



City of Ann Arbor

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Meeting Minutes Historic District Commission

Thursday, April 11, 2013

7:00 PM

City Hall, 301 E. Huron Street, 2nd Flr.

A CALL TO ORDER

Vice Chair Stulberg called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

B ROLL CALL

Jill Thacher called the roll.

Present: 5 - Ellen Ramsburgh, Thomas Stulberg, Benjamin L. Bushkuhl, John Beeson, and Jennifer Ross

Absent: 2 - Robert White, and Patrick McCauley

C APPROVAL OF AGENDA

A motion was made by Ramsburgh, seconded by Secretary Bushkuhl, that the Agenda be Approved as Amended. On a voice vote, the Vice Chair declared the motion carried.

D AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION - PUBLIC COMMENTARY - (3 Minutes per Speaker)

E HEARINGS

E-1 [13-0393](#) HDC13-038; 315 Second Street, Unit 215 - New Residential Awnings - OWSHD

Jill Thacher presented the following staff report:

BACKGROUND:

This block (Liberty/Second/William/First) had a mix of industrial and residential uses from at least 1880, when a tannery and several houses were located here. In 1925 there were five houses, a lodge/club room, and an auto parts manufacturer that covered less than one-eighth of the block. By 1931 the King-Seeley Corporation (manufacturers at that time of liquid depth gauges) had nearly doubled the size of the plant and removed the lodge, though the houses remained. By 1966 the block looked similar to the way it did when the Liberty Lofts project was approved in 2004-5, with a very large manufacturing building, the service station, and the houses at 307 and 311 Second.

LOCATION:

The site occupies most of the block bounded by West Liberty Street, Second Street, West William Street, and South First Street. This unit is on the southwest corner of

the building (facing West William and the parking lot) on the second floor.

APPLICATION:

The applicant seeks HDC approval to install two 18' wide retractable canvas awnings over a large roof deck.

APPLICABLE REGULATIONS:

From the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:

(9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

From the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for Residential Awnings:

Appropriate:

Installing the frame so historic trim and character-defining features are not destroyed or obscured.

Using canvas, vinyl-coated canvas, or acrylic fabrics.

Using an awning that is compatible in scale and form to the historic structure.

STAFF FINDINGS:

- 1. The applicant proposes installing two new fabric awnings on the west-facing wall of their condominium. The unit is on the second floor, and its western wall opens onto a large roof deck on top of the one-story main entrance section of the building. The awnings would shade the bedroom and living room from direct sun in summer. Each would be 18 feet wide, matching the width of the window sections. The awnings would be retractable and, per the applicant, non-motorized. The color has not been selected yet.*
- 2. The wall that the awnings would be attached to are concrete with a stucco finish. Each awning would require six brackets, per the supplied specs.*
- 3. The proposed awnings are large, but since they are located on a very large roof deck and are not designed to be left open like a fixed-frame awning, staff feels they are compatible with the historic building. They do not obscure or destroy any character-defining features of the building, are removable, and serve a traditional role in climate control for the condominium unit.*

REVIEW COMMITTEE'S REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Ramsburgh visited the site as part of the review.

Ramsburgh agreed with the staff report noting that the proposed location will not obscure or destroy any character-defining features of the building, and is appropriate and will be attached in the concrete. She expressed some concern about approving awnings for one unit, when she felt they needed to look at the complete building and the possibility of other units also requesting awnings.

PUBLIC HEARING:

John Rogers, 315 Second Street, Unit 215, owner and applicant said he had spoken with the condominium board and neighbors and they didn't have a problem with his request.

Ramsburgh asked the applicant if they were considering a solid colored awning, since she didn't feel that a striped awning would be appropriate on this building.

Rogers said that they would like to have a white awning that would reflect the light.

Noting no further public speakers, the Vice-Chair declared the public hearing closed.

A motion was made by Ramsburgh, seconded by Beeson, that the the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 315 South Second Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to install two new solid color retractable awnings. The proposed work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, in particular standard 9, and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for residential awnings.

(9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Vice Chair declaring the motion carried.

Certificate of Appropriateness was granted.

