



City of Ann Arbor Meeting

Minutes - Final

Historic District

Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Thursday, August 13, 2020

7:00 PM

Electronic Meeting

This meeting will be broadcast live on CTN Cable Channel 16, ATT Channel 99, and online at a2gov.org/watchCTN

To speak at public comment call: 877 853 5247 or 888 788 0099 (Toll Free)
Enter Meeting ID: 929 9364 3571

A. CALL TO ORDER

Secretary David Rochlen called the meeting to order at 7:02 pm, stating:

Welcome to the Thursday, August 13, 2020 electronic meeting of the Ann Arbor Historic District Commission. This meeting is in accordance with executive orders from the Governor to effect social distancing and mitigate the spread of the COVID-19 virus. We intend to conduct this meeting similarly to an in-person meeting. However, please be patient if there are technical issues. Public comment will be via telephone only. To speak during any of the public comment opportunities please call 1-877-853-5247 and enter meeting ID: 929 9364 3571. This information is also available on the published agenda, in the public notices section of the city website, and on the broadcast of this meeting on CTN channel 16, AT&T channel 99, and online at www.a2gov.org/watchctn.

B. ROLL CALL

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher called the roll.

Others participating in the meeting:

Planning Services Administrative Assistant Kristen Vander Lugt

Present: 5 - John Beeson, David Rochlen, Jessica Quijano, Kathryn Fortener, and Bob White

Absent: 2 - Anna Epperson, and Evan Hall

C. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

The Agenda was unanimously approved as presented. On a voice vote and a show of hands, the Secretary declared the motion carried.

D. PUBLIC COMMENTARY - (3 Minutes per Speaker)

None

E. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

F. HEARINGS

F-1 [20-1222](#) HDC20-098 202 S Seventh Street; Replace Garage Doors; OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners John Beeson and David Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Jessica Quijano, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 202 S Seventh Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to replace the garage doors with wood replicas that slide on tracks, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2 and 5 and the guidelines for building site and district or neighborhood setting; and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for residential accessory structures.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Secretary declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5 – 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - Beeson, Secretary Rochlen, Quijano, Fortener, and White

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Chair Hall, and Vice Chair Epperson

F-2 **20-1223** HDC20-115 834 W Washington Street; Rear Addition; OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners John Beeson and David Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Jessica Quijano, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 834 W. Washington, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to replace the basement walls and construct a two-story rear addition on a 13' x 8' footprint, a single-story mudroom, and a covered back porch. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for All Additions, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for

Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for New Additions, and District or Neighborhood Setting.

Moved by Kathy Fortener, seconded by Bob White to amend the motion, adding the condition:

...'on the condition that the information submitted to the HDC on August 13, 2020 be reviewed by staff and the HDC Officers before a Building permit is issued'.

AMENDED MOTION:

That the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 834 W. Washington, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to replace the basement walls and construct a two-story rear addition on a 13' x 8' footprint, a single-story mudroom, and a covered back porch on the condition that the information submitted to the HDC on August 13, 2020 be reviewed by staff and the HDC Officers before a Building permit is issued. As conditioned, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for All Additions, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for New Additions, and District or Neighborhood Setting.

VOTE ON AMENDMENT:

The amendment was unanimously approved by the Commission.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Secretary declaring the amended motion carried. Vote: 5 – 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - Beeson, Secretary Rochlen, Quijano, Fortener, and White

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Chair Hall, and Vice Chair Epperson

F-3 [20-1224](#) HDC20-116 1529 Broadway Screen Porch; BHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners John Beeson and David Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by John Beeson, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 1529 Broadway Street, a contributing property in the Broadway Historic District, to expand a modern addition on the northeast corner of the house by 24 square feet and add two new windows to it and relocate the door; and construct a 144 square foot screen room attached to the west elevation, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for new additions, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, particularly as they pertain to porches.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Secretary declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5 – 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - Beeson, Secretary Rochlen, Quijano, Fortener, and White

