ANN ARBOR HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Staff Report

ADDRESS: 1003 West Liberty Street, Application Number HDC24-0011

DISTRICT: Old West Side Historic District

REPORT DATE: March 14, 2024

REPORT PREPARED BY: Jill Thacher, Historic Preservation Coordinator

REVIEW COMMITTEE DATE: Monday March 11, 2024

OWNER APPLICANT

Name: Brian Sadek Same

Address: 1003 West Liberty Street

Ann Arbor, MI 48103

Phone: (313) 757-5537

BACKGROUND: This Alladin kit home is a one-story craftsman bungalow that features a low-slung side-gable roof, six- and twelve-over-one windows, and a street facing shed-roofed dormer with two small rectangular windows. The full-width front porch features heavy square wood half-columns above a parged deck and foundation, with simple wood guardrails and parged wing-walls flanking concrete front steps. It first appears in City Assessor records in 1905 and the first occupant was Horace T. Purfield, who purchased the property in 1880. It currently has wide vinyl or aluminum siding.

In 2019, the HDC approved an application to replace two original wood windows with two casement windows with applied muntins and spacers to simulate the original windows (HDC19-211).

LOCATION: The site is located on the south side of West Liberty Street, west of Eighth Street and east of Eberwhite Boulevard.

APPLICATION: The applicant seeks HDC approval to pave the shared driveway that runs between 1003 and 1005 W Liberty. The driveway would be concrete and would extend to the backyard garages for both addresses.

W Liberty St Eighth St

APPLICABLE REGULATIONS

From the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:

(1) A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.

- (2) The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
- (10) New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property will be unimpaired.

From the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (other SOI Guidelines may also apply):

Building Site

Recommended: Retaining the historic relationship between buildings, landscape features, and open space.

Not Recommended: Introducing new construction onto the building site which is visually incompatible in terms of size, scale, design, materials, color and texture or which destroys historic relationships on the site.

Removing or radically changing buildings and their features or site features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the building site so that, as a result, the character is diminished.

From the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines (other Ann Arbor guidelines may also apply):

Landscape Features

Not Appropriate: Introducing any new building, streetscape, or landscape feature that is out of scale or otherwise inappropriate to the district's historic character.

Paved Areas

Appropriate: On residential properties, retaining and maintaining existing historic driveways and curb cuts, including "two track" driveways and green space between the driveway and house.

STAFF FINDINGS

- 1. Aerial photos back to 1947 show a driveway in its current location leading to a garage at 1003 and parking spaces at 1005 W Liberty. A garage was added to 1005 between 1947 and 1960. The homeowner states that the driveway is currently a muddy mess and the addition of gravel is of limited help. Snow is difficult to remove, and ice is a winter hazard.
- 2. A paved driveway would be installed to direct water away from both houses, with planting strips left intact on both sides. At approximately 11' wide, the new concrete is shown slightly wider than the gravel's current extent. A planting strip would be maintained along both sides of the driveway (approximately 2' along 1003 and 3' along 1005 W Liberty). Behind the houses the driveway flares to meet the two garages, ending at the outer wall of each garage.

- 3. For 1005 W Liberty, the paving in front of the garage is noted as "Maybe in Scope". The neighbor has not yet obtained bids for the work and remains undecided about paving this portion of her lot. Staff has no concerns about this.
- 4. Staff recommends approval of the application. The proposed work is generally compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the buildings and the surrounding neighborhood and meets the *Ann Arbor Historic District Guidelines* for paved areas and landscape features, and *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation,* in particular standards 1, 2 and 10, and the guidelines for building site.

POSSIBLE MOTIONS: (Note that the motion supports staff findings and is only a suggestion. The Review Committee, consisting of staff and at least two Commissioners, will meet with the applicant on site and then make a recommendation at the meeting.)

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 1003 and 1005 W Liberty Street, contributing properties in the Old West Side Historic District, to pave the driveway with concrete from the public right of way to either or both garages, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and meets the *Ann Arbor Historic District Guidelines* for paved areas and landscape features, and *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation,* in particular standards 1, 2, and 10, and the guidelines for building site.

MOTION WORKSHEET:

I move that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the work at <u>1003 and</u> <u>1005 W Liberty Street</u> in the <u>Old West Side</u> Historic District

Provided the following condition(S) is (ARE) met: 1) STATE CONDITION(s)

The work is generally compatible with the size, scale, massing, and materials and meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, standard(S) number(S) (circle all that apply): 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10

ATTACHMENTS: letter, site drawings, photographs, joint driveway agreement

1003 W Liberty (2020, courtesy Google Street View)



1947 Aerial Photograph