Yeas: 5 - Ramsburgh, Vice Chair Stulberg, Secretary Bushkuhl, Beeson, and Ross

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - White, and Chair McCauley

E-2 [13-0394](#)

HDC13-037; 307 South Fifth Avenue - Rear Addition to Business - MSHD

Jill Thacher presented the following staff report:

BACKGROUND:

This one-story building was constructed in 1914 as a Classical Revival style house and also served as an office for Dr. Louis Rominger. A concrete block storefront with a flat roof was added to the front of the house sometime before 1981.

LOCATION:

The site is located on the east side of South Fifth Avenue, just south of East Liberty

Street.

APPLICATION:

The applicant seeks HDC approval to construct a 979 square foot single-story rear addition with a roof deck.

APPLICABLE REGULATIONS:

From the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:

(2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

(9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

(10) New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

From the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (other SOI Guidelines may also apply):

Additions

Recommended:

Constructing a new addition so that there is the least possible loss of historic materials and so that character-defining features are not obscured, damaged, or destroyed.

Locating the attached exterior addition at the rear or on an inconspicuous side of a historic building; and limiting its size and scale in relationship to the historic building.

Designing new additions in a manner that makes clear what is historic and what is new.

Not Recommended:

Attaching a new addition so that the character-defining features of the historic building are obscured, damaged, or destroyed.

Duplicating the exact form, material, style, and detailing of the historic building in the new addition so that the new work appears to be part of the historic building.

Designing a new addition so that its size and scale in relation to the historic building are out of proportion, thus diminishing the historic character.

Building Site

Recommended:

Identifying, retaining, and preserving buildings and their features as well as features of the site that are important in defining its overall historic character.

Not Recommended:

Removing or radically changing buildings and their features or site features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the property so that, as a result, the character is diminished.

From the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines (other Guidelines may apply):

Guidelines for All Additions

Appropriate:

Placing a new addition on non-character-defining or inconspicuous elevations and limiting the size and scale in relationship to the historic property.

Designing a new addition in a manner that makes clear what is historic and what is new.

Not Appropriate:

Designing an addition that requires the removal of significant building elements or site features.

STAFF FINDINGS:

- 1. There are two buildings on this parcel, 307 South Fifth, occupied by Jerusalem Garden, and 311 South Fifth, an Italianate house to the south occupied by Earthen Jar. Behind the buildings is an informal parking lot bounded by several buildings on South Fifth Avenue and East Liberty Street.*
- 2. The existing building is 1283 square feet, and the proposed addition is 979 square feet. This exceeds the 50% maximum suggested by the Historic District Design Guidelines, but staff feels it is warranted under this site's circumstances. The addition would have no visual impacts from South Fifth Avenue or East Liberty Street due to the configuration of surrounding buildings.*
- 3. The addition would come close to the red bungalow located behind Earthen Jar, but staff feels its presence would be no worse than the existing dirt parking area that wraps around two sides. The stair enclosure will be roughly the same height as the bungalow, and the roofdeck will be lower. The bungalow shares a lot with 310 East Liberty.*
- 4. The stair enclosure and exterior staircase begin approximately 90 feet from the front of the building. While the stair enclosure exceeds the height of the original structure's roof ridge, it is set so far back that it will not be visible from the street. Similarly, the secondary exterior stair will be located between the two buildings (307 and 311 S Fifth), but set back so far that the visual impact will be insignificant. The addition will be most visible from the Library Lot to the south, and will infill and activate a space that has no particular historic value.*
- 5. The addition is proposed to be clad with stucco on the lower half and cementitious siding with 6" exposure on the upper half. This is compatible with the historic stuccoed structure. Windows are proposed only on the south facing wall. The*

flat roof preserves the rear gable of the existing structure and most of its eave (with the exception of where the new wall ties in), which helps make the work reversible.

6. *Illustrative information on the height of the building and other details has been requested from the applicant and will be incorporated into staff's report at the April 11 meeting.*

7. *Staff believes the massing, materials, and design of the addition are compatible with the existing structure and neighboring buildings and meet both the Secretary of the Interior's standards and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines.*

REVIEW COMMITTEE'S REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Ramsburgh and Ross visited the site as part of their review.

Ross said she agreed with the staff report and from the site visit felt that the size and scale of the proposed addition would be in scale with the other neighboring buildings. She said she had a concern that the addition would cover the corner returns in the rear that are historic, but otherwise, felt that the addition would be compatible and would be fine.

