



**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE REGULAR SESSION OF THE
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF ANN ARBOR
Thursday, November 8, 2007**

Commissioners Present: Susan Wineberg, Sarah Shotwell, Michael Bruner, Jim Henrichs, Kristina Glusac, Diane Giannola and Robert White **(7)** **Commissioners Absent: (0)**

Staff Present: Jill Thacher, HDC Coordinator/Planner II, Kristine Kidorf, Kidorf Preservation Consulting and Brenda Acquaviva, Administrative Support Specialist V, Planning and Development Services **(3)**

CALL TO ORDER: Commissioner White called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

ROLL CALL: Quorum satisfied.

APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA:

Moved by Commissioner Wineberg, Seconded by Commissioner Shotwell, **“to approve the agenda as presented.”**

On a Voice Vote – MOTION TO APPROVE - *PASSED* - *UNANIMOUS*

A - HEARINGS

A-1 522 DETROIT STREET - OFWHD

BACKGROUND: This 1 ¾ story gable-front Queen Ann house features decorative banding, second-story wood fish scale shakes, a triangular sunburst pattern in the front gable, shaped window architraves on the front elevation, and a shallow hipped-roof tower on the south elevation. It first appears in the Polk Directory in 1929, though the house appears to be older. It may have been moved to the lot at that time.

LOCATION: The site is located on the east side of Detroit Street, between East Kingsley and North Division.

APPLICATION: The applicant seeks HDC approval to install a below-grade exterior stairwell of 6” by 6” treated landscape timbers with a concrete floor, a treated wood stair to the basement, a new basement door in the existing basement block wall on the east elevation of the tower, three mullied casement windows in the basement wall within the new stairwell, and a 42” tall above-ground railing to match the existing front porch railing.

STAFF FINDINGS:

1. This is a two-family home (upstairs and downstairs are separate flats). The new stairwell to the basement would allow the second-floor tenant access to the basement laundry and storage area. Currently, access is available only to the first-floor tenant through an interior stair. Exterior stairwells are found occasionally on historic homes that were built without interior basement access.

51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65
66
67
68
69
70
71
72
73
74
75
76
77
78
79
80
81
82
83
84
85
86
87
88
89
90
91
92
93
94
95
96
97
98
99
100
101
102

2. The new casement windows would match the vinyl-clad windows found on this elevation of the house.
3. Staff would prefer that the stairwell not have the above-ground railing extending back from the tower to enclose the stairwell, but the building official has confirmed that it is required by code. To make it as inconspicuous as possible, staff recommends that the railing not be located beyond the plane of the south face of the tower. Staff also urges the applicant to install landscaping to screen the stairwell area.

Owner/Applicant/Address: Dina Greenway, PO Box 2301, Ann Arbor, MI 48106

Review Committee: Commissioners Bruner and Shotwell visited the site.

Commissioner Bruner – We did preliminary measurements at the site and found the retaining wall would be too far back as the Coordinator stated. They are enlarging that existing opening for the basement window due to permitting requirements, but one window will suffice for egress, and I don't think the three windows proposed are necessary.

Commissioner Shotwell – I would be in agreement with amending the motion to accommodate the railing necessary for permitting requirements.

Applicant Presentation: Dina Greenway, owner, was present to speak on behalf of the appeal. She stated that the second floor tenant has no access to the basement for storage and laundry so this would address that problem. The replacement windows proposed would start with and include the existing window in the home. These windows would assist with additional light in the home and adds aesthetically. The door will be an Anderson glass door.

Questions of the Applicant by the Commission:

Commissioner White – Stated that he likes the proposed windows which will not be highly visible from the street.

Audience Participation: Richard Derrick, 415 High Street was present to ask questions on this appeal. He stated that his inclination was to object a bit about this, but isn't totally opposed to it. His main concern is that the look of this not disturb the general appearance of the property.

Discussion by the Commission:

MOTION #1

Moved by Commissioner Wineberg, Seconded by Commissioner Glusac “**that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the application at 522 Detroit Street in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District to install a new stairwell, aboveground railing, stair, and three mullied casement windows and a door in the well, on the south elevation behind the tower ON THE CONDITION that the stairwell and railing do not exceed the depth of the existing east tower wall (approximately four feet). The work is generally compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets *The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation* standards 2 and 9.”**

MOTION #1a - TO AMEND the PREVIOUS MOTION

Moved by Commissioner Shotwell, Seconded by Commission Bruner, “**that the Commission amend the previous motion with the condition that the statement stairwell and railing not exceed the depth of the east tower wall be stricken from the motion language.**”

Commissioner Wineberg – Stated that although the Commission has been rigorous about ‘below grade’ windows, but this is a unique situation due to the tower ‘bump out.’, which virtually keeps this space unviewable from the street.