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Chair Hall, and Vice Chair Epperson

F-4 [20-1225](#) HDC20-114 520 Third Street; Attic Egress Window; OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners John Beeson and David Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Kathy Fortener, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 520 Third Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to replace a pre-1945 one-over-one window in the rear-facing attic gable with a casement window that meets egress requirements and has a false muntin, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, especially those for windows and safety codes, and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standard 2, and the guidelines for windows, neighborhood setting, and health and safety.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Secretary declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5 – 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - Beeson, Secretary Rochlen, Quijano, Fortener, and White

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Chair Hall, and Vice Chair Epperson

F-5 **20-1226** HDC20-117 1112 W Liberty Street; Deck and Dormer; OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners John Beeson and David Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Kathy Fortener, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 1112 W. Liberty Street, a non-contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to construct a rear dormer, remove a rear window and install a different sized window in a nearby location, and construct a rear deck and stairs, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, in particular the guidelines for residential decks and roofs, and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular

standards 9 and 10 and the guidelines for roofs, windows, and district or neighborhood setting.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Secretary declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5 – 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - Beeson, Secretary Rochlen, Quijano, Fortener, and White

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Chair Hall and Vice Chair Epperson

F-6 **20-1227** HDC20-122 309 S Main Street; New Storefront; MSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners John Beeson and David Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by John Beeson, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 309 S. Main Street, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District to install a new aluminum and tile storefront, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for storefronts, windows, and signs, and The Secretary

of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, and 9 and the guidelines for storefronts, windows, and building site.

Friendly Amendment by John Beeson, and accepted by Bob White, to add the following condition to the main motion:

...'conditioned on applying muntins at the transom level on the three operable windows'.

AMENDED MOTION:

Moved by John Beeson, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 309 S. Main Street, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District to install a new aluminum and tile storefront, conditioned on applying muntins at the transom level on the three operable windows. As conditioned the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for storefronts, windows, and signs, and The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, and 9 and the guidelines for storefronts, windows, and building site.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Secretary declaring the amended motion carried. Vote: 5 – 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - Beeson, Secretary Rochlen, Quijano, Fortener, and White

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Chair Hall, and Vice Chair Epperson

G. NEW BUSINESS

- G-1 [20-1228](#) Presentation on Floodplain Regulations in Historic Districts

City Floodplain Coordinator, Jerry Hancock, provided a presentation on the upcoming Floodplain ordinance amendments.

H. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

- H-1 [20-1232](#) Minutes of the June 11, 2020, HDC Meeting

The June 11, 2020 HDC meeting minutes were unanimously approved and forwarded to City Council.

- H-2 [20-1229](#) Minutes of the July 9, 2020, HDC Meeting

The July 9, 2020 HDC meeting minutes were unanimously approved and forwarded to City Council.

I. **REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS**

Commissioner Quijano and Jill Thacher reported on continued repair work on-going at Cobblestone Farm; they have been working with Thacher on repairing existing historic windows.

J. **ASSIGNMENTS**

- J-1 **Review Committee: Tuesday, September 8, 2020 at 5pm for the September 10, 2020 Regular Meeting**

Commissioners Anna Epperson and Jessica Quijano volunteered for the September 10, 2020 HDC Review Committee.

K **REPORTS FROM STAFF**

- K-1 [20-1230](#) July 2020 HDC Staff Activities

Received and Filed

L. **CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS**

Quijano enquired about the little blue house and neighboring tall yellow house on E Liberty, noting she's seen a For Sale sign posted continuously.

Thacher provided information on both houses.

M. **COMMUNICATIONS**

M-1 [20-1231](#) Various Communications to the HDC

N. **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 9:55 pm.

Written comments may be submitted until 4:00 pm on the meeting day using the City's eComment system, which is available alongside the agenda at <http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Comcast 16 / AT&T 99 live, and recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>.

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.

Evan Hall, Chair
Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner
/mg