Ramsburgh said she agreed with the staff report and Ross' report, adding that the character-defining features, the peaks on the building stand out and they will continue to be seen with the proposed flat-roofed addition on the rear. She said the addition will be a better use of the property than the current parking lot.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Ali Ramlawi, 307 S. Fifth Avenue, applicant, said they need to respond to the growing demand for their product and they have been doing business at this same location since 1987 and would like to stay and expand their business.

Michael Bruner, 539 S. First Street, Architect for the project was present to respond to the Commission's enquiries.

Bushkuhl asked if the addition will be built with a slab on grade.

Bruner said there will be a basement below that will integrate the current off-site prep kitchen that the restaurant uses in order to operate the business. He said in the future they would like to see the area between their proposed addition and the library-lot become a green-space.

Noting no further public speakers, the Vice-Chair declared the public hearing closed.

A motion was made by Ross, seconded by Secretary Bushkuhl, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 307 South Fifth Avenue, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District, to construct a 979 square foot addition with a roof deck, as proposed. The proposed work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for additions and building site.

(2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

(9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

(10) New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Vice Chair declaring the motion carried.

Certificate of Appropriateness was granted.

Yeas: 5 - Ramsburgh, Vice Chair Stulberg, Secretary Bushkuhl, Beeson, and Ross

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - White, and Chair McCauley

E-3

[13-0395](#)

HDC13-035; 309 South Seventh Street - Rear Addition to Residence - OWSHD

Jill Thacher presented the following staff report:

BACKGROUND:

This one and three-quarter story gable-fronter features board trim beneath the eaves, peaked trim above the windows, and a full width front porch.

LOCATION:

The site is located on the east side of South Seventh Street, south of Murray Court and north of West Liberty Street.

APPLICATION:

The applicant seeks HDC approval to construct a 1 ½ story addition on the rear of the house.

APPLICABLE REGULATIONS:

From the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:

(2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

(9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural

features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

(10) New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

From the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (other SOI Guidelines may also apply):

Additions

Recommended:

Constructing a new addition so that there is the least possible loss of historic materials and so that character-defining features are not obscured, damaged, or destroyed.

Locating the attached exterior addition at the rear or on an inconspicuous side of a historic building; and limiting its size and scale in relationship to the historic building.

Designing new additions in a manner that makes clear what is historic and what is new.

Not Recommended:

Attaching a new addition so that the character-defining features of the historic building are obscured, damaged, or destroyed.

Duplicating the exact form, material, style, and detailing of the historic building in the new addition so that the new work appears to be part of the historic building.

Designing a new addition so that its size and scale in relation to the historic building are out of proportion, thus diminishing the historic character.

Building Site

Recommended:

Identifying, retaining, and preserving buildings and their features as well as features of the site that are important in defining its overall historic character.

Not Recommended:

Removing or radically changing buildings and their features or site features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the property so that, as a result, the character is diminished.

From the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines (other guidelines may apply):

Guidelines for All Additions

Appropriate:

Placing a new addition on a non-character-defining or inconspicuous elevation and limiting the size and scale in relationship to the historic property.

Designing a new addition in a manner that makes clear what is historic and what is new.

Limiting the size and scale of the addition in relationship to the historic building so that it does not diminish or visually overpower the building or the district. The addition's footprint should exceed neither half of the original building's footprint nor half of the original building's total floor area.

Not Appropriate:

Designing an addition to appear older or the same age as the original building.

STAFF FINDINGS:

- 1. The existing house is 648 square feet. The footprint of 432 square feet would be expanded by 200 square feet, for an increase of 46%.*
- 2. Two existing windows that are presumed to be original and a non-original door would be eliminated by the proposed rear addition. The door is damaged and not re-usable.*
- 3. The addition is simple and compatible in massing to the main house and neighborhood. The addition is differentiated from the house mainly by materials, including ICF (insulated concrete forms) foundation walls, Hardie Lap siding and Azek trim boards, and one-over-one windows in a similar size to the original two-over-two windows present on all elevations. Similarly, the kneewall windows on the second floor are horizontally proportioned. All windows would be Andersen wood. The addition is stepped back the width of the corner trim board from the sidewalls of the existing house, and there is no eave overhang on the addition. The window trim is proposed to be replicated, but in Azek instead of wood. The addition is nearly a replica of the main house, but of entirely modern materials.*
- 4. Because the design of the addition matches the main house so closely (the exception being the lack of eave overhangs), staff believes the peaked trim above the windows should not match, but instead should be straight across the top. With this simple change, staff believes the addition will keep the majority of the detailing of the house, but send a clue that the addition was constructed in a different era, rather than leaving the observer wondering if an old addition was re-clad in a modern era.*
- 5. The massing of the addition keeps the house similar to neighboring houses in terms of the relationship of open space to structure on the lot.*
- 6. With the proposed condition, staff believes the work meets the Ann Arbor and the Secretary of the Interior's guidelines, and the SOI standards for rehabilitation.*

