



City of Ann Arbor
Formal Minutes
Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Thursday, August 11, 2016

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council Chambers

A **CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Bushkuhl called the meeting to order at 7:05 p.m.

B **ROLL CALL**

Staff Present: Alexis DiLeo

DiLeo called the roll.

Present: 6 - Robert White, Ellen Ramsburgh, Thomas Stulberg, Benjamin L. Bushkuhl, John Beeson, and Evan Hall

Absent: 1 - Jennifer Ross

C **APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

The agenda was unanimously Approved as presented. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

D **AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION - (3 Minutes per Speaker)**

Alexis DiLeo provided the Ann Arbor District Library Summer Game Player code.

E **UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

E-1 **16-1155** HDC16-125; 209 S Main - Replace Storefront - MSHD

Alexis DiLeo presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Bushkuhl and Stulberg visited the site as part of their review.

Bushkuhl reported that there were no changes on site to note since last month's site visit.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Tom Brady, Jim Brady's Detroit, 23650 Woodward, Ste 300, Pleasant Ridge, owner of the building was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Hall, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 209 S. Main Street, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District to (1) remove an existing storefront and construct a new porcelain tile storefront with a slab door and folding display windows; and (2) install two new exterior business signs, as revised by the applicant for the August 11, 2016 Historic District Commission meeting. The proposed work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for storefronts, commercial entries, and signs, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 3, 5, 6, and 9 and the guidelines for storefronts, building site, and new additions.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 6 - White, Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, and Hall

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Secretary Ross

F **HEARINGS****F-1** **16-1156** HDC16-151; 538 Fifth Street - Solar Panels on Roof - OWSHD

Alexis DiLeo presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Bushkuhl and Stulberg visited the site as part of their review.

Stulberg reported that the roof surface where the solar panels are proposed to be located will be very visible from the street as well as the nearby neighbors; however given the sunlight, this location seems to be the most logical location.

Bushkuhl agreed, adding that his only concern was with proposed electrical conduit that would be coming down from the roof.

PUBLIC HEARING:

John Rietz, 538 Fifth Street, Ann Arbor, the applicant was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Beeson, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 538 Fifth Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to reroof the house and install a solar array on the south facing roof, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for roofs, energy efficiency, and mechanical systems, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, particularly as they pertain to solar installations.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 6 - White, Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, and Hall

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Secretary Ross

F-2 **16-1157** HDC16-158; 116 Crest - One Story Addition -- OWSHD

Alexis DiLeo presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Bushkuhl and Stulberg visited the site as part of their review.

Bushkuhl reported that on site they looked to see if the door was original, but they couldn't tell. They also requested additional information on materials, which was supplied to them and was helpful.

Stulberg added that the footprint of the addition would be almost identical to the existing footprint, and will not be visible from the street. He felt aesthetically, it would improve the house from any possible view.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Shaira Daya, 116 Crest Street, the applicant was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Beeson, Seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 116 Crest Avenue, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to enclose an existing back porch and construct an additional bump out to the south; and remove a 10 inch block retaining wall on the southern side of the brick driveway and along the sidewalk, regrade and landscape the area where the wall was removed, and construct a new landscape wall in front of the front

porch using blocks salvaged from the driveway wall. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for new additions and landscape features, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for new additions.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 6 - White, Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, and Hall

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Secretary Ross

F-3 [16-1158](#) HDC16-156; 1667 Broadway - One Story Addition -- BHD

Alexis DiLeo presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Bushkuhl and Stulberg visited the site as part of their review.

Stulberg reported that the carport would be visible from the street, but the addition would mostly not be visible. He said the existing tree would not be impacted by the addition. Stulberg noted that it was good to see that the roofline issue would be taken care of as a part of this proposal. He also added that the size of the addition would not overwhelm the size of the lot.

Bushkuhl noted that the size of the lot was very large, and he was glad that the application covered several issues needing attention and would make the property much more accessible and preserve it for years to

come.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Tsui-Ying Kau, 1669 Broadway Street, Ann Arbor, the owner, was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Mark Rueter, 515 Fifth Street, Ann Arbor, Architect, was present to explain the application.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Hall, Seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 1667 Broadway Street, a contributing property in the Broadway Historic District, to demolish a 210 square foot rear addition and replace it with a 757 square foot addition, construct a carport, and related work, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for additions and building site; and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for additions.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 6 - White, Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, and Hall

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Secretary Ross

F-4 [16-1159](#) HDC16-164; 1540 Cedar Bend - Driveway Paving - BHD

Alexis DiLeo presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Bushkuhl and Stulberg visited the site as part of their review.

