



# City of Ann Arbor

301 E. Huron St.  
Ann Arbor, MI 48104  
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

## Meeting Minutes City Planning Commission

---

Tuesday, November 20, 2012

7:00 PM

City Hall, 301 E. Huron Street, 2nd Flr.

---

Commission public meetings are held the first and third Tuesday of each month. Both of these meetings provide opportunities for the public to address the Commission. Persons with disabilities are encouraged to participate. Accommodations, including sign language interpreters, may be arranged by contacting the City Clerk's Office at 734-794-6140 (V/TDD) at least 24 hours in advance. Planning Commission meeting agendas and packets are available from the Legislative Information Center on the City Clerk's page of the City's website (<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>) or on the 1st floor of City Hall on the Friday before the meeting. Agendas and packets are also sent to subscribers of the City's email notification service, GovDelivery. You can subscribe to this free service by accessing the City's website and clicking on the red envelope at the top of the home page.

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Channel 16 live at 7:00 p.m. on the first and third Tuesdays of the month and replayed the following Wednesdays at 10:00 AM and Sundays at 2:00 PM. Recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website ([www.a2gov.org](http://www.a2gov.org)).

### 1 CALL TO ORDER

*Vice Chair Woods called the meeting to order at 7:00 pm.*

### 2 ROLL CALL

*Rampson called the roll.*

**Present** 6 - Bona, Mahler, Woods, Giannola, Adenekan, and Derezinski

**Absent** 2 - Westphal, and Clein

### 3 APPROVAL OF AGENDA

**Moved by Bona, seconded by Adenekan, that the agenda be approved. On a voice vote, the Vice Chair declared the motion carried.**

### 5 MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING

### 6 REPORTS FROM CITY ADMINISTRATION, CITY COUNCIL, PLANNING MANAGER, PLANNING COMMISSION OFFICERS AND COMMITTEES, WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS AND PETITIONS

#### 6-a City Council

*None*

#### 6-b Planning Manager

*Rampson reported that there will be a student group presenting ideas about a gateway approach to the South State Street corridor next Tuesday evening at 6:30 pm in the City Hall basement level conference rooms.*

#### 6-c Planning Commission Officers and Committees

*Bona reported the North Main Huron River Vision task force continues to meet. She pointed interested people to the link on the front page of the City's website for information on public meetings about the City's property at 721 N. Main. She said the City is pursuing a grant that would provide funding for the floodplain portion of the site. The next public meeting date is November 28.*

*Derezinski said he is following up on an interest of the Commission about the aging demographic. He reported that he had attended a session on aging this spring with Kirk Westphal. He said they are getting together with AARP, MSHDA, MML, Presbyterian Village to formulate a symposium, to be held in Ann Arbor, in hopes to bring people together on policy making in healthcare, transportation and housing. He said AARP will support this effort financially, and they are planning for a late February date.*

*Enter Clein at 7:10 p.m.*

*Mahler noted that the Ordinance Revisions Committee (ORC) continues to meet to consider the report of the R4C Advisory Committee, adding that they will be going to City Council to ask for an extension until the spring.*

**Present** 7 - Bona, Mahler, Woods, Giannola, Adenekan, Clein, and Derezinski

**Absent** 1 - Westphal

#### 6-d Written Communications and Petitions

[12-1482](#) Various Correspondence to the City Planning Commission

Received and Filed

#### 7 AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION (Persons may speak for three minutes about an item that is NOT listed as a public hearing on this agenda. Please state your name and address for the record.)

None

#### 8 PUBLIC HEARINGS SCHEDULED FOR NEXT BUSINESS MEETING

[12-1483](#) 515 N. Fifth Ave Apartments Site Plan for City Council Approval - A proposal to demolish the existing structure and construct a 2-1/2 story, four-unit multiple family dwelling with 6 parking spaces on this 0.20 acre parcel.

McMullen Annexation and Zoning for City Council Approval - A request to annex this 0.46 acre, single-family residential parcel located at 3100 Geddes Road, from Ann Arbor Township and zone it R1A

(Single-Family Dwelling District).

