



It is the mission of the Ann Arbor Transportation Authority to provide useful, reliable, safe, environmentally responsible, and cost-effective public transportation options for the benefit of the Greater Ann Arbor Community.

Approved Minutes
April 19, 2012
Ann Arbor Transportation Authority
Board of Directors Meeting
Ann Arbor District Library, 343 South Fifth Avenue, Ann Arbor, Michigan, 6:30 p.m.

Board Members Present: Jesse Bernstein (Chair), Eli Cooper, Anya Dale, Sue Gott, Charles Griffith, Roger Kerson

Absent with Notice: David Nacht

Staff Present: Michael Benham, Terry Black, Ron Copeland, Dawn Gabay, Michael Ford, Jan Hallberg, Ed Robertson, Mary Stasiak, Phil Webb, Chris White

Recording Secretary: Karen Wheeler

Chairman Jesse Bernstein declared that a quorum was present and called the meeting to order at 6:33 p.m.

1.0 *Communications and Announcements*

Jesse Bernstein welcomed Sue Gott to the board.

2.0 *Election of Treasurer*

Anya Dale moved to elect David Nacht Treasurer. Eli Cooper supported the motion.

Charles Griffith voiced his support for Mr. Nacht's nomination. Jesse Bernstein expressed appreciation for Mr. Nacht's willingness to serve as a board officer, and thanked all of the board members for their service.

The motion carried.

2.1 *Committee Assignments*

There was no report.

3.0 *Public Time – Comment on Agenda Items*

Thomas Partridge appeared before the Board. Mr. Partridge called on the board to offer transportation services beyond the scope of services currently being offered, and for monthly board agendas to include updates on the progress of the countywide transportation and 4-party agreement. Mr. Partridge stated his preference for meeting announcements to be placed on the home page of the AATA website, and for the paratransit service contract with Select Ride (as well as policies and practices) to undergo monthly review by the Planning and Development Committee. Mr. Partridge commented on recent incidents where paratransit service vehicles had apparent gasoline leaks.

Carolyn Grawi from the Ann Arbor Center for Independent Living appeared before the Board. Ms. Grawi commended the work of the u196 board. Ms. Grawi commented on her participation in the preparatory meetings for the second round of District Advisory Committee meetings expressing appreciation for the diverse group assembled, and specifically for the inclusion of members of the disability community in various segments of the TMP process. Ms. Grawi commented on confusion around the route of the new AirRide service as is different than the route previously used by Michigan Flyer. Ms. Grawi requested that information on the current route be made available. Ms. Grawi commented on the impact of State Street construction on the on-time performance of Route #6 and suggested adding a bus between scheduled pick-ups to help passengers make their connections on time.

Erin McMahon, Chair of the Regional Interagency Consumer Council (RICC) appeared before the Board. Ms. McMahon made a general inquiry about transportation plans and routes.

Mr. Bernstein noted that public time is not an interactive process and made a commitment to follow-up with Ms. McMahon to get the details of her inquiry and provide answers.

No one further appearing, Mr. Bernstein declared Public Time closed.

4.0 *Review and Approval of Minutes*

4.1 *Review and Approval of Minutes of March 15, 2012*

Charles Griffith moved approval of the minutes as written with support from Eli Cooper.

Sue Gott and Anya Dale abstained. The motion carried.

5.0 *Board and Staff Reports*

5.1 *Chief Executive Officer*

Michael Ford welcomed Sue Gott to the Board. Mr. Ford reported on a special board meeting scheduled for April 26 to seek the Board's concurrence to release the Draft Five Year Transportation Plan to the public. Mr. Ford noted that the May board meeting will take place as part of the annual budget retreat. The event is scheduled for Wednesday, May 16 at Noon and will be held at the Holiday Inn Express, 600 Briarwood Circle.

Mr. Ford reported on AirRide ridership for the first two weeks of service: April 2 through April 14. Ridership for the period totaled 1,168. Mr. Ford expressed his appreciation and support to board members, elected officials and Indian Trails representatives at the press conference launching the service, and acknowledged staff for their significant contribution to make the service a reality.

Mr. Ford reported that the Planning and Development Committee moved forward a resolution regarding the expenditure of WALLY Rail Fund projects. Following the meeting it was decided that additional work was needed on the background materials prior to bringing the issue to the full Board for a vote. An updated report will be presented to the board at a later date.

Mr. Ford reported that the PMER committee moved forward two resolutions: award of a contract for security guard services, and accepting the recommendations of the Financial Task Force. The committee received presentations on the Information Technology Strategic Plan and marketing program efforts.