On a Voice Vote – MOTION #1a - TO AMEND ORIGINAL MOTION - PASSED – UNANIMOUS

The Commission proceeded to vote on Motion #1 as amended:

On a Roll Call Vote – MOTION TO APPROVE MOTION #1 AS AMENDED - FAILED – UNANIMOUS (Application Denied)

Yes (3) Wineberg, White & Giannola – No (4) Shotwell, Henrichs, Bruner & Glusac

Commissioner Wineberg stated that the Commission should discuss what it is that they don’t like about the drawings or the windows before the petitioner has to return with new information so that they know what needs to be presented in the future.

The Commission discussed details that the petitioner needs to provide.

Commissioners Bruner, Wineberg and Henrichs – Take issue with the submitted drawings as to their lack of detail and plan view.

Commissioners Glusac and Shotwell had no opposition to the windows.

MOTION #2

Moved by Commissioner Glusac, Seconded by Commissioner Shotwell, “**to postpone the current application in order to allow the petitioner to provide accurate drawings to be reviewed at the December 13, 2007 Regular Session.**”

On a Voice Vote – MOTION TO TABLE – PASSED – UNANIMOUS (Postponed to 12/13).

Introduction: Commissioner White welcomed Diane Giannola to the Commission.

A-2 512 EAST HURTON STREET - OFWHD

BACKGROUND: The 1880 First Baptist Church has several additions: a two-story red brick education wing (by Colvin Robinson in 1950), a 1962 stucco and stone addition to that, a stone entrance on the south from the parking lot, and a wing on the north connecting all that to the Silas Douglass House at 502 East Huron next door (which was part of the 1993 Preservation Project of the Year). The church is a contributing structure in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District. At the August 9, 2007 HDC meeting, an application to add an exterior stair to the south elevation of the red brick education wing was approved.

155 **LOCATION:** The property is located on the south side of East Huron Street, one lot west of
156 State Street.

157
158 **APPLICATION:** The applicant seeks HDC approval to construct a pavilion near the west
159 property line next to the parking lot along East Washington Street. The proposed structure is
160 approximately 32 feet long (with roof overhangs), 10 feet deep, and 16 feet tall. It is wood frame
161 construction, with wood siding, decking, and benches, and asphalt roof shingles.

162
163 **STAFF FINDINGS:**

- 164
165 1. The proposed location is on a strip of lawn off the west end of the parking lot (accessed
166 from East Washington Street).
- 167
168 2. Two smallish trees would have to be removed to make way for the pavilion.
- 169
170 3. Though the pavilion is substantial in size, its proposed location does not negatively
171 impact the historic relationships between buildings and features on the site. The structure
172 could easily be removed in the future.

173
174 **Owner/Address:** First Baptist Church, 512 East Huron Street, A2, MI 48104

175
176 **Applicant:** H. Scott Diels, 1414 Iroquois, Ann Arbor MI 48104

177
178 **Review Committee:** Commissioner's Shotwell and Bruner visited the site.

179
180 Commissioner Shotwell – There is plenty of room to accommodate this and it is sufficiently far
181 enough away from the building that it will not detract from it. The shingles and facia will match.

182
183 Commissioner Bruner – When pacing out the location, we find it to be farther from the building
184 than proposed and are not concerned with its size.

185
186 **Applicant Presentation:** H. Scott Diehls, Architect, was present to speak on behalf of the
187 appeal. He gave a background on the church and sanctuary.

188
189 **Questions of the Applicant by the Commission:**

190
191 Commissioner Glusac – What is the relationship of the structure with the west side of the
192 property line? (Diels – It's against the property line. The zoning does not require a setback.

193
194 **Discussion by the Commission:**

195
196 **MOTION**

197
198 Moved by Commissioner Bruner, Seconded by Commissioner Wineberg, **“that the**
199 **Commission approve the application at 512 East Huron Street in the Old Fourth**
200 **Ward Historic District to build a pavilion parallel to the west property line near the**
201 **southwest corner of the site. The work is generally compatible in exterior design,**
202 **arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and to**
203 **the surrounding area and meets the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for***
204 ***Rehabilitation* standards 2, 9, and 10.**

205
206 **On a Voice Vote – MOTION PASSED – UNANIMOUS (Application Approved)**

A-3 452 THIRD STREET - OWSHD

BACKGROUND: This clapboard Colonial Revival house was built around 1900 for Mary Wagner after her husband William had died. It replaced an older but smaller house on the same site that the Wagners occupied. The new house features one of the Old West Side's exceptional field stone front porches, topped with short, round, fluted columns.