Abdulsattar Annexation and Zoning for City Council Approval - A request to annex this 1.03 acres, single-family residential parcel located at 3355 Geddes Road, from Ann Arbor Township and zone it R1A (Single-Family Dwelling District).

Master Plan; 2012 Sustainability Framework - A proposal to adopt a framework of 16 overarching sustainability goals as a new element of the City Master Plan.

*Vice-Chair Woods read the public hearing notice as published for December 4, 2012.*

**9 REGULAR BUSINESS - Staff Report, Public Hearing and Commission Discussion of Each Item**

(If an agenda item is tabled, it will most likely be rescheduled to a future date. If you would like to be notified when a tabled agenda item will appear on a future agenda, please provide your email address on the form provided on the front table at the meeting. You may also call Planning and Development Services at 734-794-6265 during office hours to obtain additional information about the review schedule or visit the Planning page on the City's website ([www.a2gov.org](http://www.a2gov.org).)

(Public Hearings: Individuals may speak for three minutes. The first person who is the official representative of an organized group or who is representing the petitioner may speak for five minutes; additional representatives may speak for three minutes. Please state your name and address for the record.)

(Comments about a proposed project are most constructive when they relate to: (1) City Code requirements and land use regulations, (2) consistency with the City Master Plan, or (3) additional information about the area around the petitioner's property and the extent to which a proposed project may positively or negatively affect the area.)

- 9-1 [12-1475](#)** The Summit Townhouses Zoning and Site Plan for City Council Approval - A proposal to zone it R3 (Townhouse Dwelling District) and construct a 24-unit multiple-family residential development with 48 parking spaces and one access driveway on this 3.3 acre parcel, located at 2081 East Ellsworth Road. Staff Recommendation: Postponement

*Kowalski presented the staff report.*

**PUBLIC HEARING:**

*S. Shah, resident of Cloverly Village, said that 12 trees on the Summit site are landmark trees and are in his view. He said the single-family home on the site was broken down. He said the development will spoil the view and bring down the value of Cloverly Village, and that it is not on the same elevation.*

*Leonard Michaels, representative for the petitioner, said he submitted this plan, starting in January of this year, noting that the process is arduous to go through annexation, zoning and site plan. He said they submitted five different options. The lot size would allow 29 units, but they have scaled this down to 24 units. He reported that they have done soil borings. He asked for a tentative plan approval at tonight's meeting, contingent upon meeting outstanding requirements.*

*Noting no further speakers, the Vice-Chair declared the public hearing closed, unless the item is postponed.*

**Moved by Bona, seconded by Clein, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the Summit Townhomes Zoning, Site Plan and Development Agreement, subject to preliminary plan approval by the Washtenaw County Water Resources Commissioner.**

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

*Bona asked about the trees vs landmark trees on the site.*

*Kowalski pointed out the trees on the slide.*

*Bona said that when one looks at the landscaping plan, there are screening requirements in addition to landmark trees.*

*Kowalski explained that there is a mix of deciduous plantings for the conflicting land use buffer along the perimeter of the site.*

*Bona asked about screening.*

*Michaels said they will be providing a line of trees along the perimeter, and that the landscape report provided addresses the landmark trees. He said staff asked for different species than what they proposed, which they changed and resubmitted to the City. He said the east side will have a large retaining wall, and they had one option that used two drives, one uphill and the other downhill, but they needed to combine them. He said this project will only add 24 units to the parcel. He said according to the traffic engineer, these additional units will not add significant volumes to the traffic on Ellsworth.*

*Bona asked about the retaining wall along the sidewalk.*

*Michaels said one will see a row of trees next to sidewalk, 2 to 15 feet in height. He said they will provide a connector sidewalk to the school property, and will coordinate with the schools on this. He said they don't object to making a parks contribution.*

*Bona asked if they will be adding landscaping to the adjacent parcel as well.*

*Michaels clarified that what was shown on the plan was existing landscaping on the adjacent property.*

