

*COMMISSION DISCUSSION:*

*Bona asked, prior to losing staff, if much work had been done on the initiative to engage the community to reduce greenhouse gas emissions in the City.*

*Appleyard responded that they have always reached out to the community through efforts such as the Green Fair and various programs, but nothing extensively. He noted that even though they were short staffed, things got done, but only because they received grants that allowed them to hire outside personal to work on those efforts, such as the PACE program. He said the Climate Action Plan has an Appendix that needs to be completed and would be a great resource document to the community.*

*Bona asked why the second position in the department wasn't filled when Andrew Brix left the City, given that the position was not eliminated.*

*Briere said it was her belief that while the City retained the positions 'on the books' they were allowed to be vacant; with the purpose being, not to eliminate the positions, but to save funding, since quite a bit of the City's budget is employee based. She said one way the City has reduced the City government is through attrition. In the case with the Energy Office, the City was in financial straits when Brix left and by not filling the second position in that office the City could save money. She said since they budget every year for these vacant positions they can now look at the situation and see if they can fill that seat.*

*Bona said she understood that interviews had already been completed for that position.*

*Appleyard agreed, and said they had even offered the position to one of the applicants, who decided not to take the offer and a second individual also turned down the position, after which the hiring process came to a halt when they worked on redefining the two positions.*

*Bona said it sounded like the position was left vacant more so by default rather than intentionally. She asked if the private sector could step up to fill the requirements in some way or if this position is one that strictly needs to be managed through the City.*

*Appleyard said that over the years the Energy Office has brought in over \$600,000 worth of grants and so it pays for itself more often. He noted that the problem with relying on outside grants and personal is that it comes and goes and with the Climate Action Plan it requires steady personal to manage the Plan and apply for additional funding grants. He further explained that when citizens in the community save money from energy efficiencies they have more money to spend locally in the community, which benefits the City and keeps a more vibrant community. With the effects of climate change and the more we can do to hunker down, the better off we will be able to weather some of the problems that hit, so having this position filled is important for those reasons.*

*Appleyard continued that there are other individuals and organizations that are in collaboration with the City in attempts to bring about these changes as well.*

*Westphal said he was comfortable advocating for this added staffing in the Energy Commission, even while it might be unusual that the Planning Commission is supporting and advocating for another Commission, it is an action included in the Commission's by-laws. He said this position has so many points that cut across, whether it's the goals of the Climate Action Plan or the Sustainability Framework, filling this position might be one of the best ways of putting money in the citizen's pocket through promoting energy efficiency in buildings.*

*Clein said he supports the resolution, adding that in looking at the D1 and D2 zoning areas downtown and the premiums, one of which has to do with energy efficiency [and discussion of possible solar access] and having the technical staff capabilities and assisting in helping them make decisions on energy efficiency issues and how it relates to the Commission's mission (and zoning and planning) would be very helpful and benefit the community, both residents as well as developers.*

*Parekh asked about the wording in the resolution, in regards to the second full time employee [FTE] position being open and if funding was presently available.*

*Appleyard said he wasn't sure what the current status of the position was, but pointed out that the City is working on next fiscal year's budget and he is hoping that funding for this position will be included in the upcoming budget so they could fill the position after July 1, 2014.*

*Giannola asked if supporting the resolution would interfere with the Planning Commission bylaws by intruding into the management of the service unit.*

*Westphal said that he didn't believe so, since the position is not a part of the Planning Division, but under another service unit of the City.*

*Bona asked if the resolution on the floor required 5 or 6 affirmative votes to pass.*

*Kahan said he believed it was 6 affirmative votes.*

*Bona reiterated the need for urgency for this request noting that these efforts take time to build momentum and felt it is not only energy inefficiency but financial inefficiency not to keep the current programs running. She said given the necessary votes to pass the resolution, which she supported, she would like to know how other Commissioners felt before they took a vote.*

*Parekh said he agreed with Bona.*

*Briere said she would really like this message to get to the City Administrator, since she felt the resolution needed to start there.*

**On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried.**

**Yeas:** 6 - Bonnie Bona, Kirk Westphal, Diane Giannola, Kenneth Clein, Sabra Briere, and Paras Parekh

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 3 - Wendy Woods, Eleanore Adenekan, and Jeremy Peters