On September 13, 2007 the Historic District Commission approved a new duplex addition to the existing house. Included in that approval was the demolition of an existing shed/garage on the rear of the lot.

LOCATION: The site is located at the northwest corner of Third Street & West Jefferson Street.

APPLICATION: The applicant seeks HDC approval to construct two new two-car garages and pave the driveway.

STAFF FINDINGS:

- 1) At the September, 2007 meeting, the HDC passed a motion to approve many parts of the application for this address, on the condition that the location of the driveway and garage(s) are considered as a separate application. This condition was in keeping with staff's recommendation. The intent was to have the applicants come back with a new design for the garages. The applicants want the same design considered again, however, and since the garage/driveway portion of the application was not denied they do not have to change the application in order to bring it back.
- 2) From the September, 2007 Staff Report: "The two proposed two-car garages occupy too much of the backyard, especially the one behind the new unit. In general, this lot may be large enough to support more than single car garages, but they should be located close to the rear lot line. A single shared four-stall garage might be an option, or pushing the garage that is behind the new unit back to the rear of the lot and reducing it to one stall, and swinging the driveway around it."
- 3) Staff still feels that the proposed driveway and garage configuration fills up too much of the backyard, that it is visually incompatible (especially from West Jefferson Street), and that it destroys the historic relationship between house, backyard, and garage near the rear lot line -- the typical development pattern of the Old West Side. It is possible that two two-car garages cannot be accommodated on this lot, and that two single-car or one shared two-car garage would be the only way to maintain appropriate relationships between buildings.

Owner/Address: Tom Fitzsimmons, PO Box 3753, A2, MI 48106

Applicant: Marc Rueter, 515 Fifth Street, A2, MI 48103

Review Committee: Commissioner Bruner visited the site.

Commissioner Bruner – I discussed this proposal at the site with the applicant, and it became clear to me that the two separate garages are appropriate as it would be more like those that exist in the neighborhood. It was discussed that pushing those structures back was not appropriate as it caused too much impervious surface.

259 **Applicant Presentation:** Mr. Tom Fitzsimmons, owner, was present to speak on behalf of the
260 appeal. He stated that he respectfully disagrees with the staff report, as this lot is the largest in
261 the Old West Side. As far as placement, there are options, but we felt the proposed placement
262 was the most advantageous. He stated addresses and examples of other homes in the area
263 with similiarly placed garages.

264
265 **Questions of the Applicant by the Commission:** None.

266
267 **Public Commentary:** None.

268
269 **Discussion by the Commission:**

270
271 Commissioner's Wineberg and Henrichs – Both stated that they're not happy with the loss of
272 rear yard, etc., but as to placement, this appears to be the best plan and fits the area.

273
274 **MOTION**

275
276 Moved by Commissioner Glusac, Seconded by Commissioner Wineberg, **“that the**
277 **Commission approve the application at 452 Third Street in the Old West Side**
278 **Historic District to construct a driveway and two two-stall garages. The structures**
279 **as proposed are generally compatible with the size, scale, massing and materials**
280 **and meets the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation standards 2**
281 **and 9.”**

282
283 **On a Voice Vote – MOTION PASSED – *UNANIMOUS (Application Approved)***

284
285
286 **A-4 711 NORTH UNIVERSITY AVENUE - SSHD**

287
288 **BACKGROUND:** This two-story brick commercial vernacular building was constructed in 1905.
289 Significant architectural features are its prominent brick quoins and cornice. The original
290 occupant was Henry & Kyer, tailors. There was a staff approval in 1999 to replace the windows
291 on the upper story of the front elevation.

292
293 **LOCATION:** The site is located on the north side of North University Avenue, between State
294 Street and South Thayer. The current street-level occupant is Moe Sport Shops, and Dance
295 Theater Studio occupies the second floor.

296
297 **APPLICATION:** The applicant seeks HDC approval to replace an original 63” tall by 43” wide
298 metal 16-paned window with a double-hung Milgard vinyl replacement window. The replacement
299 window is also hinged on one side, so the entire window (upper and lower sash) swing in as a
300 casement unit to provide maximum egress clearance.

