



City of Ann Arbor
Formal Minutes
Park Advisory Commission

301 E. Huron St.
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Tuesday, January 29, 2019

4:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second Floor, City Council chambers

Rescheduled from January 22, 2019

A CALL TO ORDER

Chair D. Santacroce called the meeting to order at 4:11 p.m.

B ROLL CALL

City of Ann Arbor Parks and Recreation Services Manager, Colin Smith called the roll.

Present: 8 - Robert Galardi, David Santacroce, Paige Morrison, Stephen Borgsdorf, Julie Grand, Mike Appel, Rachel Skylis, and Jeff Hayner

Absent: 3 - Praveena Ramaswami, Lauren London, and Ruth L. Kraut

C APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Unanimously approved as amended to move " Resolution to Recommend approval of a contract with DLZ Michigan, Inc. to provide professional design engineering services for the rehabilitation of bridges in Barton Nature Area, Bandemer Park, Mitchell Field, and Gallup Park (\$50,032.56)." to item G-2.

D APPROVAL OF MINUTES

D-1 [19-0177](#) Minutes of the December 18, 2018 Parks Advisory Commission

Attachments: 12-18-2018 PAC Minutes .pdf

Moved by Morrison, seconded by Skylis, approved by the Commission and forwarded to the City Council.

E PUBLIC COMMENTARY - (3 Minutes per Speaker)

Rita Mitchell, 621 Fifth Street, Ann Arbor, expressed satisfaction that the

Parks Advisory Commission is moving forward with the Center of the City discussion as well as the proposal to limit the use of disposable plastics in the Parks and Recreation facilities.

F SPECIAL PRESENTATIONS

None.

G NEW BUSINESS

- G-1** [19-0178](#) Discussion regarding “The Center of the City” and establishing a fee for use

Attachments: councilrescentercity_propA.pdf, Plymouth.pdf, Brighton.pdf, Dexter.pdf, F1.pdf, F2.pdf, 5713 market shed A permit.pdf, 5715 market park space permit.pdf, 5716 liberty plaza permit.pdf

C. Smith explained that at the previous Parks Advisory Commission (PAC) meeting there were questions regarding the Downtown Development Authority's (DDA) relationship to the “Center of the City” space as well as questions regarding renting park facilities. Smith stated that Jessica Black with the Ann Arbor Parks and Recreation Department and Susan Pollay with the DDA are at the meeting to provide more information.

Commissioner P. Morrison asked for clarification on the relationship between the City of Ann Arbor and the DDA.

S. Pollay answered that the DDA has managed different parking related projects for the City of Ann Arbor since 1992. She further explained that the current contract with the DDA extends through 2032, and that the discussed parcel is under contract for the DDA to maintain.

Chair D. Santacroce asked for clarification on whether or not the DDA is responsible for the surface lot above the underground parking lot.

S. Pollay answered that yes, the direction from City Council was to design an underground garage that could hold weight, and that currently the surface lot on top of the underground parking lot is used as a parking lot.

D. Santacroce inquired about the authority of the Parks and Recreation department to rent the parking lot as it is currently under lease with the DDA.

S. Pollay answered that different surface lots throughout the City of Ann Arbor have been used for various special events. She answered that the lot rental amount is the meter bag cost, and the surface lot on the discussed parcel is \$875 per day, and that the DDA has a policy to waive fees for nonprofit organizations who bring value to downtown.

Councilmember Jeff Hayner inquired about whether or not Neutral Zone's Live on Washington event is considered an event where the fee is waived.

S. Pollay answered yes, and that street closure fees are also waved for that event. She added that the lot is so near to the Library which she stated is a significant asset downtown, and that library lane was designed to accommodate people coming and going to the library. Pollay also added that the Library is always consulted before releasing the lot.

S. Pollay emphasized that the DDA understands the vote of the community in November and the roll of the resolution set forth by City Council, and that the DDA make a best attempt to balance all the demands, and to move forward with continuing to rent the Library Lot while keeping Library Lane open as much as possible.

