



City of Ann Arbor
Formal Minutes - Final
Planning Commission, City

301 E. Huron St.
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Tuesday, March 17, 2015

7:00 PM

City Hall, 301 E. Huron St., 2nd Fl.

10-c 15-0324

Racquet Club of Ann Arbor Site Improvements Site Plan - A proposal to demolish the existing tennis building on this 8.86-acre athletic club site located at 3010 Hickory Lane and replace it with a single-story, 3,533-square foot tennis facility, construct additions to the pool building (850 square feet) and snack shack (311 square feet), and install patio and pedestrian improvements and storm water detention. (Ward 2) Staff Recommendation: Approval

Cheng presented the staff report.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Antonio Gutierrez, 1901 Landmark Court, said he has to agree with the idea to install the sidewalks, given it is near Gallup Park and is not a leap frog development in the middle of nowhere.

Noting no additional speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed, unless the item is postponed.

Moved by Briere, seconded by Milshteyn, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the Racquet Club of Ann Arbor Site Plan, subject to approval of a front setback variance granted by the Zoning Board of Appeals.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

Peters asked to consider the two motions separately.

The Commission agreed.

Briere asked for the petitioner and architect to present their project.

Scott Betzoldt, Midwestern Consulting LLC., project engineer, introduced architect John Mouat and Racquet Club representative, Brent Schomaker. He described the proposed improvements, noting that access will be revised to have one central entry point. He said they will be

providing storm water management for all of the area being disturbed, where there is currently none, and they will provide infiltration in a seam of sand/gravel.

John Mouat, Mitchell & Mouat Architects, 113 S. Fourth Ave., explained this property used to be an old farm, and part of the architectural goal is to have the buildings fit in and be more harmonious. He said they looked at the existing tennis building and if it could be salvaged, but given that it has a full basement, which has water problems, as well as not being barrier free accessible, it was decided that they should start fresh. He said in order to deal with grades and infrastructure they had to push the project into the setback.

Clein said he appreciated the explanation of why the building is being pushed into the setback.

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried.

Yeas: 7 - Wendy Woods, Kenneth Clein, Sabra Briere, Jeremy Peters, Sarah Mills, Bonnie Bona, and Alex Milshteyn

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Eleanore Adenekan, and Sofia Franciscus

Moved by Briere, seconded by Milshteyn, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the Racquet Club of Ann Arbor's request for a waiver from the requirement to install public sidewalks along the Geddes Avenue and Hickory Lane frontages.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

Clein asked about the cost of the sidewalk.

Betzoldt said the Geddes Road sidewalk is the most costly, and would be a six-digit figure, noting that the grade between the property line and the curb is up to a 25% slope. He said there are also overhead power and telephone poles that would need to be relocated, along with three City light poles, one stormwater manhole, two hydrants, a manhole, and they would need to add a retaining wall, as well as remove 10-15 trees.

Clein asked about cost.

Betzoldt said it would be \$100,000 - 200,000.

Clein asked about total project cost.

Cheng said it is \$2.5 million.

Betzoldt said this area is entirely residential area and if sidewalk were to be added, it would be through a special assessment district, which the petitioner has agreed to be a part of.

Clein asked about the amount of added impervious surface.

Cheng said he did not know.

Briere said last night, Council approved the first resolution for the Special Assessment District on Geddes Road, on storm water issues, Phase 1, of a multi phase project that includes sidewalks all the way to Hickory Lane. She said if sidewalk were installed, they would be connected to something and while she is happy to hear that the petitioner is willing to participate in the assessment, she would recommend that they do it when they have control over the landscaping instead of putting in landscaping only to have the City tear it out after a year.

Betzoldt clarified the sidewalk proposed is on the north side of Geddes Road, and he understood the segment to the north is currently unfunded, due to the steep drop-off.

Mills said because of the park, she has been a pedestrian as well as on a bike, trying to do a big loop down Geddes into the Arb. She said it is not comfortable being there and if it is not part of the plan, there needs to be something to get you to Huron Parkway. She encouraged sidewalk on one side of the road, noting that we are a walkable town and she would not be in favor of waiving the sidewalk requirement.

Bona said staff supports construction of a sidewalk at this location.

Cheng said he talked to the City's Traffic Engineer, who supports putting sidewalks on both sides of Geddes as well as on Hickory Lane.

Bona asked if the City were to choose the side of the street to install sidewalk, which side would they pick.

Cheng said he would have to have a conversation with the Traffic

Engineer regarding that.

Bona said she recalls the visibility issue and would be more comfortable with crossing at Hickory Lane. She asked why sidewalk has to be at the edge, noting that it just has to be safe and they could provide an easement to get around obstacles. She felt that if the City doesn't ask for this now, they will not get another opportunity, and people should be walking here. She said she would not be able to support the sidewalk waiver request.

Woods asked if it would be appropriate to amend the motion.

Bona said she would rather vote the motion down, and have it move on to Council as it is.

Betzoldt said they would rather prefer to keep the motion the same.

Milshteyn asked about intent of procedure.

Clein said he would vote in favor in order to minimize the amount of impervious surface.

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion defeated.

Yeas: 1 - Kenneth Clein

Nays: 6 - Wendy Woods, Sabra Briere, Jeremy Peters, Sarah Mills, Bonnie Bona, and Alex Milshteyn

Absent: 2 - Eleanore Adenekan, and Sofia Franciscus