301
302 **STAFF FINDINGS:**

- 303
304 1. A City Fire Inspector visited this building and is suggesting an additional means of egress
305 from the second floor, which currently houses a dance studio. This particular window is
306 adjacent to a fire escape mounted on the rear of 709 North University next door.
307
308 2. There are several other metal windows of this style and era on this elevation of the
309 building.
310

- 311 3. Per the City Building Official, egress windows may open outward or inward.
312
313 4. Staff supports the replacement of the window for safety reasons. The vinyl double-hung
314 window chosen, however, is vastly different from the existing many-paned, metal-framed
315 windows. The rear of this building is in an enclosed courtyard off an alley and not visible
316 from any right-of-way. Nevertheless, the design of the new window should be compatible
317 with the overall design of the building. Staff expressed these concerns to the applicant.
318
319 5. In staff's opinion, this application may be corrected by installing a metal or wood window
320 with thin rails, stiles, and muntins that complement the size and pattern of the existing
321 window. It may be a double-hung/swing-in style that is mechanically similar to the one
322 proposed, or another style such as a pair of casement windows hinged on opposite sides
323 to form one large opening when both are open.
324

325 **Owner/Address:** Mike Walton & Bud Van de Weg, 711 North University Ave., A2, MI 48104
326

327 **Applicant:** George Meyer Co., 3496 Pontiac Trail, A2, MI 48105
328

329 **Review Committee:** Commissioners Bruner and Shotwell visited the site.
330

331 Commissioner Shotwell – I understand the wish to have an egress window, but not certain that
332 this is the appropriate application. If at some point the use of the building did change and the
333 egress window was required, there are other more appropriate windows that could be used as
334 opposed to those currently suggested by the applicant.
335

336 Commissioner Bruner – Concurs with Commissioner Shotwell and added that since it's not
337 currently required for egress that they should focus on repairing and painting the current one.
338

339 **Applicant Presentation:** No one was present to speak on behalf of the appeal.
340

341 **Questions to the Applicant by the Commission:** None.
342

343 **Public Commentary:** None.
344

345 **Discussion by the Commission:**
346

347 **MOTION**
348

349 Moved by Commissioner Bruner, Seconded by Commission Wineberg, **“that the**
350 **Commission deny the application at 711 North University Avenue in the State**
351 **Street Historic District to install a new egress window on the north elevation of the**
352 **building. The proposed replacement window is not compatible in exterior design,**
353 **arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the**
354 **surrounding area and does not meet *The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for***
355 ***Rehabilitation* standards 2 and 9.”**
356

357 **On a Voice Vote – MOTION TO APPROVE – *UNANIMOUS (Application Approved).***
358

359 **B - OLD BUSINESS –**
360

361 **B-1 Election of Officers**
362

363 Commissioner White – Conducted the vote for Officers. The vote was as follows:

364

365 **CHAIR** - Mike Bruner – (Yes) – Commissioners Henrichs, Shotwell and Bruner (3)

366 Bob White – (Yes) – Commissioners Wineberg, Giannola, Glusac and White (4)

367

368 Commissioner White was elected Commission Chair for the 2007-2008 term.

369

370 **C - NEW BUSINESS –**

371

372 **C-1 Resolution to Amend Staff Approvals List**

373 Coordinator Thacher stated that on February 8, 2007 the Ann Arbor Historic District Commission
374 approved minor classes of work for staff approval which was effective on April 4, 2007. The list
375 was amended on June 14, 2007.

376 Commissioner Henrichs – Asked that Item number 18 be amended to read “on-grade, in
377 between the words ‘existing’ and ‘walkways,’ in order to let the Commission continue to evaluate
378 any elevated stairways that might occur.

379

380 Commissioner Bruner – Suggested that the ‘boarding up’ specifications for mothballed buildings
381 be changed to address the need for ventilation. Inserting the phrase “Boarding used for
382 ventilation techniques allowing air flow into the building should be similarly painted a dark color.”
383 As a result of Commission discussion at the October Historic District Commission meeting, the
384 following are proposed modifications and additions to the Staff Approvals List.

385

386 **MOTION**

387

388 Moved by Commissioner Shotwell, Seconded by Commissioner Bruner, “**to amend the revised
389 staff approvals list as submitted by Coordinator Thacher and amended by the
390 Commission to allow the Planning and Development Services Manager or their designee
391 to approve these items at the staff level.**”

392

393 **On a Voice Vote – MOTION ON AMENDED RESOLUTION - PASSED - UNANIMOUS**

394

395 **C-2 Broadway Study Committee Preliminary Reports**

396

397 Commissioner White – Stated that the Committee’s preliminary recommendation is that two
398 separate districts be adopted:

399

- 400 1. The Broadway Historic District, which encompasses the residential portion of Broadway
401 and includes Jones, Traver, Moore and Cedarbend.
- 402 2. A Commercial District, 1001 to 1013 Broadway – the Exchange Block and Kellogg
403 Building which is two buildings that are connected.