C. Smith explained that City Council is specifically asking for PAC to determine a fee for the use of the lot.

D. Santacroce discussed the issue of setting a fee for a space that the Parks and Recreation Department does not have authority to rent at this time.

C. Smith responded that the PAC can write into their resolution that an established fee that would take place when or if the City of Ann Arbor Parks becomes the authority on renting the parcel, and give examples on how similar space is rented.

R. Skylis inquired about where the revenue generated from renting the lot goes.

Pollay answered that the revenue generated is returned into operations of the DDA.

J. Hayner explained that the topic was referred to PAC because of Chapter 39 and constituent interest.

Jessica Black, City of Ann Arbor Parks and Recreation Department, explained that she and Pollay have worked to provide a more comprehensive and clear application for special events. She further explained that for profit companies are not common renters of park spaces. She expressed that due to the lot being a flat space with few amenities, she is unsure about how popular it would be.

D. Santacroce inquired about how members of the community find out about renting DDA spaces.

S. Pollay answered that the process starts with the application for the event, which prompts staff to find out more about the project to match the applicant with an appropriate location.

J. Hayner explained that amenities listed for the parcel would be square footage.

S. Pollay answered that all information regarding what is needed to hold an event at the site would be provided to the applicant.

C. Smith referenced the attachments to this item, pointing out the City of Ann Arbor's application examples as well as examples of applications for special events for other communities.

D. Santacroce expressed appreciation for the information being provided regarding this topic, and suggested tabling the issue.

Councilmember Julie Grant suggested that a memo be drafted and sent to City Council with the information about renting the space.

Moved by Galardi, seconded by Appel, to table "Discussion regarding "The Center of the City" and establishing a fee for use" to a future meeting.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

R. Galardi explained that drafting a memo and providing the information to City Council would be prudent.

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion passed.

Yeas: 6 - Galardi, Santacroce, Morrison, Borgsdorf, Appel, and Skylis

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Ramaswami, London, and RAC Rep. Kraut

- G-2** **19-0183** Resolution to Recommend approval of a contract with DLZ Michigan, Inc. to provide professional design engineering services for the rehabilitation of bridges in Barton Nature Area, Bandemer Park, Mitchell Field, and Gallup Park (\$50,032.56).

Attachments: PAC Memo_DLZ Bridge Engineering_rev
2HHCS1.24.19.pdf, Parks Dept Letter -
Revised_Design.pdf

H. Hanzel explained that DLZ Michigan, Inc. (DLZ) is currently under a standing contract with the Engineering Department, and that Parks was able to have the bridges inspected through that agreement. She explained that there is a series of repairs needed. She explained that there are repairs and work needed ranging from repairs to prevent further deterioration to full bridge replacement. She explained that DLZ would provide the needed repair document information, and that part of the work needed would be able to be completed by City employees, and that the documents also would be used for the more technical work that would go out to bid. Hanzel added that the timeline for the work is to begin in spring 2019, with repairs starting summer 2019. Hanzel further explained that using DLZ would be the most efficient option for having the work done.

J. Hayner inquired about the Gallup vehicle bridge

Hanzel explained that DLZ has recommended repairs that would help the bridge last longer in the short term, but the recommendation for long term is to spend more time learning about the bridge to propose long term solution and design of a replacement.

C. Smith explained that the contract with DLZ would result in DLZ providing detailed information on the repairs needed so that staff can make the repairs internally as well as provide plans to the City for more complex work that would need to be contracted out.

J. Hayner asked about what other bridges could require significant repair other than the Gallup vehicle bridge.

Mike Nearing, City of Ann Arbor Engineering Department, explained that a good example of a less obvious necessary repair is the Mitchell Park Bridge, he explained that that some of the stringers have completely rusted out and are no longer functional. He described the process for

replacing the stringers, stating that a small crane is likely needed, and that the work needed is likely beyond what City staff is able to provide.

J. Hayner inquired about the cost of the repairs and if this topic is part of the Parks and Recreation Open Space (PROS) Plan.