Stulberg reported that there is a significant slope on the site, and there is an existing large drain on the parcel.

Bushkuhl agreed, adding that the house sits in a bowl with neighboring parcel draining onto their site.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Mike Turriff, 1540 Cedar Bend Drive, Ann Arbor, Owner, and Dennie Peters, Terra Firma, 3750 Morgan Drive, Ypsilanti, the contractor, was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Beeson, Seconded by White, that that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 1540 Cedar Bend Drive, a contributing building in the Broadway Historic District, to install a paver driveway and front walk, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Guidelines for driveways and paved areas and landscape features, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, in particular standards 2, 9, and 10, and the guidelines for building site.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 6 - White, Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, and Hall

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Secretary Ross

F-5 [16-1160](#) HDC16-157; 315-321 S Main - New Downtown building - MSHD

Alexis DiLeo presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Bushkuhl and Stulberg visited the site as part of their review.

Bushkuhl reported that in viewing the renderings he believed they were somewhat conservative and the higher levels (floors five and six) would actually be less visible than some of the renderings submitted. He said the buildings to the south all have the ability to be added to, in the future or near future so the area could look very different in the future. He reviewed the historic district limits with the Commission. He said the design, quality, and materials seem to be of high quality, and the store front configurations and windows make sense. He said the Review Committee has asked for a stone sample, of the proposed lighter stone, to be shown to the Commission, as the Architect explained it to be more muted in color than what is shown in the high-contrast renderings.

Stulberg added that it was clear to see that the existing 66-foot one-story building on Main Street doesn't fit in with the existing streetscape, and he appreciated the 3-section breakdown. He said in looking at the north-frontal view, one can now see the multi-story parking structure behind it and the proposed building would be obstructing that view. He said on the south side there is a fairly large blank wall that is being proposed, but as pointed out, the historic district ends shortly after this parcel.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Dick Mitchell, 113 S. Fourth Street, Ann Arbor, Mitchell and Mouat Architects, IHC, the applicant was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Bushkuhl, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 315 321 South

Main Street, a non contributing property in the Main Street Historic District, to demolish the existing one story building and construct a six floor mixed use building, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to adjacent and surrounding buildings and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, particularly as they pertain to New Construction in Historic Commercial Settings.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

Moved by White, seconded by Bushkuhl, to withdraw the motion on the floor and that the Commission postpone taking action to allow the applicant to take under consideration Commission comments as they relate to areas of concern and submit revised plans.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION ON THE POSTPONEMENT MOTION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the motion and discussed the matter.

A summary of the Commission's concerns on the proposed building included:

- 1. Minimizing the looming effect*
- 2. Breaking up the south wall*
- 3. Cornice in level three*
- 4. The visibility of people up on the terrace*
- 5. Request for views of more City blocks in the City to see how the building fits in.*

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Item Postponed

G NEW BUSINESS

H APPROVAL OF MINUTES

H-1 [16-1162](#) Minutes of the July 14, 2016 HDC Meeting

Unanimously Postponed to the Historic District Commission.

I REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS

Ramsburgh reported from Cobblestone Farms that on September 11th from 12-4 pm there would be an event called, Frolic at the Farm, which will include animals, crafts, food, and lots of fun for the whole family.

J ASSIGNMENTS

J-1 **Review Committee: Monday, September 6, 2016, at 5pm for the September 8, 2016 Regular Meeting**

Commissioners White and Ramsburgh volunteered for the September Review Committee.

K REPORTS FROM STAFF

K-1 [16-1161](#) July 2016 HDC Staff Activities

Received and Filed

L CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS

Bushkuhl commented that he is frustrated to see the leasing/rental signs in the Old Fourth Ward are more and more 4x4 wooden permanent signage. He said the City continues to work on this issue.

M COMMUNICATIONS

M-1 [16-1163](#) Various Communications to the HDC

Received and Filed

N ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 10:40 p.m.

Community Television Network Channel 16 live televised public meetings are also available to watch live online from CTN's website, www.a2gov.org/ctn, on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>).

Live Web streaming is one more way, in addition to these listed below, to stay in touch with Ann Arbor City Council and board and commission actions and deliberations.

- *Video on Demand: Replay public meetings at your convenience online at www.a2gov.org/government/city_administration/communicationsoffice/ctn/Pages/VideoOnDemand.aspx*
- *Cable: Watch CTN Channel 16 public meeting programming via Comcast Cable channel 16.*

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at www.a2gov.org/ctn, on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>), or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.