*Bona said she hopes that the parks contribution happens and would like to have the Parks and Recreation Open Space Plan take a look at this area to identify what funding could go toward this area. She said she has concern about the cost prohibitive nature of the retaining walls.*

*Derezinski said he had the same questions about recreational facilities in the area.*

*Kowalski said that he had spoken to the City's park planner, who has re-evaluated the location of the playscape. He offered to get more information about where the contribution would be applied, noting that the petitioners have proposed Arbor Oaks park. He noted that staff have requested a school connection, but it is not required.*

*Derezinski said that the adjacent property is apartments and across the street is a*

commercial shopping center, adding that the project is consistent with development in the area. He asked about the recommendation from staff regarding postponement on taking action.

Kowalski said staff has not had time to review the latest plans, which were submitted the previous Friday.

Derezinski asked if the plans could be reviewed by the next meeting.

Kowalski said they could be.

Giannola asked about storm water and the possibility of flooding in the area. She asked about comments submitted by a concerned neighbor and soil erosion measures.

Kowalski said that soil erosion controls will be carefully monitored by the City during construction.

Adenekan asked about the steep slope.

Kowalski reviewed the cross-section diagram with the Commission.

Clein asked if the plan has been reviewed for site lighting.

Kowalski said that they have looked at proposed parking lot lighting.

Clein asked if the Fire Marshal approved the access to the site.

Kowalski said yes.

Clein asked if the condo units will have basements.

Kowalski said yes.

Clein asked about the proposed materials for the retaining wall.

Michaels said they are currently considering carbon or precast concrete block for a permanent wall installation. He explained that for them to do detailed plans, they must move forward in order to get funding for the project.

Clein asked about the proposed retaining wall height.

Michaels said it will be stepped at approximately 15 feet, then an additional 15 feet.

Clein asked about the slope along the sidewalk.

Michaels said they will provide handrails.

Clein asked about soil boring results.

Michaels said the soil is sandy silt, and that they will have percolation tests done. He said they are asking for zoning approval, and tentative site plan approval at this time.

Woods asked if the petitioner has any drawings for the retaining wall showing elevations, noting that it is hard to imagine what it will look like at this stage.

*Michaels said they do not.*

*Rampson explained that the Commission could decide to separate the zoning request from the site plan, in order for the zoning to move ahead to City Council.*

**Moved by Mahler, seconded by Giannola to postpone this petition until staff has answers to its comments.**

*Bona asked for friendly amendment to separate the zoning from the site plan.*

**Mahler withdrew his original motion and moved rezoning to R3, seconded by Clein. On a voice vote, the Vice-Chair declared the motion carried.**

**Yeas:** 7 - Bonnie Bona, Eric A. Mahler, Wendy Woods, Diane Giannola, Eleanore Adenekan, Kenneth Clein, and Tony Derezinski

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 1 - Kirk Westphal

**Moved by Mahler, seconded by Derezinski, that the site plan and development agreement be postponed until staff has answers. On a voice vote, the Vice Chair declared the motion carried.**

**Yeas:** 7 - Bonnie Bona, Eric A. Mahler, Wendy Woods, Diane Giannola, Eleanore Adenekan, Kenneth Clein, and Tony Derezinski

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 1 - Kirk Westphal

#### **4 INTRODUCTIONS AND PRESENTATIONS**

*Woods announced that former Commissioner Evan Pratt was in attendance and explained that Commission would like to take a few moments to recognize his work on the Planning Commission. She said that she is sad to see Commissioner Pratt go, but congratulated him.*

*Adenekan congratulated Pratt and said she had learned a lot from him at the Commission.*

*Derezinski said he will remember the work they did together. He said he hopes that Pratt will join the Commission after their meetings.*

*Mahler thanked Pratt and hopes that he will continue to do his due diligence as he sends back the reviews on projects. He said Pratt had set a high bar as chair of the Commission.*

*Bona said she can't believe she is the senior Commissioner, since Pratt left. She said she will miss his layperson's way of explaining engineering issues and know he will be a huge asset to the County.*

*Giannola said thank you, reiterating that Pratt explained issues so easily, and it was nice for new Commissioner to learn from him.*