**10-a**    [14-0352](#)

Concordia University Gymnasium Addition Site Plan and Special Exception Use - A proposal to construct additions to an existing gymnasium and reconfigure nearby parking lots and storm water management features on this 80.63 acres site located at 4090 Geddes Road. Special Exception Use approval from the Planning Commission is required for a private university use in a single-family residential district. A Planned Project is requested to address the height of the proposed addition of 38 feet (30 feet maximum allowed). Ward 2. Staff Recommendation: Approval

*Kahan presented the staff report.*

**PUBLIC HEARING:**

*Curt Gielow, 1615 Lincoln Avenue, Ann Arbor, CEO of Concordia University, presented their proposed project and was available to answer enquiries from the Commission.*

*Cliff Mayer, Mayer, Helminiak Architects, LLC, 10521 N. Port Washington Rd, Suite 220, Mequon, WI. 53092, explained the proposed plans and was available to respond to questions and comments.*

**Moved by Giannola, seconded by Bona, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission, after hearing all interested persons and reviewing all relevant information, finds the petition to substantially meet the standards in Chapter 55 (Zoning Ordinance), Section 5:104 (Special Exceptions), and therefore, approves the Concordia University Special Exception Use for expansion of an athletic facility as part of a private college use.**

**COMMISSION DISCUSSION:**

*Briere, referencing the staff report, commented that staff should consider adjusting sections of the comparison chart on page 3, before the item moved on to City Council, specifically the references to height.*

*Briere invited the petitioner to present his additional comments, after which she enquired how they plan to deal with the additional student growth on their campus as well as additional traffic.*

*Gielow responded that they still have some available dormitory space and as they proceed in their planning for future growth and sustainability of the campus they most certainly will be returning before the Commission with future requests; however, are unaware of details at this current time.*

*Bona said she was very supportive of the proposed projects, adding that she believed the City was interested in their overall master plan and in getting them feedback on their plans. She said she felt it was important to look at how their project integrates, not only with the neighborhood, but with the City, and that the University is an important part of the community and the City.*

*Bona asked how the petitioner sees themselves bringing the University to 'sustainable levels'.*

*Gielow responded, when they make money instead of losing money, and that this year they will be losing \$3 million. He said the University won't sustain continuously losing \$3 million. He said for him the emphasis is to grow the student body and*

programming, new courses and new methods of courses, pointing out their outreach centers in Dearborn and Frankenmuth, and continued adult education courses as well as collaboration with nearby colleges.

Bona asked about the proposed parking for the gymnasium.

Mayer explained that there will not be more parking adding, only the existing parking area will be paved to meet the City's code, noting that there is currently more parking available than what is required by the code.

Bona asked about possible collaboration with the Ann Arbor Transportation Authority to assist with the need to store cars on campus.

Gielow explained that they are currently in discussion with 'The Ride' to be able to have them make a loop onto campus in order to assist with passenger pick-up and drop-off and getting people off the street. He noted that since there are no businesses in the area, students living on campus are forced to use the transportation system to get them around.

Bona commented that it might be a good location for a 'Zip Car'.

Gielow added that in 2006 and 2007 the University had 1,100 students, which has since dwindled to 740 students and they need to get back to that number again.

Bona stated that the benefits to the community, relative to the extra height request, is a significant asset which she supports.

Clein asked staff if the City would rather have the University rezone their site for future development rather than have them return before the Commission requesting Special Exception Use.

Kahan explained that the City handles all private colleges in this manner, through Special Exception Uses, when they are located in single-family and office zoning districts. He stated that staff believes the parcel is zoned appropriately for this type of use and is reasonable, given the size of their site.

Westphal agreed, adding that he believed the request meets all the City's standards and was in favor of the request.