REVIEW COMMITTEE'S REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Ramsburgh and Ross visited the site as part of their review.

Ross said she agreed with the staff report that the rear deck is not historic, and the addition would be appropriate in size and scale with the existing house as well as with the neighborhood. She was in support of the application.

Ramsburgh agreed, noting that everything about the proposed addition is appropriate in that it is stepped down and stepped in from the peak and the size is appropriate. She asked for the applicant, as well as the Commission's opinion on the possibility of

retaining the two historical windows and re-using them in the addition.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Kevin Lesser and Lauren Miller, owners, were present and reviewed their project with the Commission.

Lesser said that the old windows are very dry-rotted with only the paint holding them together.

Ross asked about the proportions of the windows.

Lesser explained the proposed proportions with the existing windows.

Beeson asked about proposed basement walls on the new addition.

Lesser said they plan on using ICF covered with stucco, that will look different from the exiting basement walls.

Noting no further public speakers, the Vice-Chair declared the public hearing closed.

A motion was made by Secretary Bushkuhl, seconded by Beeson, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 309 South Seventh Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to remove a rear deck and construct a new 11'6" x 17'7" one and a half story rear addition on the condition that the addition's window trim is straight across the top, not peaked. The proposed work may include eaves similar to the existing structure. The work as conditioned is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for additions and building site; and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for additions.

(2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

(9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

(10) New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Vice Chair declaring the motion carried.

Certificate of Appropriateness was granted.

Yeas: 5 - Ramsburgh, Vice Chair Stulberg, Secretary Bushkuhl, Beeson, and Ross

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - White, and Chair McCauley

F UNFINISHED BUSINESS**G NEW BUSINESS****G-1 [13-0396](#) Provision of Proposed Bylaw Amendments**

Thacher reviewed proposed bylaw amendments with the Commission.

G-2 [13-0399](#) 2013 Awards Nominations

Thacher reviewed the Award's Committee list with the Commission.

A motion was made by Secretary Bushkuhl, seconded by Beeson, that the 2013 Awards Nomination Recommendations be Approved by the Commission. On a voice vote, the Vice Chair declared the motion carried.

H APPROVAL OF MINUTES**H-1 [13-0397](#) Historic District Commission Meeting Minutes of the March 14, 2013**

The minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission. On a voice vote, the Vice Chair declared the motion carried.

I REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS**J ASSIGNMENTS****J-1 Review Committee: Monday, May 6 at 5 pm for the May 9, 2013 Regular Meeting**

Ross and White volunteered for the May Review Committee.

K REPORTS FROM STAFF**K-1 [13-0398](#) March 2013 HDC Staff Activities**

Received and Filed

L CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS

Ramsburgh urged members of the public as well as Commissioners who were interested in voicing their concerns at the City Council meeting, regarding the historic impact and sustainability of the proposed 413 E. Huron project, should attend the City

Council meeting, next Monday night.

Vice-Chair Stulberg explained that there would be an opportunity for public comment during the public hearing.

M COMMUNICATIONS

N ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 8:34 p.m.

Community Television Network Channel 16 live televised public meetings are also available to watch live online from CTN's website, www.a2gov.org/ctn, on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>).

Live Web streaming is one more way, in addition to these listed below, to stay in touch with Ann Arbor City Council and board and commission actions and deliberations.

- *Video on Demand: Replay public meetings at your convenience online at www.a2gov.org/government/city_administration/communicationsoffice/ctn/Pages/VideoOnDemand.aspx*
- *Cable: Watch CTN Channel 16 public meeting programming via Comcast Cable channel 16.*

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at www.a2gov.org/ctn, on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>), or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.