C. Smith answered that the estimated cost for the total work done on would be approximately \$250,000 which would come back to the PAC for approval under a construction bid contract for approval. Smith confirmed that maintaining the safety of existing infrastructure is part of the PROS plan.

Moved by Morrison, seconded by Skylis, to approve the resolution as presented.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

None.

RESOLUTION READS AS FOLLOWS:

RESOLUTION TO RECOMMEND APPROVAL OF A CONTRACT WITH DLZ MICHIGAN, INC. TO PROVIDE PROFESSIONAL DESIGN ENGINEERING SERVICES FOR THE REHABILITATION OF BRIDGES IN BARTON NATURE AREA, BANDEMER PARK, MITCHELL FIELD, AND GALLUP PARK (\$50,032.56).

Whereas, the PROS plan identifies bridge repair as an on-going need and one of the major categories of capital project improvements;

Whereas, recent bridge condition assessments have concluded that the bridge structures in Barton Nature Area, Bandemer Park, Mitchell Field, and Gallup Park are all in need of repair;

Whereas, some of the identified repairs can be completed by Parks Staff to save costs, while more technical work will need to be performed by a licensed contractor working from design drawings;

Whereas, these bridge repairs need to be performed soon in order to maintain their current use and prevent further deterioration and more costly repairs;

Whereas, the project supports the City sustainability goals of promoting

active living and learning and providing transportation options;

Whereas, funding for design engineering is available in the approved FY2019 Park Maintenance and Capital Improvement Millage budget

Whereas, it is not be economically feasible for another vendor to provide the engineering services as DLZ has already invested significant time familiarizing themselves with the bridges;

Whereas, a compelling urgency exists as City Engineering staff and DLZ have both recommended that repairs be completed as soon as possible in order to maintain safety and extend the lifespan of the current structures;

Whereas, the City would lose valuable time if another consultant had to familiarize themselves with the project,

Whereas, a request for proposals selection process would add considerable time to the project schedule, limiting the City’s ability to repair the bridges in a timely manner;

Whereas, Staff is recommending that DLZ, Michigan be used as a Best Source;

RESOLVED, That the Parks Advisory Commission recommend approval of a contract with DLZ, Michigan for professional design engineering services for the rehabilitation of park bridges, and approve a construction contingency of \$5,003.25 (10%) to cover potential contract change orders for a total contract amount of \$55,035.81 for the life of the project without regard to fiscal year.

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion passed.

Yeas: 6 - Galardi, Santacroce, Morrison, Borgsdorf, Appel, and Skylis

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Ramaswami, London, and RAC Rep. Kraut

G-3 [19-0179](#) Resolution to Recommend Approving an Amended Lease Agreement with the Ann Arbor Public Schools for Eberbach Cultural Arts Building

Attachments: PAC - Eberbach lease 2019CS1.24.19v2.pdf, Eberbach

agreement 2019.pdf, Eberbach Redline EXT 12-31-18.pdf

Parks and Recreation Services Deputy Manager, Josh Landefeld, explained the City of Ann Arbor and Ann Arbor Public Schools have worked together to provide programming at Eberbach Cultural Arts Building, and that since 2014, the school pays into a capital fund to make sure funds are available for repairs to the facility and that the City has charged an annual rent of \$1.00. He explained that the lease is up for a 5 year renewal.

P. Morrison inquired about outside parties renting at the site.

J. Landefeld answered that outside parties can rent the facility, but the renting process would take place through the school.

J. Hayner discussed the gutter in the back of the building as well as the sign.

J. Landefeld answered that those items are on the list of needed improvements.

C. Smith explained that the lease that was created 10 years ago is up for renewal tonight, and that it has worked very well to provide funding for an unanticipated repair.

P. Morrison inquired about how frequently the lease is up for renewal.

C. Smith answered, every five years.

Moved by Morrison, seconded by Appel, to approve the resolution as presented.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

None.