**On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried.**

**Yeas:** 6 - Bonnie Bona, Kirk Westphal, Diane Giannola, Kenneth Clein, Sabra Briere, and Paras Parekh

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 3 - Wendy Woods, Eleanore Adenekan, and Jeremy Peters

**Moved by Briere, seconded by Giannola, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the Concordia University Planned Project Site Plan for the expansion of the existing gymnasium with a maximum height of 39 feet, subject to the following conditions:**

**1. Field verification of water mains and sanitary sewer locations prior to City Council approval;**



**2. Determination of which easements will be conveyed to the City to the satisfaction of the Public Services Area Administrator prior to City Council approval; and**

**3. Providing utility easements for water mains and sanitary sewers prior to the issuance of building permits.**

*COMMISSION DISCUSSION:*

*Clein asked about the wording of the motion, if the stated 'maximum height of 39 feet' would be understood to be defined as the midpoint to the peak of the roof.*

*Kahan said yes.*

*Clein asked if the proposed roofing material would be shingles.*

*Mayer said, yes, they are currently looking at a steel shingle with granules on it and that will compliment the existing shingles on the university buildings.*

*Clein asked if they had considered steel roofing, since the City's Sustainability Framework would approve of that.*

*Mayer said they would love to be able to afford a metal roof, but given the vast amount of square footage of buildings on campus, they needed to look at materials that were economically obtainable and sustainable. He asked if the City offered any funding if they were to chose a metal roof.*

*Clein asked where the mechanical equipment was being stored.*

*Mayer said all mechanical equipment would be hidden in lower levels and any rooftop mechanicals would be hidden with screening.*

*Clein asked if they are using any benchmarking on their energy efficiency.*

*Mayer responded that they typically use all the LEED standards and apply those standards but don't go through the pricey LEED certification process, given that cost at \$1,000 per point.*

*Clein asked if they could give an estimate of what level they would achieve, noting that one of the community's standards is energy efficiency.*

*Mayer said realistically, they would reach the SILVER level and in all Concordia's building projects across the country they prioritize energy efficiency.*

*Westphal asked if they plan on using any solar panels on the proposed gymnasium.*

*Mayer reviewed the proposed gymnasium building with the Commission, noting that they would use natural light in the auxiliary gym and several other energy efficiency measures.*

*Westphal asked staff about the storm water impact of paving the current gravel surface site.*

*Kahan responded that staff believes the impact would be about the same as the current run-off, given the heavily compacted surface of the existing gravel lot. He said currently with heavy rains they would get run-off that contains contaminants as well as mud, and staff believes that constructing a new parking facility that includes bio*

*swales and detention is a positive for that site.*

*Westphal said he believes the outlined benefits of the Planned Project meets the City's standards.*

**On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried.**

**Yeas:** 6 - Bonnie Bona, Kirk Westphal, Diane Giannola, Kenneth Clein, Sabra Briere, and Paras Parekh

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 3 - Wendy Woods, Eleanore Adenekan, and Jeremy Peters

**11 AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION (Persons may speak for three minutes on any item.)**

**12 COMMISSION PROPOSED BUSINESS**

*Giannola explained that at the next Commission meeting, Bona and she would be bringing a resolution regarding future development on the Library Lot, similar to what the Commission did on the City's former Y Lot.*

*Briere said she looked forward to reading the resolution but was concerned with the timing, given that the Library Lot was scheduled to go before Council on the 17th of March and the next Planning Commission meeting was on the 18th.*

*Giannola said she believed the resolution would go to Council after they discussed the matter at Council but still in time before anything was finalized.*

*Westphal noted that there could be future discussion on the Edward's Brothers Property and what the community envisions for that corridor.*

**13 ADJOURNMENT**

**A motion was made by Clein, seconded by Parekh, that the meeting be Adjourned at 8:45 p.m. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.**

Kirk Westphal, Chair  
mg

*Community Television Network Channel 16 live televised public meetings are also available to watch live online from CTN's website, [www.a2gov.org/ctn](http://www.a2gov.org/ctn), on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>).*

*Live Web streaming is one more way, in addition to these listed below, to stay in touch with Ann Arbor City Council and board and commission actions and deliberations.*

- *Video on Demand: Replay public meetings at your convenience online at [www.a2gov.org/government/city\\_administration/communicationsoffice/ctn/Pages/Vid eoOnDemand.aspx](http://www.a2gov.org/government/city_administration/communicationsoffice/ctn/Pages/Vid eoOnDemand.aspx)*
- *Cable: Watch CTN Channel 16 public meeting programming via Comcast Cable channel 16.*

*The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at [www.a2gov.org/ctn](http://www.a2gov.org/ctn), on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>), or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.*