

## ANN ARBOR HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

### Staff Report

**ADDRESS:** 1312 Broadway Street, Application Number HDC15-037

**DISTRICT:** Broadway Historic District

**REPORT DATE:** April 7, 2015

**REPORT PREPARED BY:** Jill Thacher, Historic Preservation Coordinator

**REVIEW COMMITTEE DATE:** Monday, April 4, 2015

|                 | <b>OWNER</b>                                | <b>APPLICANT</b> |
|-----------------|---|------------------|
| <b>Name:</b>    | G. Cullen Leggett                           | Same             |
| <b>Address:</b> | 1312 Broadway Street<br>Ann Arbor, MI 48108 |                  |
| <b>Phone:</b>   | (602) 616-7474                              |                  |

**BACKGROUND:** This side-gabled Greek Revival cottage is included in the 1868 Polk City Directory as #56 Broadway, home of the Jones family. The 1869 directory tells us that James Jones, who resided at 56 Broadway, also ran a cooper shop at 43 Broadway. The record is unclear, but the house could date back to the 1830s. See the attached Broadway Historic District survey sheet for more information.

**LOCATION:** The site is located on the south side of Broadway Street, across the street and just east of Jones Drive.

**APPLICATION:** The applicant seeks HDC approval to install a new dormer on the rear elevation.

#### **APPLICABLE REGULATIONS:**

##### **From the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:**

- (9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
- (10) New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in



such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

**From the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (other SOI Guidelines may also apply):**

**Roofs**

Recommended: Designing additions to roofs such as residential, office, or storage spaces; elevator housing; decks and terraces; or dormers or skylights when required by the new use so that they are inconspicuous from the public right-of-way and do not damage or obscure character-defining features.

Not Recommended: Changing the configuration of a roof by adding new features such as dormer windows, vents, or skylights so that the historic character is diminished.

**Windows**

Not Recommended: Installing new windows, including frames, sash, and muntin configuration that are incompatible with the building's historic appearance or obscure, damage, or destroy character-defining features.

**District or Neighborhood Setting**

Not Recommended: Introducing new construction into historic districts that is visually incompatible or that destroys historic relationships within the setting.

**From the City of Ann Arbor Design Guidelines:**

**Roofs**

Not Appropriate: Adding chimneys, cupolas, or dormers where not appropriate.

**STAFF FINDINGS:**

1. This simple shed dormer is requested to allow the owner enough headroom to walk up the stairs to the second floor without hitting his head or having to duck. The sides of the dormer would be clad in shakes. The shake material is not specified, but staff's opinion is that wood or artificial (cementitious or vinyl) shakes would be appropriate for this small installation on the back of the house. The dormer would have two 36" wide x 30" tall clad wood casement windows, which are appropriate given that the rear elevation has no architecturally significant windows.
2. A stack vent would be relocated to make way for the dormer. The new location is appropriate.
3. The work is inconspicuous from the public right-of-way, and does not damage or destroy character-defining features of this very historic house. Staff finds the work compatible in exterior design, arrangement, material, and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area, and finds that it meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitation, and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines.

**POSSIBLE MOTIONS:** (Note that the motion is only a suggestion. The Review Committee, consisting of staff and at least two Commissioners, will meet with the applicant on site and then make a recommendation at the meeting.)

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 1312 Broadway Street, a contributing property in the Broadway Historic District, to install a new dormer with casement windows on the rear elevation of the roof, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the *Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines* and the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings*, in particular standards 9 and 10 and the guidelines for roofs and windows.

### MOTION WORKSHEET:

I move that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the work at 1312 Broadway Street in the Broadway Historic District

\_\_\_\_\_ Provided the following condition(S) is (ARE) met: 1) STATE CONDITION(s)

The work is generally compatible with the size, scale, massing, and materials and meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, standard(S) number(S) (*circle all that apply*): 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10

**ATTACHMENTS:** survey sheet, application, drawings.

1312 Broadway (2010 aerial photo)

