

ANN ARBOR HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Staff Report

ADDRESS: 215 North Fifth Avenue, Application Number HDC10-164

DISTRICT: Old Fourth Ward Historic District

REPORT DATE: January 13, 2011

REPORT PREPARED BY: Jill Thacher, Historic Preservation Coordinator

REVIEW COMMITTEE DATE: Monday, January 10, 2011

OWNER	APPLICANT
Name: Jon & Lisa Rye	Mitchell and Mouat Architects
Address: 300 E Long Lake Rd Bloomfield Hills, MI	113 S Fourth Ave Ann Arbor, MI 48104
Phone: (248)723-8001	(734) 662-6070

BACKGROUND: A two-story Greek revival house built on this site c.1835 was the home of Edward Mundy, an Ann Arbor merchant who became Michigan's Lt. Governor under Stevens T. Mason in 1835 and was later a state Supreme Court Justice. The house was condemned and razed in 1975. (See attached survey sheet.) A commercial auto repair shop that had been constructed behind the house in the 1950s remained, and in 1980 a single-story office addition was attached to the front of the garage. The building most recently housed the Bessenberg Bindery.

LOCATION: The site is located on the west side of North Fifth Avenue, north of East Ann and south of Catherine Street.

APPLICATION: The applicant seeks HDC approval to demolish the existing structure and construct a new 2 ½ story single-family residence in its place.

APPLICABLE REGULATIONS

From the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:

- (1) A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.

- (9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize



the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

- (10) New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

From the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (other SOI Guidelines may also apply):

District/Neighborhood

Not Recommended: Introducing new construction into historic districts that is visually incompatible or that destroys historic relationships within the district or neighborhood.

Setting

Recommended: Retaining the historic relationship between buildings and landscape features of the setting. For example, preserving the relationship between a town common and its adjacent historic houses, municipal buildings, historic roads, and landscape features.

STAFF FINDINGS

1. The 1982 Old Fourth Ward survey designated the building as “contemporary”, which would today be called a non-contributing structure. Since the structure does not contribute to the Historic District, its removal may be appropriate
2. The existing building covers around 70% of the lot, and the former garage portion is the full width of the lot. The proposed single-family residence is approximately the same length as the existing building, but covers about 55% of the lot, and the massing is broken up into three distinct sections separated by courtyards. The street-facing section presents a two-story gable front that is proportioned to fall between the buildings on either side (the east wall of the larger Armory condominiums on the south, and a smaller 2 ½ story gable-front house to the north). The center section features a cross-gable, and the rear section has a gable facing the alley and a two-car garage at grade. The front setback aligns with that of the armory to the south, and the middle of the front porch to the north.
3. The building is compatible in scale and massing to the adjacent properties. Though the proposed building is taller than the existing, it is appropriate for the district and not dissimilar from the two-story house that originally stood on the site. The modern materials proposed (brick veneer, a steel or asphalt roof, and metal and concrete fencing) are complementary to the historic materials used on the adjacent armory and other neighborhood buildings.
4. It is staff's opinion that the removal of the existing building and proposed house are generally compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding neighborhood and meet *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*, particularly numbers 1, 9 and 10.

POSSIBLE MOTIONS: (Note that the motion supports staff findings and is only a suggestion. The Review Committee, consisting of staff and at least two Commissioners, will meet with the applicant on site and then make a recommendation at the meeting.)

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 215 North Fifth Avenue, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to allow the demolition of the existing office/industrial building and the construction of a 2-1/2 story residence as detailed on the submitted drawings. The proposed work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and meets *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings*, in particular standards 1, 9 and 10, and the Guidelines for Setting and District/Neighborhood.

MOTION WORKSHEET:

I move that the Commission

_____ Issue a Certificate of Appropriateness

_____ Deny the Application

For the work at 215 N Fifth Avenue in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District

_____ As proposed.

_____ Provided the following condition(S) is (ARE) met: 1) CONDITION(s)

The work

_____ Is generally compatible with the size, scale, massing, and materials and meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, standard(S) number(S) 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10

_____ Is not generally compatible with the size, scale, massing and materials, and DOES NOT MEET the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, standard(S) number(S) 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10 for the following reason(S): 1) REASON(s)

ATTACHMENTS: application, drawings, photos.

2009 Aerial Photo



ANN ARBOR, MICHIGAN HISTORIC ARCHITECTURE SURVEY SHEET NUMBER

SURVEY DATE 7.29.73	BY <i>km</i>	ADDRESS 215 N. FIFE (GONE)
HISTORIC NAME MUNDY HOUSE	CURRENT NAME Two fam Bds	
LOCATION	SECTION	BLOCK
		PARCEL
		BUILDING

TYPE	USE PRIMARY <i>2</i>	SECONDARY	ORIGINAL	ZONING
------	----------------------	-----------	----------	--------

SURFACE MATERIAL <i>Wingless</i>	No. of FLOORS <i>2</i>	No. OCCUPIED <i>2</i>	FRONT DIRECTION <i>E</i>
----------------------------------	------------------------	-----------------------	--------------------------

ITEMS TO BE GRADED - PUT CHECK OR "X" IN APPROPRIATE SQUARE SPACE

EFFECT OF THE SURROUNDINGS ON THE BUILDING				
GOOD	MODERATE	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> NEUTRAL	DETRIMENTAL	

STRL CONDITION	GOOD	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> FAIR	POOR	<i>10</i>
MAINTENANCE	GOOD	FAIR	POOR	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <i>0</i>

ALTERATIONS	NONE or MINOR	MODERATE	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> EXTENSIVE	<i>5</i>
	APPROPRIATE		INAPPROPRIATE	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>



RESIDENCE OF EDWARD MUNDY,
MICHIGAN'S FIRST LIEUTENANT GOVERNOR
DURING THE ADMINISTRATION OF GOV.
STEVENS THOMPSON MASON (1835-40)
CONDEMNED - HOUSE DEMOLISHED SEPT. 22, 1975.

PERIOD OF STYLE	<i>C. F.</i>
DATE	<i>1835 ADDN</i>
NATIONAL IMPORT.	
LOCAL EXCELLENCE	
NOTABLE	
WORTHY OF MENTION	
POOR	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <i>0</i>

INCIDENCE	
RARE	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <i>20</i>
MODERATE	
COMMON	

TOTAL	<i>35</i>
CATEGORY	<i>D</i>

PHOTO DATE	<i>13 Jul 73</i>
BY	<i>KM</i>
ROLL	<i>20</i>
FRAME	<i>30</i>