Mr. Ford reported on work on the Transit Master Plan completed over the past month including preparations for the second round of District Advisory Committee meetings.

Mr. Ford reported on the April 2 u196 Board meeting. The board considered options for a process to decide on a working name for a new authority. A majority of the board chose "Washtenaw Area Transportation Authority". Mr. Ford listed major meetings held over the past month and referred to his detailed written report for updates on other meetings and work plan projects.

5.1.1 *Development of Website*

There was no report.

5.2 *Planning and Development Committee*

Anya Dale reported on the April Planning and Development Committee meeting. The committee received a report on sustainability of the Wally rail project and an update on marketing activities. Ms. Dale detailed highlights from the marketing presentation and noted the recent release of a new *Spanish Ride Guide*. Ms. Dale added that the new website is going to be translatable to many non-English languages.

The committee also received a presentation on the report from the Transit Master Plan (TMP) Financial Task Force, an advisory task force charged with reviewing the TMP and providing short and long term options for locally and federally funded transportation programs. Ms. Dale reported that staff provided the usual updates detailed in the meeting summary.

5.3 *Performance Monitoring and External Relations Committee*

Charles Griffith reported on the April Performance Monitoring and External Relations Committee meeting. Staff provided a briefing on a recommendation to award a contract for unarmed security services to come into compliance with the Living Wage Policy. The committee also received a report on the Financial Task Force (FTF) report and endorsed a resolution formally accepting the report as a board. Staff provided an extensive review of the marketing plan and the committee discussed work in progress and work programmed.

A report was made on the Information Technology Strategic Plan (ITSP). The committee, with input from staff and the ITSP consultant, discussed benchmarking and four key focus areas which include short, medium and long term recommendations including consideration for additional staffing to carry out the plan. The committee discussed right timing for hiring additional staff in order to better prepare for the expansion of service. Mr. Griffith noted that the ITSP will go back to committee for action at a later time.

The committee received a report on staff responses to recommendations from the March audit report. The practice of buying fuel futures is still under review by legal counsel as preliminary indications are that the application may not be in compliance with state law. Staff was encouraged to explore potential waivers from the State of Michigan given that the practice is conservative and has saved the agency money.

5.4 *Local Advisory Council*

Clark Charnetski, Vice Chair of the Local Advisory Council (LAC), reported on the April LAC meeting. The committee discussed accessibility plans of Jewish Family Services (JFS) for FY2013. JFS provides transportation services through Washtenaw County. An update was made on the driver appreciation program; work is in process to identify the questions to be used to evaluate drivers.

Mr. Charnetski reminded the Board about a letter sent to the CEO of the UM Medical Center a couple of months ago. The letter requested consideration for shelter for people who use public transportation to access the medical center. There has been no response to the letter. A second letter was sent. The committee discussed the impending replacement of five ARide vehicles and received an update on the Blake Transit Center reconstruction project.

Mr. Charnetski invited board members to attend an LAC meeting held on the second Tuesday of the month at 10:00 a.m. Mr. Charnetski congratulated Sue Gott on her appointment to the Board.

6.0 *Question Time*

Sue Gott asked where LAC meetings are held. Clark Charnetski indicated that the meetings are held in the Board Room at AATA headquarters. Mr. Charnetski added that the ability to meet in the conference room of the new Blake Transit Center (and have video capability) would be appreciated.

Jesse Bernstein thanked staff for their hard work noting that it had been a busy week with a concrete pour at headquarters for the garage expansion, installation of the new lifts in maintenance recently completed, and ongoing planning for the new Blake Transit Center.

7.0 *Old Business*

There was no old business for the Board to consider.

8.0 *New Business*

Charles Griffith moved the following resolution with support from Anya Dale.

8.1 *Approval of Contract for Unarmed Security Guard Services*

WHEREAS, the Ann Arbor Transportation Authority issued Request for Proposal (RFP) # 2009-04 for the purpose of identifying a firm to provide unarmed security guard services, and

WHEREAS, proposals were sent to twenty nine (29) firms and eleven (11) responses

were received, and

WHEREAS, AATA staff evaluated the proposals and determined that the proposal of Advance Security was found to be the most responsive and responsible of the eleven (11) proposals received, and

WHEREAS, the Authority's Living Wage Policy became effective requiring the contractor to pay a minimum wage to their employees working under this contract, and

WHEREAS, the terms of the agreement result in an increase in the annual payment in excess of 10% from the original contract, which requires additional approval from the Board of Directors, and

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Ann Arbor Transportation Authority Board of Directors authorizes the Chief Executive Officer to enter into a contract with Advance Security for unarmed security guard services for a one-year period based on hourly rates, with a one-year renewal under the same terms and conditions provided.