RESOLUTION READS AS FOLLOWS:

RESOLUTION TO RECOMMEND APPROVAL OF AN AMENDED FIVE YEAR LEASE AGREEMENT WITH THE ANN ARBOR PUBLIC SCHOOLS FOR EBERBACH CULTURAL ARTS BUILDING

Whereas, The Eberbach Cultural Arts building at 1220 Wells Street is a City owned park facility;

Whereas, The Ann Arbor Public Schools (AAPS) uses the Eberbach Cultural Arts building for various cultural arts programming and has a desire to continue to have exclusive use of the building for continued cultural arts programming;

Whereas, The City and AAPS have partnered together successfully over the last 5 years under the terms of the previous lease agreement;

Whereas, The City and AAPS have developed an amended and restated lease agreement that will allow the AAPS to continue to use the facility for public recreational programming while having the AAPS cover the operating, maintenance and anticipated capital expenses associated with the building and grounds during the lease period;

RESOLVED, That Parks Advisory Commission recommend approval of an amended five year lease agreement with the Ann Arbor Public Schools for Eberbach Cultural Arts Building.

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion passed.

Yeas: 6 - Galardi, Santacroce, Morrison, Borgsdorf, Appel, and Skylis

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Ramaswami, London, and RAC Rep. Kraut

G-4 **19-0180** Resolution to Recommend approval of a contract with All Season Gutters to install new gutters at the Farmers Market (\$29,099.00).

Attachments: PAC Resolution FM Gutters finalV2.pdf

J. Landefeld explained that new gutters are needed at the Farmer's Market and that the invitation to bid for the work needed was sent to 193 companies, and that one bid for \$29,000 was received.

D. Santacroce inquired about the fund source.

C. Smith explained that the fund source is through millage, and that the Farmer's market is a park and receives funds for maintenance through the millage.

P. Morrison inquired about the timeline.

J. Landefeld explained that ideally work would be started in the spring.

Commissioner Mike Appel inquired about a mechanism for accountability for vendors who damage gutters, stating that he was unaware that the damages were so expensive.

J. Landefeld answered that with the installation of the new gutters, it will be easier and less expensive to make small repairs.

C. Smith explained that in the past, there have been instances where Parks and Recreation was able to claim for damages but the process is lengthy.

Moved by Galardi, seconded by Morrison, to approve the resolution as presented.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

None.

RESOLUTION READS AS FOLLOWS:

RESOLUTION TO RECOMMEND APPROVAL OF A CONTRACT WITH ALL SEASONS GUTTERS TO INSTALL NEW GUTTERS AT THE FARMERS MARKET SHED (\$29,099.00)

Whereas, Current gutters need to be replaced at the Farmers Market as they are impacting vendors and customers;

Whereas, The Parks and Recreation Open Space Plan identifies infrastructure improvements for recreation facilities that are in need of repair;

Whereas, Funding for the Farmers Market Gutter replacement is available in the approved FY2019 Park Maintenance and Capital Improvement Millage budget;

Whereas, Competitive bids were received by Purchasing on December 20, 2018;

Whereas, All Seasons Gutters submitted the lowest responsive bid;

Whereas, All Seasons Gutters is in compliance with the requirements of the City's Non-Discrimination, Prevailing Wage, and Living Wage

ordinances;

RESOLVED, That Parks Advisory Commission recommend approval of a contract with All Season Gutters for installation of new gutters at the Farmers Market, and approve a construction contingency of \$2,909.90 (10%) to cover potential contract change orders for a total contract amount of \$32,008.90 for the life of the project without regard to fiscal year.

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion passed.

Yeas: 6 - Galardi, Santacroce, Morrison, Borgsdorf, Appel, and Skylis

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Ramaswami, London, and RAC Rep. Kraut

G-5 [19-0181](#) Resolution to Recommend amending a Lease with Huron River Holdings, Inc. for Use of a Parking Lot at 416 Longshore Drive (\$11,750.00)

Attachments: DRAWING-416 Long Shore Dr Parking Map.pdf, PAC - HRH Lease 2019v2.pdf, Argo lease _ Huron River Holdins 2019.pdf

J. Landefeld explained that since 2012 the parking lots have been rented to use as overflow parking for Argolivery users. He explained that it has been helpful to meet the demand of users by providing a location other than street parking. He explained that through negotiations the agreement is proposed to increase in price by \$250.00 each year.