*Clein said he appreciates Pratt's perspective.*

*Rampson expressed her appreciation to Pratt for bringing his professional expertise to the Commission as a lay Planning Commissioner and hopes he will organize future*

*Pecha Kucha presentations for the Commission's entertainment.*

*Pratt thanked the Commission and said it was great to be part of the team and work with great staff.*

**9-2**      [12-1476](#)

Seneca/Onondaga/Geddes Rezoning for City Council Approval - A proposal to rezone 6 parcels; 2014 Geddes Avenue (0.40 acre) 2024 Geddes Avenue (0.40 acres) 520 Onondaga Street (0.20 acre) 2025 Seneca Avenue (0.20 acre) 2023 Seneca Avenue (0.40 acre) 2019 Seneca Avenue (0.22 acre); totaling 1.82 acres, on this block from R1B (Single-Family Dwelling District) to R1C (Single-Family Dwelling District). Staff Recommendation: Approval

*Rampson provided the staff report.*

*Noting no speakers, the Vice Chair declared the public hearing closed.*

**Moved by Mahler, seconded by Derezinski, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the Seneca/Geddes/Onondaga Rezoning from R1B (Single-Family Dwelling District) to R1C (Single-Family Dwelling District).**

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

*Derezinski noted that he brought this to City Council for action. He said, as the report indicates, the public meeting had six residents attend. He noted the letter of support from Clan Crawford, a resident of this rezoning area, who is in support of the rezoning.*

**On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Vice Chair declaring the motion carried.**

**Yeas:** 7 - Bonnie Bona, Eric A. Mahler, Wendy Woods, Diane Giannola, Eleanore Adenekan, Kenneth Clein, and Tony Derezinski

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 1 - Kirk Westphal

**9-3**      [12-1477](#)

Memorial Christian Church Special Exception Use for City Planning Commission Approval - A request to convert this existing office building to a church use, with worship space, educational area (non-school) and administrative support spaces. No changes are proposed to the 0.69 acre site located at 1900 Manchester Rd. Staff Recommendation: Approval

*Kahan presented the staff report.*

PUBLIC HEARING:

*Robert Bride, Interim Pastor, said the church has been in the community for 121 years. They have sold their property on campus, and found this space to meet their needs.*

*Dan Mooney, representative for the petitioner, said he would be happy to answer any technical issues.*

*Noting no further speakers, the Vice Chair declared the public hearing closed.*

**Moved by Clein, seconded by Adenekan, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission, after hearing all interested persons and reviewing all relevant information, finds the petition to substantially meet the standards in Chapter 55 (Zoning Ordinance), Section 5:104 (Special Exceptions), and therefore, approves the Memorial Christian Church Special Exception Use for a church use with a maximum seating capacity of 111 persons, subject to the recording of a public utility and access easement over the former Manchester Road right-of-way prior to the issuance of any permits.**

*COMMISSION DISCUSSION:*

*Bona asked about occupancy and how did they settle on a 111-seat capacity.*

*Kahan said the parking lot has 37 parking spaces, and the code requires one space per three seats, which brings the capacity to 111.*

*Bona noted this is a two-story building, and she asked about seating needs.*

*Bride said the sanctuary will be on the second floor and will have seating for 88 persons. He said there will be a Fellowship Hall with the first floor, and they are looking for alternative uses for the remainder of the space.*

*Bona said if their numbers increase and they exceed the capacity, they should come back to the Commission and explain how much shared parking is available in the vicinity.*

*Bride said if their numbers increase they would likely first go to two services.*

*Mahler asked about traffic from the site onto Washtenaw, with traffic being heavy on Washtenaw Avenue. He asked if there is a no-left turn when exiting onto Washtenaw.*

*Kahan explained that there is no direct traffic access onto Washtenaw, but that traffic would have to use Manchester to get to the signal at Washtenaw.*

*Clein asked if the property was currently off the tax roll and if the mentioned alternative uses for the first floor would be for the congregation or for leasing out to others.*