Phil Webb reported that in 2009 the Board approved a contract for unarmed security services. Last year the Board passed a Living Wage Policy. Existing contracts were grandfathered in until their expiration. The proposal for a new unarmed security services contract was greater than the 10% guideline in the procurement manual requiring board approval.

Mr. Webb responded to questions related to the contract and indicated that the additional cost for the contract is \$55,000.

The motion carried.

Eli Cooper moved the following resolution with support from Sue Gott.

8.2 *Receipt of Recommendations of Financial Task Force*

WHEREAS, the Ann Arbor Transportation Authority (AATA) convened a Financial Task Force to review the Transit Master Plan (TMP) and the associated Funding Option Report , and

WHEREAS, members of the Financial Task Force volunteered their time and expertise to considering the service and funding implications of the TMP for the citizens of the County, and

WHEREAS, the Financial Task Force has produced a report with

recommendations for the TMP and its funding, and

WHEREAS, the Financial Task Force has expressed a willingness to reconvene periodically to assess changing conditions, particularly with respect to new legislation that may affect transit funding,

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Ann Arbor Transportation Authority Board of Directors hereby accepts the recommendations of the Financial Task Force for consideration by the AATA and the community in advancing transit in Washtenaw County,

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the AATA will monitor proposed legislation and other conditions affecting transit funding, and reconvene the FTF as needed to consider amendments to their recommendations,

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Ann Arbor Transportation Authority Board of Directors hereby expresses its gratitude to the members of the Financial Task Force for their outstanding effort and results.

Eli Cooper commented on the work of the Financial Task Force indicating that the committee, and a subcommittee formed out of the task force, advanced the conversation of movement from the current AATA to a new potential regional countywide type authority by helping to focus in on very specific financial matters. Mr. Cooper indicated that based on the presentation about the committee's work, the group went above and beyond what was asked of them by creating models that staff will continue to use to assess and evaluate implications of various service strategies. Mr. Cooper indicated that he was pleased to support the motion to accept the report and allow it to inform the board's deliberations as they move the effort forward.

Jesse Bernstein thanked members of the Financial Task Force for taking time from their incredibly busy schedules. Mr. Bernstein indicated that the team did a great job figuring out what makes sense for a transportation service plan in the next five years.

The motion carried.

9.0 *Public Time*

Vivienne Armentrout appeared before the Board. Ms. Armentrout expressed appreciation for being included in the planning process for the Ann Arbor District Advisory Council meeting. Ms. Armentrout indicated that she had concerns and questions; however, noting that attendance was sparse and that it appeared that invitees were mainly representatives of various stakeholder groups. Ms. Armentrout encouraged broader inclusion and participation of Ann Arbor citizens who are "regular folks", and providing the opportunity for participants to interact with the people who

will eventually represent the citizens of Ann Arbor on the new authority board.

Jesse Bernstein announced that the organizational kick-off meetings are open to the public. All meetings will be publicized as widely as possible. Mr. Bernstein indicated that the district meetings are an ongoing process being built in to make sure there is every linkage with public possible. District meetings will be held at least four times a year.

Thomas Partridge appeared before the Board. Mr. Partridge address the board on a perceived need for an open and visible meeting policy suggesting that there are many public boards and committees in Washtenaw County holding meetings at times and locations out of sight of the public. Mr. Partridge encouraged the Board to hold its meetings, the u196 board meetings and AATA committee meetings at the Ann Arbor District Library or another venue with access to the Community Television Network. Mr. Partridge commented on a University of Michigan Board of Regents meeting.

No one further appearing, Mr. Bernstein declared Public Time closed.

10.0 *Closed Session to Consult with Counsel Concerning Pending Litigation*

Jesse Bernstein reported that the Board would not hold a closed session. Mr. Bernstein reported on a court hearing held earlier in the day regarding the lawsuit against AATA for denying placement of an ad on the bus. The judge heard oral arguments and indicated that a written opinion would be provided at some time in the future. Once an opinion is received, the Board will discuss the matter in closed session.

11.0 *Adjourn*

Roger Kerson moved to adjourn the meeting with support from Anya Dale. The motion carried and the meeting adjourned at 7:13 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Charles Griffith, Secretary