404

405 The Commission invited The Broadway Study Committee Co-Chair Tom Stulberg to elaborate
406 on the Committees findings.

407

408 Mr. Tom Stulberg was present and stated that he is one of the co-chairs of the study committee
409 and that the committee is pleased to present this report to the HDC. There will be a public
410 hearing on the proposed districts on Wednesday, November 14th, 2007 at 7:00 p.m. here in
411 Council Chambers. He invited the Commission and the public at large to attend the public
412 hearing.

Discussion

Commissioner Bruner – The owner of the commercial properties made it known at the public discussion that took place at Northside school that he is not in favor of having his buildings in a district alone. My concern is that this being singled out and without the support of the person that owns it that City Council will not favor the creation of that district. If that happens, the single oldest commercial building in Ann Arbor would not be protected. The owner is unclear about the advantages of being in a district and has the usual questions regarding ‘control’ over his property. We did assure him that maintenance of his property and most related issues are approvable by city staff and not an HDC issue.

Commissioner Wineberg – Stated that the public should know that this discussion is in regard to the Anson Brown Building. This is the first building on your left as you come over the Broadway bridge.

MOTION #1

Moved by Commissioner Bruner, Seconded by Commissioner Shotwell, **“to accept the preliminary report and its findings (to propose the creation of two separate historic districts) to City Council for review and approval.”**

On a Voice Vote – MOTION PASSED – Yes (6) – Commissioners Henrichs, Glusac, White, Giannola, Wineberg and Shotwell; No (1) – Commissioner Bruner

MOTION #2

Moved by Commissioner Wineberg, Seconded by Commissioner Shotwell, **“that the Commission write a letter to the Broadway District Study Committee, and enthusiastically accepting the report and the creation of the two historic districts.”**

On a Voice Vote – MOTION PASSED – UNANIMOUS

D - APPROVAL OF MINUTES –**D-1 Draft Minutes of the October 11, 2007 Regular Session –**

Corrections: Line #358 to 370 (Refers to old business – needs to be stricken) Line #627 Bob White (not spelled correctly) Line #692 (Change to Jones, Traver, Moore and Cedarbend).

MOTION

Moved by Commissioner Bruner Seconded by Commissioner Glusac, **“that the Minutes of the October 11, 2007 Regular Sessions be accepted as amended.”**

On a Voice Vote – MOTION TO APPROVED - PASSED - UNANIMOUS

E - REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS – None.

465
466
467
468
469
470
471
472
473
474
475
476
477
478
479
480
481
482
483
484
485
486
487
488
489
490
491
492
493
494
495
496
497
498
499
500
501
502
503
504

F - ASSIGNMENTS –

522 Detroit Street – (POSTPONED)

512 East Huron Street - Commissioner Glusac

452 Third Street - Commissioner Bruner

Commissioner Wineberg – Thanked staff for providing an inspection report form. She suggested that staff also send the determination form for each appeal so that the Commissioners could be reminded of what has been approved.

Coordinator Thatcher – Stated that beginning with the December meeting, she would provide the reporting forms with the determinations for each attached and can be returned to her at the meetings and/or mailed to her.

Review Committee – For the December 13, 2007 Regular Session – Commissioner’s Shotwell and Bruner will meet Coordinator J. Thacher on Monday, December 10, 2007, at 12:00 p.m.

G – CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS – None.

H - STAFF ACTIVITIES REPORT

I-1 Staff Activities Report for October – There were seventeen applications: eleven were approved by staff, six 1/2 by the HDC. Ninety seven percent of those were approved. We’ve added the HDC Monitor lists to this to help us keep track.

Commissioner Glusac asked if the location maps for each appeal could once again be provided. Coordinator Thacher stated she would provide those.

J - COMMUNICATIONS –

K. Kidorf – Passed out proposed amended by-laws and new standing rules for the HDC for consideration at next month’s meeting. These were changed last April at the yearly retreat.

Moved by Commissioner White **“to adjourn the meeting.”** *The Meeting was adjourned at 9:00 p.m. without objection.*

SUBMITTED BY: Brenda Acquaviva, Administrative Service Specialist V, Planning and Development Services.