D. Santacroce explained that based on the feedback from the community, additional parking is very needed in the area.

Moved by Galardi, seconded by Morrison, to approve the Resolution as presented.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

None.

RESOLUTION READS AS FOLLOWS:

Resolution to recommend amending a Lease with Huron River Holdings, Inc. for Use of a Parking Lot at 416 Longshore Drive (\$11,750.00)

Whereas, Argo Canoe Livery and Argo Cascades are used heavily due to the popularity of water recreation,

Whereas, The parking lot at 416 Longshore Drive provides up to 58 parking spots in close proximity to the Argo Livery;

Whereas, Demand for parking at the canoe livery is 7 days a week between April and October when the Livery is open;

Whereas, This parking lot has been used since the 2012 season and has assisted in helping meet parking demand;

Whereas, It is anticipated that increased revenue from users fees will help offset the cost of leasing the parking lot for the livery season; and

Whereas, Funding is available in the approved FY2019 Parks & Recreation Services General Fund operating budget;

RESOLVED, That Parks Advisory Commission recommend approval of amending a lease with Huron River Holdings, Inc. in the amount of \$11,750.00 for use of parking lot at 416 Longshore Drive for additional Argo Canoe Livery parking with an option to administratively renew for 3 successive 1-year periods.

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion passed.

Yeas: 6 - Galardi, Santacroce, Morrison, Borgsdorf, Appel, and Skylis

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Ramaswami, London, and RAC Rep. Kraut

G-6 [19-0182](#) Resolution to Recommend Approving the Purchase of Golf Course Maintenance Equipment from Spartan Distributors (NIPA - \$129,325.57)

Attachments: PAC - GOLF EQUIPMENT2019 (SpooonerCS).pdf

C. Smith explained that this is the last year of a three year plan to replace golf course equipment and move into the fleet fund. He explained that the needs have come in below what was budgeted. He explained that the cost of the hybrid equipment is more expensive than the standard, but meets the goals of the Green Fleets Policy.

M. Appel commented that the Green Fleets Policy has been implemented resulting in three electric cars available for City use as well as charging stations for them.

The Commission further discussed efforts for sustainable options for Parks fleet items.

M. Appel commented that the Green Fleets Policy has been implemented resulting in three electric cars available for City use as well as charging stations for them.

The Commission further discussed efforts for sustainable options for Parks fleet items.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

None.

RESOLUTION READS AS FOLLOWS:

Resolution to Recommend Approval of the Purchase of Golf Course Maintenance Equipment from Spartan Distributors (NIPA – \$129,325.57)

Whereas, The Fleet & Facilities Unit needs to purchase replacement golf course maintenance equipment for the City's fleet;

Whereas, Spartan Distributors, Sparta, MI, was the lowest responsive bidder to the National IPA Cooperative Purchasing Program (contract #2017025);

Whereas, Spartan Distributors complies with the requirements of the City's conflict of interest and non-discrimination ordinances;

RESOLVED, That the Park Advisory Commission recommend the three pieces of golf course maintenance equipment being replaced be traded in or sold at the next City vehicle auction held after the equipment is removed from service; and

RESOLVED, That the Park Advisory Commission recommend approval of the issuance of a purchase order to Spartan Distributors for the purchase of three pieces of golf course maintenance equipment for a total amount of \$129,325.57 and the future budgeting of annual

replacement costs of approximately \$18,040.92 in the Parks & Recreation General Fund operating budget to fund future replacements.

Moved by Morrison, seconded by Appel, to approve the resolution as presented.

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion passed.