*Kahan said it is off the tax roll since the parcel had been owned by another non-profit organization.*

*Bride said they are looking to lease out the space to other non-profit groups on first floor for weekday use, which would not be competing for parking.*

*Giannola asked if the small grassy area is privately owned or City owned.*

*Kahan said publicly owned.*

*Rampson clarified that the parcel is City owned, but it is not a park.*

*Woods said it is nice to see the building being reused. She noted the special exception use decision will be made at the Planning Commission level.*

*Derezinski said the neighborhood is used to church parking in the neighborhood for St. Frances, and it has not been a problem in the past.*



**A vote on the motion was as follows, with the Vice Chair declaring the motion carried and the special exception use approved.**

**Yeas:** 7 - Bonnie Bona, Eric A. Mahler, Wendy Woods, Diane Giannola, Eleanore Adenekan, Kenneth Clein, and Tony Derezinski

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 1 - Kirk Westphal

9-4

[12-1478](#)

Resolution and Support of Climate Action Plan - Staff  
Recommendation: Approval

*Nathan Geisler, Energy Programs Associate, reviewed the Climate Action Plan with the Commission.*

**Moved by Adenekan, seconded by Mahler, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby approves the "Resolution Supporting Adoption of the Ann Arbor Climate Action Plan" dated November 20, 2012 and directs Planning and Development Services staff to transmit this resolution to City Council.**

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

*Bona thanked Geisler and Wayne Appleyard, Chair of the Energy Commission, for leading them through this process. She said the committee was a well informed group, and the plan is well thought out. She asked them to please let City Planning Commission know what they can do to help.*

*Clein said he is very supportive of the plan. He asked about how this proposal will relate to the 350 parts per million target.*

*Geisler said while we can't really pinpoint our microclimate's ppm, they estimated from what they know, which is based on a cumulative impact.*

*Derezinski said it is a very well done report. One of the things he had an issue with is the statement that the goals line up with major science, and if they are only talking about CO2 emissions, does that push us towards nuclear power.*

*Geisler said the plan pushes for renewable sources. He noted that the City Council supported the state Ballot Proposal 3. He said the question is how can renewables be part of that, adding that nuclear energy is part of the mix. He said stressing the need for urgency so we don't wait to address these concerns is part of this plan.*

*Woods said she appreciates the effort and coordination between commissions that worked together. She said the plan will take a lot of effort on everyone's part.*

*Geisler thanked the Commission.*

**On a voice vote, the Vice Chair declared the motion carried.**

**Yeas:** 7 - Bonnie Bona, Eric A. Mahler, Wendy Woods, Diane Giannola, Eleanore Adenekan, Kenneth Clein, and Tony Derezinski

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 1 - Kirk Westphal

10

**AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION (Persons may speak for three minutes on any item.)**

None

11 **COMMISSION PROPOSED BUSINESS**

*Derezinski asked the audience members what group they represented.*

*The students said they were from the Land Use Policy and law class from U of M and Masters of Urban Planning from the Planning Law and Planning Theory courses.*

12 **ADJOURNMENT**

**Moved by Bona, seconded by Clein, that the meeting be adjourned. On a voice vote, the Vice Chair declared the motion carried.**

Kirk Westphal, Chair  
mg

*Community Television Network Channel 16 live televised public meetings are also available to watch live online from CTN's website, [www.a2gov.org/ctn](http://www.a2gov.org/ctn), on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>).*

*Live Web streaming is one more way, in addition to these listed below, to stay in touch with Ann Arbor City Council and board and commission actions and deliberations.*

- *Video on Demand: Replay public meetings at your convenience online at [www.a2gov.org/government/city\\_administration/communicationsoffice/ctn/Pages/VideoOnDemand.aspx](http://www.a2gov.org/government/city_administration/communicationsoffice/ctn/Pages/VideoOnDemand.aspx)*
- *Cable: Watch CTN Channel 16 public meeting programming via Comcast Cable channel 16.*

*The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at [www.a2gov.org/ctn](http://www.a2gov.org/ctn), on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>), or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.*