



City of Ann Arbor

100 N. Fifth Avenue
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Meeting Minutes Historic District Commission

Thursday, September 8, 2011

7:00 PM TRAYERWOOD BRANCH LIBRARY, Meeting Room; 3333
Traverwood Drive, Ann Arbor

PLEASE NOTE TEMPORARY LOCATION

A CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order by Chair Ramsburgh at 7:02 PM.

B ROLL CALL

Thacher called the roll.

Present: 4 - Kristina A. Glusac, Robert White, Ellen Ramsburgh, and Benjamin L. Bushkuhl

Absent: 2 - Patrick McCauley, and Thomas Stulberg

C APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Motion made by Ramsburgh, seconded by White that the Agenda be Approved with addition to Item H-2; Minutes of the July 14, 2011 HDC Meeting. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

D HEARINGS

D-1 11-1108 HDC11-123 519 Third Street - New Deck in Rear Yard - Old West Side Historic District

PUBLIC HEARING:

Jill Thacher gave the staff report.

BACKGROUND:

This two-story gable-fronter with a slightly off-center three-quarter width front porch first appears in City Directories in 1911 as the home of Roy Standbridge, a piano setter at the Ann Arbor Organ Company.

A certificate of appropriateness was granted in August, 2010 to restore the original siding, remove a rear addition, construct a two-story rear addition and screened porch, and other related work.

LOCATION:

The site is located on the east side of Third Street, south of West Jefferson and north of West Madison.

APPLICATION:

The applicant seeks HDC approval to build a 11.5' by 27' deck between the rear screened-in porch and the side of the garage.

APPLICABLE REGULATIONS:

From the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:

(9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

(10) New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

From the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (other SOI Guidelines may also apply):

District or Neighborhood Setting

Not Recommended: Removing or radically changing those features of the setting which are important in defining the historic character.

STAFF FINDINGS:

- 1. The deck would have two sections, an 8' by 11.5' upper deck that is 2' off the ground, and a step down to a 19' by 11.5' lower deck that is 1.5' off the ground. Only the east side of the upper deck would have a railing, designed to match the existing guardrail on the back stairs.*
- 2. The lower deck would tie into an existing 5' x 6' deck outside of the garage's person door.*
- 3. The deck is located entirely behind the house, has a very low profile, and is situated on a relatively large lot with large amounts of open space in the south sideyard and behind the proposed deck.*
- 4. Staff recommends approval of the application since the design of the porch is compatible with the historic structure, and the deck is appropriately scaled and removable. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, material and relationship to the rest of the site and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, in particular standards 9 and 10, and the guidelines for district or neighborhood setting.*

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT:

Commissioners White and Ramsburgh visited the site as part of their review.

Ramsburgh stated that the proposed deck was very un-intrusive and relates well to the house and is totally removable.

White stated that he agrees with the staff report and Ramsburgh and supports the application.

AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION:

Swati Dutta, 519 Third Street, Ann Arbor, owner of the property spoke on behalf of the project. She said that a deck will tie together all the renovations they have done on the parcel.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

Ramsburgh complemented the owner on all the improvements they have made to the property.

Motion made by White, seconded by Bushkuhl that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 519 Third Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to construct a wood deck in the rear yard, as detailed in the applicant’s submittal. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, material, and relationship to the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 9 and 10 and the guidelines for district or neighborhood setting. On a roll call vote the Chair declared the motion passed.

Yeas: 4 - Glusac, White, Chair Ramsburgh, and Bushkuhl

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Vice Chair McCauley, and Stulberg

D-2 11-1109

HDC11-127 214 South Main Street - New Wall Sign - Main Street Historic District

PUBLIC HEARING:

Jill Thacher gave the staff report.

BACKGROUND:

This two story commercial building in the Art Moderne style was constructed in 1949. The original occupant was F.W. Woolworth Co. The storefronts, second floor windows, and two second floor window openings are not original.

LOCATION:

The site is located on the west side of Main Street, north of West Liberty and south of West Washington Street.

APPLICATION:

The applicant seeks HDC approval to install a non-illuminated commercial storefront sign in the sign band near the doorway to the stairs leading to second floor businesses.