Yeas: 6 - Galardi, Santacroce, Morrison, Borgsdorf, Appel, and Skylis

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Ramaswami, London, and RAC Rep. Kraut

G-7 [19-0184](#) Resolution to Recommend restricting the purchase of plastic straws and stir sticks at City of Ann Arbor Park Facilities

Attachments: RESOLUTION RESTRICTING THE PURCHASE OF RES PLASTIC STIR STICKS AND PLASTIC STRAWS.pdf

C. Smith explained that this Resolution is a small step towards a larger effort for sustainability. He explained further that although there is not a large amount of business done through concessions, he is hopeful that the resolution can contribute to awareness of the issue. He explained that he anticipates working with the Office of Sustainability to determine more areas where more sustainable choices could be made.

R. Galardi inquired about signage and public awareness for no longer having plastic straws or stir sticks available.

J. Hayner expressed support for the resolution, and discussed the importance of leading by example.

R. Skylis inquired about the plastic straw replacement, and discussed the needs that members of the community might have, such as mobility issues.

C. Smith answered that the resolution doesn't prohibit people from bringing their own plastic straws and stir sticks to a park site.

Moved by Morrison, seconded by Skylis to approved the resolution as presented.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission discussed other initiatives and the timing of implementing initiatives.

RESOLUTION READS AS FOLLOWS:

RESOLUTION RESTRICTING THE PURCHASE OF PLASTIC STIR STICKS AND PLASTIC STRAWS BY ANN ARBOR PARKS AND RECREATION

WHEREAS, the City of Ann Arbor Parks and Recreation Services Unit is committed to serving as an effective and careful steward of our natural resources and environment; and

WHEREAS, the reliance on single-use plastics contributes significantly to global warming, landfill size and associated air pollution, and marine plastic pollution; and

WHEREAS, plastic does not biodegrade but instead breaks down into smaller particles that enter the marine food chain and, eventually, into humans, potentially causing as-yet unknown health risks; and

WHEREAS, reasonably priced alternatives to plastic straws and stirring sticks exist; and

WHEREAS, the Park Advisory Commission is committed to environmentally sustainable practices and the stewardship of parkland in Ann Arbor;

RESOLVED, the Park Advisory Commission recommends the City of Ann Arbor Parks and Recreation Services Unit effective May 1, 2019 no longer purchase plastic straws or plastic stirrer sticks, unless for health, medical, or safety purposes.

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion passed.

Yeas: 6 - Galardi, Santacroce, Morrison, Borgsdorf, Appel, and Skylis

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Ramaswami, London, and RAC Rep. Kraut

H COMMISSION PROPOSED BUSINESS

H-1 [19-0185](#) Discussion regarding updated PAC By-Laws

Attachments: PAC - BYLAWS.pdf, PAC Bylaws amendments
1-14-19-track changes.pdf

C. Smith explained that there has been interest in combining meeting times for the PAC and the Land Acquisition Committee (LAC) meetings. He explained that along with that change the attorney's office has also made some updates for consistency with other City of Ann Arbor Commissions. Smith added that at this time the proposed amendments are being provided to PAC to review, and that there will be more steps in the approval process.

Received and Filed

I REPORT FROM PARKS AND RECREATION MANAGER

C. Smith explained that City Hall and all Parks Facilities will be closed on January 30, 2019 - January 31, 2019.

J REPORT FROM RECREATION ADVISORY COMMISSION

No report.

K REPORTS FROM RELEVANT COMMISSIONS, COMMITTEES, BOARDS AND/OR TASKFORCES

L PUBLIC COMMENTARY - (3 Minutes per Speaker)

None.

M CLOSED SESSION

N TRANSMITTALS

N-1 [19-0186](#) Park Planning Capital Project Update

Attachments: 2019-01 PAC Update.pdf

Received and Filed

N-2 [19-0187](#) PAC Council Update

Attachments: PAC COUNCIL UPDATE 1_2019.pdf

Received and Filed

N-3 [19-0188](#) Parks Project Status Table

Attachments: Parks_Project_Status_Table-FY2018-19.pdf

Received and Filed

O **ADJOURNMENT**

Unanimously adjourned.