APPLICABLE REGULATIONS:

From the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation:

(9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural

features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

(10) New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

From the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (other SOI Guidelines may also apply):

Storefronts

Not Recommended: Using new illuminated signs; inappropriately scaled signs and logos; signs that project over the sidewalk unless they were a characteristic feature of the historic building; or other types of signs that obscure, damage, or destroy remaining character-defining features of the historic building.

STAFF FINDINGS:

1. The proposed business sign is appropriately scaled and its placement in the upper of two sign band areas is appropriate for a second-floor business. On the superimposed photo supplied on the drawing, the placement looks somewhat awkward and uncentered in relation to the large first floor storefront (formerly occupied by 16 Hands), but when viewed from the sidewalk it balances the Karate sign to the north with the Espresso Royale sign (see 2007 photo below – the Barclays sign is no longer on the building). For future signage on this building, staff believes the upper band is appropriate for signage for upstairs businesses, and ground-level business signs should be placed in the larger, lower band.

2. Staff recommends approval of the proposed sign since it meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Storefronts.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT:

Commissioners White and Ramsburgh visited the site as part of their review.

Ramsburgh reported that she found the proposed sign to be appropriate for the building and fits well with the existing signage in the area.

White reported that he supports the project and agrees with the staff report as well as comments made by Ramsburgh.

AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION:

Brandon Baugh, 214 S. Main Street, Ann Arbor, representative and co-owner of RUB Ann Arbor, was present to answer any enquires.

Glusac asked if the sign included a wooden band.

Baugh responded that he believed it was some sort of plaster material.

Glusac asked if the sign would be installed into original brick.

Baugh answered that he believed it was cinderblock and they have taken precautions to make sure they preserve the building from water damage.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

None

Motion made by Glusac, seconded by White that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 214 South Main Street, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District, to install a business sign as documented in the owner’s submittal. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 9 and 10 and the guidelines for storefronts. On a roll vall vote the Chair declared the motion passed.

Yeas: 4 - Glusac, White, Chair Ramsburgh, and Bushkuhl

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Vice Chair McCauley, and Stulberg

E OLD BUSINESS

F NEW BUSINESS

Election of Officers

The Election of Officers for the Commission will be discussed at the October HDC meeting.

White and Ramsburgh volunteered to be on the nominating committee.

G PUBLIC COMMENTARY - (3 Minutes per Speaker)

H APPROVAL OF MINUTES

H-1 11-1110 Historic District Commission Meeting Minutes of the June 9, 2011

A motion was made by Chair Ramsburgh, seconded by White, that the Minutes be Approved by the Commission and forwarded to the City Council. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

H-2 11-1177 Historic District Commission Meeting Minutes of the July 14, 2011

A motion was made by White, seconded by Bushkuhl, that the Minutes be Approved by the Commission with corrections and forwarded to the City Council. On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried.

Yeas: 4 - Glusac, White, Chair Ramsburgh, and Bushkuhl

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Vice Chair McCauley, and Stulberg

I REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS

J ASSIGNMENTS

**J-1 Review Committee: Monday, October 10 at Noon for the October 13, 2011
Regular Session**

Bushkuhl said that he could volunteer if necessary. Thacher suggested asking Stulberg and McCauley if they were available.

K REPORTS FROM STAFF

K-1 11-1111 August 2011 Staff Activities

Received and Filed

L CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS

Ramsburgh commented that in reviewing sites in the historic districts she has noted properties that have been neglected to the point of demolition. She said she has been thinking about the formation of a committee that could approach owners with neglected properties and offer suggestions on possible repair options instead of waiting until they have to demolish historic structures. She asked for volunteers that would be interesting in sitting on such a committee.

Bushkuhl said he would be interested. He added that it would be helpful to those out of town owners.

Ramsburgh said that maybe the Building Department would also be able to offer some guidance on this issue. She said that it can be cost saving to do the preventative work instead of having to deal with the issues after the fact.

M COMMUNICATIONS

N ADJOURNMENT

Meeting was unanimously adjourned at 7:32 PM.